How Can We Sing the Song of the Lord in an Alien Land?

The Potosí Principle

Colonial Image Production in the Global Economy

Edited by
Alice Creischer
Max Jorge Hinderer
Andreas Siekmann
How Can We Sing the Song of the Lord in an Alien Land?

The Potosí Principle
Art history has traditionally located the origins of modern art in the paintings of Gustave Courbet, Édouard Manet, and the Impressionists; in other words, in that break with the traditional forms of art that was undertaken in order to reflect the immediacy of the subjective experience of reality. Romantic idealism, and Baudelaire’s “spleen” were other milestones in the modern perception of the world. Trapped in an account consisting of familiar names and settings—an emblematized by the artist who moves from Paris to New York, occasionally stopping off in central Europe—we have created a closed universe of references that prevents us from understanding the cultural practices of an expanded modernity, which goes beyond such frameworks in order to express itself in contemporary global society. We have been surprisingly blind to the fact that, since the sixteenth century, the history of Europe has been inseparable from that of its colonies, and that modernity quite clearly does not exist without the center–periphery relationships that first arose with colonialism. What would happen if we substituted for René Descartes’s *ego cogito* Hernán Cortés’s *ego conquiro*, or Immanuel Kant’s concept of pure reason (what Karl Marx termed the principle of primitive accumulation)? What if, instead of starting our account of the modern age in the England of the Industrial Revolution or the France of Napoleon III, we started it in viceroyal South America? The answers to these questions undoubtedly offer us an illegitimate view of history. In the current context the hypothesis of an advanced culture, endowed with technical and intellectual means superior to those of others, who are always one step behind, appears far-fetched. The evidence is that we find ourselves within a global system in which, moved by certain dynamics inherited from colonial domination, the various actors associate and interrelate by way of intense flows of communication. Here, culture is not the independent and privileged site of ideas; it not only reflects a power structure but is the very power that is fought over.

In the seventeenth century, barely one hundred years after its discovery and conquest, Potosí was one of the most important cities on the planet with a population larger than London or Paris. The silver and other metals that were mined from the “Rich Mountain,” as it was known, circulated the planet and were used to fund the Habsburg wars in Europe and to repay that dynasty’s enormous loans to German and Genoese bankers. The exploitation of the Potosí mines produced the first accumulation of capital in the modern period and the forerunner and model for present-day financial globalization. In Potosí this excess of wealth was founded on the *mita*, a slave-based system in which the indigenous population worked in subhuman conditions. More than five centuries later, Abu Dhabi, China, and numerous other places are still characterized by processes of exploitation and accumulation with similar social consequences. Then as now, art had and has an inherent ambiguity. If, on the one hand, the experimentation and expansion of the field of knowledge associated with its practice serves to help us become better human beings, on the other, it could be said that the institution of art can easily act in complicity with a new global slavery, the commercialization of subjective viewpoints, and the transformation of immaterial heritage—for example, historical memory—into a pure economic transaction. In aiming to show works from its collection in its new venue in Abu Dhabi, the Louvre makes them more accessible but also gains significant financial benefit.

In a similar way, the intensive proselytizing of the indigenous peoples helped them to become aware of their rights with regard to earlier modes of domination, while this proselytizing also functioned to consolidate the colonial system. Nonetheless, art is political precisely because its very poetic structure has something within it that is impossible to assimilate, transforming it into an active element of liberation. Colonial paintings from Caquiariri and Calamarca were responses to the ecclesiastical doctrine of the day and their function was an educational one. However, their particular use of the pictorial idiom, imported from the metropolis, allowed for an inversion of social structures. Saints and Virgins were reinterpreted in indigenous festivals and ceremonies, resulting in a hybrid spirituality devised to resist the colonial enterprise.

The Enlightenment aimed to establish a common measure that could harmonize the heterogeneous nature of social relations generated by colonial expansion, trade, and the growth of urban life. Everything that did not fit into that rational measure was considered to be outside the civilized self. However, as Eduardo Subirats has reminded us, Spanish Enlightenment thinkers hesitated to interpret modern reason as a universal principle, to define the secularization of culture in its fairest consequences, and to implement fully the moral and political principles of the autonomy of the individual. The starting point of the processes of primitive accumulation in Spain was an empire based on economic and social models that prevented the development and consolidation of a process of colonial expansion similar to that which took place among the northern powers. The intensity and speed of such processes resulted in a parallel dislocation in the dominating and dominated societies. As a result, modernity was baroque by nature almost from its outset.

There can be no single origin of modernity as soon as it is seen that modernity itself entails processes of dissemination, contamination, and permeability that destabilize the very notion of origin. This understanding of modernity invalidates any linear, evolutionary interpretation of the arts towards the achievement of purity in the varieties of aesthetic phenomena, as the prophets of modernism argued. If the baroque and the theatrical were once anathema to the perfect incarnation of modernity, they now present themselves as an option for an alternative type of modernity. From
Walter Benjamin to Gilles Deleuze, numerous intellectuals have reflected on this phenomenon. As an aesthetic category or philosophical proposition, the Baroque is a nineteenth- and twentieth-century concept rather than a seventeenth-century one. For the northern world it represents the lack of moderation evident in the despotic methods of domination found in human behavior: blind, violent, and irrational ones that produce fanatical, aggressive, and superstitious individuals. The Baroque is the subjugated "other" of Enlightenment modernity, and for that very reason the object of its fantasy of losing itself and its precise boundaries within that "other." However, that dislocation also brings about a process of opening up and a blending of the systems of ways of seeing and representation, a "madness of seeing," according to Christine Buci-Glucksman, a yearning vision made flesh that generated types of knowledge inaccessible to the rational Cartesian individual. While the Enlightenment was only able to perceive the significant viewpoints arising from colonial dynamics as aberrations, Baroque society did not avoid depicting the specificity of social relations, opting not to conceal them, however violent they might be. The arbitrary nature of language in the Baroque gave rise to its total ideological manipulation by the forces of power, but its disseminating power made it less controllable. Allegory, the representative mode based on the inevitable arbitrariness of language, typical of the baroque, allows for multiple signifiers and for appropriation and distortion.

*The Potosí Principle (Principio Potosí)* responds to this double articulation. It reflects a situation of exploitation and increasing labor insecurity, of which culture is art and part, while at the same time *problematicizing* this through the very same art. If religious paintings and paraphernalia from the colonial period took on a new dimension when they were recontextualized in indigenous events and rituals, in the museum they undergo a further transformation. The estrangement suffered by these objects is not hidden, but rather accentuated by their dialogue with the interventions by contemporary artists. By creating a tension between the colonial works and surroundings that are alien to them, the museum becomes Baroque and behaves like the forms of indigenous resistance to the colonial project. It becomes a paradigm of a relationship with a world in crisis that does not ignore the catastrophic state this is in.

Manuel J. Borja-Villel, director of the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía, Madrid

---

As asked about the significance of the project *The Potosí Principle*, Edgar Arandía, director of the National Museum in La Paz, replied that it would foster a greater understanding of the history of Bolivia and of its role within the contemporary global context. What is the nature of this new understanding and with which artistic strategies has it been forged?

I shall address the second question first by inviting you to cast your eyes around the exhibition. Here we encounter a painting by Gaspar Miguel de Berrío from 1758, showing a view of the town of Potosí, with the Cerro Rico, the "Rich Mountain," in the background. It is to this mountain and its abundant natural resources, primarily silver, that the town owes its wealth. We see a large, sprawling settlement—at the time Potosí was regarded as one of the most affluent towns in the world—boasting an excellent infrastructure; for example, lakes, which supplied the area with water. Yet human life—with but few exceptions—has receded into the shadows of this imposing architecture. The development of Potosí, fueled by the treasures of the soil, had evidently reached its acme.

Before the visitor reaches Berrío's canvas, he is confronted at the beginning of the exhibition with a copy of a painting of hell originating from Caquitrivi, one of the towns from which workers were recruited for the Potosí mines under the colonial system. The painting depicts devils dragging people down from life on earth into the yawning chasm of hell, where they are cruelly tortured: either by being stretched across rotating wheels or cooked alive in vats pots; instruments and utensils, incidentally, which played a crucial role in the mining and refining of the silver.

Located within the immediate vicinity of the Caquitrivi painting are tools used in housing construction in China today. They are among the exhibits of a museum founded by migrant workers in China. Essentially featuring items taken from the working life of migrant workers, the museum also documents their fragile social status as laborers, whose presence in the cities is only tolerated for as long as their services are required.

As he continues on his tour, the viewer encounters waterpipes protruding from the wall. On the other side, he finds a row of washing machines, which form part of an installation by the Argentine artist Eduardo Molinari, whose oeuvre explores working conditions in the production of soya in his native Argentina, a highly capitalized system of agriculture.
The visitor now finds himself in a room featuring a range of diverse objects. In the sixteenth/seventeenth centuries, when Potosí was experiencing its halcyon days, such rooms were known as “cabinets of curiosities” due to their collections of exotic and diverse objects. A theoretical foundation for the cabinets can be found in Gottfried Leibniz’s Monadology, in which he posited that all objects within the universe are in some way interrelated. Under this concept, it is left to the imagination of the visitor to draw a connection from one exhibit to the next.

Also conceived as a cabinet of curiosities, the exhibition of The Potosí Principle is based on an idea which traces back to the Baroque era, namely that of the Gesamtkunstwerk, or total work of art. The most important creative moment of the The Potosí Principle as a Gesamtkunstwerk is the transgression of boundaries, and consequently a number of the core categories with which Western Modernity imposes order on the world have been consciously deactivated.

This begins with our linear concept of time which is predicated on the notion of a continual progression into the future. However, this exhibition compresses the temporal strands of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries and the present to form one temporal layer. In this way, the colonial past, together with its mechanisms of power and legitimation, become part of our conscious world.

This temporal concentration corresponds to a dissolution of all territorial boundaries. Whereas since the nineteenth century historiography has been closely tied to the rise of the nation-state, this exhibition abandons these geographical demarcations in order to embrace the wider global context.

Ultimately the exhibition transgresses the boundaries of the category art, itself a product of Modernity, and of its segmentation into social subdivisions. The reasons are two-fold: firstly, to interrogate the requirements of institutional art to categorize; and secondly to reveal the connection between art and other societal developments—specifically the exploitation of human relationships, which are shaped by power asymmetries.

This approach is reflected in the formal strategies of the Gesamtkunstwerk The Potosí Principle, which represents a global world from the perspective of Potosí. For it is precisely this process of globalization that challenges the classical endeavors of European Modernity to categorize the world about them. Consequently, it is no coincidence that the cabinet of curiosities of the sixteenth/seventeenth centuries, which at the time dispensed with categories, marks the beginning of the globalization process that Potosí ultimately came to embody.

Founded on this methodology, this Gesamtkunstwerk goes on to reveal the mechanisms and representational strategies of a self-globalizing economy, which in the seventeenth century saw Potosí expand into the central hub of an economic and trading system that spanned the globe. Or to be more exact, it was the silver from Potosí that first facilitated global trade, for it financed the settlement of Spain’s public debt in Europe, the purchase of slaves from Africa, and the acquisition of silk and porcelain from China. This wealth was generated on the back of the ruthless oppression and exploitation of the indigenous population, who were transported to Potosí from all parts of the country.

Colonial painting played an instrumental role in this development. On the one hand, it legitimated the power of the ruling elite through its dramatic portrayals of the leading protagonists (as in the portrait of Antonio López de Quiroga from 1660), whilst, on the other, engendering fear and terror among the population through its images. Its pictorial strategies were largely borrowed from the Counter-Reformation and launched across the globe by the Catholic Church, which had the basic pictorial motifs manufactured in Antwerp, ideally by the Plantin-Moretus printing house. The work in the mines was perceived as atonement for the sins committed on earth. Particularly the instruments and objects featured in the impressive representation of the caves appear to be based directly on everyday experiences in the mines.

Thus the early seventeenth century heralds the birth of a global economy that only now is approaching its zenith. Beginning with Potosí, the exhibition draws a striking and continuous line to the new modern-day hotspots:

- To the industrialized agriculture of Argentina, which produces soya for the world market and whose chemicals destroys the local soil. Diseases among the rural population are apparently tacitly accepted as collateral damage.
- To the Gulf region, where workers from the Indian subcontinent are herded together in work camps, deprived of civil rights, and set to work on gigantic construction projects. To the Chinese migrant workers, who, deprived of any social or legal security, have been instrumental in the development of China’s turbotcapitalism.

Naturally we Europeans are part of this system. Our firms produce in the countries mentioned. Our livestock uses soya as fodder. And, as highlighted by Eduardo Molinari’s washing machines mentioned at the outset, art often serves as the sweetener. For its aesthetic sheen is intended to mask the inhumane production methods and to cast the exploiters into a favorable light.

Postscriptum: The concept of the cabinet of curiosities also forges a link between this project and Berlin. For it was here that the cabinet of curiosities furnished the idea for the early presentation of the worldwide collection of the Prussian Cultural Heritage Foundation.

Post-postscriptum: This catalogue forms part of the above-mentioned Gesamtkunstwerk. Consequently, the passages and quotes from artists contained herein, are not, in my opinion, statements about the world, and neither are these texts concerned with truth or falsehood in a classical episte-
mological sense. The objective is to learn to see the world anew from a fresh perspective.

From the very start, the project *The Potosí Principle* was a highly interesting experiment in the best sense of the word, a process that permanently brought interesting insights to light, even in the most difficult phases. I would like to cordially thank everyone who took this journey with us:

- first of all, the curators Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, and Andreas Siekmann, who developed the project;
- the artists and correspondents;
- the Museo Reina Sofia, especially Manuel Borja-Villel, for co-producing the project with us;
- the German Federal Cultural Foundation, especially Hortensia Völckers, whose generous support enabled us to realize this project in the first place;
- my entire team, Daniela Wolf, Sonja Oehler, Helga Dressel, and Valerie Smith, who were substantially responsible for implementing the project at the Haus der Kulturen der Welt;
- Martin Hager and his team of editors who got the catalog underway.

Bernd M. Scherer, director of the Haus der Kulturen der Welt, Berlin

---

The Functional Aesthetic: Potosí Revived

An anonymous eighteenth-century painting, "christened" the *Virgen Cerro* (Virgin Mountain), synthesizes the philosophy of progress that did more to reinforce European colonialism than all the power of its armies, the abilities of its diplomats, and its commercial and spiritual operations. The Enlightenment project aspired to place reason at the service of liberty and justice, and on this premise modernity was seen as a new era for humankind, as an univocal truth that sought to do away with everything represented by tradition, without reaching or understanding the Other rationality on which it was founded. The Enlightenment, as we know, ignored the fringes while its project for modernization and progress found—for several centuries—its instrument in dominant groups that held power, leaving in darkness a world that little by little started to hem them in, above all in lands where the extermination of idolatries and the superimposition of early capitalism couldn't do away with ancient economic practices, or with the worldview of the indigenous world. That is, where the over-exploitation of men failed to annihilate forever these cultures, despite the *mitas gruesas*, the recruitment strategy invented by viceroy Toledo to ensure they entered the Cerro Rico in Potosí in their thousands to extract silver. Though ever-lower *mitayos* re-emerged, the women carefully hoarded and kept watch over the traditions and profound wisdom in hidden places, where the echoes of Eurocentric modernity did not reach.

The Museo Nacional de Arte was once the residence of Tadeo Díez de Medina, Mayor of La Paz and attorney for the tribunal at the Royal Audiencia of Charcas, military officer and member judge of the Audiencia of Santiago de Chile, a member of the powerful elite who were involved in bringing the indigenous leader Tupac Katari to justice in 1781. Together with the National Mint building (founded by Viceroy Francisco de Toledo, once a powerful force in financial regulation) and the palace of the Marquis of Villaverde (with its coat of arms that reads "This sword will break, but my faith shall not fail," declaring the intention of reproducing modernist thought prepared to justify exploitation), these buildings were converted into museums in the twentieth century, with the mission of disseminating and anchoring in society the view that the aesthetic values of modernity and the civilized world only found expression from colonial times onwards. As such, indigenous artistic and symbolic creation was seen as mere folklore, superstition, and cheap handicrafts.

This view of the Creole intelleigentsia is the reflection of the instrumentalization of Enlightenment thought, oriented towards economic, religious, and cultural domination. Glimpses of this attitude still endure in Bolivian society, and Potosí, a region in constant crisis, is a mirror in which the whole world can be observed. Just as they imposed the decrees of their domination, of the restoration of the lost order, in the contemporary world the *mitas gruesas* assume other names and as if in a historical revolt, these museums now display in their rooms parts of the show *The Potosí Principle*, institutions making up the Fundación de Banco Central de Bolivia, where new winds now blow.

The absence of the emblematic work *Entrada de Virrey Morcillo en Potosí* screams from the walls, its narrative a perfect analogy for the paraphernalia that announce the exploitation of human beings in today's world.

Globalization accelerated art's losing contact with its geographic base, the uprooting of its historical process of the culture of belonging; the artistic avant garde made a deal with banality and frivolity taken to their nonsensical
Edgar Arandia Quiroga

The wealth and complexity of the Ibero-American universe sinks its roots into a history that, before and after the traumatic encounter of the *conquista*, came to determine an experience of human and cultural intermingling that was exceptional in its intensity and continuity. Untangling the constants and differences in the evolutionary process that over the centuries would come to configure the identity of the various peoples of this great community of nations is a demand made by the knowledge that constantly sets out new questions and the search for new answers to the multiple dimensions comprising this great process. Learning to read the frequently forgotten keys that link past and present, tradition and modernity, we are also called to question the established bases of these concepts, and their relation with the ideological, social, and political structures that frequently enclose overlapping messages susceptible to readings as polemical as they are stimulating. Penetrating one of the essential threads of this labyrinth of meanings—the interpretation of images—is the objective of this exhibition, centered on an audacious proposal to compare the great artistic creations of the painting schools in Potosí and other centers of the viceroyalty of Peru with the new forms of artistic expression that have become established today.

The curators of the exhibition have selected several works from the Andean viceroyal Baroque and confronted them with works by contemporary artists from a range of countries and continents, in an attempt to overcome barriers of culture, time, and geography. The intention is to strip down the image until it reveals its final, essential meaning—that which, it might be said, has been distorted by the accumulated interpretations of centuries, the result of varied vested interests. The path that links the great artistic output of the indigenous peoples with the European culture that was impregnated with its influence throughout the centuries of the viceroyalty can be seen here in a new light, swarming with shadows and much closer to the very contradictions that contemporary art struggles to express amidst all kinds of official and unofficial pressures. Far from any temptation to apologetics, this exhibition delves into the mestizo history of the peoples who lived and created, in the territory now known as Bolivia above all, in the world they formed and the forms in which they voiced their successive beliefs, collective longings and, also, their suffering and conflict. All this appears reflected in works of art inseparably linked to the conceptual categories of each period but much closer to our own anxieties and expectations than the conventional filters of exoticism would allow us to imagine. Thus, the viewer approaching this exhibition will be able to understand the essential elements of a long creative journey through time that encloses the painful labor in the mines under the splendor of the gold and silver trapped in the viceregal images, corresponding to the enduring struggle of art to express social values that have become contaminated or are being denounced.

In producing this ambitious enterprise together with the Haus der Kulturen der Welt and the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía, the Sociedad Estatal para la Acción Cultural Exterior wishes to pay tribute once more to the necessary diffusion of the history we share with a great sister country in America, with a people whose past also represents an essential dimension of our own history and identity. This is why, in recognition of the efforts undertaken over years to open new paths to collaboration and new doors to knowledge and the enjoyment of beauty made image and word as the greatest promise of the Ibero-American peoples, we should express our thanks for the participation of all the institutions and specialists that have made possible this innovative exhibition and the stimulating discussions on which it is founded.

