

<sup>6</sup> Walter D. Mignolo argues a premise for this post-colonial amalgamation with border theory. In *Local Histories/Global Designs*, he envisions a theory in which people "... think from the borders and [from] the perspectives of subalternity" (2000: 110). This theoretical perspective should have an interdisciplinary approach and aim to speak to "... those unnamed ways of thinking that have been silenced..." by other theoretical frames (2000: 110). Although Mignolo warns that terms like "border writing," "border culture," and "border matters" might be overused in modern, critical circles, it is possible to make an epistemological correlation between the littoral space and a construction of border reality. For example, in coining the phrase "epistemic potential," Mignolo suggests a context for broadening border theory to include multiple iconic spaces.

<sup>7</sup> Kincaid writes: As your plane descends to land, you might say, What a beautiful island Antigua is—more beautiful than any of the other islands you have seen. . . .where the sun always shines and where the climate is deliciously hot and dry for the four or ten days you are going to be staying there; and since you are on your holiday, since you are a tourist, the thought of what it might be like for someone who had to live day in, day out in a place that suffers . . . must never cross your mind. (2000: 3-4)

<sup>8</sup> I include the French (marron) and English (maroon) spellings here. Glissant uses the French etymology. However, the term is equally applicable and relevant within Anglophone Caribbean literature and criticism. See, for example, Cynthia James's *The Maroon Narrative: Caribbean Literature in English Across Borders, Ethnicities, and Centuries* (2002).

<sup>9</sup> In *The Signifying Monkey*, Henry Louis Gates acknowledges the ways in which African-American authors construct texts that write back to other texts. In addition to this notion of a "speakerly text"—the ways in which writing enables a text to speak—Gates also uses the term "signify" to highlight the iconic presence and metaphoric voice some African-American authors utilize in terms of a Yoruba deity, Eleggba. In this case, I co-opt the term, "signify," in order to reiterate the ways in which Glissant is, one, writing to other Caribbean authors, two, writin against a white, canonical tradition, and three, monopolizing an image in an attempt to symbolically capture the essence of the above, dual purposes.

<sup>10</sup> Specifically, Marina Paola Banchetti-Robino and Clevis Ronald Headley write: "However, this tradition [of shifting the geography of reason] can be made visible contingent upon the realization that it exists in a different textual geography, that is, the intertextual space crafted by the Caribbean thinkers who exploited to the fullest the discursive space that they were allowed to inhabit" (2008: 8). Thus, in the context of this paper, the littoral as archetype is set-up and contextualized as "a different textual geography," one that can provide a discursive space for universalizing resources and ideas of expression that are derived from a postcolonial vantage point.

## Black Metamorphosis: A Prelude to Sylvia Wynter's Theory of the Human Derrick White

"The Greatest Mind the Caribbean has ever produced," wrote C. L. R. James in the margins of a transcribed Sylvia Wynter lecture. James bestowed Wynter with a title that could have easily been his. However, the fact that James' comments on Wynter's lecture have only recently come to public attention reflects that Wynter's life and intellectual work have for too long been behind-the-scenes.<sup>1</sup> Fortunately, scholarly appreciation of her essays and lectures has dramatically increased in the last decade. Sylvia Wynter's forty-plus years of intellectual production has been the subject of several recent scholarly endeavors, namely, an in-depth 2000 interview by David Scott, Paget Henry's chapter in *Caliban's Reason*, a special 2001 edition of the *Journal of West Indian Literature*, a 2002 University of the West Indies conference, "After Man, Towards the Human" from which an edited book with the same title was published, and another 2005 interview published in an internet journal.<sup>2</sup> The growing appreciation of Wynter's intellectual work speaks to her profound theoretical scholarship from the margins. These scholars have emphasized Wynter's theoretical examinations of Caribbean politics and culture, leading Paget Henry to declare her the "'Divine One' of Caribbean Letters."<sup>3</sup>

Despite the growing scholarship on Wynter, little of the new research has explicitly examined her connections to Black Power era institutions and the effects of the period on her thinking. Any analysis of her work must acknowledge, besides the anti-colonial movement in the Caribbean, the effect the Black Freedom Struggle had on her Theory of the Human. The dearth of scholarly attention is a curious omission, considering Wynter's early literary criticism often examined the import of the American Black Power Movement and its ideologies in the Caribbean.<sup>4</sup> In addition, Wynter's essays have also continually extolled the significance of the Black Studies Movement of the late sixties through the seventies. According to Demetrius Eudell and Carolyn Allan's assessment of Wynter's scholarship, she saw Black Studies as "a re-enactment, if not completion, of the revolution of lay humanism."<sup>5</sup>

The lack of scholarly attention to Wynter's experiences in the United States and the effect of the Black Freedom Struggle on her thought were often the result of too few sources, forcing scholars to rely primarily on her published essays that have often focused on Caribbean subjects. This essay explores the effect of Wynter's move to the United States on her theoretical perspective by examining her unpublished manu-

script *Black Metamorphosis: New Natives in a New World* submitted for publication to the Institute of the Black World (IBW). What emerges from the manuscript is a deeper understanding of her theoretical shift away from Marxism to Wynter's Theory of the Human, which provides some clues to the influence of Wynter's move to the United States on her thinking.<sup>6</sup>

Wynter's relations with IBW constitute a brief, but key moment in her life. IBW was an Atlanta-based think tank founded by historian Vincent Harding, literary critic Stephen Henderson, and other faculty members in the six colleges that composed the Atlanta University Center in 1969. Initially, IBW was a component of the Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial Center founded by Coretta Scott King after her husband's assassination. IBW and the King Center split in 1970 in a disagreement over ideology, finances, and differing visions of King's legacy. Under Harding's leadership, IBW developed an impressive roster of research associates and supporters that included political scientist William Strickland, historian and *Ebony* magazine editor Lerone Bennett, Jr., and sociologist Joyce Ladner. Numerous Caribbean intellectuals were affiliated with IBW. Marcus Garvey scholar and historian, Robert Hill was a long time research associate, C. L. R. James lent support for lectures and summer seminars, and economists George Beckford and Norman Girvan produced essays and lectures for IBW. Sylvia Wynter also was a part of the Caribbean connection at IBW. She submitted a short essay and a longer book manuscript to IBW, both went unpublished because of the IBW's perpetual financial difficulties.

In 1971, Wynter and Vincent Harding met in Jamaica at a conference on Commonwealth Literature. They taped a series of radio broadcasts that discussed problems facing the Black diaspora. Moreover, Wynter and Robert Hill, who came to the Institute in 1970, knew one another as both were teaching at the University of the West Indies in the late 1960s and early 1970s. By 1979, Wynter served on the Board of Directors for the Institute. Wynter's association with IBW continued a lifetime of intellectual-activism. Like much of her previous intellectual-activism, Wynter chose to stay on the periphery of the organization.<sup>7</sup>

After Wynter's original meeting with Harding in 1971, she agreed to write an essay, *Black Metamorphosis: New Natives in a New World* for an IBW publication. According to Wynter, this essay

Would explore the Minstrel Show as the first Native North American theatre – and why Amerika [sic] distorted it; why a process of genuine creativity became a process of imitation and degenerated into a power stereotype, a cultural weapon against its creators. I shall relate the Minstrel Show to the nineteenth century folk theater patterns of the Caribbean and Latin American trying to link it to certain archetypal patterns of theater that we find for example among the Yoruba, the Aztecs and the folk English; and the way in which the blacks created a matrix to fuse disparate and yet archetypically related patterns.<sup>8</sup>

