R ERI ERIA Т ΑT ER IAL МАТ Ε R Ι ΑL Ι Ι ММАТ Ε R ΑL IS ΙΜΜΑΤ R IAL Ε ISM Ι ALIS I ММАТ E R Μ Ε R Ι ΑL S Ι М ΜA Т Ι Μ ΑL Ι М Μ ΑT Е R Ι Ι S Μ Α Ι A L Ι Ε R S Ι Μ Μ Τ M М Т ER Ι Α L Ι S Ι Μ Α Μ Ι Μ Т Е R Α L Ι S Ι Μ Α Μ Е R L Ι S Ι Μ Α Т Ι Α М Μ Ι Μ Μ Α Т Ε R Ι Α L Ι S Μ ΑT Ε R Ι ΑL Ι Τ Μ Μ S Μ Ι М МАТ ERI ΑL I S Μ Ι ММАТ ΕR Ι ΑL Ι S Μ ΙΜΜΑΤ Ε R Ι ΑLΙ SM ММАТ ΕR Ι ΑL Ι S ΕRΙ МАТ ΑL Τ АТ ERI ΑL TERIA ERI R

## VILÉM FLUSSER

METATEXT

## IMMATERIALISM

VILÉM FLUSSER

METAFLUX

FIRST PUBLISHED IN PORTUGUESE AS AN ARTICLE IN THE BOLETIM DA SOCIEDADE BRASILEIRA DE HISTÓRIA DA CIÊNCIA, 1987 THIS IS THE AUTHOR'S OWN ENGLISH VERSION. ©1987 VILÉM FLUSSER ©2015 MIGUEL GUSTAVO FLUSSER 1. PHILOSOPHY 2. POETRY 3. ART FIRST EDITION ©2015 METAFLUX PUBLISHING ART AND BOOK CONCEPT BY CHAGRIN \* THIS BOOK WAS CREATED WITH COURIER NEW PUBLISHED BY METAFLUX PUBLISHING WWW.METAFLUXPUBLISHING.COM \* DISTRIBUTED BY INGRAM CONTENT GROUP WWW.INGRAMCONTENT.COM ISBN 978-0-9933272-1-6

Μ **MSM** MSISM MSILISM MSILALISM MSILAIALISM MSTLATRTALTSM **MSTLATRERTALTSM MSILAIRETERIALISM MSTLATRETATERTALTSM MSILAIRETAMATERIALISM** MSTLATRETAMMMATERTALTSM MSILAIRETAMMIMMATERIALISM **MSILAIRETAMMMATERIALISM MSTLATRETAMATERTALTSM** MSTLATRETATERTALTSM **MSILAIRETERIALISM** MSILAIRERIALISM MSTLATRTALTSM MSTLATALTSM **MSILALISM** MSTLTSM MSISM MSM Μ

WHATISMIND?NOMATTER HATISMIND?NOMATTERW ATISMIND?NOMATTERWH ISMIND?NOMATTERWHA ISMIND?NOMATTERWHAT SMIND?NOMATTERWHATIS IND?NOMATTERWHATISMIN D?NOMATTERWHATISMIN ?NOMATTERWHATISMIND NOMATTERWHATISMIND?

WHATISMATTER?NEVERMIND HATISMATTER?NEVERMINDW ATISMATTER?NEVERMINDWH ISMATTER?NEVERMINDWHAT SMATTER?NEVERMINDWHAT SMATTER?NEVERMINDWHATIS ATTER?NEVERMINDWHATISM TER?NEVERMINDWHATISMAT ER?NEVERMINDWHATISMAT ER?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTE ?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTE ?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTER?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTER?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTER?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTER?NEVERMINDWHATISMATTER?

| <pre>\$\TWORDS MAY CHANGE THEIR</pre> | SOMETHING TO DO WITH      |
|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| MEANING. THE ONE THAT                 | THE CONCEPT »MATTER«.     |
| IS THE TITLE OF THIS                  | NOW IF ONE SUCCEEDED IN   |
| ARTICLE MAY SERVE AS AN               | DOING THIS, ONE WOULD     |
| EXAMPLE. IT USED TO MEAN              | HAVE OPENED AN ACCESS TO  |
| A PHILOSOPHICAL TENDENCY              | THE UNDERSTANDING OF THE  |
| TO DENY THE REALITY OF                | CULTURAL REVOLUTION WE    |
| MATTER (FOR INSTANCE                  | ARE WITNESSING. BECAUSE   |
| BERKELEY). IT NOW OFTEN               | »MATTER« IS OBVIOUSLY     |
| MEANS A FORM OF ART THAT              | A BASIC CONCEPT OF OUR    |
| RESULTS IN IMAGES WITHOUT             | CULTURE, AND IF IT HAS    |
| MATERIAL SUPPORT (FOR                 | SHIFTED ITS MEANING, THE  |
| INSTANCE HOLOGRAMS). BUT              | ENTIRE EDIFICE OF CULTURE |
| THERE MUST BE SOMETHING               | WILL BE SHAKEN. THIS      |
| IN COMMON TO THOSE TWO                | ARTICLE WILL EXAMINE THIS |
| MEANINGS. IF NOT, WHY USE             | SHIFT. ¶CONCEPTS MUST     |
| THE SAME WORD? IT MUST                | BE DEFINED, IF THEY ARE   |
| BE POSSIBLE TO EXTIRPATE              | TO HAVE A MEANING. THEY   |
| THAT COMMON NUCLEUS OUT               | MUST BE DISTINGUISHED     |
| FROM THOSE TWO WIDELY                 | FROM OTHER CONCEPTS. FOR  |
| DIFFERENT MEANINGS. AND               | INSTANCE: THE CONCEPT     |
| THAT NUCLEUS WILL HAVE                | »TABLE« CAN BE DEFINED    |