Charo Otegui Pascual, president of the Sociedad Estatal para la Acción Cultural Exterior, SEACEX
Alexander von Humboldt, "the discoverer of the New World," wrote to his brother in a letter from 1800: "There is perhaps no country in the entire world in which one could live more comfortably and peacefully than in the Spanish colonies, through which I have been traveling for fifteen months." This assessment may have turned out differently had his expedition led the explorer—as originally planned—to Potosí, the mining city in the highlands of Bolivia that as a Villa Imperial was the main source of Spanish silver and a cosmopolitan city in the sixteenth century. It was said that with the silver from the mines of Potosí a bridge could be built across the Atlantic all the way to the Andalusian city of Cádiz. In a report to the Spanish "Indian council" from 1699, this sounds a bit different: "Not silver is shipped to Spain, but the blood and sweat of the Indians."

"Vale un potosi"—this harmless-sounding saying can already be found in Don Quixote and even today means "It's worth a fortune." The vernacular has washed away the blood sticking to the silver. Yet there is still no agreement on how many people died in the silver mines of Potosí. The talk is of eight million—a number that can never be absolutely precise, for the mine is still being operated today, employing thousands of mineros under deadly working conditions. The life expectancy of the miners is approximately forty-five years.

Back to Alexander von Humboldt once more—following this excellent exhibition's associative method so rich in contrasts. He set off to Latin America in 1799 to explore "the appearances of things in their general interrelations." The Humboldt Principle follows a universalistic ideal of harmony. The curators of this project, Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, and Andreas Siekmann, counter this with their "Potosí Principle." First of all, it means that the silver from Potosí triggered the accumulation of capital in Europe, allowing a hegemonic unfolding of magnificence, while in Latin America hosts of indigenous laborers lived in the mining hells of Cerro Rico. Furthermore, it means that the asymmetries of capital accumulation here and of oppression there continue to persist in the global economies of the present. A historical line can be drawn from sixteenth-century Potosí to the current power centers of capital—to Moscow, Dubai, or Beijing, to mention a few places which the contemporary artists in this exhibition are dealing with.

With its contemporary positions, this show not only elucidates the topicality of the "Potosí Principle," it also refers to its relevance in today's worldwide art system. In the international art markets and the hubs of globally operating museums in the metropolises, economic and symbolic capital are closely related. Here, the "Potosí Principle" has the effect of a principle of thematic exclusion: What is shown in the centers of power is in line with the interests of the powerful. Cultural hegemony follows political hegemony. And those working in the mines of the global economic system remain symbolically "under the surface" even in the present day.

For this reason, the most ambitious but at the same time the most fascinating claim of this exhibition lies in also depicting the voids forced by the "Potosí Principle" of symbolic exclusion in the discourse: Even the pictures that for reasons of conservation or political constraints in one place or another cannot be displayed in this exhibition itinerary can be seen—as gaps in the space. Similarly, in the video installation dealing with the living conditions of workers in Dubai, we first have to hold a piece of white paper and balance it like a projection screen to be able to recognize the images of the video film.

It is up to us to work with the images. Without making an effort, we fail to grasp the critical view of the global cultural and economic relations that takes into account the symbolic exclusions caused by the "Potosí Principle." Commandingly, this project expects us to make these efforts—and it may do so like virtually no other, because the responsible curators and artists, foremost Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, and Andreas Siekmann, have worked on the historical exploration, artistic depiction, and curatorial mediation of this "Potosí Principle" for a number of years and on many different journeys, thus paving the way for intensive, transatlantic cooperations. We thank the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia in Madrid, the Museo Nacional de Arte and the Museo Nacional de Etnografía y Folklore in La Paz for their participation in this project, as well as the Haus der Kulturen der Welt which—two hundred years after Humboldt—has recommended itself with this project as a forum that rejects all hegemonies stabilized by the "Potosí Principle."

Hortensia Völckers, artistic director, executive board of the German Federal Cultural Foundation
In the Cathedral of Seville, 2008
Workers clean and polish the silver of the monstrance
Photo: Andreas Zielmann
# Thematic Table of Contents

**Andine Baroque Painting / Circulation of Paintings**
125  On Image Production in the Viceroyalty of Peru  
24   On the Global Circulation of Paintings  
262  Roberto Choque Canqui: La iglesia de Jesús de Machaca  
231  Anna Artaker: WORLD MAP  

**Excursions**
21   The Postimerías of Caquiviri  
32   Fátima Olivarez: Representations of Santiago  
33   Many Santiagos  
37   Harun Farocki: The Silver and the Cross (on Descripción del Cerro Rico e Imperial Villa de Potosí)  
49   La Muerte  
52   Virgen del Cerro  
53   María Galindo / Mujeres Creando: Between Two Powers (on Las Novicias)  
58   St. Ildefonsus Receives His Vestment  
60   Virgen de la Natividad de Chuchulaya  
64   Virgen Candelaria de Sabaya  
244  Luis Víctor Alemán Vargas: Desfalso Potosí (on La flagelación de Jesús)  
77   Melchor María Mercado  
84   Amor divinus  
87   Triunfo del Nombre de Jesús  
95   El Primer Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno  
109  Sonia Abián: Angels with Harquebuses  
114  Trinidad  
117  David Riff: A Beautiful Image  
124  Moyen 1720, 1868 and 2010  
127  The Martyrs of Nagasaki  
134  The Festive Entry of Morcillo (on Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí)  
145  Cerco de La Paz  

**Why Pictures Are Coming and Why Pictures Are Not Coming**
18   Why Pictures Are Coming and Why Pictures Are Not Coming  
19   The Case of Caquiviri  
68   Luis Víctor Alemán Vargas: The Looting of Potosí (on La flagelación de Jesús)  
87   Why the Pictures from Jesús de Machaca Are Not Coming  
108  Why the Pictures from Calamarca Are Not Coming  
131  Why the Painting Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí Is Not Coming: (A speech play)  
135  Why the Quipus Are Not Coming  

**Baroque, Hispanidad, Mestizaje**
228  Baroque, Hispanidad, Mestizaje. Jorge Luis Marzo in conversation with Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, Andreas Siekmann  
225  Marcelo Expósito: 143.353 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados)  
49   Mestizaje or Motley Society? (on Muerte de Caquiviri)
Councils
47 Extermination of Idolatry
241 Confesionario para los curas de indios
264 Concilio de Trento (1563). La invocación, veneración y reliquias de los Santos, y de las sagradas imágenes

There is a Primitive Accumulation that is Merely so Called
26 Eduardo Molinari: The Soy Children
28 Karl Marx School of the English Language: The Rosy Dawn of Capital
30 Chto delat: The Tower: A Songspiel
223 Dmitry Vorobyev and Thomas Campbell: The Gazprom Tower Project: Everything Changes for the Better!
42 Paid Freedom and Decolonization. A conversation with Roberto Choque, former Vice-Minister for Decolonization
233 Roberto Choque Canqui: La Mit'a
235 Alice Creischer: Primitive Accumulation, as Exemplified in Potosí
238 Gabriela Massuh: Los verdaderos dueños de la tierra o el desmadré de la minería en América Latina
61 Elvira Espejo: Camino de las Santas – The Path of the Saints
63 http://www.mapademataro.net
71 CVA: Consulting Letter
256 Anthony Davies: Burn Baby Burn ... Some Thoughts on Finance and Art
78 Matthijs de Bruijne: 1000 dreams
81 Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers: The Making of the Chinese New Working Class. Thirty Years of Migration
259 “If you aren’t aware of your culture it seems that you haven’t existed in history.” Max Jorge Hinderer and Matthijs de Bruijne in conversation with Sun Heng and Lin Zhibin
91 Servicio doméstico activo (sedocac): Rafaela, Marlene, and Mary from the sedocac association (Active Domestic Service) in conversation with Konstanze Schmitt
265 Triunfo de las domésticas activas (Performance)
270 Isaías Griffoio: Quienes nos representan en realidad nos reemplazan
274 Breve Relación de los agravios que reciben los indios que ay desde cerca del Cuzco hasta Potosí del Padre Antonio de Ayanz (1596)
280 Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela: Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí
247 Max Jorge Hinderer: Prologue – The long Memory of Cocaine
250 John Barker: From Coca to Capital – Cocaine and the Potosí Principle
Human Rights Tickets

"They are not dignified places, hence the political issue."
Maria Galindo in conversation with Alice Creischer and Max Jorge Hinderer

María Galindo: No se puede descolonizar sin despatriarchizar

"El subsuelo político es la sombra de incertidumbre política que produce un país." Entrevista con Luis Tapia por Max Jorge Hinderer

"Subjectivity should lie on the side of those demanding rights." Christoph Menke in conversation with Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer and Andreas Siekmann

Zhao Liang: Film Sequences from the Archive Petitioners

Documentary Films and Art as a Human Rights Ticket in China. Zhao Liang in conversation with Hildegund Amenshauser, Alice Creischer, and Andreas Siekmann

Sonia Abián: The Aparatoángel

La bua sublimis deus de Pablo III

León Ferrari: Letters to the Pope

"You can’t just say we don’t give a damn about your hyper-capitalism, we will leave the culture industry and only do art and discourse. But precisely this impossibility is what we will do." David Riff in conversation with Alice Creischer and Andreas Siekmann

Universalism

"Declaration on the Importance and Value of Universal Museums"

135 Tom Flynn: The Universal Museum – A Valid Model for the Twenty-first Century?

283 The “Anti-Humboldt”

279 Alice Creischer / Andreas Siekmann: Universalism in Art and the Art of Universalism

284 Nation Branding: Art, Culture and the Construction of National Identity. Panel at the Anti-Humboldt congress

286 Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales: It’s like WORK, which is not to everybody’s liking

World Upside Down

147 Christian von Borries: The Dubai in me

148 World Upside Down: Email correspondence between Peter Linebaugh and the curators, December 2009

290 “La Nación clandestina es la que dice: No ¡Ya basta!” Entrevista con Jorge Sanjinés por Max Jorge Hinderer

List of works

Photographic credits for color plates

List of contributors

Credits
On our first visit to Potosi in 2006 we had the opportunity of viewing the paintings originating from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century under Spanish colonial rule. When in the spring of 2006 we were asked to devise a project for the Museo Reina Sofia in Madrid, we immediately chanced upon the idea of borrowing these canvases and asking contemporary artists to fashion a response to a particular work. We originally named the project Inversión Modernidad, in order to prompt a revision of the concept of Modernity—long overdue in the art world—and to place this term in its colonial context (in Spanish Inversión means both inversion and investment). At issue here was whether the historical relationship of artistic production can be projected onto the present as the regalia of state or as legitimacy for colonial pillage, plunder and genocide, and whether there is a connection between the function of colonial painting and that assumed by the art system in conferring legitimacy upon globalization’s new elites. Our idea was enthusiastically received, not only by the Museo Reina Sofia, but also by the Haus der Kulturen der Welt in Berlin, which as early as autumn 2008 sought responsibility for staging the exhibition in Berlin.

When attending the Otros Bicentenarios conference at the invitation of the Goethe Institute in Buenos Aires, together with sociologists, political scientists and indigenous activists from Bolivia and the Argentine provinces of Patagonia and Salta, we were keenly aware of the danger that the project could possibly become interpreted as yet another item on the “program of events” for the 2010 anniversary festivities. Consequently, we redoubled our efforts to emphasize that our project did not form part of the celebrations marking the “liberation” of the colonies if these were intended to commemorate the liberation of a bourgeois elite which set out with the very same motto with which the French Revolution ended: “Feather your own nest!”. And in so doing, effectively occluded socially and politically more relevant uprisings, such as those launched by Tupac Katari and Bartolina Sisa. Nowadays research projects form part of the program of many art institutions which consider themselves progressive. Based on our experience on this project, we would like to recommend that institutions dedicated to a practice of more intensive research foster greater exchange and links with local institutions and extra-institutional discussions, and that the time-scales for research be expanded. In our opinion, the institutional underpinning of such conditions could help to compensate for absence of opportunities to engage in pure and independent research at the “economized” universities and afford albeit limited freedom in which to conduct it.

Fearing that we lacked the expertise to curate the historical paintings and their contexts, we turned to various institutions for support. We were unable to assess the complexity of the procedures required for securing the loan of the paintings which largely were being shown for the first time in Europe. The Museo Reina Sofia devoted itself to this process—which proved to be one of its most difficult tasks. The organization of the overall project and the loan of the paintings posed a daunting challenge to both institutions. For facilitating the project we would like to extend our gratitude to the directors of the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte, Reina Sofia, and the Haus der Kulturen der Welt, Manuel Borja-Villel and Bernd Scherer, and their staff, together with the Sociedad Estatal para la Acción Cultural Exterior (SEACEX), the Federal Foundation for Culture (Bundeskulturstiftung) and the Fundación Cultural Banco Central de Bolivia. We would also like to take this opportunity to express our special thanks to Edgar Arandia, the Director of the Museo Nacional de Arte in La Paz, for having promptly shared with us his views on the possibility of “decolonizing” public institutions, and for concurring with our conclusion that the role of the artists and curators within such a process must not conform to hegemonic forms of labor division.

From our experience in projects gained prior to The Potosí Principle, we came to recognize that for us “curating” is not a profession, but a form of interrogating how it is possible to continue to work artistically under the present political conditions. It is a collective process in which we, the curators, do not simply select and exhibit the newly produced works, but rather develop them in collaboration with the artists. An artist whose work is chosen by a curator often remains excluded from important decisions; hence there is a two-fold breakdown in communications, both acute and structural in nature. We want to change this. Such a curatorial self-conception has formed part of artistic practice since the 1990s, and deliberately sets out to counter the tendency to depoliticize artistic statements. (This tendency is inherent to the institutions, the art market and to artistic production itself). Such artistic practice is, on the one hand, responding to the simple fact that political information is a precious asset in the world of Berlusconi, Bertelsmann/Murdoch or Disney/Time Warner, and that each of us must endeavor to engage in political work within our own particular sphere, and to reflect this in our methodology. On the other hand, we are also concerned with establishing our own art-historical genealogies; necessitating a fascinating and exhaustive search in both an academically deformed historiography and in an exhibition industry, which—in the era of event marketing—has
outsourced both its responsibility for mediating meaning and context, and its own political memory and archival storage. This has engendered distorting policies on artistic identity and a nationalistically-oriented rhetoric. Often consciously ignoring the division of labor and competences, such a practice may possibly generate conflicts, arising not only from administrative procedures but also from differing political positions. It is precisely such conflicts which define the political valency of a project. During the course of our activities, we sometimes felt trapped between Scylla and Charybdis: having to contend, on the one hand, with diplomatic etiquette and unexpectedly high transportation costs, whilst fearing, on the other, the identitarian categorization of the colonial paintings. Whilst working on the project, we felt torn between the danger of corroborating a discourse which did not strictly reject national-identitarian representation, and the danger of succumbing to a fallacy and affirming, for example, indigenous alterity as the sole legitimate opposition. We wanted neither the one nor the other. For we arrived at the conclusion that both are inextricably linked. We have often observed a tendency to essentialize culture and ethnicity. This detracts from the global interdependence obtaining between economies and politics, which can promote desolidarization. Hence during this project we have adopted a decided internationalist and anti-identitarian position, and consequently have attached greater importance to contemporary aspects, i.e. to the presence of, and responsibility for, the historical and political processes in which we are involved.  

First and foremost, we would like to thank all the artists for the great commitment and expertise they have devoted to this project, particularly also our so-called correspondents, Matthijs de Bruinne, David Riff and Anthony Davies who as co-curators and inspirational sources of ideas, supported the project with incredible patience and solidarity, and María Galindo, whose political experience proved invaluable during the difficult phases we encountered. We would also like to extend our gratitude to the art historians who assisted us in La Paz, Sucre and Potosí, above all to Teresa Gisbert and María Isabel Álvarez Plata, and Fátima Olivaraza and Roberto Choque Canqui in La Paz, without whose advice we could never have gained the requisite art-historical knowledge. Thanks must go to the authors of the catalog, particularly for their readiness to enter into a spirit of cooperation and provide many of their contributions free of charge. We also would like to express our appreciation to Sonja Oehler and Martin Hager for their patience and untiring commitment in compiling this publication; to Francisco Godoy for coordinating on behalf of MNCARS and SEACEX, and once again to Sonja Oehler for handling the coordination in the House of Cultures of the World. Yet our greatest debt of gratitude on this project is extended to those people who have consistently supported and accompanied us during the course of the project: Felix and Nelly Siekmann and Felice Pisano. Without their patience and understanding this project would not have been possible.

Acknowledgments

It is impossible to mention everyone who has supported us in our research and planning and assisted us through the difficult situations encountered within this project. We would like to thank Sergi Farré for securing the loan of the paintings; Carlos Rúa for the remarkable restoration work and cooperation in implementing our ideas for the exhibition; Nuria Enguita, Gabriela Massuh, Sally Gutiérrez, Mercedes Bernabé and Luis Guarani for their solidarity and generosity. We are also indebted to Susanne Leeb, Karin Gudovatz, Marisa Kern, Karoline Noack and Peggy Goede Montalván for lending us their art-historical expertise in Berlin. And we also wish to express our appreciation to Andreas Hoff and Renzon de Luca for their research into the "Nagasaki" painting, and to Franz Obermaier for the loan of the Nierebergh engraving. We would also like to thank Jorge Luis Marzo for his valuable suggestions and advice in regard to Spanish art history.

Thanks also go to Ana Méndez de Andés and Traficantes de Sueños, Ben Seymour, Alexei Penzin, Attilio Valdivieso, Andrés Unter, Orina Guzmán, Jorge Hurtado, Su Wei, the Payers, Ursula Thiemer Sachse, Amparo Carvajal, Minze Tummescheid and Arne Hacter, Hildegund Amanshauser, Cristian Forte, Perdo Querejazu, Lucía Querejazu, Aquiles Alencar Brayner and Geoff West, Guido Cloet, Marijke Heilemans, Werner Thomas, Beatriz Loayza, Lupe Menehcan, David Arquiquia, Reina González, Padre Hugo Limache, Orieta Durandal, Marcela Inch, Marisel Villagomez, Fortuy la Casa Hermanos Manchego, Peggy Goede Montalván, Gloria Cruz Justiniano, Anne Hinderer, Hans-Georg Hinderer, Mirjam Thomann, André Rotmann, Sabine Breitwieser, Helmut Draxler, Hortensia Völckers, Mathias Grufrath, BNV Producciones, Alexander Alberro and John Dunn.

Last, but not least, we would like to express our heartfelt gratitude to all the institutions for the loan of their paintings, which has made it possible for the first time to take a complete exhibition of colonial painting (back) to Bolivia.

Alice Croischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, Andreas Siekmann, July 2010

1 For more details see the lecture by Pilar Liñares and Carlos Vacaflor (Tarra) at the conference Otros Bicentenarios in December 2008. http://otrobicentenario.blogspot.com/2008/12/el-bicentenario-universitario-de-la.html (accessed September 8, 2010).


3 This is how André Rotmann appositely described our dilemma in his article "1000 Words," Artforum, September 2010.

Editorial Note

This catalog is divided into a front section, which provides a guide through the exhibition and introduces the individual works, and a rear section, featuring essays, interviews and lists of sources. The common thread in the first section is the guide, which we wrote for the exhibition in Madrid and which helps illuminate the individual works and paintings within the context of our project. The guide is orientated on the exhibition architecture in the Museo Reina Sofia. Many of the shorter essays at the front refer to the rear sections in which the texts are largely printed in their original language because the budget did not extend to having all the texts translated. The structure of the front section is based on a numbering system which refers to each work. A table of contents lists the key themes of the catalog.
There is a primitive accumulation that is merely so called

There are human rights to have rights over humans

How can we sing the alien song in the land of the Lord?