The essay evolved into a nine-hundred-plus page manuscript, taking most of the seventies to complete. The document provided the seeds of Wynter's developing conceptual framework. IBW's probing and inquisitive search for new ideological perspectives supplied an intellectual space for her to modify her analytical theory. The importance of this space must be understood in relation to her move beyond Marxist analysis. The book manuscript, *Black Metamorphosis* was a prelude to her Theory of the Human.<sup>9</sup>

A brief biography on Wynter provides a few clues to the influence of the civil rights and Black Power movements on her intellectual development in understanding a broader Black, instead of Caribbean, identity. Wynter has taught in the United States since 1974. She was a professor at University of California - San Diego in the early seventies, then moved to Stanford University where she chaired African and Afro-American Studies from 1977 –1979. Currently she is a Professor Emeritus at Stanford University.<sup>10</sup> As mentioned above, she was also affiliated with the IBW from 1971 until the organization folded in the early eighties. Despite being Jamaican and traveling across Europe as a student and as a dancer, Wynter remembered that her experiences in America altered her thoughts on racial identity. "[C]oming to the United States, coming to UCSC [University of California – San Diego], I began to learn something of the complexity of the society of the United States itself. Above all, I began to experience the entirely different nature of what it is to be something called 'black' in this society, as distinct from in Jamaica, in the Caribbean . . . . [T]he fact that the United States is itself based on the insistent negation of black identity, the obsessive hypervaluation of being white. For being American in post-Civil War US is being white, being above all, *not-black*. The totality of this negation was something new to me!"<sup>11</sup> The theoretical insights gained from her diverse experiences contributed

to Wynter's re-thinking of Marxism, which until the late seventies had been her theoretical foundation. This rethinking led her to examine weaknesses not only of Marxism but of Nationalism and of Liberalism as well. The resulting intellectual journey isolated her from old friends; so much so, she revealed to Vincent Harding that she "lives as an internal exile." In the intellectual space provided by IBW, Wynter reflected on her profound and alienating experiences in the United States to produce her *Theory of the Human*.<sup>12</sup>

### Theory of the Human

To fully understand the significance of the United States' Black Freedom Struggle and the relationship with IBW on Wynter's thought one must start at the end. Much of Wynter's recent theoretical work has revolved around her questioning the subjectivity of what it means to be human in a society. The key to Wynter's thinking on Human identity formation is paradigmatic thinking. A philosopher of science, Thomas Kuhn in *Structure of Scientific Revolution* (1962, 1996) argues that paradigms establish the context of normal scientific thought and procedure. Paradigms, for Kuhn, supply the limits of possible scientific outcomes because normal science only addresses questions that could be potentially solved within the framework of the paradigm. "[O]ne of the things a scientific community acquires with a paradigm is a criterion for choosing problems that, while the paradigm is taken for granted, can be assumed to have solutions. To a great extent these are the only problems that the community will admit as scientific or encourage its members to undertake."<sup>13</sup> Moreover, Kuhn suggests practitioners of scientific paradigms, avoid, evade, and occasionally adjust to maintain normative status in the face of anomalies and crises. Practitioners and thinkers make these adjustments in the hopes of saving the framework, not because the paradigm has superior explanatory power. Practitioners reinforce normal scientific perspectives for cultural reasons, as much as scientific ones. The crises and responses expose a paradigm as an "epistemological theory."<sup>14</sup> The paradigmatic, rather than empirical, understanding allowed Wynter to see the broader implications of her attention to Black culture and to move away from a Marxist analysis.

Wynter's theory of the Human relies on Kuhn's insight about paradigmatic thinking. The theory argues that all societies, especially a now globalized Western culture, present a local conception of "man" as isomorphic with human species. Wynter's theory posits a transcultural mode of analysis that avoids the judgmental traps of understanding what it means to be human. The judgmental traps of local cultures cut in two directions. One direction suggests that different cultures are by definition inferior.

The other direction suggests that groups within a local culture that do not embody the idealized Self, "man," are inferior.<sup>15</sup> Wynter's use of the transcultural builds on the insights of Mikhail Epstein who states, "Transculture means a space in, or among, cultures, which is open to all of them. Culture frees us from nature; transculture frees us from culture, any one culture."<sup>16</sup> For Wynter, transcultural space is a frame of analysis that allows scholars to observe the cultural identities which serve as the foundation to any society in a non-judgmental or non-hierarchical manner. Wynter's theory of the Human argues that cultural analysis requires an examination of how identity is narratively created and reinforced by the intellectual class and the power structure of a society. The method of looking at identity formation through a society's narratives is, in Wynter's analysis, transcultural. Therefore, the Human is a transcultural space that is not bound by science or superstition, it is a narratively created identity in which people are socialized. Wynter writes, "[T]he phenomenon of culture rather than 'nature' or 'history' . . . provides the ground of all human existential reality or actuality."<sup>17</sup>

There are four key components to Wynter's theory of the Human. First, she argues that all societies develop a conception of what it means to be human - the idealized Self - that is locally specific. Wynter relies on cultural anthropologists such as Clifford Geertz and Asmoran Legesse whose fieldwork demonstrated indigenous societies' value systems. She also relies on historical scholarship of Africa, medieval Europe, and indigenous societies in the New World to further demonstrate the localized nature of an idealized Self. "[W]hat is normally imperative to each culture-as-a-living system is that it know its reality adaptively, *i.e.*, in ways that can best orient the collective behaviors of its subjects, together with its mode of subjectivity (the I) and of conspecificity (the We)."<sup>18</sup> Wynter insists that cultures be understood as local manifestations, thereby undermining the normative perspective of a now globalized Western culture and its idealized Self.

Second, Wynter's recent scholarship has consistently explored and exposed how a particular society's intellectual class narratively instituted the idealized identity of self. According to Wynter, intellectuals, whether they are the clergy, the shamans, the soothsayers, the scientists, or the academics, create and re-create narratives of symbolic life and death that outline the local culturally specific notions of what it means to be human. These narratives are paradigms of value and authority that associate positive and negative traits to particular behaviors, beliefs, and ultimately groups who best exemplify them.

Most intellectuals reaffirm the paradigms that justify cultural and political hegemony and shape behavior, which is the third component. For populations living within a local cultural conception, its goal is to embody and become the idealized Self. This is the cultural definition of success. For populations outside a local cultural conception, it will be judged based on its cultural approximation to the normative culture. Wynter argues that behavior is not shaped by biology, nature, or free will, instead actions occur within the paradigm of an idealized Self. Wynter labels this process sociogeny, after Frantz Fanon's insights.<sup>19</sup>

The final component of the Wynter's Theory of the Human is the source and location of change. As Thomas Kuhn noted, paradigms often avoid a crisis and any anomalies. Despite a preference for evasion, paradigm shifts eventually occur because intellectuals insist that a new paradigm best explains and accounts for anomalies. Wynter applies this concept to cultural systems. She contends that it is the liminal categories, the non idealized Self, which institute and promote a cultural transformation of what it means to be human. "*The liminal categories . . . experience a structural contradiction between their lived experience and the grammar of representations which generate the mode of reality by prescribing the parameters of collective behaviors that dynamically bring that 'reality' into being. The liminal frame of reference can provide . . . the 'outer view,' from which perspective of the grammars of regularities of boundary and structure maintaining discourses are perceivable . . .*"<sup>20</sup> Change from one paradigm to another paradigm will emerge from the liminal position. However, for any change to become truly revolutionary it must take a paradigmatic view of what it means to be human. The analysis should look at how these discourses are maintained and how it shapes behavior. Wynter's transcultural view constitutes a new vision for the study of the Humanities, one that erases the "barrier between the natural sciences and the humanities, as the condition of making our 'narratively constructed worlds and their orders of feeling and belief' subject to 'scientific description in a new way.'"<sup>21</sup> For Wynter, the impetus for a transcultural theory will have to emerge from Black Studies and other "New Studies" (ethnic and gender) because intellectuals who represent these ideas exemplify the liminal perspective. Wynter sees the importance of Black Studies as challenging the ontology of Man in the contemporary order as analogous to the confrontation made by lay humanist. The transformative potential ascribed to Black Studies is central to Wynter's theory of the Human.