4 VILÉM FLUSSER

BY DISTINGUISHING IT FROM THE CONCEPT »CHAIR«. IT THEN BECOMES OPERATIVE. ONE MAY, FOR INSTANCE, CONSTRUCT A WIDER CONCEPT, NAMELY »FURNITURE«, AND HAVE IT COVER THE TWO ORIGINAL CONCEPTS. OR ONE MAY CONSTRUCT A GREY ZONE BETWEEN »TABLE« AND »CHAIR«, IN WHICH BOTH CONCEPTS APPLY, AND ONE MAY INSTALL, FOR INSTANCE, A SPECIFIC SORT OF SCHOOL FURNITURE WITHIN THAT GREY ZONE. NOW WITH THE CONCEPT »MATTER« THOSE OPERATIONS WILL NOT WORK, AND FOR A CURIOUS REASON. OUR TRADITION DEFINES »MATTER« WITH REGARD TO TWO OTHER

CONCEPTS, NAMELY »SPIRIT« AND »FORM«. BUT IT DOES SO »DIALECTICALLY«, MEANING THAT THE TWO CONCEPTS DEFINED WITH REGARD TO EACH OTHER CONTRADICT EACH OTHER. THUS, »MATTER« IS EITHER DEFINED AS »OBJECT OF SPIRIT« OR AS »CONTENTS OF FORM«, AND, INVERSELY, »SPIRIT« IS DEFINED AS **»THE SUBJECT OF MATTER«** AND »FORM« IS DEFINED AS »CONTAINER OF MATTER«. NOW SUCH NEGATIVE DEFINITIONS DO NOT PERMIT OPERATIONS. NEITHER A WIDER CONCEPT, NOR A GREY ZONE BETWEEN CONCEPTS CAN BE CONSTRUCTED. IT

MATTERRETTAM ATTERRETTAMM **TTERRETTAMMA** TERRETTAMMAT ERRETTAMMATT RRETTAMMATTE RETTAMMATTER **ETTAMMATTERR** TTAMMATTERRE TAMMATTERRET AMMATTERRETT **MMATTERRETTA** MATTERRETTAM MATTERRETTAM ATTERRETTAMM **TTERRETTAMMA** TERRETTAMMAT ERRETTAMMATT RRETTAMMATTE RETTAMMATTER ETTAMMATTERR TTAMMATTERRE TAMMATTERRET AMMATTERRETT **MMATTERRETTA** MATTERRETTAM

SPIRIT SPIRIT S PIRIT SPIRI T S P IRIT SPIR I T S P I RIT SPI RIT S P I R IT SP I R I T S P I R I T S P I R I T SPIRIT SPIRIT S P I RIT SPI R I T S PIRIT SPIRI T SPIRIT SPIRIT S PIRIT SPIRI T S P IRIT SPIR I T S P I RIT SPI R I T S P I R IT SP I R I T S P I R I T S P I R I T SPIRIT SPIRIT S P I RIT SPI R I T S PIRIT SPIRI T SPIRIT SPIRIT SPIRI T S PIRIT S P IRIT SPIR I T S P I RIT SPI R I T SPIRIT SPIRIT SPIRITSPIRIT SPIRIT SPIRIT S P I RIT SPI R I T S PIRIT SPIRI T SPIRIT SPIRIT

IS AS IF WE HAD DEFINED »TABLE« AS AN »ANTI-CHAIR« AND »CHAIR« AS AN »ANTI-TABLE«. THIS TYPE OF CLUMSY CONCEPT IS CALLED »METAPHYSICAL«. AND ALTHOUGH IT MIGHT BE ELEGANT IT IS NOT VERY USEFUL. ¶NON-WESTERN CULTURES DO NOT SEEM TO BE TROUBLED WITH THIS SORT OF METAPHYSICAL SCRUPLE, AS FAR AS THE CONCEPT »MATTER« IS CONCERNED. FOR INSTANCE, THEY QUITE HAPPILY CONSTRUCT A GREY ZONE BETWEEN »MATTER« AND »SPIRIT«, WHICH THEY FILL WITH THIN MATTER OR THICK SPIRIT OF THE TYPE »GHOST«, OR »ANGEL«, OR »ASTRAL BODY«, AND THEY

EVEN PHOTOGRAPH THOSE PHANTOMS. OF COURSE: THIS INTERMEDIATE POPULATION EXISTS IN THE WEST JUST AS WELL AS ELSEWHERE, BUT WITH US IT IS CONSIDERED EITHER AS A REMNANT OF A PRIMITIVE AND ALMOST EXTINCT RACE, OR AS ILLEGAL IMMIGRATION. BECAUSE WE, THE TRUE HEIRS TO THE ANCIENT JEWS AND GREEKS, DO NOT PERMIT ANY SPIRITUALISATION OF MATTER OR MATERIALISATION OF SPIRIT. FOR US, THESE ARE OPPOSITE CONCEPTS, FLUSSER AND AN ABYSS SEPARATES THEM. ¶YES, BUT: IF OF MATTER) « AND »MATTER« »SPIRIT« MEANS »SUBJECT MEANS

SMV ISMVS LISMVSI ALISMVSID IAL ISMVS IDE RI AL ISMVS I D Е A ERIAL ISMVS I EAL D ERIALISM v s IDE ALI т ISM ΙD АТ ΕR IAL V S Е A L IS IAL ISM MA т ΕR v s ΙD Е A L I SM A т Е R IAL ISMVS ΙD Е A L М 1 s М IALISMVS I D EAL A ТЕ R Ι s М A Μ IALISMVS ΙD ER т I s Μ A М R IAL ISMVS I D Е A т Е L Ι s М ISM ISM ISM ISM ISM L I A s I D Е Е R v A L Ι s м A L L I D I R v s A Ι Е L Ι Е s м vs I R A D Е A L I s I v s I Е L Е R A L D A Ι s т Е R I A L I s М v s I D Е A L I Μ т s M L v R I A Ι s М s I D Е A L s М Е I М т L R I A I S мv s I D Е A L Е Ι s т м M A IS IS IS M M vs vs L L I т Е R I A Ι D Е A s М М A т Е R I A L I D Е A L Ι s М R AL М v s I I s т Е I D Е A L М A М L IS A м s I R I v DE A I s A т Е L М М R I A L I S M V S R I A L I S M V S E R I A L I S M V S E R I A L I S M V S E R I A L I S M V S I D т Е Е L I s M A М I D E I D E AL М A т Ι s М т A L s A Ι М М т ΙD A Е A L I М s М T Е RIALI**S**MVS IDE MA A L ISM АТ E RIALI**S**MVS IDE ALIS TERIALISMVS IDEALI ERIALISMVS IDEAL RIALI**S**MVS IDEA IALISMVSIDE ALISMVSID LISMVSI ISMVS SMV М