The Potosí Principle
The world upside down
Welcome to an alien land. We hope you managed to endure the security at departures. Please don’t let the handcuffs of the security guards disturb you. You are neither in prison nor are you being held in a bank as a potential investor. You are not even here anymore. You have left your contemporariness, so to speak, for you are now in a historical space which, we claim, does not draw a straight line but constitutes a simultaneous and never-ending space.

The point from which you will begin your departure is the city of Potosí, a mining city in Bolivia, of which it is said that in the sixteenth century it was larger and more magnificent than London and Paris, and that on public holidays the sidewalks were paved with silver. It is said that with the silver brought from Potosí to Europe a bridge could be built across the Atlantic, all the way to the port of Cádiz. There is an ongoing disagreement about how one can assess the number of people who died from forced labor in the mines. It must have been hundreds of thousands, but it does not stop with this region no longer being a colony—it extends throughout the 200 years of the Republic that is celebrated with the Bicentenario, right up until the present day. This project is dedicated to bringing to mind how all this came about.

The silver is shipped to Cádiz. The Spanish king is so indebted that, in front of the port, the silver is already loaded onto ships traveling to the stock exchanges across Europe. It effects a dynamism decisive to the development of industry, the banking system, the colonial trading companies with their wars and slave ships, the agricultural industry, and the expulsion and impoverishment of people, rendering them available as laborers.

“Hurling” people onto the labor market took place simultaneously in Europe and the colonies. It marks the start of a system that has always operated globally. Our project is about bringing to mind that modern European society and its economic system cannot be conceived without its colonial conditionality and crimes. It is all about the fact that this conditionality has prevailed and continues to prevail everywhere.

This dynamism discharges a mass production of images that are first shipped to the colonies, where they then produce their own images. When we show some of these pictures here, we want them to bear witness to the fact that cultural hegemony is not a symbolic dimension but instead is linked with violence. We cannot demand from these testimonials the engendering of a linear continuity up to the conditionality of hegemony and the globalized creation of value as it exists today. However, we can claim that there are connections between the function of colonial painting and the function that art now assumes in vesting the new elites of globalization with legitimacy.

There are different paths you can take during your departure, but you will always cross the same geographical points, places from which we have invited artists to respond to the pictures from Potosí, based on their local situation in today’s boomtowns. Not the least of our concerns was to make it clear that the production of images is never entirely in line with the technology of power, and that even in its most repressive forms it is capable of expressing a fear and an anticipated revenge against the impossibility of conceiving that a border can actually exist within this infinite immanence of power, and that there are indeed opponents—erratic, corruptible, and unstable ones, who refuse to partake.
Existe una acumulación originaria que sólo se llama así
There is a primitive accumulation that is merely so called

If you have not been immediately steered further and have found a seat on a bench somewhere to read (we do not know how long you will be allowed to stay here), then you will now be looking at the reverse of two large pictures. Because they are transparent, you may be able to recognize a few details on the front. Don’t go to the front, just take a closer look at the reverse. They depict sadistic and obscene torture scenes, distorted faces symbolizing the senses destroyed by torture. In her most recent book, Naomi Klein describes the development of shock therapy in 1960s psychiatry and its link to neoliberal think tanks and the CIA. Shock therapy grasps the “ill” psyche as a computer program that must be deleted so that it can be reinstalled. The methods of shock therapy were first employed both as torture and as an economic program in the dictatorships of South America. Terror and restructuring programs, paralyzing resistance against antisocial policies by producing fear still belong to the program of neoliberalism.

The engravings you see here were made in the Jesuit province of Paraguay in 1705. They are part of a compendium teaching people how to fear hell and death. What you see here are details of an outstanding pioneering achievement, one of the first self-produced prints translated into Guaraní in the viceroyalty of Peru: That is how important it was to arouse fear.

You deem the leap from the methods of neoliberal politics to these motifs to be too big, too imprecise? You are right. Now let us take a look at the picture from the front and start something we will continue to do along the entire section, namely, to survey the distance of this leap in a more precise way. Please take a look at the first of the two large silver point drawings. They are drawn on duplicating foil and modeled on pictures from the church of Caquiaviri. You can listen to the audio recordings of the five-hundredth anniversary of the church (on January 17, 2010) over the headphones.

The parish refused to lend us these pictures. You can read about the reasons for this on the reverse of the photo which is hanging together with a magnifying glass on the bottom edge of the picture.
Why Pictures Are Coming and Why Pictures Are Not Coming

Why it is important that absent pictures are accorded the same space their presence would have taken up.

When we started with the project we thought borrowing pictures from Bolivia would be fairly unproblematic. We thought the municipalities and museums would be happy that we were interested, because it would lead to these pictures being restored and brochures being published of them, where at present very few people are familiar with the works. We thought we could repeat the experience of our first visit to Caquiaviri, where we apparently came to an agreement with the priest. In return for lending us a picture the community would receive a new alarm system for the church that would make the work more difficult to steal when it was returned. We even planned a compensatory exchange of pictures between Europe and Bolivia. We deemed it high time for a rehabilitation of the pictures that are hanging in European ethnological museums rather than those devoted to art. We now realize that these ideas were naïve.

With just one exception, no pictures arrived from the communities, and the pictures from the institutions were accompanied by substantial invoices for transportation and insurance expenses. We cannot regard the reason why some pictures arrive and why others do not as an organizational problem, because it reveals a power relation of which we are a part.

There are funny anecdotes about why pictures fail to arrive: a mayor who has to show off in front of his municipality demanding a mountain tractor; an artist asking for a solo show at Museo Reina Sofia and Centre Pompidou; curators suspected of stealing pictures. However, if you read about the reasons why pictures from Europe are not lent to Bolivia, then these anecdotes turn into an appropriate response to the absurdity of the power to retain, something endorsed in European institutions regarding pictures and objects from former colonies.

You will also be able to read about how these absurd stories and the justified mistrust of the communities gain a different coherence in the face of organized lootings by the recipients of stolen antiques. When you discover that the world's largest collection of quipus ended up at the Ethnological Museum in Berlin, which today claims to possess more than 50 percent of all existing artifacts, you will realize that this is by no means a marginal topic.

Let's return to the fact that pictures disappear after we—the curators of a project at Museo Reina Sofia—have viewed them, or that the costs for their transportation exceed the project's scope. Hence, we have ourselves initiated a process we term fetishization, in the sense of a valuation that always stands in a hostile relationship to its surroundings. This valuation that is unavoidably linked to our interest in making this exhibition, can—in terms of consequences for the communities—entail the pictures being threatened by robbery, either by gangs of fences, by their own government, or by European governments and their state museums.

We were no supposed to intervene in the tricky negotiations between the Spanish and local institutions regarding the loan of pictures. These were certainly negotiations that, in their own institutional manner, knew how to place stakes on the colonial history between Spain and Bolivia, as a pawn. Similarly, the recent Bicentenario—the anniversaries celebrations commemorating the independence of Latin America, within the framework of which this exhibition will take place—indeed meant liberation for a certain class. The negotiations are certainly a pioneering achievement that we respect, providing the opportunity once more letting these pictures gain significance in their circulation.

The high sums for transportation and insurance are quite natural for historical pictures. Yet we cannot ignore the fact that this valuation, which we are now witnessing and have contributed to by initiating, is logically and necessarily linked to theft in the past and in the present in terms of the storage of stolen goods; this strange form of caring for their preservation, as if their imperishability would lead to people forgetting that they had been stolen.

One commonly used definition holds that fetishization entails forgetting an original theft and the violence it involved, and that, precisely by overcoming it, it becomes an attraction or a regalia of the same violence. This takes place in the form of commodities, but also in the epistemological models on which a society views itself. For us, the issue of why pictures arrive and do not arrive was a general experience regarding the overarching epistemological model of the museum: collecting, comparing, ordering, preserving objects—a bank and its bonds, which are forfeited if their significance is not warranted. Yet this significance is not only established and sealed in the neighboring institution of the academy. It must be additionally confirmed by a public discourse, which also always poses a threat because it can give an account of the places from
which the objects stem. It may be right that we see our task as posing a threat of this kind, but it is not entirely true.

We are not in agreement about whether we should have put reproductions on show instead of the original pictures. On the basis of what we have already experienced, we are saying no to the originals. But involuntarily we wish for a yes because we are fetishists ourselves, enticed by the pictures at the moment of their presence and, at that moment, we are convinced that their presence is not "dust", but the presence of their own history. This presence we insist on.

Reina J. González, director general of plurinational public administration in the Vice-Ministry of Decolonialization, who participated in the negotiation and lending process with various different communities:

"We have to find an explanation for the fierce resistance demonstrated by certain communities to lending pictures. We applied to borrow several paintings from various communities, including Calamarca, Jesús de Machaca, and Caquiaviri, of which only one (Chuchulaya) was accepted. These reactions are impressive, and it is interesting to note that there is a common cause for all of these decisions: evidence of the existence of reappropriation of heritage by these communities. As part of our efforts to have the loan authorized, we were able to attend a joint meeting, along with the staff of the Spanish embassy and the Museo Reina Sofía, that was called to address a primarily political issue. We learned that the communities have a central concern about lending works of art: 'What happens if they are taken away and we never see them again? This has happened to us before.' Or 'What happens if we give away the painting and we get an imitation back? We are not going to let the painting go!' This was the final answer, even though there was a real possibility of someone elected by the community itself accompanying the painting during transportation and throughout the process until the opening of the exhibition. This all suggests a perfectly justified reappropriation of what we call heritage, in which each painting represents not only the time and place, but also the real context of its creation, and the related mistrust is also associated with another phenomenon: theft. A significant amount of heritage theft goes on in Bolivia, in particular from community churches. This is a central issue when it comes to loans; the visibility of the pictures implies the possibility of their being stolen. There is a national position, a government position, but there is also a community position, which we have to recognize and accept."

The Case of Caquiaviri

It was clear from the very start that borrowing pictures would be difficult in technical terms, due to their size and the fact that nobody knew how they were attached to the walls. At the same time, negotiations commenced between the municipalities, the Spanish Embassy, and the Museo Reina Sofía. In exchange for the loan, the mayor of Caquiaviri initially demanded a solo exhibition at Museo Reina Sofía and the Centre Pompidou for a famous folklore artist who is an honorary citizen of the municipality. During the further course of negotiations he added demands for a mountain tractor and permission for twenty members of the community to travel to Madrid with the picture. There were rumors that the mayor had issued these stipulations in order to regain his previously lost sympathy in the community.
The picture consists of two highly dissimilar parts. Right at the top, people are depicted strolling through an idyllic landscape in broad daylight and being fished with rods directly to hell by devils. The legality of torture, the equivalence of torture to sins, the equality in law of cardinals, princes, and popes in the cooking pot—all this is merely a brief distraction from the massiveness of power detached from legality, which without reason can draw people from the landscape into torture. When we look at the picture, we cannot forget that Caquiyaviri was a transportation hub of the silver and copper trade, that the cacique, the community authority, held shares in the mines of Potosí 1,000 kilometers away. The cacique was made responsible by the Spanish colonial power in the entire region for recruiting Indios for forced labor in Potosí.

The picture is part of one of the few completely preserved, impressive picture ensembles, so-called postrimerías, filling the entire church in Caquiyaviri. Postrimerías (depictions of Death, the Final Judgment, and Agonies) were quite widespread in the region around Lake Titicaca. They belong to the first Christian picture motifs in South America. As small altars, they even accompanied the baptism of slaves when they arrived in the ports. Baptism and showing hell thus constitute one and the same moment.

The anthropologist Michael Taussig described the role of terror as a mediator par excellence regarding colonial hegemony. It opens up a space in which the arbitrariness of the colonizer prevails as unrestrictedly as the power of hell. These spaces have a long and rich tradition, and their signifiers mingle with those of the conquered. Yet these signifiers do not function correctly, for the arbitrariness of power aims at obliterating meaning. Taussig transfers this destruction of meaning to the same disarrangement between ourselves and commodities.

Before continuing, take a long look at the picture. You are familiar with its motifs; they reference a long tradition of terror in Europe itself—before it was exported to the colonies by the colonial government.

The Postrimerías of Caquiyaviri

Max Jorge Hinderer: Are there links between the economic development of the city of Potosí between the 1500s and 1700s and image production there?

María Isabel Álvarez Plata: I think there are very strong links. In terms of the development of mining, its output, mining develops very rapidly over the centuries you refer to. It has its ups and downs, but I think that above all it is responsible for what is produced in the painting of the time.

That is, it is the miners who are consuming this art, and they are the ones who have political power locally. But at the same time, they are directly related to the power of the Church, so that as they are creating wealth they have to help the Church, and thus a circle is established, since it's the Church that's going to evangelize the indigenous people, and the indigenous people who are going to work in the mines. So there's no question that this circle is important, you see; while you're generating money in mining you're going to be able to fund more images and evangelize more indigenous people, and these same people are going to work in the mines and hold the beliefs that you are defining. It is a very well thought out circle of power.

María Isabel Álvarez Plata in conversation with Alice Creitscher, Max Hinderer and Andreas Siekmann, La Paz, January 12, 2009

Photos: Carlos Rúa Landa / Ministerio de Culturas, Gobierno Plurinacional de Bolivia
The postrimerías of Caquiaviri consist of Death, the Last Judgment, the Reign of the Antichrist, Hell, and Glory (Muerte, Juicio final, Reino del Anticristo, Infierno, Gloria). It occupies the nave of the church. On the top part of the wall is the cycle of St. Anthony the Abbot, the patron saint of the parish.

The iconography of the pictures of Caquiaviri refers to the then highly popular treatise: *Diferencia entre lo temporal y lo eterno* by the Jesuit Eusebio de Nieremberg, which was translated into all European languages. It is a compendium of religious edifying literature on the last four things people experience: Death, Purgatory, Hell, and the Last Judgment. Such compendiums and their etchings are important sources for religious program painting in Europe and America. *Lo temporal y lo eterno* belongs to the repertory of the publisher Plantin Presse in Antwerp and the missionary teaching tools of the Jesuits. The etchings in the respective editions were created by different artists, among others, Gaspar Boutilats, Johann Hieronymus, and Johan Wierix.

Teresa Gisbert assumes that the series in Caquiaviri was inspired by the archbishop of La Plata’s brother, who was trained at the Jesuit school San Bernardo in Cusco and lived in Caquiaviri. The sons of the caziques from the region around La Paz also went to this school.2

One of the often cited sources on the dissemination and effect of the postrimerías in the kingdom of Peru is a passage in the chronicle of Poma de Ayala: “and in each church a court should be painted, and that is where the arrival of the Lord to the court is to be shown, Heaven, Earth, and the torments of Hell.”3 Rolena Adorno assumes that Poma de Ayala may have been an interpreter at the Third Church Council of Lima.4 In addition to the numerous mentions of the Council, his chronicle also takes up the rhetoric of the sermons and prayers, which were guidelines for missionary work in the communities. The decrees of the Council were confirmed both by the Spanish Crown and the Pope.5

Poma de Ayala draws the Leviathan, (in this picture on the bottom right), who is a fixed component of the iconography of Hell, a “worm of consciousness…. This worm is grim sorrow and vain penitence that the evil persons there will always possess, and it will never end as long as God is God and in all eternity without ceasing. Consider this punishment….”6, and reverses the thread against the class which installed it.

We have asked ourselves if this is a picture puzzle. Sinners being punished in hell, people being driven off their land and forced to work in the mines. Is historical reality depicted in an imposed iconography, or are we seeing an imposed catechism, congruent with its iconography and so banal in this perfect hegemony that the presence of history becomes mere speculation in the eye of the beholder?

Teresa Gisbert writes that it is difficult to make out any clearly indigenous bodies in this jumble of the many naked, tormented bodies in this inferno. She assumes that most of the bodies are white, because that is how the European original has it.7 So are the bodies white or rather brown, is the red complexion of some skin caused by the glow of fire or by race? The attempts at art historical classification become monstrous and banal themselves. Is this kind of art history a part of the self-conception of a class that culturalized indigeneousness as national identity and that excluded the majority indigenous population from all political decision-making (as European art history ignores its own colonial history)? So is “I cannot for the life of me make out any
indigenous bodies in this hell" the symptom of a white middle class in a state apart? And do we have a different analysis to offer?

In *Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man* Michael Taussig describes the role of terror as a "mediator par excellence of colonial hegemony." It is what constitutes a space in which the despotism of the colonizer is as unbridled a ruler as the power in hell:

"This space of death has a long and rich culture. It is where the social imagination has populated its metamorphizing images of evil and the underworld. With the European conquest ... these spaces of death blend into a common pool of key signifiers binding the transforming culture of the conqueror with that of the conquered. But the signifiers are strategically out of joint with what they signify."  

Taussig investigates European narratives of colonial terror at the start of the twentieth century: reports on the killing fields of Colombian rubber plantations and Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* in the Congo. But the accounts either remain banal or become accomplice to the perpetrators in their descriptions of horror, which inappropriately marry savagery and terror in fascination. "Terror nourished itself by destroying sense." This destruction of sense can be transferred to the same "disarrangement ... between us and the things in the fetishism of commodities. ... In modern history the fetishism of commodities rejuvenates the mythic density of the space of death ... whereby a resurgent animism makes things human and human things."  

We claim that images such as the hell of Caquiarui are situated on a simultaneously readable timeline. So let us attempt a third leap in time, from silver to rubber to the resources of the 1970s, all the way to the present day. In her most recent book, Naomi Klein describes the development of shock therapy in 1960s Canadian psychiatry and its connection to the Milton Friedman Institute in Chicago. Shock therapy grasps the "sick" psyche as a computer program that must be deleted, to then reinstall it again. The patient is subjected to a torture of interrogations with the aim of destroying the entire personal consciousness and its memories. The methods of shock therapy became a component of the CIA's torture training for dictatorships in South America; their episteme legitimized neoliberal reforms conducted by these governments as an experiment. Klein describes various historical cases of this "therapy" in South America, South Africa, and subsequently in Poland, Russia, and China, where ostensible democratization in the 1980s and 1990s was linked—as the only alternative—to a neoliberal regime. She also gives an account of the so-called reforms in Bolivia after 1985, after (and with) the dictatorial Banzer government. She reports how Jeffrey Sachs (later the most influential adviser of the new governments of the 1990s) consults the Banzer government even before the elections, and how these plans are implemented by the Eustensoro and Lozada administrations. The measures of this therapy "called for the elimination of food subsidies, the canceling of almost all price controls, and a 300 percent hike in the price of oil, the freeze of wages." They were prepared like a coup d'état. They amounted to a dictate employing the arguments of urgency, a state of emergency, radical enforcement, and the immediate cure of a sick person. Nobody in the cabinet contradicted these arguments. Klein compares this approach to military strategies, that "seize control of the environment and paralyze or so overload an adversary's perceptions and understanding of events so that the enemy would be incapable of resistance."  

Is it the image of such a package of measures that paralyzes one's ability to perceive? So does the destruction of sense by terror and its historical continuity make it impossible for us to interpret the image of hell in Caquiarui, although/because its iconography follows the European original so faithfully? Can we sit back and link this impossibility to an age-old European problem of knowledge: the mirroredness of one's own statements, the impossibility of making synthetic judgments a priori, where the a posteriori, the space of experience is tunnels, galleries, the cell—impossible to enter and horrific? The way out of this aporia seems as simple as it is laborious.