Wynter's recent essays outline a comprehensive and robust theory of the Human. However, her analysis was not always as confident. Like many Caribbean scholars of her generation, Wynter was a Marxist, because the analytical frame confidently ex-

plained colonial exploitation in the Caribbean and proposed an alternative, revolutionary, model of change. Wynter's early interests could be located in the understanding Black cultural production, religious and secular, and connecting this production to proletariat consciousness. *Black Metamorphosis* is a key document because it is a blueprint for Wynter's ever evolving thinking on culture and ideology. In *Black Metamorphosis*, Wynter starts with a project of reconciliation between Black culture and Marxist analysis and ends with the seeds of her theory of the Human.<sup>22</sup>

### Black Metamorphosis

The monograph Wynter submitted to IBW reflected her evolving epistemological mutation. The massive volume could be divided into two sections. The first part of the manuscript appears to have been written while Wynter was a professor at University of the West Indies. In this section, she slightly amends the Marxist premise that the infrastructure or economic production determines the superstructure, the level of culture, ideas, and laws. She asserts that the alienation and devaluation of Black humanity "take place on the super structural level and it is also this super structural level that maintains in being the relations of production which, defining him [the Black] as lesser man, ideologically justify his super exploitation both as labor power and consumer."<sup>23</sup> Her focus is how Blacks became devalued units of labor. Specifically the question: how does society marginalize Black or native culture through its value-laden ideas? Her reevaluation of Marxist superstructure stems from attempts to reconcile Marxism with Black cultural production and resistance in the New World. The first section of the manuscript echoes themes in her early published essays where Wynter is wrestling with limits of Marxist theory in analyzing culture.<sup>24</sup> In the second part of the manuscript, which appears to be written after her move the United States in 1974, Wynter abandons the attempt to reconcile Marxism and the Black cultural experience. Seeking an approach beyond the paradigmatic limitations of Marxism, she uses *Black Metamorphosis* to lay the foundation for her Theory of the Human.

As Norval Edwards points out, Wynter's early essays "posits a meta-theory of Caribbean history and culture."<sup>25</sup> Wynter's theory at this point presses against the limits of Marxist theory. In the post-World War II period, Caribbean Marxism was a dominant philosophy among West Indian radical students, intellectuals, and activists. Paget Henry outlines the genealogy of Caribbean Marxism, noting that in the collapse of Marcus Garvey's movement in the 1920s three Trinidadian intellectuals - George Padmore, C. L. R. James, and Eric Williams - shaped the emerging philosophy. By the 1950s, the failure of pro-capitalist development in the West Indies led to

stringent critiques of capitalism and politicians calling for socialist governments. Despite emerging from the ashes of Garvey's Pan-African movement, Henry also maintains that Caribbean Marxism often retained a strong emphasis on Pan-African culture. These intellectual and political movements shaped Wynter's perspectives. She was educated in Europe in the late 1940s at the University of London where she studied Modern Languages – Spanish Literature with an English minor. She was involved with the anti-colonial struggles in Europe. Wynter joined the Boscoe Holder dance troupe, which fostered Caribbean identity across Europe. Returning to London in 1957-58, she became a playwright and novelist, writing *The Hills of Hebron* (1962). *Hills* explored complex interactions between traditional religiously based cultural systems and a secular Marxism. Wynter uses the novel to problematize both Black Nationalism and Marxism by having her characters question the narratives of a decolonized nation. Literary scholar Shirley Toland-Dix describes the novel as “experimental, complex, and paradoxical, both epic narrative of the nation and critique of the extant vision of the nation.”<sup>26</sup>

Wynter's fictional philosophical clash mirrored her experiences with the conflicts between Black Nationalism and Marxism in the Caribbean. In 1961, Wynter went to British Guyana to help Cheddi Jagan, a leading anti-colonial leader, communist, and founder of the People's Political Party (PPP). In the English-speaking South American country, she wrote radio scripts designed to explain the economic budget to common people. Guyana burdened by racial and class tensions between Blacks and Indians, eventually exploded into chaotic mass demonstrations where the Blacks blamed Indians for displacing them in the economic order. The Black masses called for change and Forbes Burnham's People's National Congress (PNC) manipulated this demand with a form of anti-communist Black Nationalism devised to put him in political office without changing the economic conditions of working class Guyanese and to garner covert Cold War support from the United States and Great Britain.<sup>27</sup> Wynter was in a small house on the outskirts of Georgetown, Guyana's capital, writing the radio scripts, when the disaffected Black masses, who had already burnt sections of the capital city, marched towards the house that was a known location for Jagan's supporters. Timely intervention by British troops thwarted a disastrous situation; however, for Wynter, the profound contradictions of the moment forced her to reassess her intellectual perspective. She recalled that until that moment, “like most of my generation, I was a Marxist because Marxism gave you a key which said look, you can understand the reality of which you're a part. A lot of my rethinking came out of that experience. It was not a matter of negating the Marxian

paradigm but of realizing that it was one aspect of something that was larger.” She attempted to explain to Jagan that the division between Blacks and Indians in Guyana was profound. She recalled,

I tried to speak to Cheddi [Jagan]. I said that whilst I'd love to continue working there [in Guyana] it seemed to me that the greatest emphasis was to see if we could build a common history, place the emphasis on creating a sense of a shared community, of solidarity, because it did not exist. But Cheddi at that time was a very orthodox Marxist, and to even suggest that the superstructure was not automatically determined by the mode of production but was constructed, so that you can reconstruct it, that would have been heresy for him, genuinely.<sup>28</sup>

Her intellectual shift from orthodox Marxism marginalized her to large segments of the Caribbean intellectual community. As Wynter declared in a 1985 interview, “For a good many years I had tried to cling, sometimes tenuously, to the Marxist tradition. But then my own experience kept contradicting the theory. And while liberalism can be self-correcting, Marxism cannot. You take or leave it all in one piece. I had to leave it.”<sup>29</sup> The relationship with IBW provided an outlet for her developing intellectual position on how to overcome the limits of Marxism she experienced in Guyana.<sup>30</sup>

The first half of *Black Metamorphosis* takes a long historical view of Black cultural resistance in the New World because Wynter explores how these cultural manifestations countered the belief in Black cultural inferiority. She sees Black cultural resistance in relation to the economic structure. She situates Black cultural resistance by contextualizing how eighteenth and nineteenth century European intellectuals, through a combination of religious, scientific, and political ideology, constructed Africans and American Indians as culturally inferior to Europeans. She demonstrates how once European intellectuals “proved” Black (and Native) cultural inferiority, economic exploitation of Black labor on the encomiendas and plantations of the New World easily and logically followed. Wynter writes in *Black Metamorphosis*, “the systemic devaluation of the black as human went hand and hand with the systemic exploitations of his labor power.”<sup>31</sup>

Using her background in medieval and Renaissance Spanish culture and her knowledge of the Caribbean, Wynter examines Juan Gines de Sepulveda, the sixteenth-century theologian, who argued in his debate with Bartholomew de las Casas, that Indians

were “natural slaves” and, therefore, justifiably enslavable. She also investigates the writings of Edward Long, the eighteenth-century Jamaican planter/historian who argued that Blacks were culturally inferior and enslavable. Despite a two-century difference between Sepulveda and Long’s writings, Wynter concludes that the significance of the European discourse was a binary opposition between Native (Indian and Black) and White.<sup>32</sup> Wynter notes, “[T]he perception of the Indian, black, native as inherently inferior plays a central role in the concrete determination of the value of ‘inferior’ men, and of their ‘inferior’ labor power.”<sup>33</sup> Wynter insists that Europe’s economic domination was based on a mode of cultural domination. Therefore, she believes that Black cultural resistance predominated over an organized working class resistance, because cultural marginalization was the justification of economic exploitation. The African diaspora wanted to regain their humanity, of which labor was just one component.