M

| MATERIALISMVSIDEALISM |
|-----------------------|
| ATERIALISMVSIDEALISMM |
| TERIALISMVSIDEALISMMA |
| ERIALISMVSIDEALISMMAT |
| RIALISMVSIDEALISMMATE |
| IALISMVSIDEALISMMATER |
| ALISMVSIDEALISMMATERI |
| LISMVSIDEALISMMATERIA |
| ISMVSIDEALISMMATERIAL |
| SMVSIDEALISMMATERIALI |
| MVSIDEALISMMATERIALIS |
| VSIDEALISMMATERIALISM |
| SIDEALISMMATERIALISMV |
| IDEALISMMATERIALISMVS |
| DEALISMMATERIALISMVSI |
| EALISMMATERIALISMVSID |
| ALISMMATERIALISMVSIDE |
| LISMMATERIALISMVSIDEA |
| ISMMATERIALISMVSIDEAL |
| SMMATERIALISMVSIDEALI |
| MMATERIALISMVSIDEALIM |
| MATERIALISMVSIDEALIMM |
| ATERIALISMVSIDEALISMM |
| TERIALISMVSIDEALISMMA |
| ERIALISMVSIDEALISMMAT |
| RIALISMVSIDEALISMMATE |
| IALISMVSIDEALISMMATER |
| ALISMVSIDEALISMMATERI |
| LISMVSIDEALISMMATERIA |
| ISMVSIDEALISMMATERIAL |
| SMVSIDEALISMMATERIALI |
| MVSIDEALISMMATERIALIS |
| VSIDEALISMMATERIALISM |
| SIDEALISMMATERIALISMV |
| IDEALISMMATERIALISMVS |
| DEALISMMATERIALISMVSI |
| EALISMMATERIALISMVSID |
| ALISMMATERIALISMVSIDE |
| LISMMATERIALISMVSIDEA |
| ISMMATERIALISMVSIDEAL |
| SMMATERIALISMVSIDEALI |
| MMATERIALISMVSIDEALIM |
| MATERIALISMVSIDEALIMM |
|                       |

•

»OBJECT (OF SPIRIT)«, WHAT HAPPENS IF I THINK ABOUT »SPIRIT«? DOES IT NOT BECOME AN »OBJECT«, AND THUS A CURIOUS KIND OF »MATTER«? FOR INSTANCE, AS WITH DESCARTES, A »RES COGITANS«, A »THINKING THING«? AND, BEING A »THING«, MUST IT NOT BE LOCATED SOMEHOW SOMEWHERE, AT SOME MOMENT? THIS OF COURSE WOULD RESULT IN SUCH FUNNY PROBLEMS AS THE ONE THAT SEARCHES FOR THE »SEAT OF THE SOUL«. AND IF ONE PURSUES THIS QUEST FURTHER INTO THE DIRECTION OF ELEGANT SPIRITISM, ONE WILL

FINALLY COME UP AGAINST THAT EVEN FUNNIER PROBLEM CONCERNING THE »IMMORTALITY OF THE SOUL«. **MAN EVEN MORE IMPRESSIVE** EXAMPLE FOR THE TROUBLES WE ARE IN WHEN TRYING TO OPERATE WITH THE CONCEPT »MATTER«: »SPIRIT« CONTRADICTS »MATTER« AND THIS CONTRADICTION MANIFESTS ITSELF AS **»WORK«. THE RESULT OF THIS** IS »CULTURE«. THEREFORE, CULTURAL OBJECTS ARE MATERIALISED SPIRIT AND SPIRITUALISED MATTER, ALTHOUGH NOT OUITE IN THE SENSE THAT EXTRA-OCCIDENTALS MEAN WHEN TALKING OF PHANTOMS, WHICH SHOWS THAT

METAPHYSICAL CONCEPTS ARE NOT VERY COMFORTABLE. **¶OF COURSE: THIS GORDIAN** KNOT MAY BE EASILY CUT THROUGH, EITHER BY DENYING THE »REALITY« OF »MATTER« (IMMATERIALISM IN THE OLD SENSE) OR OF »SPIRIT« (RADICAL MATERIALISM). BUT THIS IS NOT A VERY CLEVER METHOD. IT LEAVES »MATTER« AND »SPIRIT« UNDEFINED, AND THUS WITHOUT MEANING. TO SAY THAT »EVERYTHING IS MATTER (OR SPIRIT) « IS JUST AS MEANINGFUL AS IS A COCK'S CROWING. WE MUST FIND OTHER WAYS OUT, AND SCIENCE IS TRYING TO DO SO. ¶SCIENCE DEVELOPED FROM PHILOSOPHY LIKE A BUTTERFLY FROM ITS COCOON, AND WHAT I HAVE DISCUSSED UP TO THIS POINT IS THAT EMPTY SHELL, WHICH SCIENCE HAS LEFT BEHIND. NONETHELESS, SCIENCE COULD NOT BUT INHERIT THE CONCEPT »MATTER« FROM PHILOSOPHY, BECAUSE THIS IS A BASIC CONCEPT. AND IT DID NOT KNOW VERY WELL WHAT TO DO WITH THIS CLUMSY CONCEPT, EXCEPT TO TRY AND MEASURE IT. THUS, IT INVENTED THE CONCEPT »MASS«, WHICH IS ALSO NOT VERY COMFORTABLE, BUT WHICH AT LEAST PERMITS ONE TO POSE THE OUESTION OF THE STRUCTURE OF MATTER. THE RESULT, ALTHOUGH NOT VERY HELPFUL, IF