"Our way lies upstream, against the current, upriver near the foothill of the Andes where Indian healers are busy healing colonists of the phantoms assailing them. There... the healer desensibilizes terror so that the mysterious side of the mysterious (to adopt [Walter] Benjamin's formula) is indeed denied by an optic that perceives the everyday as impenetrable, impenetrable as the everyday."  

Thirty years after the creation of the paintings of Caquiarui, in the course of the indigenous rebellions of the eighteenth century, the authorities set up re-education ayllus for Spaniards, with the aim of civilizing them.

"... between the years 1750 and 1771 there were three rebellions that established the basic pattern for the more recent liberation of the indigenous people. The first was the religious decolonization, expressed in the Ambaná rebellion of the 1750s. The second was the recovery of economic control over the area, which came about at Chulumani in 1771, ... in the same year the Caquiarui rebellion broke out, during which the indigenous people killed the local corregidor and were taken by surprise by their own victory. What was to be done with the Spaniards who were resident in the town? ... Finally the community leaders of Caquiarui decided to make the mestizos and creoles a Machaqu Ayllu, a new ayllu, which would be an ayllu for miners, that is to say,
those who are learning to be civilized, on the understanding that, obviously, to be civilized is to be indigenous. ... So the Machaq aylla of Caquiariviri had to be re-educated in the ways of indigenous society and to renounce its unearned privileges, and would stop being q’aras and become people ... the mestizo creoles were made to wear indigenous clothing; the women had to learn to spin and weave, and the men to work the soil. ... The action taken in Caquiariviri implies a valuation of the farm as a world that produces not only potatoes but also philosophy, culture, and a social and political order. ... The idea of poiesis could be applied to this civilizing and cultural dimension, as proposed by Waman Puma de Ayala. ... The seventeenth-century Andean chronicler remarks on the indigenous wise man as a ‘poet and astrologist’ ... as the creator of a material and spiritual poiesis, he embodies the re-education of the colonizer as proposed by the indigenous people of Caquiariviri in 1771.15

So must we simply leave the aporia itself and learn from those who were in hell? And does this not assume that one can simply switch off one’s own life experience and one’s own achieved existence at will, as if one were but a generic die—ininitely expandable and pervasive to the new foreign experiences.

AC

1 Here, we mainly refer to Teresa Gisbert, Iconografía y mitos indígenas en el arte (La Paz, 2004) and El paraíso de los pájaros parlantes (La Paz, 2003).
2 "We know that since 1735 Don Pablo Marceliano y Agramont (1696-1740), brother of the Archbishop of La Plata, was a priest in Caquiariviri." Gisbert, El paraíso, p. 130.
4 See Rolena Adorno: Guaman Poma, Writing and Resistance in Colonial Peru (Austin, 1988).
5 "In many rural churches the four stages of the end of man were depicted ... according to the recommendations of the Third Council of Lima in 1584, as expressed in the Doctrina Cristiana y catecismo para instrucción de Indios (‘Christian Doctrine and Catechism for the Instruction of the Indians’). There, twenty-three folios are dedicated to the postrimerías or ‘last things.’" Gisbert, El paraíso, p. 133.
6 Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala, El Primer Nueva Corónica Y Buen Gobierno, p. 943.
7 "It is very difficult to make out indigenous people among the countless naked bodies in the picture. They are mostly white people, corresponding to the European engravings," Teresa Gisbert: Iconografía y mitos indígenas en el arte, p. 210.
9 Taussig, ibid. He is referring to slave-like working conditions in the region of the Putamayo river at the beginning of the twentieth century. Some 30,000 indigenous workers were tortured and killed.
10 Taussig, ibid.
14 Taussig, Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man, p. 12.

On the Global Circulation of Paintings

On the murals adorning the pediment of the church in Carabuco on Lake Titicaca one can recognize a compass and a circle. Painted in the eighteenth century, this logo of the Plantin Press alludes to the history of the global circulation of paintings, whose origins trace back to the sixteenth century. It is a history that is closely connected to the Plantin-Moretus printing house from Antwerp:

The Plantin press owned the monopoly on the publication and sale of liturgical works destined for export to Spain and the colonies. Known as books of the “New Message,” thousands of religious treatises flooded onto the Ibero-American market after 1572.1

The history of the Plantin Press demonstrates that the industrialization of pictorial reproduction through the printing and circulation of paintings is inextricably linked
to the politics of the Counter-Reformation and evangelization in the new colonies. It also shows that the Counter-Reformation and colonialization were two sides of the one and same coin: an Iglesia Militante.

Since the Council of Trent, reproductions of paintings had become one of the key instruments in the drive to evangelize the new colonies and disseminate propaganda in the religious wars in Europe. Hence the “pictorial turn” of the Counter-Reformation was directed against the emancipatory possibilities unleashed by the Reformation and the Gutenberg press, namely the democratization of the study of the Bible. It was, therefore, intended for a populace who could not read and whose literacy was deemed undesirable.

Back to the Plantin Press: By the end of the religious wars, Antwerp had grown into a citadel of the Counter-Reformation. Philip II of Spain exploited the local printing industry both to expand the administration of the colonial empire and for religious propaganda purposes.

“On June 20, 1570, the King nominated Plantin as the ‘prototypographus regius’. The printing house was charged with the task of policing the ordinances set forth in the royal correspondence for controlling the printing presses in the Netherlands and Flanders. Furthermore, on February 1, 1571, he awarded the publishing house the monopoly on the production and sale of breviaries, books of hours designed by the Council of Trent. Having initially himself acted as publisher and purveyor of these publications, Philip II then transferred such responsibilities to the Jeronimites of San Lorenzo de El Escorial in 1573.”

Consequently, one can assume that the function entrusted to Plantin was to impose censorship on the printing houses in Flanders and the Netherlands, and prohibit the circulation of documents which were deemed inimical to the interests of the Counter-Reformation.

“When Jan Moretus, Plantin’s son in law, inherited the publishing house, both he and his successors continued to work for the Spanish crown, even during the Bourbon dynasty. ... The importance of the books from this printing house ... lay in the fact that they were works with copper prints illustrating the title pages along with parts of the mass relating to special feasts of the liturgical year: the Easter, Pentecost, and Advent cycle began with pictures alluding to those feasts, thus making these books into real visual encyclopedias of the Christian faith ... apart from this, Plantin and other printers published countless prints of the most varied themes of Christian religion, including the lives of the apostles, evangelists, saints, martyrs, doctors, and founders of religious orders, engravings of which reached into the tens of thousands.”

The Peruvian art historian Francisco Sastam describes how this printing industry serviced (and indeed satisfied) the increased hunger for knowledge, which extended across all cultural and scientific realms.

These religious prints enjoyed the widest circulation. Not only were they to be found in all European cities, but the epoch of their reproduction coincided with the discovery of the New World and the missionary campaigns of the Counter-Reformation. There are too many examples of these prints serving as artistic models to believe that this was a phenomenon isolated merely to Peru. In fact it was general practice. We know that they were used a thousand times over and that the workshops of the artists were veritable archives of copper-engraving. After his death, the Colombian painter Baltasar de Figueroa left behind six engraved books on the lives of the saints, as well as 1,800 additional engravings.

Consequently, it would be too one-sided to characterize these liturgical and religious compendia as the “yellow press” of the Counter-Reformation. Yet neither were they akin to didactic fiats issued by the Church and dispatched to the farthest reaches of the colonies. They served as templates, and, at the same time, vehicles for disseminating the motifs of artistic production throughout the centers of Europe, and to centers extending from America to the Philippines. Their fluctuating proliferation spawned the creation of fashionable or particularly popular motifs which derived from the Church’s general plan, but which become uncontrollable as this new medium developed a momentum all of its own. Some of the paintings presented here are good examples of this.

3 Teresa Gisbert, Jose de Mesa, Pedro Querejazu, Bolivian Masterpieces; Colonial Painting (La Paz and Houston, 1994), p. 74.
4 Francisco Sastam, Breve Historia del Arte en el Peru (Lima, 1967), p. 35.
We are impatient and will now guide you straight across the entire room to the right, behind the last wall, because we would like to continue telling you the following about commodities: in each commodity, as concealed labor time, lies concealed a history of terror, of forcing people to work. Since colonization, it has been inextricably linked to the export of the bestiality of our own social relations to the periphery, the colonized countries—where it engenders new commodities and terror: silver or natural rubber, coins for standing armies or tires for the Model T, palm oil, green fuel, and—the car tank in competition with the stomach—soy.

You now find yourself in a Laundromat like in the movies of the Fordist dream factory. Here, you can look at drawings, documents, and photos, all components of a travelogue leading to the Argentine provinces of Buenos Aires and Santa Fe. Once again, a torture of the senses is described:

"Something alien came from the visual field, fell into our senses to the other parts of the body and forcefully hit the stomach.... It is something one cannot see, cannot define, and which is in absolute harmony with the concept of transgene." (Eduardo Molinari) The torture consists in the intolerability of not being able to resolve—like Pavlov's dog—an equivalence of signs between this green, peaceful landscape and the knowledge of the fact that this is a polluted, highly capitalized, agrichemical complex. The report will give you information on the history of soy cultivation ("soyazation") in Argentina, serving as an example of the current boom in agriculture as THE novel financial product following the crisis. According to the World Hunger Index 2009, the number of people suffering from hunger will exceed one billion in 2010. Since the crisis, regions the size of European countries are being purchased in Latin America and Africa for the agroindustry. Continue reading about what the issue is with washing machines at the end of the first path.

The Soy Children
Eduardo Molinari

The "soyazation" process has turned Argentina into the world's third-biggest producer of soy and by-products, second-biggest producer of genetically modified soy (after the USA), and biggest exporter of soy flour and soy oil. Of the total cultivated lands in Argentina, 50 percent belong to soya, and 90 percent of that surface corresponds to Monsanto's RR GM soya (and Monsanto's local representatives). This agrarian system and its results are only possible using Roundup herbicide, the brand name of Monsanto's glyphosate. During the 2007-08 season, 180,000,000 liters of glyphosate were sprayed over Argentina land, turning the country into a "massive experiment" from the ecotoxicological point of view—in the words of Andrés Carrasco, director of the Laboratory of Molecular Embryology at the National Scientific and Technical Research Council (CONICET) and professor of embryology at the Faculty of Medicine of the University of Buenos Aires (UBA). At the same time, this territory is a part of a new recognizable form on the maps of South America: the "Republic of Soya." Created for an advertisement by the multinational company Syngenta, this new "republic" crosses the borders of some of the national states which celebrate their bicentennials in 2010: it covers part of Argentina, Uruguay, Paraguay, Bolivia, and Brazil. [...]
that gives information about cases of people and towns in Argentina suffering the effects of the indiscriminate use of agrotoxic chemicals, but above all, tries to raise awareness for people to defend themselves from the consequences of agribusiness, through collective work and knowledge of legal instruments. Through GRR’s material I knew of shocking cases, such as that of Marta Cian from Líbaros, in the province of Entre Ríos, who has to wear a mask every day, similar to those used by soldiers in World War I, to protect herself from poisonous gases.

Or Fabián Tomasi, ex-fumigator and flagman, in Basavilbaso, in the same province:

“...No one ever explained to us the quality of the water, I’ve learnt about it later on. We wore women’s stockings, tights on the mouth for the slime not to pass, to cover the mouth of the pipe in the airplane. That was the only treatment for the water. I’ve worked as a flagman many times and, although they deny it to Dr. Graciela Gómez, I know they keep on doing it for the sake of practicality. There are many pilots who don’t know how to use GPS, so it is easier to place an employee on the field with a bag to mark the lot and generally, in order not to waste time, one ducks down; we ducked when that spray fell on our backs, it was poison, but we were happy and thanked the pilot for cooling us.”

My wishes (an urban inhabitant’s wishes) to get close, physically, to a field transformed by biotechnology and agribusiness, to know its scale, proportions, smells, colors and above all, to try to inhabit—at least for a short time—the invisible world of transgenic plantations, my wishes faced something unexpected: the soy-world has a pleasant appearance, full of green, stillness, and immensity. However, something strange escapes the field of vision, an escape from our senses to another part of the body, that punches us in the stomach. The soy-world is full of black holes, of passages to another and no place. What remains unseen is what defines it, in perfect tune with the very notion of the transgenic.

As the anonymous painter of the colonial painting of St. Ildefonsus had done, among those strange, genetically manipulated plants I tried to find the main figures of the soy rural model. The reality that inhabitants of cities only know through mass media, in flattened versions, like something out of a sci-fi film (directed by unknown people), or also like an alien invasion.

I tried to observe, listen, get close, and depict the landscapes and inhabitants of those regions in which nature and its immense power are “there,” within one’s reach.

Many times during the trips, walking along natural trails, by the river, near the trees, the animals, birds, through tracks (or unpaved roads), under the sun or (unexpected) rains, I remembered the anonymous Andean painter and wondered what images he would choose today to paint his picture.

I also remembered him as I walked to wherever my intuition took me, in the surroundings of the well-watched plants of the farming pools, the silos, the parking lots for thousands of trucks, the entrances to ports.

What are the faces portrayed today in the transgenic landscape? Who walk through the strange plants and shake hands on a bridge? Would anybody have reasons to flagellate themselves? Is a mystical ecstasy possible here? Are there donors? Finally, do miracles happen in the “Republic of Soya”?

Extracts from Eduardo Molinari, Los niños de la Soja (Buenos Aires, 2010).

---


---

Read more about the picture on the wall above the washing machines at the end of the third departure path (p. 140).

In two months, the Museo Reina Sofía attracts 360,000 visitors, filing them through and spitting them out again. It was pointed out to us often enough that this procedure requires strict organization. We sabotage their rapid checking and clearance, for it is crucial that we take the time to tell visitors more about this initial path of departure. It is dedicated to a process in which “great masses of men are suddenly and forcibly torn from their means of subsistence, and hurled as free and ‘unattached’ proletarians on the labor market.” This is how Marx describes expropriation in the chapter on primitive accumulation. These thrusts are uninhibited and do not form a starting point that has a beginning or an end; they are instead part of a circulation, the commencement of which was greatly accelerated by the silver from Potosí.
Now go back to the front along the wall with the tubes of the washing machines until you arrive at a small door. To the left of it you will find a small picture. The door leads to a chamber in which you can listen to the following lesson: "The discovery of gold and silver in America, the extirpation, enslavement, and entombment in mines of the aboriginal population, the beginning of the conquest and looting of the East Indies, the turning of Africa into a warren for the commercial hunting of black-skins, signalized the rosy dawn of the era of capitalist production." This is one of the essential statements in the chapter on accumulation. You now repeatedly and insistently hear this statement with a Russian accent—provided with American corrections in regard to pronunciation. You can follow the way the "students" relate this sentence to their political situation in Russia, and how the alien, hegemonic language is both a barrier and a memory of the extinguished knowledge of a political era. The discussion becomes loud and the pictures on the wall start to tremble, when the issue is a political practice that claims to resist the process of accumulation.

Karl Marx School of the English Language: The Rosy Dawn of Capital

The Karl Marx School of the English Language was not originally an art project, but a language workshop and reading group of artists, philosophers, and political activists. It was founded in Moscow in 2005. The group’s meetings took place once a week in 2006 and 2007 at the studio of the artist Dmitry Gutov.

English native speakers helped the Russian participants to read aloud, pronounce, and understand English translations of Karl Marx. These included the "Theses on Feuerbach," a letter from Marx to Arnold Ruge, and "Private Property and Communism" from the Economic & Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844. After comparing the English translations to their German originals and their Russian versions, the group would launch into intense political and artistic debates on the current relevance of these texts. Gutov began to make paintings for every new session to avoid doing his written homework, thus eventually turning the reading group into an art project.

In January 2010, the Karl Marx School of the English Language reconvened to read and discuss the chapter on primitive accumulation in Capital Vol. 1. The present installation documents this activity.

The Rosy Dawn of Capital

The discovery of gold and silver in America, the extirpation, enslavement, and entombment in mines of the aboriginal population, the beginning of the conquest and looting of the East Indies, the turning of Africa into a warren for the commercial hunting of black-skins, signalized the rosy dawn of the era of capitalist production.

DG: The discovery of gold and silver in America, the extirpation …
DR: … extirpation …
DG: … the extirpation, enslavement, and entombment …
DR: … entombment …
DG: … entombment in mines of the aboriginal population …
DR: … the aboriginal population …
DG: … aboriginal population, the beginning of the conquest and looting of the East Indies, the turning of Africa into a warren for the commercial hunting of black skins …
DR: Can you say “black-skins”?
DG: Black skins?
DR: Black-skins.
DG: Black skins.
DR: …
DG: Signalized the rosy dawn of the era of capitalist production.

These idyllic proceedings are the chief moments of primitive accumulation.

On their heels treads the commercial war of the European nations, with the globe for a theatre.

[...] But they all employ the power of the State, the concentrated and organized force of society, to hasten, hot-house fashion, the process of transformation of the feudal mode of production into the capitalist mode, and to shorten the transition.
Force is the midwife of every old society pregnant with a new one. It is itself an economic power.

DR: What does it mean?
DR: Put the manuscript away, Kostya ...
KB: Okay. ... Retell this phrase, yeah ...
DR: ... in your own words ...
KB: Colonial system use force to get the goal it wants, and it uses the force of the state for its purposes, to hasten, to hothouse the process ...
DG: I think that the meaning of this sentence is much wider ...
KC: Broader.
DG: Broader?
DR: Broader.
DG: Broader.
KB: Broader, because force is an economic power.
DG: But, you see, here we’ve got pure violence as a form of greed.
DR: Greed?
IB: I don’t understand what greed is. I understand what greed means, but I don’t think this is a question of that capitalism is just greedy. Capitalism at every moment of its growth need to destroy ...
DR: Needs ...
IB: Needs to destroy and need to intervene in the areas ...
DR: NEEDS ...
IB: Needs to intervene in the areas where there are possibilities for capitalism to grow. I think that every normal capitalist crisis and every strategy of every capitalist company in a capitalist crisis is the best example for this kind of violence.
DG: We remember it so well, all of us. The nineties in this country were the epoch of primitive accumulation in its purest form, and I remember when I was reading this chapter in the nineties, I reread it maybe once a week. It was the best illustration of what was going on in the streets.
KC: Murders.
DG: Murders, violence ...
KC: Clashes between ...
DG: Absolutely in the same form. We KNOW ...
KC: We saw primitive accumulation.
DG: It’s not history that was five or three hundred years ago. We remember: it was and it is part of our lives.

KB: And I as an adult person think that this process was not primary accumulation.
DG: Primitive.
KB: Primitive, because it didn’t change the mode of production, it did not change the character of the property.
KC: Since today’s capitalism is globalized, it always has interconnections with wild capitalism, the places where the new money is coming from. The places of the new money are China, Latin America, and if you talk about Russia, it is still not refined capitalism.
DR: Primitive accumulation is still going on.
DG: Friend, friends! I think what is really important. We have to find a way to connect all these theoretical problems and these historical problems ...
KC: With our lives.
DG: With our own lives. And for an example. Yeah, it’s OK. With painting. It is absolutely impossible to deal with these pictures in painting. It’s the self-destruction of art.

Continued in chapter 2, pp. 118–19.