Wynter subsequently uses the next several chapters to analyze formulations of Black cultural resistance, such as Jonkunnu, the ring shout, and syncretic Black Christianity.<sup>34</sup> She asserts that Blacks’ “cultural response to the dehumanizing alienation of the capitalist plantation system . . . was to reroot himself, making use of the old cultural patterns which had undergone a true sea-change [the Middle Passage], in order to create the new vocabulary of the new existence.”<sup>35</sup> Here Wynter counters the central premises of Liberalism and Marxism. Liberalism contained the almost-universal scholarly belief that Blacks had no culture and African traditions were lost during the Middle Passage. Her research on African traditions in Jamaica, which uses Melville Herskovits and Jean Price-Mars’ scholarship on African cultural retentions, provides an alternative perspective to the dominant Liberal interpretation popularized by Gunnar Myrdal’s *An American Dilemma* (1942) and *The Moynihan Report* (1963) that New World Blacks lost of their African culture during slavery, forcing them to unsuccessfully mimic White culture.<sup>36</sup> Next, she argues against the orthodox Marxist premise that religion and cultural expression was the “opium of the people,” which led to false consciousness, or a consciousness that was not rooted in the economic structures of society. Wynter argues against Marxism’s privileging of proletarian consciousness. Instead of false consciousness, Wynter views the cultural resistance in the Caribbean and the United States, as an alternative consciousness resistant against the “economic orthodoxy” of the plantation.<sup>37</sup>

Wynter insists that European intellectual discourses on Black inferiority together with Blacks’ retention of African traditions and culture created a situation where the oppression and resistance reinforced notions of Black inferiority and ultimately de-

valued Black labor.<sup>38</sup> Wynter, at this point, has contributed a major revision to orthodox Marxism. In this reformulated Marxist theory, Wynter still ascribes consciousness to economic production. However, she sees the privileging of economic production, as the reason Marxist theory could not conceptualize Black cultural resistance. From Wynter’s perspective, the dominant notions of cultural value established by European and American scholarship and intellectuals formed the superstructure and thus determining economic value. This premise functioned as an inverse of the Marxist axiom – one’s position in relation to capital determined consciousness. She asserted later that alienation and Black devaluation “take place on the superstructural level and it is also this superstructural level that maintains in being the relations of production which, defining him [the Black] as lesser man, ideologically justify his super exploitation both as labor power and consumer.” Despite the challenge to the traditional Marxist interpretation, she uncomfortably held to its explanatory power because she was operating within the horizons of the Marxist paradigm. The anomalies her analysis of culture produced were at some level resolved, because the paradigm had predetermined the problem. In this case, the problem that she was trying to solve was the source of labor exploitation.<sup>39</sup>

The second half of the manuscript overhauls Marxism and presents an early example of Wynter’s Theory of the Human. The transition between the first and second manuscript sections puts Wynter in the vein of the Black Radical Tradition. Political theorist, Cedric J. Robinson’s *Black Marxism* points out, Marxism served as a “staging area” for many Black intellectuals’ development toward the Black Radical Tradition. Diasporic intellectuals’ racial (and gender) experiences exposed the theoretical and ideological weaknesses of Marxism. Wynter’s experiences in the Caribbean and the United States caused her move toward the radical tradition that Robinson identifies. This tradition incorporates precepts of Marxism, but sought to exceed it. The Black radical tradition, although starting with a critique of capitalism emanating from Marxism recognizes that production was the not the organizing principle of society, rather race and racial ideology are the mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion. Here Robinson’s insights need be quoted at length:

The Black radical tradition that they [Black intellectuals] were to rediscover from a Black historical experience nearly grounded under the intellectual weight and authority of the official European version of the past, was to be the very foundation upon which they stood. From this vantage point they could survey the theoret-

ical, ideological, and political instrumentation with which Western radicalism approached the problem of revolutionary social change. The Black radical tradition cast doubt on the extent to which capitalism penetrated and re-formed social life and on its ability to create entirely new categories of human experience stripped bare of the historical consciousness embedded in culture. . . . [T]he Black radical tradition forced them to reevaluate the nature and historical roles of ideology and consciousness. . . . [T]he Black radical tradition had defined the terms of . . . destruction [for colonialism and neo-colonialism]: the continuing development of a collective consciousness informed by the historical struggles for liberation and motivated by a shared sense of obligation to preserve the collective being, the ontological totality.<sup>40</sup>

For Robinson, Black radicalism was based not in Western analysis, Liberalism or Marxism. Black radicalism emerged from a "collective consciousness" and the "ontological totality." Black radicalism was an assertion of Black humanity with destruction of the culture that preserved notions of Black inhumanity. Wynter's analysis arrives at similar conclusions. Wynter demonstrates a move toward the Black Radical Tradition in a single manuscript. In the second half of her document, she revises her earlier position and arrives at an intellectual position beyond Liberalism, Nationalism, and Marxism – the Theory of the Human.

Sylvia Wynter alters her argument after considering the effects of the Black Freedom Struggle. In a moment of rare intellectual honesty, Wynter realizes that her argument at the beginning of the monograph, despite its attempts to reinterpret the importance of Black culture, still reinforces a Marxist framework that marginalizes Blacks and their cultural production. She writes,

I would like at this point to contradict an earlier formulation. At the beginning of the monograph, I defined the Sambo stereotype as the mechanism by which more surplus value could be extracted from the relatively devalued labor. . . . I would tend now, however, to see [the] Sambo stereotype as a mechanism which is far more central to capitalism's functioning as a mode of domination. That is, I would see its function in extracting surplus value as secondary to its function of permitting a mode of domination to be generalized at all levels of the system. . . . I had accepted the Marxian division between the infrastructure - the economic posited as base, and the super structure defined as a separate level of culture. . . . I had therefore accepted the theory

that the economic tended to determine the 'superstructure.' This theoretical position carried on the marginalization of the cultural by the economic which is perhaps capitalism's central strategy of domination. Marxism too continues this marginalization of the cultural by the economic because of the implication of what I shall call the factory model of exploitation.<sup>41</sup>

Wynter's new position recognizes that Marxist theory could not account for the distinctive and non-reducible realities of the Black experience even in areas where the parallels between the proletariat and Black community were clear. In moving beyond the economic prescriptions of both Liberal capitalism and Marxism, Wynter posits the cultural realm or the symbolic structures, and its creation of a structural law of value, as the location for analysis. By focusing on culture, Wynter lays the groundwork for her current Theory of the Human.<sup>42</sup>