| 1     | 6  |
|-------|----|
| ND.   | 50 |
| TIC   | 3  |
| D T Z | ÷. |
| L L   |    |
| ž     |    |

| THE OVERCOMING OF         | AND THE SMALLEST DOLL     |
|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| METAPHYSICS IS THE AIM,   | IS THE QUARK DOLL         |
| IS, TO SAY THE LEAST,     | (WHERE IT IS DIFFICULT,   |
| SURPRISING. \$\"MATTER«   | EVEN MEANINGLESS, TO      |
| NOW LOOKS VERY MUCH LIKE  | DISTINGUISH BETWEEN       |
| A SERIES OF RUSSIAN       | PHENOMENON AND            |
| DOLLS, ONE CONTAINING     | MATHEMATICAL SYMBOL). NOW |
| THE OTHERS. THE BIGGEST   | THIS DOES NOT SOUND VERY  |
| DOLL IS ASTRONOMICAL      | HELPFUL, EXCEPT FOR ONE   |
| (EINSTEINIAN), IT         | BIG SURPRISE, WHICH IS    |
| CONTAINS THE MOLECULAR    | THAT WHATEVER PHILOSOPHY  |
| DOLL (NEWTONIAN), WHICH   | SAYS CONCERNING »MATTER«  |
| CONTAINS THE ATOMIC DOLL  | RELATES EXCLUSIVELY TO    |
| (WHERE MASS AND ENERGY    | THE MOLECULAR LEVEL.      |
| MERGE), WHICH AGAIN       | ON ALL OTHER LEVELS, IT   |
| CONTAINS THE NUCLEAR      | IS NONSENSE TO SAY THAT   |
| DOLL (WHERE CAUSALITY     | »MATTER« IS AN »OBJECT    |
| ABDICATES IN FAVOUR OF    | OF SPIRIT« OR A »CONTENT  |
| STATISTICS), WHICH AGAIN  | OF FORM«. ¶THUS, ALL OF   |
| CONTAINS THE PARTICLE     | THE ETERNAL PROBLEMS      |
| DOLL (WHICH POSES CURIOUS | THAT PHILOSOPHY HAS WITH  |
| PROBLEMS OF SYMMETRY)     | MATTER, LIKE THE          |

```
ΗY
         PHYS
       APHYSI
      TAPHYSIC
      ETAPHYSICA
    METAPHYSICAL
   M ETAPHYSICA L
  M E TAPHYSIC A L
 M E T APHYSI C A L
 METAPHYSICAL
METAPHYSICAL
M E T A PHYS I C A L
 M E T APHYSI C A L
  M E TAPHYSIC A L
   M ETAPHYSICA L
    METAPHYSICAL
      ETAPHYSICA
       TAPHYSIC
       APHYSI
         PHYS
         ΗY
```

1 VILÉM FLUSSER

DIALECT ΙC IALEC D т Ι СА С D Ι AL Е т Ι CAL С т D Ι A LΕ ICALL EC L т Ι D I Α CALLY D Ι A L Е С т Ι CALLYO Е С т Ι CALLYOP Ι A L D С т ICALLYO D Ι A L Е ΡP CALLYO L Е С Ι Ρ D Ι A т ΡΟ С т ALL Y 0 Ρ Ρ D Ι A L Е Ι С 0 S Е С т I С LLYO Ρ ΡO D Ι A L A S Ε Ι L Е С т I С L L ΥO Ρ ΡO S D A Α Е D LLYOPPO D Ι A L Е С т Ι С Α SΕ ALLYOPPOS D Ι A L Е С т Ι С YOP С т ALL ΡO D Ι Α L Е Ι С D Ι Α L Е С т Ι С ALLYO ΡP D Ι A L Е С т Ι С ALLYOP L Ι Ι D A Е С т CALLYO L С Ι Е т D Α Ι С ALLY LΕ С Ι т Ι Α CALL D ALE СТ Ι ICAL D IALECT I СА D DIALECTIC

| INC<br>OF<br>MAT<br>HOW<br>UNT<br>EXC<br>THE<br>DIM<br>ON W<br>OUR<br>HAV<br>DIM<br>ENT<br>JUM<br>THE<br>THE<br>THE<br>THE<br>WIS<br>DEC | S. SCIENCE IS<br>COMPETENT IN THE FACE<br>THIS KIND OF PROBLEM.<br>SECOND SIGHT,<br>VEVER, THIS BECOMES<br>RUE. WE DO NOT LIVE<br>CLUSIVELY WITHIN<br>CENTIMETRE/SECOND<br>MENSION. PROCESSES GO<br>WITHIN OUR BRAIN AND<br>NERVOUS SYSTEM, WHICH<br>VE ALTOGETHER DIFFERENT<br>MENSIONS. PARTICLES<br>CER THOSE SYSTEMS, THEY<br>MP QUANTICALLY BETWEEN<br>CHERVE SYNAPSES, AND<br>CHERVE SYNAPSES, AND |
|--|--|
|--|--|