"If you are trying to do art, the result will be like this artist. You will be lying on the floor and waiting for an angel," as in the picture in front of the door. More on this picture at the end of the second chapter (p. 117).
When you climb onto the roof of the chamber, you will find an example of the experience of so-called primitive accumulation in Russia at the end. It's a video about the character masks of the new Russian oligarchy. "The point of departure of the film is a decision to build the highest building—the office of Gazprom state corporation—in St. Petersburg and it triggers many connected real and fictional stories around it that represent the historical moment of the development of Russian society, one that is driven by accumulation of capital and power by dispossession of most of the population. It is also important to note that this planned construction provoked the most heated debate and resistance in public in Russian politics recently. Constructing the ideology of the state corporation is from our point of view the most profound contemporary example of the implementation of the 'Potosi Principle' nowadays in Russia." (Dmitry Vilensky) The Gazprom Tower is being built by the Emirate-based corporation, Arabtec. Gazprom and Arabtec are international corporations, and we (the authors of this text) find it suggests itself to compare them with criminal organizations, just like Antonio Lopez de Quiroga was certainly criminal, even if this designation is not legally correct. How is it possible to stage reality without losing one's outrage? Please watch the film.

The Tower: A Songspiel

From the screenplay by Chto delat

The action takes place in a corporate boardroom, where a meeting has been called to discuss the rebranding campaign for the Gazprom Tower. The participants—a politician, a corporate security chief, a PR manager, an Orthodox priest, a successful gallery owner (who is in line to become director of the museum planned for the skyscraper), and a hip artist—converse among themselves and from time to time rehearse speeches addressed as it were to the public. They get up from the conference table, which sits atop a podium, walk to the edge of this platform, make their speeches, and then return to their seats. There is an absurdly gargantuan telephone in the middle of the table. During the course of the songplay it becomes clear that this telephone links the meeting participants with the "supreme authorities," although we do not know exactly who is at the other end of the line. A tangle of telephone lines and cables runs from beneath the table (underneath the spot where the telephone sits), through the podium, and across the stage. The stage is populated by a number of other players, who represent various social groups. They react to the proceedings on the podium in the form of songs.

Scene two

PR manager: Dear colleagues, allow me to open the meeting. First, I would like to congratulate you: we're going to build the Gazprom Tower, our tower! (Applause) We've worked hard and managed to overcome all obstacles in the way of its construction. Don't forget that we're building a symbol of the New Russia. For what, ideally, is Russia? It's a very big corporation. That means it should be managed as well as our company, Gazprom. We are the nation's elite. That means we've earned the right to shape the future as we see it. As our developers put it: "The best for the best." (Applause) [...] We have to communicate the symbolic importance of the Tower to society. People have to realize that the Tower is being built for their own good. As you know, however, there are still, uh... people who are protesting our tower. They organize demonstrations; they file lawsuits. But an attack on the tower is a direct challenge to our power! (Everyone buzzes in agreement; the PR Manager addresses the security chief) We have to put an end to this, using all the means at our disposal.

Security chief: Our department understands what you're asking. We will be collaborating with the Center for Extremism Prevention. [...] Politician's speech: Ladies and gentlemen! My fellow Petersburgers! The new Gazprom Tower will bring in revenue. Not just revenue, but big money, tons of money, money for all residents of our city.

Other powerful corporations will follow Gazprom to the city, and then we'll have even more money! We'll build artificial islands in the Gulf of Finland, places where the business elite can work and relax in a manner that becomes them. Our city will be the Dubai of the North. Just think about it! We were the Venice of the North, but we'll become the Dubai of the North. We have to keep in step with the times. And the first step in this direction is the Gazprom Tower.

Some people criticize us. They say we're violating the building height regulations in this district. This isn't true:
we’re not violating the law. We’re making an exception to the law. What is this tower, after all? It’s a symbol of the New Russia. And what is a symbol? It’s an exception, and that means it’s above the law. It makes its own laws. It’s the Law itself! The new law of our lives!

Third dialectical chorus: on the laws

Intelligentsia:
No one is above the law.
Law is the foundation of civil society.

Pensioners:
The rich control the laws!

Workers:
Might makes right.
Might makes right.
A prison regime:
Such is law of our lives.

Civil rights activists:
Law must defend culture!

Clerks:
If you look for problems
You’ll find them.
Keep quiet and you won’t have problems.
Don’t stick your neck out.
Don’t protest.
Don’t meddle in politics
And everything will be okay.

Every
Radical (screaming):
Down with the extremism of the authorities!

Workers:
Might makes right.
The knife is mighty; that means it’s right
The cop is mighty; that mean he’s right!

Intelligentsia:
Beauty!
That’s what will unite us!
We will rise up together
In defense of our city’s beauty.
Our city’s beauty!

Migrants:
Might makes you rich.
If you’re rich, you’re the boss.
The boss builds, and we work.
The boss is the law.

Intelligentsia:
We will close our ranks!
Everyone to the defense of beauty!

Clerks and young women:
Give us new beauty!
We’re tired of your old junk!

All (except clerks and young women):
The cops torture, steal, and murder.
The courts and the prosecutors cover them.
The authorities confiscate everything to line their pockets.
If you fight the power, you’re a goner.
If you complain, they’ll take your last ruble.
If you protest, you’ll be disappeared.

Pensioners, intelligentsia, civil rights activists, and radical:
Down with the tower!
Down with the tower!
Down with the tower!

(All other chorus members look at them in amazement.)

Clerks:
Quiet! Quiet! Quiet!

The Gazprom Tower Project: Everything Changes for the Better!

Dmitry Vorobyev and Thomas Campbell

What follows is an attempt—in mid-story—to briefly capture some of the key moments in the attempt by the Gazprom corporation and St. Petersburg city hall to build a 403-meter-high skyscraper near the downtown area of the city, a Unesco World Heritage Site. At present, no one knows for certain why Russia’s economic and political powers that be have decided to erect a building that will certainly have a negative impact on the city’s historic (low-rise) appearance. Many tower opponents argue that the tower is a symbolic or vanity project for the ruling elite, which, like other newly wealthy “Asian despots” (in the Middle East and East Asia), wants to visualize its more or less unchallenged power in this way. In reality, the conflict is more interesting because this as-yet-nonexistent skyscraper has generated a highly divisive debate (verging on low-scale partisan warfare) on such questions as historical preservation, economic and architectural modernization, and the role of
The film is projected opposite a number of equestrian pictures: One is St. James (Santiago) killing “blackamoors,” the second is a portrait of Philip V quickly repainted to depict Santiago to save the painting from republican upheavals, the third a portrait of Antonio López de Quiroga, one of the wealthiest men in the history of Potosí. In regard to character masks, Marx writes that they pretend that their means of production, their machines, buildings, and know-how are investments. Yet these “investments,” like commodities, are past and exerted labor, always disguised as capital. Quiroga was a legendary big investor and benefactor. One can read on the right side of the picture that he donated “Dio Veinte y un millones de Quintos” (21 million quintos) to build the San Francisco church, which is either a lie or flattery. Do you remember the common sense of the character masks in the 1990s in which—blinded by the stock market spectacle of the New Economy—it was claimed that capital can create value out of itself merely through advanced technologies? One of the stories that people in Potosí tell of Quiroga even today goes like this: Once a week, he organized a large soup kitchen. Afterwards the poor knotted their ponchos and Quiroga threw a few coins into them. One time somebody refused to do so and said: “I will only accept money if you wring out your cloak.” After hesitating, Quiroga took off his cloak and wrung it out—and blood dripped from it.

**Representations of Santiago**

Fátima Olivarez R.

There are three types of iconography relating to St. James: the first is James the Apostle, also known as James the Greater, son of Zebedee and Salome, brother of John the Evangelist, called the “Son of Thunder,” being distinct from James the Less, son of Alphæus. The second type is James the Pilgrim, whose popularity derives from the pilgrimage route to Santiago de Compostela in Spain, taken by believers from Spain and other regions in Europe. The third type is St. James the Moor Slayer, who is a Spanish hero on account of his appearance before King Ramiro I in 844 on the eve of the Battle of Clavijo.

The work created by Lucas Valdés entitled *Santiago batallando con los moros* (St. James Battling with the Moors), 1690, is a singular example of Sevillian pictorial art, achieving a recurring representation of the legend of St. James in his fight against the Muslim invasion of the Iberian peninsula. The second representation of St. James chosen for the exhibition, *Felipe V, convertido en Santiago Mutamadores* (Philip V, Transformed into St. James the Moor Slayer), is the work of an anonymous master from La Paz in the eighteenth century. It is one of the only examples that remain in Bolivia, and one of only two known to have survived since the time of independence, whose conversion from an equestrian portrait of Philip V into James the Apostle approximately a century after it was created saved it from being destroyed along with other official portraits. The fact that few por-
traits of Spanish kings have survived in America makes the example in the Museo Nacional de Arte in La Paz exceptional, not just because of its iconographic transformation achieved by repainting heraldic insignia as clouds and changing the king’s attire (white cape and top hat), but also in its reflection of the relationship between Spain and the Andes.

The existence of Illapa or Tata Illapa, the Aymara-Quechua god of lightning, is directly related to St. James as a warrior of the sky and master of atmospheric phenomena, performing miracles for the Spanish and answering the indigenous people’s prayers to protect their livestock in the Andes region. This immaterial religious syncretism can be seen every year at the July 25 celebrations dedicated to the patron saint, in a symbiosis of indigenous culture and Christian religion.

In 2009, during the festival month, we held the Tata Santiago—Tata Illapa exhibition at the Museo Nacional de Arte. The exhibition was set up as an urban/rural reference point for faith and devotion by means of a dialogue between the past and the present, manifested as pictorial creations of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, small altarpieces representing popular worship, personal interpretations in contemporary art and photographs of the festival in honor of St. James. The sorrowful, needy woman, the silent worshipper, the grateful family, people of mixed race, indigenous people, the rich and the poor: every one knelt before Tata Santiago and the lightning stone in an intercultural chapel to meet and revisit their saints and gods. To round off the religious festival and the rituals, the museum invited all visiting worshippers and the whole of La Paz to a mass to bless their own St. James, and this gesture was returned in kind with a wañwa (offering) to the Pachamama and Tata Santiago—Tata Illapa in a sort of evocation of higher beings of heaven and earth.

1 St. James is the English name for Santiago.

Many Santiagos

Fatima Olivarez described the different depictions of Santiago as typography, suggesting that the many reproductions of the Santiago icon must be conceived serially, and showing how this seriality continued in the Spanish colonies. In the case of the “Santiago Matamoros” there is, particularly in the painting of the viceroyalty of Peru, a tradition of deviation, along the lines of which historical transformations of global power relations can be retraced. The “Santiago Matamoros” is adapted to the territorial claims to power. There are famous examples of Santiago in Cusco that are depicted not as “Mata-Moro” but as “Mata-Indio.” In Santa Cruz de la Sierra, in Bolivia, there is even an example of a Santiago that reveals the Europeans’ economic interests in China: a “Santiago Mata-Chinos.”

In her book, Iconografía y mitos indígenas en el arte, Teresa Gisbert writes that in the reproduction and appropriation of Christian icons in the Andean region, mistakes were likely to occur. In the Department of Oruro, in Sabaya, for instance, the Santiago was mistaken for Saint Martin, something which suggests itself due to the white horse and the equestrian depiction. As Olivarez writes, during the period of the Republic, the ruler depiction of Philip V could also become a Santiago. For The Fosoti Principle we would
like to add another exception to the "Matamoros" typography, for Santiago is one of the patron saints of the silver city, namely, Santiago as a modern entrepreneur:

The portrait by Antonio López de Quiróga dated 1660 is part of the permanent exhibition of the Casa de Moneda in Potosí and hangs in a prominent place in the house's festival hall. It clearly distinguishes itself from the other pictures of the same period by the way it is painted. The museum's exhibition director, Sheila Beltrán, points out that this depiction must be didactical. The picture is painted in a planar way, it is based on simplified forms, and is unsigned. Due to the depiction, we cannot avoid comparing the picture from today's perspective with constructivist depictions that at the beginning of the twentieth century grasped and identified any representation of "reality" as a comprehensible construction following certain rules.

Santiago Quiróga

The historian Peter Bakewell dedicated an entire book to the silver baron Antonio López de Quiróga, giving the following reason: "He must rank, indeed, as one of the most diverse and capable businessmen to appear in the whole span of the Spanish Empire in America." Here is his description of the portrait in the Casa Moneda:

"López’s name lives on in present day Potosí as an epitome of the town’s days of ancient wealth and splendour. Sustaining that almost folk-memory of him is a crudely painted but forceful portrayal that hangs in the galleries of the Casa de Moneda. No painter’s name appears on this picture of López, but the canvas bears three legends, apparently each by a different hand. Each of them is in some way wrong. But the mistakes themselves reflect the strength of the impression that Antonio López made on Potosí.

The least of the errors is in the title at the lower left: El Maestre de Campo Don Antonio López de Quiróga, Año de 1660. López was not, in fact, to become a maestre de campo (a military rank roughly equivalent to colonel) for another decade after 1660; and his name was never graced with the honorific don.

At the upper left, surrounded by a triumphal wreath, appear the words, Fundador de la Iglesia y Convento de San Francisco de Potosí ("Founder of the Church and Monastery of Saint Francis in Potosí"). This is either great ignorance or conscious exaggeration on the part of whoever painted the portrait, for the Franciscan monastery of Potosí traces its beginnings to the middle of the sixteenth century, a hundred years or so before López came on the scene.

Finally, at the upper right of the portrait, in a third style of lettering, is the statement that López contributed 21 million pesos in quinientos, or silver royalties, to the Spanish treasury during his career: Dío Veinte y un millones de Quinientos, como consta en la Real Caja de esta Villa de Potosí. Though López was the leading silver producer of Potosí for most of the part of his life that he spent there, and also probably the preeminent silver miner and refiner of the Spanish American Empire of his day, that figure is still a wild exaggeration. The best estimate that can be made of López’s silver output is that his mines and refineries yielded, at most, just under 15,000,000 ounces during his career. The quinientos payable on this amount would have been only some 3,400,000 pesos.

The texts on the portrait give us, then, an Antonio López de Quiróga exaggerated in social standing, munificence, and wealth. But these exaggerations can be read as evidence of the expansion of López’s figure in Potosí’s memory after his death. ... He must rank, indeed, as one of the most diverse and capable businessmen to appear in the whole span of the Spanish Empire in America.”

The Santiago as businessman thus distinguishes itself from the two other pictures selected for the exhibition: from the vision of Santiago who killed the enemy by his own hands and trampled him (Lucas Valdés) and from Santiago as a republican warlord, who no longer uses his own hands but is the commander of an army, like in the portrait of Philip V, at whose feet the army represents power and threat (this one quite clearly reveals to what extent the republican promise of freedom remained a Creole privilege in Bolivia).

The Santiago-Quiróga, on the other hand, acts masked as the general benefactor. He donates to the public weal and symbolizes economic progress. In perfect NGO style, one could say, he sustains the lives of the poor, while at the same time, as a profit-oriented mine owner, reproducing and reinforcing social imbalance that makes it possible for him to be acknowledged as a benefactor in the first place.

MJH


2 The author visited the museum Casa de Moneda in Potosí and was given a guided tour of the permanent exhibition by Sheila Beltrán, December 2008.

"It might be a good contribution to direct the ‘Santiagos’ mirror towards Spain. It seems to me also true that the relationship between modernity and colonialism, in the case of Spain, was also pretty problematic, since the colonial metropolis in this case, i.e. Spain, has been historically—and consecutively—the European bastion of Counter-Reformation, anti-Enlightenment, and fascism—all projects of modernization or reform have been historically here problematic, and basically they have all been defeated." (Marcelo Expósito) That is the project description of the Santiagos on the other side.

143.353 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados)
Marcelo Expósito

What does excavating an image mean? What kind of truth appears or returns when we exhume from it a clue, a fragment, a meaning that has been buried, silenced, or made to disappear?

... In order to undertake a reading of both paintings—Santiago batallando con los moros by the Sevillian Lucas Valdés and Felipe V, convertido en Santiago Matamoros, by an anonymous painter—this project has returned to the principal tools used by the Spanish movement for the recovery of historical memory to implement their particular “Antigone model,” a model that consists of multiplying disobedience: both with regard to unwritten laws (the silence about how to face the magnitude of the genocide carried out at the beginning of the Franco period) and with regard to existing laws (for example, this disobedience explicitly or tacitly demands the overturning of the way in which the 1977 Amnesty Law, which came into force just two years after the dictator’s death, has imposed itself as a de facto “full stop” law covering all individual responsibility for politically motivated crimes carried out by the repressive apparatus during the first years of the military dictatorship and its precursors in the civil war). ... We have decided to shift our perspective to the original site of the myth of Santiago, the myth that for centuries has generated a particular idea of Spanishness: this place is the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela, built over the site where the apostle is said to have been buried. [...]

On September 22, 2008, the Platform for Victims of Forced Disappearances of Franquism handed Judge Baltasar Garzón of the National High Court several lists that detailed a total of 143,353 names of persons whose disappearance during the civil war and the first years of the military dictatorship could be confirmed. A more systematic comparative analysis of these lists, as well as the application of standard criteria of the definition of “victim” and strict time limits led to a rounding down of the figure to 113,000. Over the ten-year period of this project, the Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory has located and excavated some 150 mass graves throughout Spain where the remains of approximately 1,500 individuals have been found. The excavation shown in this project was filmed in 2007, and took place over two years in an area measuring 3,000 square meters from which 309 bodies were dug up. This area of land is located at the foot of the Uclés Monastery, the historical seat of the Order of the Knights of Santiago, which was visited by the Catholic Monarchs at the time of the Siege of Granada, the last Islamic enclave on the Spanish Peninsula, to seek the aid of the Moor-killer. After 1493—the year following the capture of Granada, the expulsion of the Jews from the peninsula, and the arrival in America of the maritime expedition led by Christopher Columbus—the monks Isabella and Ferdinand directly administered this Order. In 1936, following the outbreak of the civil war, the monastery was attacked by Republican partisans and converted into a hospital for the 8th Medical Corps of the People’s Army until the end of the war; it was during this period that the land around the flour mill at the foot of the monastery became an improvised cemetery. When Nationalist forces took the area, the monastery became a prison where political prisoners were interred. The deaths of 316 people between 1940 and 1943 have been documented, with ages ranging from three to seventy-two, of whom 160 were shot and 156 died as a result of hunger, mistreatment, torture, or untreated illness. The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory of Cuenca has patiently exhumed all of them, like a human chain grabbing the hands of those who were cast under the horses’ hooves.

Read the whole essay on pp. 225–28 (Spanish)
Baroque, Hispanidad, Mestizaje

On national narratives and cultural production
Jorge Luis Marzo in conversation with
Alice Creischer, Max Jorge Hinderer,
Andreas Siekmann

Jorge Luis Marzo: The national narration of Spain is a narration of loss. There was a big empire in the fifteenth, sixteenth century, which went downhill from the seventeenth century up until the present day, or at least until 1975. But the idea of culture is being retrieved from this imperial decline; culture was kept out of society in order to save it from deteriorating. This gap results from the fundamental strength of Baroque—the dissociation of culture from society. What is the discourse to really being able to project this idea of culture dissociated from society? It is the idea of an exception, which is so present in Mexico, Chile, and Argentina.

Andreas Siekmann: Think of Franco's ideology about Spain as exceptional, as having followed its "vocación imperial," as different from Europe—not modern, not part of progress. Hispanidad as a program to revitalize the golden century of the Empire, unifying all Spanish-speaking countries, was shared by Juan Perón and Augusto Pinochet.

Jorge Luis Marzo: Exactly, but how can we understand this idea of a gap between culture and society in the present? The Ministry of Foreign Affairs commands 82 percent of the Spanish government's cultural budget rather than the Ministry of Culture. Culture means promoting an image of nation. In the 1980s the Spanish government created the slogan: "Culture will create citizens." In other words, citizens are not the ones who create culture.