Wynter describes economic exploitation as just the present form of devaluation, and it was the cultural narratives central problem. Western culture implements, according to Wynter, a Single Cultural Norm that organized society. She argued, "The imposition of the great Single Norm of being and of Culture has been the Central strategy of the bourgeois ruling consciousness." Moreover, the Single Norm's precepts socialize entire societies according to identities of Self (norm) and Other (non-norm). Wynter also argues that it was the Black/White identities, rather than class identities, that are the "central inscriptions and divisions" that generate all other hierarchies within the present episteme. Black skin, in her analysis, serves as the zero reference point in the Western social system, because the cultural representation of Blacks function as the ultimate non-norm. The modes of socialization instituted by the dominant intellectual classes of the eighteenth and nineteenth century established and reinforced this hierarchy. The importance of Black culture is that it challenged this hierarchy and often proposes an alternative, more democratic social system.<sup>43</sup>

After turning Marxism on its head, she contends Black America needs a liberatory theory developed from the Black experience. This theory would "incorporate some liberal and Marxist insights, negate others and go beyond them both." Wynter suggests, "It is only out of the theoretical insights gained from the perspective of the black experience that a theory of revolutionary transformation adequate to deal with the complexity of the American experience can emerge."<sup>44</sup> The sixties led Wynter to this conclusion. She believes the 1960s were a "revolt against the inscription of the code of exploitation" or the cultural narratives of race. For Wynter, the decade was the "first opening towards a social transformation centered about the representation of Amer-

ican, as distinct of the White American – national identity.”<sup>45</sup> Black Nationalism of the 1960s and 1970s symbolized the challenge to American identity. Wynter, who to this point is critical of Liberalism and Marxism, also examines the strengths and intellectual inertia of Black Nationalism.

She sees Black Nationalism as a “powerful *internal critique*” of the ruling consciousness. However, this evaluation simply inverts the Single norm, as it is “tempted in its turn to posit itself ... as the place of the New Norm, as the New Single Universal.”<sup>46</sup> The inability of Nationalist and Marxist movements to move beyond the Single Norm, led to Wynter’s concern with, “the new piles of wreckage.”<sup>47</sup> As Nationalist and Marxist based movements challenged Liberalism, they often created new hierarchies that led to new atrocities under the guise of neo-colonialism. Moreover, in her estimation, the inability to move beyond inverting the single norm was the “incomplete victory” of the 1960s. Although Black Nationalism and Marxism criticized the liberal social hierarchy, at the same time these ideologies reconstituted the very notion of a single normative idea, thus replicating the process of hierarchical inferiority. In essence, Wynter suggests that Nationalism and Marxism invert yet do not transcend the social order.

The evidence of the power and weakness of the social critiques of Marxism and Nationalism was the identity politics of the 1970s. Wynter recognized that a variety of “minority” groups articulated challenges to the liberal social order. However, these challengers each conceived of themselves as normative. “The central insight of all these (workers, farmers, Black, women, etc.) movements,” according to Wynter is “that capitalism functions as a mode of domination in which the experience both of dominator and dominated is generalized; in which the large majority of people are both exploiter and the victims.”<sup>48</sup> The dual experiences, as exploiter and victim, point toward the hierarchical nature of domination, meaning that some populations endured more than others. Wynter argues that this hierarchy was the central reason for the difficulty these disparate movements had in unifying during the 1970s and how the Black lower classes remain the most wretched social group in the Western social order. Wynter’s theory of culture, the analysis of the intellectually and narratively created structural law of value identified the often-invisible hierarchy at play in the framework of equality.

In the 1960s and 1970s African Americans, women, Chicanos, Native Americans and other marginalized groups contested the American social order, often separately. These marginalized groups competed for limited governmental resources, thereby lim-

iting cooperation. Despite the disparate challenges, most protests groups in the seventies had a common role model - the civil rights movement. The movement, especially before 1965, applied the discourse of equality, demanding that the United States live up to its democratic and equality creeds. So as other populations vied for their piece of the American pie, they too replicated the call for equality. Wynter analyzes these challenges to the social order in the second half of the manuscript, arguing the lack of unity occurred in the various social movements of the 1970s because the populations were too focused on equality, rather than on the “transformation of cultural values of the social order.”<sup>49</sup> For Wynter, the movements accepted the fiction of equivalence, because the movements did not focus on cultural analysis.

Wynter, continuing the second half of the manuscript, maintains that a cultural Norm relied on the presence of a Non-norm, or Conceptual Other, (she would later state this as the difference between “man” and Human.) This connection by its very nature depended upon inequality. Therefore, the ability for the normative position to socialize the public, through the control of ideas, created and maintained the relationship between Self and Other – Norm and Non-Norm. For Wynter, the foundational character of this relation is more important than the empirical categories themselves. “It is not that the variable of *white* is more important than the variable of *male*, but rather that *White/Black* oppositions is the symbolic structuring division which then exists as the condition of possibility of all other in the American reality.”<sup>50</sup> Moreover, similar Self/Other opposition functions in hierarchical fashion from the most privileged Norm to most deviant, which allows most people to be both “exploiters and victims.” The fiction of equivalence in the post-1960s obscured this sliding hierarchy or ranking rule, according to Wynter. The struggle for equivalence was (and is) a central component of the modern project of socialization. Wynter avers, “It is clear that the *concept of equality* itself constitutes the cement of a social order which depends on the *production of inequality* which alone can ‘think’ and actualize the opposed term of equality.”<sup>51</sup> Moreover, the production of inequality based on the sliding hierarchical scale of norm and deviant was central to the coherence of the egalitarian ideology embedded in the American culture. Despite the language of egalitarianism that permeated the protest movements of the 1960s and 1970s, it was the lack of equivalence that produced the struggle for integration, equal pay, and equal rights by Blacks, workers, and women. She argues that true equivalence is impossible without creating a new cultural paradigm from which identity is generalized. Wynter will later postulate the Theory of the Human as a basis for paradigmatic change.<sup>52</sup>



The civil rights movement challenged the Black/White racial paradigm, but rather than creating a new cultural system, Wynter describes how intellectuals adjusted the racial order to keep significant portions of the racial hierarchy or paradigm. The Black Freedom Struggle's destruction of Jim Crow, seemingly, guaranteed equality and eliminated the political ideology that had established White Anglo Saxon Protestant (WASP) males as the social and cultural norm. Wynter explains that the decline of WASP identity as the Norm was replaced by an immigrant paradigm that recreated the racial hierarchy, now with immigrant Whites constituted as Norm in a reorganized Whiteness.<sup>53</sup>

This new liberal archetype continued the fiction of equality during the 1970s. More important, a host of scholars legitimated this model with research that contained and controlled the implications of the civil rights revolution in the 1960s and 1970s. This scholarship compared Blacks unfavorably to other "minorities," thereby reestablishing the sliding racial hierarchy. For example, Nathan Glazer and Daniel Patrick Moynihan, although only discussing New York City, declared that the melting pot did not occur. They argued, "Ethnic identity is an element in all equations."<sup>54</sup> Glazer would later assert that scholars and intellectuals who invoked the uniqueness of the Black experience (an implicit jab at Black Power advocates) took a "pessimistic view of American society." Alternatively, Glazer deemed "the ways in which the relatively successful integration of white ethnic groups is being duplicated for nonwhite groups" was the optimistic view. According to Glazer, scholars and activists who promoted the uniqueness of the Black experience may divide the country, "to the disadvantage of all groups."<sup>55</sup> In making the experiences of European immigrants analogous with African and American Indian descendant populations, Glazer, Moynihan, and others normalized the experiences of White immigrants as those of all Americans. This argument subtly begins to shift American identity from a White Anglo-Saxon Protestant norm towards an "immigrant" model that homogenizes "minority issues" and erases the history of European immigrants as both victims to WASP identity and victimizers towards Blacks. Sylvia Wynter identified this shift and its intellectual flaws, describing it as a Counterreformation of Liberalism that limited Black aspirations.