D VILÉM FLUSSER

SPIRITUALISEDMATTER PIRITUALISEDMATTERS IRITUALISEDMATTERSP RITUALISEDMATTERSPI TTUALISEDMATTERSPIR TUALISEDMATTERSPIRI UALISEDMATTERSPIRIT ALISEDMATTERSPIRITU **LISEDMATTERSPIRITUA TSEDMATTERSPIRITUAL** SEDMATTERSPIRITUALI EDMATTERSPIRITUALIS DMATTERSPIRITUALISE MATTERSPIRITUALISED ATTERSPIRITUALISEDM TTERSPIRITUAL TSEDMA TERSPIRITUALISEDMAT ERSPIRITUALISEDMATT RSPIRITUALISEDMATTE SPIRITUALISEDMATTER PIRITUALISEDMATTERS IRITUALISEDMATTERSP RITUALISEDMATTERSPI TTUALISEDMATTERSPIR TUALISEDMATTERSPIRI UALISEDMATTERSPIRIT ALISEDMATTERSPIRITU LISEDMATTERSPIRITUA **TSEDMATTERSPIRITUAL** SEDMATTERSPIRITUALI EDMATTERSPIRITUALIS DMATTERSPIRITUALISE MATTERSPIRITUALISED ATTERSPIRITUALISEDM TTERSPIRITUALISEDMA TERSPIRITUALISEDMAT ERSPIRITUALISEDMATT RSPIRITUALISEDMATTE SPIRITUALISEDMATTER MATERIALISEDSPIRIT ATERIALISEDSPIRITM TERIALISEDSPIRITMA ERIALISEDSPIRITMAT RIALISEDSPIRITMATE IALISEDSPIRITMATER ALISEDSPIRITMATERI LISEDSPIRITMATERIA ISEDSPIRITMATERIAL SEDSPIRITMATERIALI EDSPIRITMATERIALIS DSPIRITMATERIALISE SPIRITMATERIALISED PIRITMATERIALISEDS IRITMATERIALISEDSP RITMATERIALISEDSPI ITMATERIALISEDSPIR TMATERIALISEDSPIRI MATERIALISEDSPIRIT MATERIALISEDSPIRIT ATERIALISEDSPIRITM TERIALISEDSPIRITMA ERIALISEDSPIRITMAT RIALISEDSPIRITMATE IALISEDSPIRITMATER ALISEDSPIRITMATERI LISEDSPIRITMATERIA ISEDSPIRITMATERIAL SEDSPIRITMATERIALI EDSPIRITMATERIALIS DSPIRITMATERIALISE SPIRITMATERIALISED PIRITMATERIALISEDS IRITMATERIALISEDSP RITMATERIALISEDSPI ITMATERIALISEDSPIR TMATERIALISEDSPIRI MATERIALISEDSPIRIT

C VILÉM FLUSSER

MUCH ON THE LEVELS OF PARTICLES AS WE LIVE ON THE MOLECULAR LEVEL, WHICH GIVES RISE TO A CURIOUS SUSPICION: WHAT IF »SPIRIT« WERE THE NAME WE GIVE »MATTER« ON THE LEVEL OF PARTICLES, AND WHAT IF »MATTER« WERE THE NAME WE GIVE »SPIRIT« IN THE MOLECULAR LEVEL? THIS MIGHT NOT SOUND LIKE A VERY ORIGINAL SUSPICION (IT SOUNDS LIKE SPIRITISM) BUT, UNLIKE SPIRITISM, IT PERMITS TECHNICAL EXPERIMENTATION. ¶UNTIL RECENTLY, ALL EXPEDITIONS UNDERTAKEN INTO THE VARIOUS LEVELS OF MATTER STARTED FROM THE MOLECULAR LEVEL. DEMOCRITUS LEFT IT IN SEARCH OF ATOMS. ARISTOTLE IN SEARCH OF THE STARS AND SCIENCE CONTINUED TO DO SO, ALTHOUGH IT ORGANISED ITS EXPEDITIONS A LITTLE BIT MORE CAREFULLY. THIS IS CHANGING. WE NOW WITNESS EXPEDITIONS COMING FROM THE LEVEL OF PARTICLES THAT INVADE THE MOLECULAR LEVEL AS IF FROM BELOW. THINGS LIKE THERMONUCLEAR POWER STATIONS, COMPUTERS, ROBOTS, OR ELECTROMAGNETIC IMAGES ARE PARTICLES INVADING OUR MOLECULAR LEVEL. THEY EXPLODE OUR ETERNAL PROBLEMS. IT IS NONSENSE TO SAY OF A

THERMONUCLEAR PLANT THAT IT SPIRITUALISES MATTER; OF A COMPUTER, THAT IT IS A MATERIALISED SPIRIT; OF A ROBOT, THAT IT DECIDES AND ACTS UPON DECISIONS; OR OF A TV IMAGE THAT IT IS A PURE, PLATONIC FORM. ALL SUCH METAPHYSICAL FORMULATIONS FAIL, WHERE SUCH PARTICLE INVASIONS ARE CONCERNED. INSTEAD, IT BECOMES POSSIBLE TO EXPERIMENT WITH THESE SORTS OF PROCESSES, WHICH ARE OF THE ORDER OF MAGNITUDE OUR BRAIN INHABITS. **¶SO-CALLED** »ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCES« MAY SERVE AS EXAMPLES FOR THIS TRANSITION FROM METAPHYSICS TO TECHNICAL EXPERIMENTATION. THEY ARE RUDIMENTARY SIMULATIONS OF A FEW BRAIN FUNCTIONS. NEUROPHYSIOLOGY HAS NOT ADVANCED VERY FAR INTO THE SECRETS OF THE BRAIN, BUT FAR ENOUGH TO PERMIT THOSE SIMULATIONS. THIS IS NOT SURPRISING: PALAEOLITHIC MAN DID NOT NEED A WELL-ELABORATED THEORY OF MECHANICS TO SIMULATE A FEW FUNCTIONS OF HIS ARM TO INVENT THE LEVER. OF COURSE: IT WOULD BE AN EXAGGERATION TO CALL A LEVER AN »ARTIFICIAL ARM«, JUST AS IT IS AN EXAGGERATION TO CALL OUR CRUDE SIMULATION