In Spain culture is based on foreign affairs and diplomatic parameters to an extreme extent. The idea is that Spain creates culture just by itself, just by being what it is. Baroque is about this; Baroque doesn't need a social practice. It is by itself. It is essential.

The gap between culture and society is the true continuity from the Baroque age through to the present. Antoni Tàpies was paid by Franco's Ministry of Propaganda. Is Tàpies Franquist or not? Probably he was not Franquist. He de-ideologized himself to become part of the system. That is the problem.

Berlin, July 9/12, 2009

Jorge Luis Marzo is a member of the project team for El (DI)Efecto Barroco, Políticas de la imagen hispana (exhibition begins November 3, 2010, at the Centro de Cultura Contemporánea de Barcelona).

"The exhibition is an exploration of the identity narratives of Spain and of Latin America by way of an analysis of the politics of the image. One of the most powerful myths has been that of the Baroque. As a myth, it has legitimized a biased vision of the culture both in terms of national or local realities and in terms of the creation of great international brands: 'Latino' or 'Spanish.' The exhibition proposes a dissection of this narrative and the cultural policies that continue to write it, often at the cost of hijacking other kinds of writing..."


Read the whole interview on pp. 228–30.

You have heard one basic principle of primitive accumulation and seen a current example from Russia. You are now aware that every commodity and every investment bears and simultaneously conceals this form of accumulation. But how can this be applied to the historical case of Potosí? Go back down. Straight ahead there is a wall. You will probably switch back and forth between its sides, which show a picture with a view of Potosí and a film about the picture. The picture does not show you a hell but an industrial city in the eighteenth century. In the squares and streets of the city, the individual episodes are painted as meticulously as in the columns of a city newspaper: caravans of pack animals, processions, a murder, a wedding, an animal being slaughtered. You don't see any mines in the mountain, you see the investments and the infrastructure: dams, canals, and refineries. But you see only a few workers in the city, as if this picture were also a character mask. Eighteen years after this picture was painted, Adam Smith described how an invisible hand creates wealth, in his book The Wealth of Nations.
The film shown on the other side of the wall works against this invisibility. Here, you will learn about the concrete conditions of labor: the displacement of indigenous metallurgy through amalgamation and the subsequent disqualification of indigenous labor. "On the silver mountain one sees workers in the most diverse formations; but one cannot find a gallery entrance. The mitayos, the forced laborers, often came from villages a few hundred kilometers away from Potosí; the journey there often lasted a month and they had to stay there for a year—that's why they brought along their families and their livestock. The pictures show the housing of the workers, but no women, children, or livestock. One can see a courtyard building where the workers receive their wages, and in front a small street market where beverages are sold. But one cannot distinguish between the free workers and the forced laborers ... It seems reasonable to assume that an event as important as the discovery of America ought to be mentioned somewhere in the holy scriptures." ... Todorov cites this sentence, and it seems reasonable to me to assume that an event such as the largest genocide in history ought to be mentioned somewhere in the picture." (Harun Farocki)

The Silver and the Cross

Harun Farocki

In the spring of 2009 I received an offer from Alice Creischer and Andreas Siekmann to write a piece on the painting Descripción del Cerro Rico e Imperial Villa de Potosí (Description of Cerro Rico and the Imperial City of Potosí) by Gaspar Miguel de Berrio.

The extant reproductions of the painting proved rather inadequate, consisting essentially of black-and-white prints found in a New York exhibition catalogue, and in a number of book publications, in addition to an A 4 color poster from the museum Casa de Moneda in Potosí itself. However, the original, measuring some 350 x 200 cm, features a number of important details such as figures under a centimeter in size, representing workers that in these reproductions remain unidentifiable.

I have frequently embarked upon a project in which I first had to familiarize myself with the new subject matter, but never before have I approached a topic with so little prior knowledge. After a while I started to believe that I was deliberately being deprived of background information to ensure I read up sufficiently on Potosí, Bolivia, South America, the slave trade, and colonialism.

On making my way to the library of the Ibero-American Institute in Berlin, I realized that I had not entered the building for many decades. Originally I had borrowed books there in anticipation of the revolutions about to sweep across South and Central America. Subsequently, I availed myself of its services again in the wake of the victorious counter revolutions staged in Chile, Argentina, and elsewhere. Reputedly one of the best in the world, the library contains mainly Spanish and Portuguese titles, followed by English and a handful of German and French publications. Although the literature on Latin America seldom extends beyond the barriers of its own language, there is an abundance of material on Potosí and its history, including highly specialized studies on mining and smelting techniques, on the living and working conditions of the indigenous population, and on the import of industrial equipment and luxury goods. Whilst researching his book Coercion & Market—Silver Mining In Colonial Potosí 1692—1826, Enrique Tandeter unearthed many new sources from the archives of the colonial administration and from the records of mining and smelting companies. His book is also a valuable trove of information on the resistance mounted by the indigenous workers: how they managed to defy the system of coercion to work the mines illegally at the weekend and stage the uprising of 1751.

However, there is an absence of sources furnishing exhaustive descriptions of Berrio's painting or placing the work's details into the context of historical events. Of the books I studied in preparation for the project, I had only previously read Tzvetan Todorov's marvelous account of The Conquest of America, in which the author refers to the colonization of South America by the Spanish as the greatest act of genocide in human history.

Since Berrio's painting was due to arrive from Madrid only a few weeks prior to the opening of the exhibition, we elected to fly to Bolivia and preview the painting ourselves. Accompanied by cameraman Ingo Kratisch and sound engineer and producer Matthias Rajmann, I negotiated the first stage of our trip from Madrid to Santa Cruz in a jumbo jet. The airplane was full of Bolivian guest workers—the men farm laborers, the women domestic servants—all travelling home from Spain to celebrate carnival. Never before have I undertaken such a long journey in order to film just one single object.
We arrived towards midday and took rooms in a hotel just across from the museum—which we visited almost immediately. Thus, finally, I was able to set my eyes on the painting. It was poorly lit, but the accommodating museum director, Orieta Durandal, granted us permission to open the windows and climb up on a chair to study the details.

When we began filming the following day, the painting was placed into an antechamber where it was illuminated indirectly and evenly by daylight. The museum staff readily assisted us in discovering and interpreting some of the details. For example, I was anxious to learn if the painting depicted the waterwheels which powered the machinery used to crush the ore in the ingenios, the smelting works. Thus six of us began systematically examining one ingenio after the other, until we thought we had found the wheels; or least the sites at which the water would cascade out of the viaduct, and the stone-brick shafts in which they would have been located. The museum director and her assistants Cecilia Guevara and Leonor de Serrano were familiar with a number of the details which, however, they each interpreted differently.

To the foreground of this panoramic painting are the town’s residents; only a few centimeters in size, they can be assigned to a particular social class by dint of their attire. Hence, the museum director was able to distinguish between the various orders of monks, manual craftsmen, and—slaves. The latter came as a revelation since I had previously read that there were no slaves in eighteenth-century Potosí. The director showed me a book on traditional dress in which precisely these—splendid—costumes were identified as those worn by women slaves. Subsequent consultation with a social historian revealed that they were not slaves in the strictest sense of the word, but rather maidservants who were, however—technically, at least—denied even the most basic freedoms.

Even as far back as the early sixteenth century, the Spanish crown had decided not to deploy slaves in the mines and the smelting works. The reasons were twofold: The enslavement of the indigenous populations of the Caribbean had almost led to their extinction, and importing slaves from Africa appeared too expensive. Hence the decision to introduce compulsory labour—a system which was to endure for another 250 years, and which was still being practiced when Berrio completed his painting in 1758.

I inquired if the painting featured a hospital as I had read that the clergy often charged forced laborers exorbitant fees for admitting them to treat their mining injuries there. They also applied this exploitative practice to the dependents of those killed in mining accidents for the staging of burial ceremonies. Yet no hospital could be found among the hundreds of buildings depicted.

The painting also shows participants of a procession embroiled in a dispute—one of them can be seen lying on the ground, either injured or dead. Hence violence among the Spanish or Creoles is openly represented, whereas violence against the workers is not. There is no sign of the gendarmery or military personnel.

Jürgen Osterhammel writes that the Protestant settlers of North America deemed the indigenous peoples to be impervious to Christianization and unsuitable for work, and thus delivered a far more damning judgement than the Conquistadors did of the Indios of South America.

If one takes a step back and studies Berrio’s painting in its entirety, a predominance of a dark-red brown hue becomes apparent. However, when we selected a small detail for the video recording and inspected it closely we were struck by the variety of pastel tones. Thus from the details no generalizations could be drawn.

After having examined, discussed, and filmed the painting over a period of several days, we drove to Potosí, which lies over 4,000 meters above sea level. The arduous journey, lasting several hours, through virtually uninhabited and inhospitable terrain conveys some impression of the avarice which must have impelled the Spaniards some 500 years ago to first traverse the ocean, and then scale the Andes to lay their hands on the silver treasure. The silver mined in Potosí helped the Spanish crown to finance its wars, but hardly changed the landscape of the region. In the Spanish and Creole quarters of Potosí, the layout of the streets and the buildings are still as depicted in Berrio’s painting. A number of the reservoirs have survived, and some fragmentary ruins of the viaduct remain. A waterwheel and a crushing machine have been reconstructed in a small open-air museum. Nothing remains, however, of the living quarters of the workers. By the same token, the dwellings of the plebeians from ancient Rome have also failed to withstand the ravages of time; not even in the form of paintings.

Still light-headed from the effects of altitude sickness, I felt as if I were walking through a painting. Never before had I visited a place I knew so well from studying a 250-year-old picture. I was astonished at the way in which the people quite naturally resided in the houses of the historic city center. Initially expecting to run into the artist himself, now I was even looking forward to mingling with the city’s residents whom he had so meticulously portrayed.

The evening prior to our departure was spent in Sucre talking to Klaus Pedro Schuetz, a Bolivian filmmaker. In 1945 his father bought a country cottage. A few dozen families lived there and worked the land, and were required to render half their harvest to the landlord. The new owner released them from their fiscal obligations. Not until 1952, however, following a revolt, was serfdom finally abolished in Bolivia.
Before I level accusations at the painter Berrios, it is important to bear in mind that the philosophers of European Enlightenment also made no mention of slavery or the slave trade. Furthermore, Berrios’s painting has been subject only to scant research. From the study of the larger representations of the general population, one could perhaps draw conclusions as to the living conditions of the manual workers, who, by contrast, are rendered much smaller. Nowadays, archeology is able to determine from the analysis of bodies long since dead whether they were eating a healthy diet or suffering from malnutrition—after many hundreds of years. Such advanced techniques are now also required for examining paintings.

Close by, a bit more to the center of the room, you will see another two-sided wall. On one side, there is a picture that looks like an illustration from the then-popular textbooks on alchemy, where gold is obtained by means of a mystical procedure. But this drawing explains amalgamation, which had been developed in the mines of Mexico in the middle of the sixteenth century and, after the discovery of mercury in Huancavelica, was also employed in Potosi. The silver ore was pulverized in courtyards, then mixed with blue vitriol, common salt, and water to form a mush to which mercury was added. This mass was stomped with the feet and exposed to the sun for eight weeks. A silver amalgam was formed that could be separated by means of cold rolling or heat. Mercury poisoning leads to headaches, memory loss, dizziness, shivering, perception disorders, colic, and kidney failure. The workers often died after returning to their communities. This connection between labor and sickness has also disappeared in present-day Potosi.

The amalgamation process and the mita, the state systematization of forced labor, are two sides of the same coin regarding the measures to make the obtaining of silver more effective in Potosi. “Through the introduction of the amalgamation process the production of silver skyrocketed from 1573 on, and from 1580 to 1610 increased from 190 to 230 tons per year.” (Anna Artaker) Now go to the other side of this display wall. Paths of silver are marked on a world map “by means of frottages of a historical coin that was minted in Potosi between 1586 and 1591.” Elsewhere the artist continues: “The connection between the expansion of global trade in the wake of European expansion and the progress made in cartography is evident: Worldwide transportation of goods was carried out by merchant ships that required exact nautical charts to navigate. ... The world map is a true-to-scale reproduction of the coastlines of a map printed by Arnoldo di Arnoldi in Holland in 1600. Di Arnoldi’s map is a copy of the world map published by Petrus Plancius in Amsterdam in 1592. The map also reveals the geographical knowledge and the image of the world at the time the coin was minted.”

WORLD MAP

Anna Artaker

The point of departure of my work entitled World Map is the worldwide trade that commenced in the late sixteenth century and in the long term led to establishing a new world order based on the power of trade and economy.

The picture of the world map that is common today originated only in connection with this globalized trade, through which the world as a whole permanently enters the horizon of human experience. The world map is the picture we have of the world and one that is disseminated millions of times in atlases, school books, and classrooms. This picture is causally related to global trade: The worldwide transport of goods was carried out by cargo ships that required exact nautical charts for navigation. Creating these charts was the task of modern scientific cartography, the beginnings of which not coincidently range back to the second half of the sixteenth century (Gerhard Mercator’s famous world map was published in 1569, in the Mercator projection still used today).
With my *World Map*, I seek to depict the connection between seafaring and cartography on the one hand, and constant trade relations between the Orient, Occident, and the African continent with the silver peso as the first global currency, on the other. It is a hand-drawn, 1:1 reproduction of a world map that was printed by Arnoldo di Arnoldi in Siena in 1600. Di Arnoldi’s model was the world map of the Dutch cartographer Petrus Plancius published in Holland in 1592. My reproduction of the map is limited to the coastlines as they were known at the time and the loxodromic network that ran through the oceans on the map. In addition, there are frottages of a historical silver coin that was minted in Potosí between 1586 and 1591. In lines, the frottages mark the sea routes that the silver from Potosí took in both eastern and western directions across the globe.

The choice of frottage as a pictorial technique based on contact with the actual object can be understood as a counterpart of the allegorical depiction of the Baroque, which was the prevailing art style in Europe at the end of the sixteenth century and was also exported to the New World. At the same time, a world view manifests itself in the development of scientific cartography, in which allegory is increasingly replaced by new forms of depiction.

In this way the *World Map* stands for a new form of depiction and presents the cartographic knowledge and abilities of the time. With the frottages of the coin—due to its minting date a contemporary of the world map—it additionally refers to the world economy and the beginnings of globalization.

Read more on pp. 231–33.

---

Please continue reading about the drawing of the diver in the second path description (p. 116). As you already know, this circulation is an essential attribute of the “rosy dawn of capitalism.” It is often claimed that the flood of silver, achieved by making the mining industry in Potosí more effective, was responsible for the price revolution of grain crops in Europe starting in the sixteenth century. But Silvia Federici in her historical analysis of primitive accumulation doubts this: “Gold and silver are not capital ... they were planted into a developing capitalist world, in which a growing percentage of the population ... had to buy the food that they had once produced because the ruling class had learned to use this magical power of money to cut labor costs.” (Federici, *Caliban and the Witch*) The circulation triggers a growing dependency of survival on money.

---

Now go back to the other side. You will see copies of historical documents:

A) Two sheets of the system to list the *Yanaconas* Indios in Potosí, two subsequent pages from the San Lorenzo parish.

“List of the Yanaconas Indios (indigenous people) ... living in this city of Potosí, Porco province, and who otherwise are assigned to the royal house of this city, drawn up by Don Hernando y Molina y Cobos. Capitan Mayor of the said Indios, September 16, 1711. Consisting of: 146 numbered pages that show the lists of residents of this continent/lists of residents of the *yanaconas* Indios ... living in the parish of San Lorenzo,” Archivo de Casa Moneda, Potosí.

B) Then lists of *forasteros* (non-local indigenous people) in the town of Siporo, classified according to name and age, who are to be brought there by the *caciques*.

“List of Foreign Indians assigned to the parish of Siporo and Aciento de Piquisa whose Tributes must be collected by the Governing Chieftain to be Designated,” Archivo de Casa Moneda, Potosí.

C) Lists of non-local *yanaconas*, assigned to the king, the church, and the convents. “List of the Foreign Yanaconas Indians assigned to the king, church and convents, added to this Village in order they fulfill their obligations there like the original residents,” Archivo de Casa Moneda, Potosí.

D) A document from 1692, an itemization of the assignment of forced laborers from different regions to the *mita* in the mine, or the metal deposition mills (*ingenios*).

“Summary of the Persons to whom are to be assigned the Indians detailed as Follows,” April 27, 1692, Archivo Biblioteca Nacional, Sucre.
El government document dealing with the regulation of daily wages of the mitayos, among others, in the bankrupt mines. This reveals that the price for which the forced laborers could buy their way out of the obligation to pay tribute was much higher than the wage that the mita laborers received. The document calls for an alignment of prices and wage of free and state-assigned workers to preclude injustice and the “great confusion in the charging of Taxes, and the whole Mita of Potosí.” Archivo Biblioteca Nacional, Sucre.

But this “gran confusion” has more to do with the speculative value of labor. The first mita quotas are determined in 1572 along with the population censuses, but already five years later, the communities can no longer abide to them because they have become depopulated. The mita is a measure lying at the center of a statistical pair of scissors: the growing demand for laborers in the city and the depopulation of the provinces. The reasons for depopulation lie not only in the epidemics caused by European pathogens but also in the destruction of indigenous subsistence. The scissors have three consequences that precisely apply to what we understand as primitive accumulation and the “Potosi Principle.” At this point, we have to divide your departure path into three branches in order to grasp these consequences.
Paid Freedom and Decolonization

A conversation with Roberto Choque, former Vice-Minister for Decolonization

The history of Potosí is inextricably linked to the control of life and labor that the mita implied for the indigenous population. The mita was the legal system regulating labor, time, and life—it entered into force in the viceroyalty of Peru through Francisco Toledo in 1573. We start from the assumption that the mita in South America can be described as a phenomenon marking the biopolitical turning point in the history of a global economy, gradually taking hold since the end of the sixteenth century. It marks the difference between a politics of “conquest” (Charles V) and a politics of “administration” (Philip II).

It is important to make it clear that, by identifying life with money, a decisive difference is introduced as a technology of governance that cannot be associated foremost with ethnic aspects, but is instead predominantly based on a difference regarding the relations of ownership and assets. During colonial times, the racist difference was still more of an object of exchange, in the sense of a material debt which could be traded as a value; it was ontologized only in the wake of the republican ideology.

After the Cuban revolution, in the 1960s and 1970s historians and theorists especially from Latin America began analyzing colonial rule from an economic perspective to evade the ethnifying, anthropological discourse on “otherness” at academic faculties. The history of Potosí was paradigmatic for this discourse. In Bolivia, this experience was mixed with the painful aftermath of its own revolution in 1952. The Aymara historian Roberto Choque is one of the most prominent intellectual heirs of this period. He was the first vice-minister for decolonization in Bolivia and, in this capacity, member of the cabinet of the Morales administration until 2010.

Max Jorge Hinderer: A question about the history of the Jesus de Machaca rebellion in 1921. This has been used by the white mestizo upper class to cement prejudices against the indigenous population.

Reina J. Gonzalez: A stigma.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Yes, to stigmatize indigenous people and to create a whole campaign of precaution that warns against any kind of farmer, labor union, or indigenous mobilization. More and more they are stigmatizing people really by way of their concept of community, collectivity, and linked to this, their proven capacity for insurgency. This fear of indigenous insurgency has been repeated throughout the history of colonial and republican Bolivia, so that from a political point of view it appears almost to define its governments.