Wynter contends that Glazer, Moynihan, and others' research reduced the Black struggle to the "minority code," equating Blacks with women, Asians, Chicanos, et. al. She notes that when Blacks failed to embody this new "ethnic norm," they became the definitive deviant population, a status once held by all Blacks but in the 1970s and beyond increasingly carried by the Black lower classes. Under the rubric of the immi-

grant model, Wynter identifies policies like affirmative action that justified replacing Blacks with middle class white women and other immigrant minorities, "in good conscience." In addition, the Black lower class' social, economic, and political problems were outside the realm of discussion as intellectuals declared this population as pathological. The minority paradigm and its language of equivalency also functioned to conceal structural racism.<sup>56</sup> Wynter suggests that this concealment is deliberate, as the minority codes institutes a new Norm of "ethnic success," which is "then used as the norm against which the inherent failure of the deviant Black is measured." However, liberalism's reliance on the immigrant model, with a discourse of ethnicity, allowed partial Black incorporation. The model was essential in allowing the marginal incorporation of the Black middle class, which siphoned off the most articulate spokespersons for the race. Wynter asserts that "ethnicity ... is a strategy which socially incorporates a new stratum at the same time as it legitimates the social marginalization of the majority on the basis of their lack of skills and/or intellectual genetic endowment."<sup>57</sup> This incorporation left the Black lower classes voiceless in the political sphere, what one scholar calls the "dirty little secret" of Black politics.<sup>58</sup> As a result, the Black lower classes, like generations before them, turned to cultural resistance, this time it was hip-hop whose origins begin in the late 1970s.<sup>59</sup> To control lower class populations, Blacks and others, Wynter asserts the logical conclusion for the state was the prison system, anticipating the prison industrial complex that entrapped millions of Blacks and Browns in the United States in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. Moreover, the immigrant paradigm's logic, serves as the principle behind claims of reverse discrimination (increasingly brought forth by other minorities against programs aimed at Blacks), yet the immigrant paradigm failed to comprehend the systemic nature of Black exploitation.<sup>60</sup>

A study of the monograph *Black Metamorphosis*, presents a revision to Paget Henry's argument that Wynter's work postulates that epistemic transformation trumps economic transformation. Rather than epistemic change trumping financial change, the manuscript suggested economic transformation depended on epistemic change. *Black Metamorphosis* proposes a subtle but importance difference, because Henry seems to intimate that Wynter was less concerned with transforming the economy. The manuscript demonstrates a profound concern with economic improvement, but a realization that it begins with the concept of being Human. Wynter foresaw that the weaknesses and the results of social movements of the 1960s and 1970s were only partially clear in the 1970s. She identified that the weakness of the civil rights movement was its reliance on equality and integration because those concepts were "based

on attempts to make the non-norms – equal to norms. Which is impossible since it is inequality that defines them.”<sup>61</sup>

Although a reconstituted racial liberalism as the immigrant code occupies a majority of Wynter's attention in the text, she still analyzes Nationalism and Marxism that were resonant in the 1970s. These were advocates of Black Power and Marxism who sought to institute new social orders. The leading oppositional movement to Liberalism - Black Power - occurred primarily through the ideology of nationalism. Black Cultural Nationalism organized people based on a direct attack on the dominant discourse of Black inferiority. Wynter explains that the weakness of cultural nationalism is that it inverted the symbolic order, it identified the WASP cultural perspective that pervaded both segregation and civil rights, but it inverted the norm – creating an Afro-Man as Norm – rather than deconstructing the cultural code. Moreover, cultural nationalism functions successfully within the developing minority code. Finally, Marxism subsumes the Black experience under a proletariat code, and echoing cultural nationalism, creating Working –Man as norm. She identifies, using Paget Henry's term, the “discursive authoritarianism” of the social movements involving both Nationalism and Marxism.<sup>62</sup>

### Conclusion

Wynter's monograph *Black Metamorphosis: New Natives in a New World* argues that, “the originality of the social movements of the 60s lay precisely in the surfacing of the submerged latent popular model of pluralism that exists within American reality – a mode of pluralism that carries with it the imperative of social and political decentralization and of direct group participation in their ‘own’ socialization.”<sup>63</sup> The manuscript reveals Wynter's shift from reformed Marxist to a focus on cultural narratives that justify and explain inequality. The unpublished manuscript served as a prelude for Wynter's Theory of the Human. The document suggests that her move to the United States exposed her to the extreme negation of Blackness. From this liminal perspective, Wynter could “see” limits of her previous thinking about culture and outline a framework for transcultural thinking. This shift and Black Metamorphosis marks the fulcrum between Wynter's early essays and her later Theory of the Human. As Wynter wrote, “There can be no revolutionary praxis without revolutionary counter-representation.”<sup>64</sup>

### Notes:

- <sup>1</sup>Sylvia Wynter, “We Know Where We Are Coming From: The Politics of Black Culture from Myal to Marley,” 1977. This unpublished essay was found by Anthony Bogues at the C. L. R. James archives at the Oilfield Workers Trade Union in San Fernando. I want to thank Bogues for allowing me to see the quotes and essay. Anthony Bogues, “The Human, Knowledge and the Word: Reflecting on Sylvia Wynter,” in *After Man, Toward the Human: Critical Essays on Sylvia Wynter*, ed. Anthony Bogues (Kingston: Ian Randle, 2006), 337, note 19.
- <sup>2</sup>David Scott, “The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter,” *Small Axe* 8 (2000): 119-209. Paget Henry, *Caliban's Reason: Introducing Afro-Caribbean Philosophy* (New York: Routledge, 2000), 117-43. *Journal of West Indian Literature*, vol. 10, nos. 1 & 2: (November 2001). Anthony Bogues, ed., *After Man, Towards the Human: Critical Essays on Sylvia Wynter* (Kingston, Jamaica: Ian Randle, 2006). Greg Thomas and Sylvia Wynter, “Proud Flesh Interview: Sylvia Wynter,” *Proud Flesh: A New Afrikan Journal of Culture, Politics, and Consciousness*. <http://www.proudfleshjournal.com/issue4/wynter.html> - Accessed September 17, 2008.
- <sup>3</sup>Henry, *Caliban's Reason*, 118.
- <sup>4</sup>Norval Edwards, “‘Talking About a Little Culture’: Sylvia Wynter's Early Essays,” *Journal of West Indian Literature* 10, no. Nos. 1 & 2 (2001): 12-39. An important exception is Jason E. Glenn, “A Second Failed Reconstruction? The Counter Reformation of African American Studies, a Treason on Black Studies,” *Journal of West Indian Literature* 10, no. Nos. 1 & 2 (2001): 119-71.
- <sup>5</sup>Demetrius L. Eudell and Carolyn Allen, “Sylvia Wynter: A Transculturist Rethinking Modernity,” *Journal of West Indian Literature* 10, no. Nos. 1 & 2 (2001): 7. Sylvia Wynter, “A Black Studies Manifesto,” *Forum N. H. I.: Knowledge for the 21st Century* 1, no. 1 (1994): 3-11.
- <sup>6</sup>Sylvia Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis: New Natives in a New World*, unpublished manuscript, 12. IBW Papers, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, New York, Box (Sylvia Wynter). The IBW Papers are unprocessed at this point and will be referred to as IBW Papers hence forth.
- <sup>7</sup>Institute of the Black World, *Inside the Black World (Monthly Report)*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (April 1971). “15 February 1971 Letter from Sylvia Wynter,” IBW Papers. “5 January 1979 Letter,” Black Economic Research Papers, Box 29, Folder 3. David Scott, “The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter,” 119-209.
- <sup>8</sup>“15 February 1971 Letter from Sylvia Wynter,” IBW Papers.
- <sup>9</sup>Derrick E. White, “‘Liberated Grounds’: The Institute of the Black World and Black Intellectual Space,” in *‘We Shall Independent Be’: African American Place Making and the Struggle to Claim Space in the United States*, ed. Angel David Nieves and Leslie M. Alexander (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2008), 167-184. Stephen Ward, “‘Scholarship in the Context of Struggle’: Activist Intellectuals, the Institute of the Black World (IBW), and the Contours of Black Power Radicalism,” *Black Scholar* 31, no. 3/4 (2001): 42-53. Robert A. Hill, “Preface: The C.L.R. James Lectures,” in *Small Axe: A Caribbean Journal of Criticism* (Indiana University Press, 2000), 61-64. C.L.R. James, “Lectures on The Black Jacobins,” in *Small Axe: A Caribbean Journal of Criticism* (Indiana University Press, 2000), 65-112. Norman Girvan, *Aspects of the Political Economy of Race in the Caribbean and the Americas: A Preliminary Interpretation* (Atlanta, Ga.: Institute of the Black World, 1975). Walter Rodney, *Walter Rodney Speaks: Making of An African Intellectual*, ed. Robert Hill (Trenton: Third World Press, 1990).
- <sup>10</sup>Eudell and Allen, “Sylvia Wynter: A Transculturist Rethinking Modernity,” 1-7. Institute of the Black World, *Inside the Black World (Monthly Report)*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (April 1971). “15 February