R OBJEC TOF s RIT М Е Ρ Ι : 0 в J Е С т 0 F s I R I Е R Ρ т т R : 0 в J E с T T T T T T T I R 0 F s P т т Е Ι т E R : 0 B T E R : 0 B T E R : 0 B T E R : 0 B T E R : 0 B T E R : 0 B J E I с с с с с с с 0 F s P Μ т т R Ι Ĵ Е 0 F s Ρ т I M JE JE JE O F O F т s Ι A АТ s Ι M A т 0 F Ι м С АТ TER : O B J E 0 F s P I М R т т Е R : 0 в J EC т 0 F s Ι TER : o JB в С т т 0 F s P в ΕR : 0 J С 0 т т Е т F s I R Τ т : 0 в С т т Е R J Е т 0 F s P I R İ с т т Е R : 0 в J Ē т 0 F s P I R I т Μ с т Е R : 0 B J Е т 0 F s P I R М т I т E R : OB J E E R : OB J E T E R : OB J E T E R : OB J E C T E R : OB J E C т с т 0 F т s P I R I M т т С т 0 F s ₽ I I М A R т т s I т 0 F Ρ R I т A СТ АТ 0 s P Ι R Ι т м F т ER:OBJE с т мат 0 F ₽ I R Ι т s т т Е R:OBJEC 0 1 М A т F s Ρ R I т E т т R:OBJEC т 0 F s Ρ I R 1 A т т т ER:OBJE С 0 F s I R I т P т ER:OBJEC то F s Ρ I т т I R т R:OBJECTOFS Ρ I I т т Е R т : OBJECTOFSPIRI R т Е т М A Т OBJECTOFSPIRIT м A т т Е R

s SUBJECTOFMATTER P Ι R I т T SUBJECT s P I R Í ΟF MA TTE R s P I R I T:SUBJECT ΟF MA тт Е R IT:SUBJECT IT:SUBJECT ΟF MA т s Р Ι R т Е R s Р I RIT OFMA т т Е R P IRIT : SUBJECT OFM A т s т Е R P I RIT : SUBJE CTOF s м A т т Е R I RIT:SUBJE сто Р F s м A т т Е R IRIT : SUBJE СТ Ρ 0 s F М A т т Е R IRIT: SUBJEC т 0 F s P М т т R Е RIT:SUBJE S Ρ I С т 0 F Е М A т т R s F I R IT:SUBJ Е С т 0 F Μ т R ٩ Е R I T:SUB J Е С 0 I т т Е S F Μ т R R Í т : S U в J E С S I т 0 F Т Е R I т : S υ J Е С S P Ι R в т o Е R F т I T S U B J E R I T S U B J E R I T S U B J E C R I T S U B J E C I R I T S U B J E C I R I T S U B J E C T O : S U J E С I R I т в т s E 0 F Е R т С s P I R Т 0 E R F M т I s P 0 F E R т s P I 0 E R M P 0 s F М R т Ρ s 0 F R М A Т т Е Ρ F s М A т т E R O F O F M ΡI s М A т т E R s Ρ A т т E R F MA S P I т т Е R P I F М A т т Е R S P I R I T:SUBJECT 0 F М A т Т Е R s RIT I : SUBJECTOFMAT s Ρ ŤΕ R SUBJECTOFMATTER s P Ι R Ι т

26

OF BRAINS »ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCES«. STILL, THE LEVER IS THE ANCESTOR OF ALL MACHINES, AND MACHINES HAVE NOT ONLY TAKEN OVER MOST OF THE MUSCULAR BODY FUNCTIONS, THEY HAVE EXCEEDED THE MECHANICAL CAPACITIES OF THE BODY BY A LONG WAY. WE ARE, AS FAR AS OUR INTELLECTUAL CAPACITIES ARE CONCERNED, AT THE STAGE OF THE LEVER. ¶NOW THESE CRUDE SIMULATIONS SHOW THAT MUCH OF WHAT PHILOSOPHY (AND THEOLOGY) USED TO CONSIDER »SPIRIT« (LIKE LOGICAL REASONING OR DECISION MAKING) CAN BE PERFORMED BY APPARATUS. THUS, »SPIRIT« IS BEGINNING TO ESCAPE FROM ITS IMPRISONMENT WITHIN THE SKULL, AND MAY BE OBSERVED AS IF FROM OUTSIDE. THE FOGS OF PHILOSOPHY, THEOLOGY, PSYCHOLOGY, AND OTHER IDEOLOGIES THAT ENVELOP IT ARE LIFTING. WE SHALL HAVE TO THINK EVERYTHING CONCERNING »SPIRIT« ALL OVER AGAIN. ¶ANOTHER SUCH INVASION OF PARTICLES INTO THE MOLECULAR LEVEL IS ELECTROMAGNETIC IMAGES, AND THEY TOO OBLIGE US TO RETHINK ETERNAL PROBLEMS. BUT WITH THEM, IT IS NOT THE DIALECTICS OF »MATTER-SPIRIT« THAT

ARE IN OUESTION, BUT THE DIALECTICS »MATTER-FORM«: LET US CONSIDER IT. ¶THERE IS A CURIOUS MYTH THAT SUSTAINS WESTERN THOUGHT IN THIS RESPECT, AND WHAT IT SAYS IS THIS: IN THE BEGINNING (WHATEVER THAT MAY MEAN), THERE WAS A FORMLESS SOUP CALLED »MATTER« AND OVER IT HOVERED EMPTY FORMS (SOMETIMES CALLED »IDEAS«). THE FORMS SOMEHOW DIPPED INTO MATTER LIKE SPOONS AND FILLED THEMSELVES. AND THIS IS CALLED »CREATION«. NOW, ALTHOUGH THIS MYTH IS UNBELIEVABLE, IT IS DEEPLY ROOTED IN US. WERE WE TO GIVE IT UP, WE WOULD HAVE GIVEN UP JUDEO-CHRISTIANITY AND THE GREEK BELIEF THAT THE UNIVERSE HAS A MATHEMATICAL STRUCTURE. WE WOULD ALSO HAVE TO GIVE UP THE ENDLESS QUARREL BETWEEN »MATERIALISM« AND »IDEALISM«. BUT WE WILL HAVE TO GIVE IT UP IN THE FACE OF SCIENCE. ¶SCIENCE SAYS THAT THE UNIVERSE IS A PROCESS, OR AN EVER MORE UNIFORM DISTRIBUTION OF THE PARTICLES FROM WHICH IT IS COMPOSED. IT TENDS VILÉM FLUSSER TOWARDS THE TOTAL LOSS OF FORM. IN FACT, THIS TENDENCY TOWARDS LOSS OF FORM MAY BE TAKEN AS