Roberto Choque: The struggle for land has been one of the most significant motivations. We are also trying to address this in order to decolonize this stigma. Following the creation of Bolivia in 1825 a law was signed to confiscate indigenous or community lands. The government motivated people telling them they could sell their land. The people didn't know how to read or write in Spanish. When they first received the money, they thought it was great. But the money ran out very quickly, and then they saw how they'd been exploited. The situation with the indigenous rebellions was already preparing itself at this period. It was affecting many former members of the communities. The liberals were appropriating community lands and creating this atmosphere of conflict between the two parties. This situation lasted until the Chaco War. This led to a much greater resistance on the part of the communities, particularly those who had been in the war. And the indigenous movement was making progress. ... I believe that a historian must hold a position and an ideological orientation. All these situations are ones that led me to take the most notable. He ran the whole wine trade for Potosí and Oruro. I find the Guarachi chieftains interesting not only because of the political power they had, and for the tribute system, but also because of their economic power and the mita. They started out buying land from the communities and even gave the communities titles as landowners. Since they controlled the indigenous population and also had this link with Potosí through their trading, they started to reduce the number of mitayos, not only from Machaca, but from the whole Pacaques province. So for example, the Guarachis started to employ youths who didn't want to do their mita in their own businesses. They took them in, freed them, and dealt with the resulting absence of mitayos in Potosí by contracting other people, the minges. At the same time they made use of the labor force for their own benefit.

From an interview with Roberto Choque Canqui and Reina J. Gonzalez, Vice-Ministry of Decolonization, Bolivia

MJJ

42
up history. I was also motivated by a book by Frantz Fanon about how to confront and escape from colonialism, and where and how to detect it. That was when I realized: we have to decolonize History.

Max Jorge Hinderer: What does being vice-minister for decolonization mean symbolically, and what do you do?

Roberto Choque: The concept of decolonization is a way of assimilating and thereby evaluating our history. It means collaboration amongst languages and political movements, and valuing ourselves. There’s no doubt that decolonization means fighting racism. We can’t overcome domination, economic dependence, or racial violence in urban centers immediately. Though they say in the universal rights of man that we are all equal, the first thing is to achieve an equality of conditions. To do this we are dealing with a lot of material in order to undertake our work on the concept of rights in the indigenous villages. It was thought that such villages no longer existed. Instead, we should value the knowledge of the indigenous people. The white elite was the dominant force until just recently. Now, we have an indigenous president. This is something extraordinary, and that’s why we don’t want to lose political power. Gradually society is changing. Decolonization may be followed by the application of both national and international laws. The establishment of human rights. I myself am still discriminated against; not perhaps when I walk into a luxury hotel, but behind my back, yes. The struggle against racism is very difficult. One of the key elements is education. To change the educational system, evaluating all the aspects of history, valuing people themselves, their practices, the way they organize themselves. So, that’s where we are.

January 15, 2010, La Paz, Bolivia

On the occasion of the seventy-fifth anniversary of the revolt against the privatization of communal land by the government on March 4, 1921, Choque published a book, Sublevación y Masacre de 1921 (1996), on the history of the revolts in Jesús de Machaca. His entire studies on Jesús de Machaca have now been newly published in a series of four volumes: Jesús de Machaca: la maraña rebelde Vols 1–4, Xavier Albó, Esteban Ticona, eds, (La Paz, 2003).

Read excerpts from Volume 1 of Cinco Siglos de la Historia, the chapter on the mita, in the essay section, pp. 233–35 (Spanish).

 Primitive Accumulation, As Exemplified in Potosí

“The name Potosí is commonly associated as no other in colonial Spanish America with forced labor. The Black Legend hangs heavily around the town’s history. The Mita of Potosí ... was larger than that assigned in any other single place in the empire. Working conditions in the mines of Potosí, from the time of Theodor de Bry’s gloomy drawings of the 16th century, have been assumed by historians and propagandists to have been as miserable as they were hazardous.”

The question of how to “examine a stereotype shaped by national, power-political interests without trivializing the extent of its crimes?” was among the methodological challenges facing a generation of historians during the 1970s, as they set out to critically examine the history of Potosí. Bakewell and Tandeter analyze the organization of coercion, work, and survival in the case of the Potosí mita, and explore the relationship between free labor, wage labor, and forced labor. A system of coercive labor practiced within the Peruvian viceroyalty, the Mita was not based on the arbitrary brutality of a conquista, but was the means by which a modern state supplied its entrepreneurs with the population required to create added value. There was no immutable distinction between forced and free labor. The continuous shift between wage labor and forced labor in Potosí reveals a system in which work had become a commodity and survival depended upon money.

“‘Primitive accumulation’ is the term that Marx uses ... to characterize the historical process ... of capitalists’ relations ... its importance lies, above all, in the fact that ‘primitive accumulation’ is treated by Marx as a foundational process, revealing the structural conditions for the existence of capitalist society. This enables us to read the past as something which survives into the present.”

For more information on Potosí as an example of so-called primitive accumulation, please turn to pp. 235–38.

The Real Owners of the Earth, or Latin America's Mining Mess

Gabriela Massuh

"We don't want another Potosi" was the reply given by Evo Morales to Spanish television during his most recent visit to Spain in September 2009. He was referring to potential forthcoming Spanish and Bolivian cooperation strategies, as well as the interest of various European countries in participating in lithium extraction, a vital mineral for energy storage of which Bolivia possesses more than half the world's resources. Since Evo Morales has been at the helm, Bolivia has seen itself benefit from a tax of no less than 5% percent of profits generated by its natural resources. If this demand is considered within the history of Bolivia in particular and the current situation with regards to mining in Latin America in general, this is a unique situation.

In terms of minerals, Latin America has embarked upon a new period of having its veins bled. The new owners of the crown are less glamorous than in colonial times. They are transnational corporations, mostly from Canada, the US, Great Britain, and Australia. Those operating in the region are, among others, Rio Tinto, Barrick Gold Corporation, Freeport Mac Moran, BHP-Billiton, Newmont, Placer-Dome, Meridian Gold, Exeter Resource Corporation, Freeport Mcmoran Copper & Gold Inc., and Minera Andes. The Latin American Environmental Conflict Observers (OLCA) and the Executive of the Latin American Mining Conflict Observers (OCMAL) have counted a total of 337 open-cast mining projects along the whole length of the Andean mountain range from Mexico to Ushuaia. More than half have caused conflicts with neighboring communities. The features these conflicts all share are human and environmental rights violations denounced by nearby villages, claims which are systematically ignored by the states and companies implicated.

Read more about the current situation of the mining industry on pp. 238–40 (Spanish).

The first cut of the scissors applies to the disposal of life. Cross the room diagonally, all the way to the front and to the right, until you stand in front of five magnificent bubbles. At the time we wrote this guide, we did not yet know if these bubbles were oculars directed towards motifs on the right half of the picture or episodes depicting the main protagonist—the female body and its close ties to plants, rhythms, and ornaments. On the picture opposite, the seven mortal sins surround a dying person. They are his pillows, threatening him as animals, hovering as red-framed bubbles, episodes of life toward the pleasure, which is an antechamber to hell. In the center bubble, Indios worship a farting goat, coca leaves are spread out as sacrificial offerings.

This branch deals with a biopolitical turn of the narration, with how the proletariat is “made.” The witch hunts in Europe and America and the extermination of indigenous culture are components of this “making.” In Europe as well as in the colonies, the female body becomes an instrument of human labor. The bodies are to be at the unlimited disposal of investments, they must therefore be separated from their own lives. The ban on bodily self-determination implies the destruction of forms of community, knowledge, and memory. This destruction is accomplished by campaigns to obliterate idolatry in the Andes, or the Malleus Maleficarum in Europe. Settlement plans are made at the same time. Philip II plans a city in the vicinity of Potosi to breed mine workers. Between 1696 and 1760, Jesuits build settlements in the rainforest regions of the viceroyalty of Peru for converted Indians—Baroque urban layouts, new Jerusalems that were forgotten for the Spaniards, with magnificent churches, altars, and rehearsals of Baroque music. Close by you can see a pedestal with a book. A costume is hanging there, a theater for the instincts and the genitals. It is planned that at certain times a countertenor will perform here, opening the book and singing the music. The famous castrato Carlo Broschi Farinelli alleviated the depression of Philip V each night for almost ten years with his singing. The countertenor will sing the questions of a confession manual laid down at the Council of Lima in 1585: a pitiless search for the pleasures and intimate agreements of one’s own body with the stones, the sky, the mountains, and plants. The book from which the countertenor sings has a cover made of snakeskin. The community of the Shipibo, who live in the Amazon basin in Peru, believe that the world was sung into existence by a gigantic anaconda. The Christians believe that the Leviathan devours the entire world. When the snake sang, the patterns of its skin formed the universe. The weaving of the Shipibos represents this skin of the snake, and at the same time one can read and sing it like notes.

Take another look at the Muerte picture. At the middle of the lower edge, there is a confession scene in which the devil holds the Indio’s mouth shut, and it cannot be determined whether he is preventing or protecting him from confessing.
Confesionario: Confession Book for the Priests of the Indigenous Population

"The Witch Hunt was not just a European phenomenon, but also stretched across the Americas as conquistadors and pilgrims sought to break indigenous women's power here. The colonization of the 'New' World in many ways mirrored the proletarianization and housewifization that confronted men and women in Europe. Here too, women had the most to lose, often having enjoyed greater status and power here than their counterparts in Europe. Here too, the new colonial economy required a division be engineered between indigenous men and women. Finally, here too the hunting of witches served to ‘instill terror, destroy collective resistance, silence entire communities, and turn their members against each other...’ So by hunting witches the colonists ‘targeted both the practitioners of the old religion and the instigators of anti-colonial revolt,’ while attempting to redefine ‘the spheres of activity in which indigenous women could participate.’"¹

There is a connection between the mass murder of women in Europe and the murders committed in the colonies. Confession and the induced fear of death play an important role in this regard.

Confesionario para los curas de Indios: con la instrucción contra sus ritos, y exhortación para ayudar a bien morir, y suma de sus privilegios, y forma de impedimentos del matrimonio / compuesto y traducido en las lenguas quichua y aymara. Por autoridad del Concilio Provincial de Lima, del año 1583 (Confession book for the priests of the indigenous population. Includes instructions on their rites and the exhortation to offer help so as to die in the right belief; the entirety of their privileges and reasons impeding marriage. Written and translated into Quechua and Aymara. Published upon the commission of the Provincial Council of Lima in 1583).

Continue reading on p. 241 (Spanish).

Extermination of Idolatry

The Third Council of Lima (1582) aimed to adapt the Tridentine enactments to the situation in the viceroyalty. It initially appeared as if this adaptation—and the renewed canonization of pictorial contents during the Counter-Reformation—would have come into conflict with the evangelization methods that combined indigenous deities with the nomenclatures of Christian saints and angels. And what appears to be a diversion from this conflict is that the indigenous culture was instead persecuted—especially after the revolt of Tupac Amaru, who was beheaded upon the order of Toledo in Cusco in 1572. The revolt was accompanied by a religiosity in which Christian and indigenous motifs were equal mediums of resistance. An entire executive apparatus was dedicated to the Exterminación de la Idolatria (Extermination of Idolatry). Visitors went to places to inspect indigenous customs and cult objects. This apparatus complemented the inquisition, which had been installed in Lima ten years earlier and was meant to keep the faith of the Spanish population under control. In 1621 the Exterminación de la Idolatria by the Jesuit Pablo de Arriaga was printed in Lima, a guide for the visitors searching in the individual communities for feather ornaments, small animal figures and corncobs made of stone, mummies, jugs to brew chicha, sacrificial receptacles, trumpets, shells and other instruments, and quipus.

In a certain regard, the deployed visitors were in line with the recommendations made at the end of the Tridentine picture decree, stating that the bishop had to be informed of any new picture miracle or relic. We would even claim that the visitors attained a comparable significance and function within the context of a new political utilization of the population as a resource. Following the reform of Toledo, the population was used for forced labor in the mines and to build the infrastructure just as systematically as the population of the new mercantile states to work in the manufactories, new ports, and galleys. In the Exterminación de Idolatrias, as in the Malleus Maleficarum of the same period, instructions were given to persecute and destroy local knowledge of coexistence and procreation so as to place it under the global regime of exploitation.

The Council of Trent modernized the sacrament of confession. The confessional, the secret conversation in confidence, and the internal examination of one’s conscience were important instruments for bracketing subjectivation and subjugation—the interiorizing of power making modern subjectivity in this way suitable to be ruled. The Council of Lima implemented this in regard to controlling and producing subjectivity in the colonies.

In the last chapter of the chronicle, Poma de Ayala gives an account of the practices of the visitors/the acting iconoclasts and their all too familiar methods of establishing the truth by means of torture and extortion:

“And the poor author thus came to a miners’ settlement in Sotomayor, and three old, poor Indians who were there ... gave this account: ‘Señor, we ... fled from the priest and doctor Aúila, the visitor of the diocese of Lima.’ They said that it was because of the doctor, who wanted to turn them into magicians and who during the interrogation asked what a uaca mocha (idolater) is. Although they were not idolaters, he was happy and said they adored stones. He did not chastise them but placed corozos on them, tied a rope around their necks, and put wax candles in their hands. And he said they should join along in the procession like this ... And if someone is a Christian, he should say that he does not know of the uacas, the idols, and that he prayed to the one God, the Holy Trinity ... he would let this said Indian ascend to a white heaven immediately, and then he said he would lash him much, until his blood flowed down the back of the white lamb, so that the blood of the poor Indian could be seen. And because of the tortures and pain, the Indian said that he adored the old idol, the uaca ...”

And because he also told them [him] that a visitor of the Holy Church named Dr. Aúila and the corregidor, under the pretext that he was an idolater, had taken away from him large amounts of gold, silver, clothes, feather-works, and other jewelry, clothes of cunbe and auasca, topes, shirt garments, porongos (clay vessels with long, narrow necks), aquillas (silver or golden sacrificial receptacles), all made of silver and gold.”

Teresa Gisbert: The Baroque was very free, these kind of exotic things were much liked. The indigenous influence could be seen for example in the mermaids, which are goddesses in Lake Titicaca. The Spaniards, however, saw them as a symbol of sin. That is, the indigenous people read them in one way, as their ancient goddesses of the lake, and the Spaniards had a different reading, yet they still appear on every church around the lake, in great size on the gates. The sun and moon were expressly forbidden. Toledo prohibited many things, but they had to put up with it because the great majority saw it as natural and good. Each had their own reading. The European saw it as the symbol of the sun and the moon, which is sometimes seen beside the crucifixion or the virgin. The indigenous people saw their old gods in the background, whom they never really gave up in the end.

The curators: Did the Church have a way of organizing visual production at the time? As we know there were the Councils of Trent and of Lima? What kind of problems emerged as a result?
Teresa Gisbert: Various problems emerged. For example, when it came to construction the indigenous people had no idea how to build a vault or anything like that. In cases where we have documents they show that the Europeans or Creoles generally took charge of this. But when it came to quarrying and general laboring, especially the decorative detailing, this was in the hands of the indigenous people. For example, in Sica Sica “Malko made me” has been written, in Yarvicolla we can read: “Sapaka made me,” and the cathedral at Cusco also has the name of its builder. This is something the Europeans didn’t do. This shows that the indigenous people valued themselves greatly as creators. And they were given more or less free reign in this, because amidst all that Baroque decoration, if they put an extra leaf or if there was a monster more or a monster less, like the grotesques, it was neither here nor there for the Spaniards, they weren’t going to cause a fuss. So all these elements began to appear, in part like those we see in San Francisco, definitely like those in San Lorenzo: the mermaids that move the heavenly spheres with their music and we see the sun and moon and so on. In this way they blended European erudition with certain symbols from here. They were the overwhelming majority and they were needed as laborers, so they had to reach a deal with them. When it came down to it, somehow they had to tolerate it.

La Paz, January 16, 2009

From these two sequences, which we have edited together, one can arrive at the notion of what we call repressive tolerance, namely, tolerance within a hegemony that is conditional upon annihilating what it cannot include. It is possible to equip angels and gods of lightning, but it is not possible to dedicate ceremonies to Illapa. Yet this model of inquisition and repressive tolerance is not universal, for it does not include the very simple fact of production that occurs despite the ban:

Later too they created a parallel art form with which the Spaniards did not interfere, which is the art of the keros, or painted wooden cups. This art form was essentially restricted to the chieftains. The labor was undertaken by the second or third sons of the chieftain, if they dedicated themselves to the art, because they did not have to pay tribute. As artisans they had certain privileges, in which, again, the Spaniards did not intervene. Generally the keros do not depict saints; there is only indigenous history, or agrarian history, such as horses, or harvesting—in other words, local matters, and painted with a technique and style that were far removed from the European. This technique continued in parallel until independence. It was also prohibited to depict animals on clothing, such as serpents, as these could be the object of idolatry. Thus garments with animals were not worn in the cities, but in the villages they were, and this has lasted right up to the present day. I don’t know if you’ve had the chance to see these textiles, from Jalka or Potolo, that show a series of mythical animals. Well, to put it simply they were banned, but they still carried on making them.

This excluded fact now reveals that this model can apply to our own, present-day conditionality of artistic production and that of colonial painting—like two strangers wandering on the same side of the equation. But it would be too airy to think that this side does not reveal a rupture.

We now continue this montage of sources with the narration of another theft from the chronicle of Poma de Ayala, to find out what this rupture could mean:

“Christian reader, you scare us, for those with their idolatry and old heretical beliefs were wrong; as old, heathen Indians they followed the wrong path. Like the Spaniards, who had idols, as the honorable Pater Fray Luys [Luis] de Granada wrote: For the heathen Spaniard had his idol of silver, which he formed using his own hands, and another Spaniard stole it from him. He then went looking for his idol, crying: he cried more over the idol than the silver. In this way, the Indians, as barbarians and heathens, cried over their idols, when they were broken during the time of the Conquista. And thou hast idols in thy fortune and silver in the entire world.”

The extorted treasures of the visitors recalled the theft and the smelting of sacred objects during the conquista. It is a Spaniard who himself shaped his idol from silver, who cried when it was taken away from him, like the Indians who cried. And it was the Christian readers who hoarded idols and silver from the entire world in their treasures.

The rupture on the side of the equation between current artistic production and colonial painting refers to a persisting historical imbalance. It directly applies to this exhibition and the way it originated: in a power relation between international museum policies, rejected restitution claims, and the unredeemed theft of artistic and ritual objects.
La Muerte

The image depicts a process that gradually took place in the Ars moriendi literature of Europe from the sixteenth through the seventeenth centuries—the transition of court depictions to the personal drama of the soul in the death room:

"from now on the fate of the mortal soul is decided at the moment of physical death. ... The death room ... became the stage of a drama, on which for the last time the fate of the dying person was played. ... [His] gaze is directed with spellbound attention ... to the heavenly beings that ... crowd around his head. Hence, the large assembly at the end of times takes place in the death room of the ill."¹

In this picture, however, there is no drama of the soul, no subject that must weigh the paths of sin and virtue, which in bubbles slowly float to their final interiors: pleasure garden and prayer room. Two skeletons—one shooting the dying persons with arrows of lily, the other with bolts of lightning—form the axis dividing the picture into its scenes: the death of the pious and of the sinner. At the skeletons’ feet one can discern Vanitas, the impotent insignias of power, the crowns and hats of kings, popes, cardinals, and also an uncu, the dress of an Inca nobleman.