- 1971 Letter from Sylvia Wynter," IBW Papers, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, New York, NY. "5 January 1979 Letter," Black Economic Research Papers, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, box 29, folder 3. 18 October 1973 Letter from Wynter to Vincent Harding, Vincent Harding Papers Box 17, Folder 5. Donald Stokes, "Sylvia Wynter Crosses Boundaries to Find Science of Human Systems," *Stanford Campus Report*, October 23, 1985, 5, 16.
- <sup>11</sup> Scott, "The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter," 173. Emphasis in original.
- <sup>12</sup> "18 October 1973 Letter from Wynter to Vincent Harding,"
- <sup>13</sup> Thomas Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* 3rd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1962, 1996), 37.
- <sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 78.
- <sup>15</sup> Sylvia Wynter, "On How We Mistook the Map for the Territory, and Re-Imprisoned Ourselves in Our Unbearable Wrongness of Being, of *Désêtre*: Black Studies Toward the Human Project," in *Not Only the Master's Tools: African-American Studies in Theory and Practice*, ed. Lewis R. Gordon and Jane Anna Gordon (Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, 2005), 122-124.
- <sup>16</sup> Mikhail Epstein, "Postcommunist Postmodernism: An Interview," *Common Knowledge* 2, no. 3 (1993). Quoted in Sylvia Wynter, "Unsettling the Coloniality of Being/Power/Truth/Freedom: Towards the Human, After Man, Its Overrepresentation - An Argument," *New Centennial Review* 3, no. 3 (2003): 286.
- <sup>17</sup> Sylvia Wynter, "The Pope Must Have Been Drunk, The King of Castile a Madman: Culture as Actuality, and the Caribbean Rethinking of Modernity," in *The Reordering of Culture: Latin America, the Caribbean and Canada in the Hood*, ed. Alvina Ruprecht and Cecilia Taina (Canada: Carleton University Press, 1995), 20-21.
- <sup>18</sup> Sylvia Wynter, "Columbus, the Ocean Blue, and Fables That Stir the Mind: To Reinvent the Study of Letters," in *Poetics of the Americas: Race, Founding, and Textuality*, ed. Bainard Cowan and Jefferson Humphries (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1997), 157. Emphasis in original.
- <sup>19</sup> Sylvia Wynter, "Towards the Sociogenic Principle: Fanon, The Puzzle of Conscious Experience, of 'Identity' and What it's Like to be 'Black'," in *National Identity and Sociopolitical Change: Latin America Between Marginalization and Integration*, ed. Mercedes and Antonio Gómez-Moriana Durán-Cogan (New York: Routledge Press, 2001).
- <sup>20</sup> Sylvia Wynter, "The Ceremony Must be Found: After Humanism," *boundary 2* 12, no. 3 (1984): 39. Emphasis in original.
- <sup>21</sup> Wynter, "Columbus, the Ocean Blue, and Fables That Stir the Mind: To Reinvent the Study of Letters," 162.
- <sup>22</sup> For an example Wynter's argument in full detail see: Wynter, "The Ceremony Must be Found: After Humanism," 19-70. "Unsettling the Coloniality of Being/Power/Truth/Freedom: Towards the Human, after Man, Its Overrepresentation - an Argument," 257-337.
- <sup>23</sup> Sylvia Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis: New Natives in a New World*, 12, 107, 220.
- <sup>24</sup> Norval Edwards, "'Talking About a Little Culture': Sylvia Wynter's Early Essays," 12-38.
- <sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*: 22.
- <sup>26</sup> Frantz Fanon, *Black Skin/White Masks* (New York, NY: Grove Press, 1967). Scott, "The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter," 127-32. Sylvia Wynter, *The Hills of Hebron* (Harlow, Essex: Longman, 1984). Anne Walmsley, *The Caribbean Artists Movement, 1966-1972* (London: New Beacon, 1992). Shirley Toland-Dix, "The Hills of Hebron: Sylvia Wynter's Disruption of the Narrative of the Nation," *Small Axe* 25, no. February 2008 (2008): 58.
- <sup>27</sup> Stephen G. Rabe, *U. S. Intervention in British Guiana: A Cold War Story* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2005).
- <sup>28</sup> Scott, "The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter," 141.
- <sup>29</sup> Donald Stokes, "Sylvia Wynter Crosses Boundaries to Find Science of Human Systems,"
- <sup>30</sup> Scott, "The Re-Enchantment of Humanism: An Interview with Sylvia Wynter," 140-43.
- <sup>31</sup> Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis*, 12.
- <sup>32</sup> For Sepúlveda - Las Casas debate see Anthony Pagden, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1982). Also see, Edward Long, *The History of Jamaica; or General Survey of the Ancient and Modern State of the Island: With Reflections on Its Situations, Settlements, Inhabitants, Climate, Products, Commerce, Laws, and Government*. (London, UK: E. Cass, 1774, 1970).
- <sup>33</sup> Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis*, 13.
- <sup>34</sup> Jonkunnu, or John Canoe was a cultural festival in Jamaica. The festival incorporated characteristics of African traditions, such as the Yam Festival of the Ashanti and its use of masks and dance as conceived by the Yoruba. See Sylvia Wynter, "Jonkunnu in Jamaica: Towards the Interpretations of Folk Dance as a Cultural Process," *Jamaica Journal* 4, no. 2 (1970): 34-48. The ring shout was a counter-clockwise dance ceremony with its origins in West African burial ceremonies. Historian Sterling Stuckey uses the ring shout as a metaphor for the creation of New World Blacks from the disparate West African ethnic communities. See Sterling Stuckey, *Slave Culture: Nationalist Theory and the Foundations of Black America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 3-97.
- <sup>35</sup> Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis*, 18. Emphasis in original.
- <sup>36</sup> Herskovits argued against the belief that the Middle Passage destroyed all traces of African identity and culture, especially as articulated by sociologist E. Franklin Frazier. Melville Herskovits, *The Myth of the Negro Past* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1941). Jean Price-Mars re-vindicated African culture in Haiti that had been devalued with the economic and political dominance of the mulatto class in Haiti. His work strongly influenced Aimé Césaire and Leopold Senghor in the articulation of Negritude. See Jacques Antoine, *Jean Price-Mars and Haiti* (Washington: Three Continents Press, 1981).
- <sup>37</sup> Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis*, 9, 53, 63, 78.
- <sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 220.
- <sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, 220.
- <sup>40</sup> Cedric J. Robinson, *Black Marxism: The Making of the Black Radical Tradition* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000, 1983), 170-71.
- <sup>41</sup> Wynter, *Black Metamorphosis*, 429 - 430.
- <sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*, 562.
- <sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 435, 465 - 492, 585.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., 583-584.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., 726.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid., 746.