27

FICIALI С R T T T I I I I N т Е L L I G E N Е I A I A I A I A c c F F F I I I I R L IN т Е L Ι С LIN L L Ι С Е R т Е G Е N С L N L т I т E L I G Е N С Е F С R т I L I N т E L L Ι G Е N с Е I A L I I A L I I A L I I F I с N т E L L I G Е N С Е L L с L I F Ι N т E I G Е N С Е F I С N т E L I E N с R т I G Е I A L L т I F С I I N т E L I GΕ N С Е R I С I L I NTE L L I G ΕN С Е F A т I I I с A L I N те L L I G Е I NC Е A R т F с I A LI ALI IALI IALI IALI N T E L L N T E L L N T E L L N T E L L N T E L L N T E L L I G G G G E E I I I I I С I F с N Е I R т I F N С Е A с R т Ι F I Е N С Е c c C I A L I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I C I A L I C I A L I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I I C I A L I т I F 1 G Е N с A R F I Ι G Е N R т С A Е F E N L L Ι G т Ι т Е A R N С F IIIII N E L L I G A R т т E F L т N т L I G A R Е С L T T T F L R N т Е I G С Е R F F F F N т Е L L Ι с Е Α Е N R N т Е L L I С Е N N N Т Т Т L L с Е Е I G R E E E L L I G Е т N С I 1 с т G Е L L Е т L I N I G т F L Е N С E I I 1 F I Е L L L L G т N т E N С Е L L L I I F N т Е G Е N С Е I с G G т I F I ALIN ΤЕ I Е N С Е R F I С I A L I N ΤE I Е С Е т Ι L I N T E L L A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E L L I A L I N T E Y I A L I N T E Y N I Ι I с A I I I I I I G ENC Е R т F A I с I G E E N с т F R I I Е A F с G G I R т Ι F N С Е A с с I с с іс іс N т Ι R Е т F I С R Ι F G Е N A Е I R т I G Е N С A E F G A R т I L Ι Е N С E I I I I c c IAL т т F I N т Е L L L I G A R Е N С F L R I N Т E L I G E С A N E L т IFICIALIN т Е İ A R G Е N С E ARTIFICIALI Е L L I G Е С N т N Е

ARTIFICIALIN т I F ICIALINT R A т I F IC IALINTE R I ΙA LΙ т F r с ΝT ΕL A R I F I С I A LI NT ELL R т IALI т I F I C N T Е L LI A R I A L I N T I A L I N T A L I N T F I С Е L LIG R т I F I С Е L L R т I IGE I с I Е LLIGEN т Ι F I L I NTELLIGENC I F С I A т I с I A L INTELLIGENCE I F R т LINTELLIGENC I F I С I A R т A F I С ALINTELLIGEN R т I I A R т I F I С I ALINTELLIGE F С IALINTELLIG т Ι I A R F ΙC IALINTELLI Ι A R т ICIALINTE F A R т Ι LL A R т ΙF ICIALINTEL R т I FICIALI N т Е A RTIFICIALI NT A ARTIFICIALINT ELLIGENCE INTELLIGEN С Е LINTELLIGEN С E ALINTELLIGE С N Е IALINT**BLLI**G Е N С IALINTELLI G N С с E I C IALINTELL I G Е N С IC IALINTEL I G F L Е N C ΙF IC IALÍNTB L L I G Е N С E I F IC IALI NТ E L L I G т Е N С Е I IC IALI N L L I RТ F т Е G E N С E ΙC IA LI Е L L I I F т AR т N G Е N С Е LI L L I ΙC IA Е G RТ I F N т Е N С Е IA L L I т I F IC I N т Е L G Е N С Е I IF IC IALI N ΤE L L G Е N С Е FIC IALINT E L I L G Е N с Е IALINTELL I IС G Е N с Е CIALINTELLI G Е N С Е IALINTELLIG Е N с Е ALI NTELLIGE N с Е LINTELLIGEN С Е INTELLIGENC E NTELLIGENCE

THE UNIVERSE AS A WHOLE. AND OF EVERY PHENOMENON THEREIN (E.G. THE CARBON TEST). THE EQUATIONS THAT PERMIT THIS MEASUREMENT ARE THOSE OF THE SECOND PRINCIPLE OF THERMODYNAMICS. ¶NOW, WHAT THOSE EQUATIONS MEAN IS THAT EVERYTHING TENDS TO BECOME MORE PROBABLE, AND THAT WHAT WE CALL THE »UNIVERSE« IS AN IMPROBABLE, TRANSITORY STAGE OF THIS PROCESS. THUS, WHAT WE CALL »MATTER« IS AN IMPROBABLE FORM OF ENERGY THAT WILL DECAY INTO UNIFORMLY DISTRIBUTED HEAT (THERMIC DEATH). THUS, »MATTER« AND »FORM« COME TO MEAN THE SAME THING, NAMELY A TRANSITORY AND IMPROBABLE STAGE OF ENERGY DISTRIBUTION. **WHAT IS SURPRISING IN** THIS IS NOT SO MUCH THAT THE ANCIENT DIALECTICS OF »MATTER-FORM« HAS LOST ITS MEANING. RATHER, IT IS THE CENTRAL POSITION THAT THE CONCEPT »PROBABILITY« TAKES. IT HAS SOMETHING TO DO WITH GAMES, WITH CHANCE, WITH LUCK, WITH ACCIDENTS, IN SHORT: WITH DICE. THE UNIVERSE APPEARS AS A KIND OF BLIND GAME, WHICH WILL RESULT IN THE END IN THE EXHAUSTION OF ALL ITS CHANCES

A MEASURE OF THE AGE OF

IMMATERIALISM

PROBA B ILITY ROBA B ILITYP OBA B ILITYPR BA B TLTTYPRO A B ILITYPROB B ILITYPROBA **B** ILITYPROBA ILITYPROBA B ILITYPROBA B LITYPROBA B Ι ITYPROBA B IL TYPROBA B ILI YPROBA B ILIT PROBA B ILITY ROBA B ILITYP OBA B ILITYPR BA B ILITYPRO A B ILITYPROB В ILITYPROBA B ILITYPROBA ILITYPROBA B ILITYPROBA B LITYPROBA B I ITYPROBA B IL TYPROBA B ILI YPROBA B ILIT PROBA B ILITY

C VILÉM FLUSSER

SYNT H ESIS YNT H ESISS NT H ESISSY T H ESISSYN H ESISSYNT H ESISSYNT ESISSYNT H ESISSYNT H SISSYNT H E ISSYNT H ES SSYNT H ESI SYNT H ESIS YNT H ESISS NT H ESISSY T H ESISSYN H ESISSYNT H ESISSYNT ESISSYNT H ESISSYNT H SISSYNT H E ISSYNT H ES SSYNT H ESI SYNT H ESIS

(A ZERO-SUM GAME), BUT IN THE COURSE OF THIS ACCIDENTS MAY OCCUR, UNFORESEEABLE SITUATIONS. AND IT IS THESE ACCIDENTS, THESE STROKES OF LUCK. WHICH CONCENTRATE OUR ATTENTION. THE EQUATIONS OF THE SECOND PRINCIPLE OF THERMODYNAMICS, WHICH MEASURE THE TENDENCY TOWARDS THE EVER MORE PROBABLE, MAY BE TURNED AROUND, AND THEY WILL THEN POINT TOWARDS THE IMPROBABLE, THE ACCIDENTAL. THIS TURNING AROUND HAS BEEN ACHIEVED BY THE THEORY OF INFORMATION. AND ELECTROMAGNETIC IMAGES MAY BE CONSIDERED TO BE RESULTS OF THIS THEORETICAL UNDERSTANDING OF »INFORMATION«. ¶WHAT ONE SEES, IF ONE LOOKS AT IMAGES LIKE VIDEO-CLIPS, HOLOGRAMS, OR THOSE SYNTHESISED ON COMPUTER SCREENS IS HIGHLY IMPROBABLE CONFIGURATIONS OF PARTICLES LIKE PHOTONS. THESE IMPROBABLE CONFIGURATIONS HAVE NOT COME ABOUT BY BLIND CHANCE (AS THEY DO, FOR INSTANCE IN GENETIC INFORMATION), BUT BY HUMAN DELIBERATION. THEY ARE THE RESULT OF A DELIBERATE INVERSION OF THE UNIVERSAL TENDENCY TOWARDS UNIFORM

VILÉM FLUSSER

¶STILL: FUTURE »IMMATERIAL« CULTURE, THE CULTURE OF »PURE INFORMATION« WILL BE ALMOST COMPLETELY DIFFERENT FROM OURS. AND THIS, IS WHAT IS SUGGESTED HERE BY THE SHIFT IN THE MEANING OF THE WORD »IMMATERIALISM«.

»ENERGY« (A TERM THAT DEFIES DEFINITION). NO DOUBT, HERE, WE HAVE COME UP AGAINST A PROFOUND CULTURAL REVOLUTION. THE VERY PILLARS OF WESTERN CULTURE, »MATTER«, »SPIRIT«, AND »FORM« HAVE FALLEN. BUT WE HAVE BY NO MEANS OVERCOME METAPHYSICS. WE HAVE DEMYSTIFIED THESE THREE PILLARS, BUT A MYSTERY NOW ENVELOPS THE CONCEPTS OF »ENERGY« AND »PROBABILITY« INSTEAD. IF ONE THROWS METAPHYSICS OUT THROUGH THE DOOR, IT COMES BACK THROUGH THE WINDOW.

М

MSM

S Ι SΜ М

S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S М М S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ А  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι

М S M S Ι А Ι  $\mathbf{L}$  $\mathbf{L}$ А Ι S

Μ М L S Ι Α Ι R Ι A L Ι S

Μ

S Ι

Μ Ι

S

М

М

Е Ι  $\mathbf{L}$  $\mathbf{L}$ Α Ι R R А Ι S M

Μ

L Α Ι R Ι Α  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι R Е Т Ε SM Ι R т Ι Α  $\mathbf{L}$ А Α Т Е R Ι Ε

S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ S S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Α Ι R Е Т А А т Е R Ι Α  $\mathbf{L}$ М М Ι S Μ S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ А Ι Е Т А Μ М A Т R Ι А  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S М R М Ε М Ι Α Ι Т Α М М Ι М М Α Т Е Ι А  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ R R Е

Α Ι L Α Ι R Е Т Α ММ М Α Т R Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Е S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Α Ι R Е Т ΑM Α Т Е R Ι Α  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι А М

Ι Е Ι Α Ι S Ι L R Е Т Α Т R  $\mathbf{L}$ S Ι Α Ι А Ι М S  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι R Е Т Е R  $\mathbf{L}$ S Μ

S А  $\mathbf{L}$  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι R Е R Ι Α Ι S M М Ι

S Ι L Α Ι R Ι A  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S М М M S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Α Ι A  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S М

> S М Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Α  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S Μ

S Ι  $\mathbf{L}$ Ι S М

M S Ι S М М

SM

Μ

М

ΜS

M S

Μ

S М

М

S Μ

Ι S

М

М