<sup>47</sup> Henry, *Caliban's Reason*, 124.

<sup>48</sup> *Black Metamorphosis*, 583 – 584, 625, 667 – 670.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., 635.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 635. Emphasis in original.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid., 788. Emphasis in original.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 647.

<sup>53</sup> Ira Katznelson, *When Affirmative Action Was White: An Untold History of Racial Inequality in Twentieth-Century America* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2005). David R. Roediger, *The Wages of Whiteness: Race and the Making of the American Working Class* (London, UK: Verso, 1991).

<sup>54</sup> Nathan Glazer and Daniel Patrick Moynihan, *Beyond the Melting Pot: The Negroes, Puerto Ricans, Jews, Italians, and Irish of New York City*, (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press & Harvard University Press, 1963), 6.

<sup>55</sup> Nathan Glazer, "Blacks and Ethnic Groups: The Difference, and the Political Differences It Makes," *Key Issues in the Afro-American Experience*, eds. Nathan I. Huggins, Martin Kilson, & Daniel M. Fox, (New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc., 1971), 198-199, 211.

<sup>56</sup> Eduardo Bonilla-Silva, *Racism Without Racists: Color-Blind Racism and the Persistence of Racial Inequality in the United States* (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003).

<sup>57</sup> *Black Metamorphosis*, 671, 683, 723, 902, 906.

<sup>58</sup> J. Phillip Thompson, *Double Trouble: Black Mayors, Black Communities, and the Call for a Deep Democracy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 39 -74.

<sup>59</sup> Tricia Rose, *Black Noise: Rap Music and Black Culture in Contemporary America* (Middleton, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1994).

<sup>60</sup> Ibid., 804, 829. Bonilla-Silva, *Racism Without Racists*.

<sup>61</sup> Ibid., 824.

<sup>62</sup> Paget Henry, *Caliban's Reason*, 123.

<sup>63</sup> *Black Metamorphosis*. 858.

<sup>64</sup> Ibid., 917.

"The Erotics of 'Under/Development' in Walter Rodney: On Sexual or Body Politics and Political Economics – for 'Guerilla Intellectualism'"

Greg Thomas

*For centuries, the dominant event of modern history has been the slave trade. Its repercussions, racism and colonization, have been decisive elements in the tragic destiny of African people. Colonization and economic exploitation have remained the driving force of imperial domination, threatening the colonized with the gravest danger to life and health, to their culture and their faith and even to their bio-physical equilibrium.*

— Acklyn Lynch, *Nightmare Overhanging Darkly* (1992)

Worldwide, Walter Rodney may be known best for his seminal work on "development" and "underdevelopment." Out of a corpus consisting of countless essays and articles, speeches and pamphlets, and several other books ranging from *A History of the Upper Guinea Coast, 1545-1800* (1970) or *The Groundings with My Brothers* (1969) to *A History of the Guyanese Working People* (1981), it is *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa* (1972) that is often read as Rodney's "classic" text by Pan-African audiences in and outside of academia. After all, armed with a most profound purpose, its preface concludes on the following note: "The purpose has been to try and reach Africans who wish to explore further the nature of their exploitation, rather than to satisfy the 'standards' set by our oppressors and their spokesman in the academic world" (Rodney 1982, viii). This is the same preface that rewrites the conventional intellectual preface, "classically," as well: "Many colleagues and comrades shared in the preparation of this work.... But, contrary to the fashion in most prefaces, I will not add that 'all mistakes and shortcomings are entirely my responsibility.' That is sheer bourgeois subjectivism" (vii). That school of thought is dispensed with by the whole of *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*, which may be considered merely one of Rodney's "classic" texts and which is surely not his only set of reflections on the subject of "underdevelopment" and "development," by any stretch.

Hence, in "Slavery and Underdevelopment" (1979), Rodney states that the premise of this paper is that underdevelopment constitutes a central part of the development of capitalism on a global scale (276), or even a ("dependent and asymmetrical") form of development itself (282). In tune with *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa's* discus-

## THE CLR JAMES JOURNAL:

A Publication of the Caribbean Philosophical Association

Volume 16 • Number 1 • Spring 2010

Copyright © 2007 The Caribbean Philosophical Association

Editorial Collective: Anthony Bogues, Paul Buhle, William Cain, Selwyn R. Cudjoe, Madhu Dubey, Judy Fagan, Lewis R. Gordon, Obika Gray, Paget Henry, Winston James, Scot McLemee, Bernard Moitt, Nancy DuVergne Smith, and Margaret Thompson, Matthew Quest.

Paget Henry, Editor

The Caribbean Philosophical Association was launched at the University of the West Indies (Jamaica) on June 14<sup>th</sup>, 2002 at a conference celebrating the thought of Sylvia Wynter. The CLR James Society, founded in 1989, exists to promote the work of James, to act as a clearinghouse of information about James, and to demonstrate the many dimensions of his scholarship. *The CLR James Journal*, although a part of this commitment to James' scholarship has had a broader focus. It opened to the wider field of Caribbean ideas to which James was a major contributor. The Caribbean Philosophical Association shares the broader focus of the *CLR James Journal* of examining and contributing to the ideas informing Caribbean life. In June 2005, the CLR James Society became a body of the Caribbean Philosophical Association. As a result, the *CLR James Journal* has become the official journal of the Association.

Manuscripts: Critical articles, book reviews, and bibliographic studies about the work and life of major Caribbean figures such as Blyden, Garvey, James, Fanon, Walcott, Kincaid and others are welcome as are letters to the editorial collective. Articles should be no longer than 35 pages double spaced and conform to the MLA Style Sheet. Submit texts to the Editor, Paget Henry, Dept. Africana Studies Department, Box 1904, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912.

No portion of *The CLR James Journal* may be reproduced for commercial purposes without permission of the editorial collective.

Cover art: Photograph by Barry Ferguson of Errol Lloyd's bronze bust of C.L.R. James.

Production layout and design by Graphic Services  
(Graphic Services, Brown University)

## Table of Contents

Editor's Note .....1

## Philosophy, Phenomenology and Music

The Body in the Phenomenologies of  
Kojima and Aurobindo  
Marina Paola Banchetti-Robino .....5

Changing the Subject: Making Democracy  
Through Making Music  
Tracey Nicholls .....17

## CLR James in Brazil, Trinidad and the U.S.

CLR James and the Rise of Solidarity Economy in Brazil  
Ana Margarida Esteves .....37

Beyond Blackness: CLR James the Working Class Messiah  
Jerome Teelucksingh .....67

CLR James and the Global Community of Activists  
Paul Buhle .....83

## Literature, History and Politics

Nostalgie D'Amour: A Migratory Childhood  
Myriam J.A. Chancy .....92

Littoralia or the Littoral as Trope: Developing a  
Paradigm of "Post-coloniality"  
Karima Jeffrey .....99

Black Metamorphosis: A Prelude to Sylvia Wynter's  
Theory of the Human  
Derrick White .....127