In the death room of the just one, the seven virtues come together. The seven mortal sins surround the sinner, represented by animals: The dog stands for pride, greed and envy; the donkey for lust and sloth; the jaguar for wrath; the pig for gluttony. The symmetry is continued all the way to the upper part: On the right of God the Father, we see Christ, Mary, Joseph, and San Antonio Abad, the patron saint of Caciquiri. Opposite, the devil with his demons.²

Hence, there is no occidental subject that creates these emblems by balancing out their asymmetries, indeed, one could say instead that the subjects are part of the symmetry. One could also say that this image belongs to the propaganda of inquisition and its visitators in the so-called fight against idolatry—a church offensive to exterminate indigenous culture, which is the medium of the indigenous revolts. Therefore the dying become mere signs of assimilation or refractoriness. The sinner is surrounded by images of indigenous culture: the consumption of coca, the adoration of animals, indigenous musical instruments, the kero jug filled with chicha. But the moment of weighing, of choice, the dangerous freedom of the soul, has undermined the emblems themselves. It is suddenly no longer certain what the signs designate, whether, with the dog and jaguar, the consumption of coca and the adoration of animals, a narration doesn’t suddenly break into the self-contained world of Baroque emblems, a narration that is unknown and whose deciphering gets out of control. It is also no longer unambiguous whether the devil in the vignette at the feet of the skeletons prevents or protects the indigenous from confessing.

¹ Philippe Ariès, Geschichte des Todes (Munich, 1982), p. 139.
² Teresa Gisbert, El Paraíso y los Pajaros Farjantes (La Paz, 2001), p. 222, to which we make reference throughout our description of the image.

Mestizaje or Motley Society?

In the picture’s confession scene, the mouth of an Indio is held shut by the devil himself or a demon, evidently preventing him from confessing the “whole truth” of his sins. What could superficially appear as an allegory of the undeliverable structural guilt of the indigenous population vis-à-vis the Spanish crown can also be read differently: The devil and the dwellers of the underworld need not be adversaries of the Indios. As the adoration of the devil in the mines of Potosí (called “Tio”) reveals, the devil can very well be understood as an ally—as a deity seeing to it that, corre-
sponding to the compensatory principle of pacha, the relation-
ship between “giving to the Earth” and “taking from the Earth” (i.e. also between life and death) remains in balance. Accordingly, the picture offers a hidden reference to which the Christian reading remains blind. Such a reading is in accordance with an invisible space of political subver-
sion (“Don’t tell anything that could be pinned on you as a sin!”) that eludes the hegemonic doctrine and connects the indigenous community by means of a counter-principle of mutual understanding.

This interpretation of the confession scene in the Muerte picture can count as an example of a contemporary politi-
cal discourse in Bolivia, one critically opposed to the pre-
disposition of the mestizaje discourse influenced by inter-
est. It is frequently assumed that cultural expression right up until the present day in Bolivia is generated by the notion that indigenous forms of expression are subordinate to a principle of mestizaje, meaning the dominant “white” culture. In contrast, the critical discourse starts with the assumption that beneath the social surface of the mestizaje an autonomous, parallel space of resistance exists. This space offers the communities coherence and thus provides a revolutionary potential that remains partially invisible to the ruling class. The concept of a “sociedad abigarrada” (“motley society”) introduced by the Bolivian political sci-
entist René Zavaleta (1935–84) can be regarded as a com-
mon point of reference for this discourse and its different positions. Zavaleta grasps the “sociedad abigarrada” as a soci-
ey opposing the principle of the mestizaje, which is constitu-
ted not by homogenizing amalgamation but by the jux-
taposition of asymmetrical communities and modes of produc-
tion.

This approach can be visually retraced in the films of the UKAMAU group, which since the early 1960s has made the perhaps most important cultural contribution to the politi-
cal discourse in Bolivia. The sociologist Silvia Rivera Cusica-
canqui refers to Zavaleta in her book Oprididos pero no ven-
cidos (1984), as do the members of the La Comuna group in their descriptions of the indigenous and syndicalist revolts since the neoliberal structural adjustments (1985) and in view of the resource policies of Gonzalo Sanchez de Lozada in the 1990s. There are currently attempts to think of the concept “sociedad abigarrada” beyond the boundaries of the Bolivian discourse and make it productive at an interna-
tional level for political discourse. A series of symposia reg-
ularly invites international guests who are active in this intellectual field, including renowned figures such as Immanuel Wallerstein, Gavatri Spivak, Toni Negri, Enrique Dussel, and Judith Revel.\(^1\)

MJH

---

1 See El Calextvo 2, no. 2 (reverse side of the detachable Muerte poster in the middle of the brochure) (La Paz, 2009).

2 See Alvaro Garcia Linera and Luis Tapia, eds, Imperio, multitud y sociedad abigarrada (La \(\text{\textregistered}\) Paz, 2008). See also the books edited by mem-
bers of the La Comuna group: Alvaro García Linera et al, eds, El fantasma intomme: Pen-
sando el presente desde el manifesto comunista and El retorno de la Bolivia plebea (La \(\text{\textregistered}\) Paz, 1999; 2000).

---

Please go back to the wall piece on the right of the room, from which a piece has been cut out. There you will find a picture showing one of the most famous motifs of Andean painting. The Carro Rico, Potosi’s Silver Mountain, has become the coat of the Virgin Mary. The coat/mountain is the scene of disputes between the new and established adventurers over silver claims. Clement XI and Philip V are shown kneeling near the bottom edge of the picture, with further dignitaries, businessmen, and caciques behind them. This picture is a new, “Bourbon” version of the old picture of Charles V and Paul II in the Casa Moneda in Potosi. In the interpretation of the syncretism between Maria and the Pachamama (or the Earth), the Earth is frequently called a mother. But the Pacha deity is basically sexless. It becomes female perhaps because it is a resource, an exchangeable quantity.
Virgen del Cerro

In a letter to the general of the Jesuit Aquaviva order in 1599, Pater José de Arriaga describes how the indigenous population of Potosí worship two mountains, which he identifies as the Cerro de Potosí and the Huayna Potosí.² To put an end to such heretical practices, Arriaga had a wall built around the Cerro de Potosí, which, however, collapsed a short time after being erected. While the Indios heralded this incident as affirmation of the undiminished power of the deities, Arriaga put the collapse down to poor building materials. Teresa Gisbert writes:

"The existing cult of idolatry of the mountain of Potosí prompted the obligation to Christianize and create the myth of Mary appearing on the Silver Mountain. The identification of both was simplified through the visual means. ... Progressing from the—theologically substantiated—identification of Mary with a mountain to the identification of Mary with the Pachamama was only a small step, and this process took place both among the rural and general population, and among church scholars."²

It is well known that in the Andes region various motifs of Christian iconography were applied to replace specific local myths and deities.³ Gisbert posits that under the global principle of the Christian doctrine, icons were used to replace local myths, thus reinforcing the universal supremacy of Christianity. The superimposition of the figure of Mary onto the Cerro Rico⁴ furnishes the most striking example of this practice.

Teresa Gisbert identifies five versions of the motif of the Virgen del Cerro, dating from between 1583 and 1720, from which she infers that it must have been an established motif.⁵ In addition to the harquebus angels, it plays a prominent role in the genesis of a specifically Bolivian history of art. This appears particularly plausible in the case of the Virgen del Cerro, due to the ambiguous character of the motif. On the one hand, because it is assumed that the Virgen Cerro refers iconically to the Virgen de Copacabana (in La Paz),⁶ who is also revered beyond the borders of Bolivia, and who, after the birth of the Republic, was selected as national patron saint; and, on the other hand, because it forms a silhouette of the Cerro Rico, which formally replaces the virgin's three-cornered costume. The Cerro Rico was accorded pride of place at the center of the Bolivian coat of arms upon the Republic's inception.

The painting selected for the exhibition is part of the collection of the Museo Nacional de Arte (MNA) in La Paz. This work distinguishes itself from its better known predecessor in the Casa de Moneda in a variety of ways. For in this earlier and far flatter version, the various myths surrounding the discovery of silver can be seen on the mountain itself: the accounts of the Inca Maita Capac (the pre-Spanish conqueror) and the Inca Huayna Capac, who learns that the exploitation of the silver was forbidden by the gods and that the silver was destined for subsequent rulers from abroad. Then there is the story of the rediscovery of the silver during the conquista era, when the indigenous Diego Huallpa accidentally chanced upon the silver and related news of his find to the Spanish. Despite rendering the traditional and mythical stories in simplified form, the version hanging in the MNA depicts battle scenes between the newly arrived Spanish and the long-established creoles, which point to conflicts over securing privileged access to the silver. On both canvases the sun and moon are portrayed to the left and right side of the Cerro Mary, which attests to the presence of the indigenous cosmology. However, flanked by the archangels Michael and Gabriel, the Holy Trinity floats above everything.

The change of regents portrayed in both paintings alludes to the replacement of the Habsburg monarchy by the Bourbon dynasty, and proclaims the subsequent Bourbon Reforms.⁷ Generally speaking, these reforms can be construed as a paradigm shift in the nature of governance. This becomes particularly clear in the depiction of the replaced rulers on both Virgen Cerro paintings in the Casa de Moneda and in the MNA. Instead of knightly armor and crown, Philip V is wearing a modern secular gown and a powdered wig. The emergent separation between the powers of church and state is reflected in the fact that the "Bourbon" Mary is no longer adorned with a crown as a symbol of her holiness. The secularization of the colonial economy coincided with the bureaucratization of working conditions.

For the empty royal coffers of the Spanish crown, the reforms, however, ultimately proved counterproductive. In the colonies they triggered the Criollo rebellion of 1809, fomented by wealthy land and mine owners, who subsequently fought for independence from the crown. Initially, however, the reforms were felt most deeply by those at the lower end of the economic hierarchy within the global circulation of capital. This led to the revolutionary resistance by the indigenous population on what is today Bolivian territory, specifically to the Katarist revolt of 1780/81, from which social movements in Bolivia still draw their inspiration today. Following the betrayal and subsequent public quartering of the leader Tupac Katari, resistance in the highlands was quashed—temporarily—in 1781. Just a few years previously, Francisco Tadeo Díez de Medina y Vidango, who passed the death sentence on Tupac Katari, had a residence built that today houses the Museo Nacional de Arte in La Paz, and where the Bourbon version of the Virgen Cerro from 1720 still hangs.

MJH
Go to the right, around the wall, and look at another picture first—it is hanging behind a grille that one knows from confessionalists. In the convent of Santa Teresa, this picture stands behind a similar grille. It shows two girls being brought to a convent, accompanied by their fathers, with a band of flowers above them as a bond to heaven. They are two daughters from wealthy families who were already destined for the convent at the age of three. They are a security or pledge that the entire family will go to heaven.

Between Two Powers
María Galindo/Mujeres Creando

All of them are Spanish. Seven people: four men and three women. The men represent colonial power: two as the power of the Church, and two as the power of the nobility. While the priest is blessing the scene on the altar, with bible, chalice, and cross—the sentries of his power—behind him, to his right another priest, the confessor, his face hidden, kneeling with his back to us and wearing a black cassock, plays the inquisitorial guard of the scene.

The brilliant red of the chasuble and the lace on his suit afford him the stature of one who judges, accepts, rejects, challenges, saves, or condemns souls and destinies. His blessing makes him the central figure of the scene, the final recipient of all that has been offered: the representative of God on earth, of the Pope in the colonies and the extension of the power of the viceroy himself. The priest and his blessing hold the key that open and close the meaning of the scene. In the same way that his figure is placed above everyone else, thanks to the height of the altar, so his voice echoes around the chapel while everyone else listens in silence.

Before both representatives of the Church, at the other end stand two men; elegant, caped and armed with swords; completing a quadrilateral that brings the space together, and at the same time leaving no doubt that the power rests on the various male pillars, the mutual recognition they afford one another, and the complex and varied web of alliances that they establish. The scene shows a day of celebration and reinforcement of this alliance of male powers.

The two men eventually reach the convent to deliver their daughters. The girls are around fourteen or fifteen years old and they receive their fathers' advice on their knees. It is the first and only time in their lives that their fathers will speak to them and look at them at the same time. However, it is not this that makes the moment important, but the fact that they are fulfilling the shared destiny of second daughters: to be delivered to the convent to become, by their delivery, means of accruing family prestige, thus becoming an instrument to reinforce commitments and intrigues between one power and another. Girls are also very valuable instruments for the transfer; via their dowries of money, jewels, and economic power from the representatives of the king to the leaders of the Church.

The two young girls say nothing and feel nothing. They are fulfilling the rite in silence by merely watching with devotion and obedience, as they will do throughout their lives, which is written before they are even born. They are just about to enter the closed convent, permanently separating them from the rest of the world. They come from another separation of the world: the walls of the paternal home. They do not know what is going on at that moment
in Potosí, the colonies, Spain, or the world. They have been quickly conditioned to dismiss all manner of personal consciousness or thought of exercising their own free will. In this chapter of history, they are mute, anonymous vehicles of paternal family power, in which they are almost spectators in their own lives. They are neither the masters of their own destiny nor of the jewels that guarantee the continuation of their privileges within the convent. They are condemned to eternal immaturity, eternal obedience and, most of all, eternal ignorance.

There are two of them because this destiny is shared by all daughters of noble birth. A shared destiny that does not merit an original ceremony, or a personal one. A shared destiny that does not merit the presence of their mothers because it is to their fathers, to the paternal name, to the family authority that they now answer with their submission. The protagonists in this scene are the fathers administering a part of their estate: their daughters.

Upon their heads fall two chains, chains of flowers, chains disguised as virtue that they themselves will never be able to decipher. There is no questioning, no doubt on their faces, their own free will is something that was never nurtured and, like well dressed dolls kneeling at the feet of their fathers, they fulfill a destiny different to that of the firstborn daughters, already promised to marriage without consent, love, or free will. While the firstborn daughters shall serve family authority from their womb and by multiplying the family's wealth through marriage alliances, they shall serve family authority with chastity and virginity.

A nun, surveying the scene, awaits them; a woman who herself lived this moment of plunder decades before. She is watching attentively, noting every detail, because although everything will go as planned, she will be the guardian of these children, she will be charged with swapping their women's clothes for nun's habits. She will be charged with watching over them, managing them, and turning them into closed-convent nuns. She will be charged with ensuring that their hearts never flourish, that they never remember their dreams by night, that they never long for—or seek—any link to the outside world.

The adult nun will quash their questions, their thoughts, and their rebellions. She is the efficient intermediary of religious power. She contemplates the scene, contented that the wheel keeps turning. Yesterday it was her, today it is these girls. She contemplates the scene, aware of the infinite delights that the corners of the convent offer the women who live there, separated from the world by a wall that not only separates them, but also protects them from the destiny of getting a husband and a family, more appalling to obey than convent life.

The child dolls have only one power to exercise: to condemn two young servant girls to the same fate, to serve them within the convent. They do not even appear because not only are they invisible, but they exist in a sort of non-place; they are omitted. They are the indigenous servants tied to the destiny of their mistresses. They do not appear because the submission of the mistresses in no way allows them to understand their submission, or to see it more clearly. One is tied to the other, the servant is tied to the mistress, but at the same time they remain detached from one another. While the submission of one equates to colonial paternal prestige and power, the submission of the other is the exercise of power that allows the doll-child to become, eventually, the doll-mistress. This is how their destinies are joined without joining, without mixing or meeting. They are one, but not the same: one is the daughter of the conqueror, the other her servant. One is white and Spanish, the other is indigenous and servant.

The girls have been delivered, they have traveled the short corridor of pillars leading to the Virgin and, in just a few minutes, they have been separated from the world and closed in the convent. The fathers bid farewell to the confessor and the priest, discuss some financial details and, with renewed authority in their voices as benefactors of the convent, they make another appointment to reach new agreements.

The picture only has three females: an intermediary and two daughters as goods. The other people who make up the complex feminine universe of colonial relationships are not present in the scene: no wives, no abbesses, no prostitutes, no lovers. The mixed-race children are not there, neither are the heretical indigenous people persecuted through the process of "extermination of idolatry," and even the servants who share the same fate are omitted from the scene. Their absence is in many ways another form of omitted, hidden, or elusive presence, and this makes the nun-intermediary and the doll-children into containment figures for a complex plot of feminine characters contained one within the other. A plot where their submission, and the submission of all of the other women who do not appear in this scene, can only be placed and understood as a whole.
"They are not dignified places, hence the political issue."

María Galindo in conversation with Alice Creischer and Max Jorge Hinderer

Alice Creischer: Mujeres Creando is a women’s collective which has been carrying out actions in public spaces, mostly in La Paz, since 1992. Are there any differences from when you started out—the experiences you had when you started carrying out actions and your experiences now?

María Galindo: There was a “revolution” in the use of public spaces such as the street in 1985. The street became the most important survival space, the most important forum for the whole of society. They were survival reactions. It was such a major phenomenon that it changed the public context in Bolivia. Up at the top, in terms of public order, the politicians were deciding things, but the people were actually sorting out their stuff on the streets. The only thing that Mujeres Creando did was to understand this process and run with it.

We did everything in the street; not just actions, we also sold papers and food on the street. We incorporated everything we learned while doing these things into our actions.

Max Jorge Hinderer: I think it is interesting that you put the starting point of the movement at 1985. For me, 1985 means the “neoliberalism” campaigns, deregulation of the market, privatization of state companies and the supposed redemocratization of Bolivia.

María Galindo: But what else happened? The miners’ movement collapsed like a house of cards, and that brought down the entire popular movement. It practically signaled the death of politics, the politics of resistance. After that defeat, and the dispersion of the labor union movement, the women came out to start this process, which can be seen all over the country. It is a process that has been growing for the last twenty-five years. And it basically involves women taking back the streets, turning the street into a means of subsistence, and therefore converting public spaces into domestic spaces. At the same time, this lowered the cost of living and helped to strengthen the social and political fabric. While the Left was doing its NGOs, saying “politics is not working,” we were engaging in politics in these street communities.

It is true that this process by which women claimed the streets involves a series of contradictions, and there was also an attempt to co-opt the economic independence of these women with a series of mechanisms, such as excessive debt through microcredit. But I think it is very important to recognize that it is a force that has transformed public space, the street. Firstly because it changed it into a domestic space, and also because it made the street so important that other public institutions began to lose value and relative weight compared to this social fabric.

During the 2003 uprising, Parliament was unable to unite or adopt any sort of stance. The political parties were not even able to release statements, and meanwhile these street communities were running the country. There were general strikes, soup kitchens, and popular resistance. Nonetheless, it is a network that has never acknowledged its own existence. Popular resistance in Bolivia is founded on this network of women, because they are still the ones who are dealing with the children, they are still the ones providing food and security. They are doing all this day after day unnoticed, and if this work is not done, then resistance and politics are impossible.

Max Jorge Hinderer: The entire period from 1985 to 2005, when Evo Morales came to power, has been a time of
change, especially since 2000. It is closely related to social movements. What has this evolution meant to the experience of Mujeres Creando on the streets?

**María Galindo:** I will explain, but first I would like to say this: No one in Bolivia is saying the things that we are saying now. The official Bolivian version is that the indigenous rural movement came to the town and forced the change. I think that this is a partial, male, interested perspective, because what women did in taking the streets is invisible, irrelevant, non-existent. At Mujeres Creando, we acquired a voice on the streets because we were born out of a split with the Left and the NGOs. The Left believed that our natural place was working with them. The NGOs believed that work needed to be done from institutions to reach out to women. We came about by splitting from both. This means that we are on our own; it means that neither the media (currently totally right-wing), a defeated—and yet arrogant—Left, nor the NGOs were prepared to give us any space. So we started to work from the streets, and we started making ourselves heard through ordinary, day-to-day mechanisms such as gossip and expectation. The street became our loudspeaker. We are understanding, dealing with, and learning things, always loads of things at once, things that politics would not touch, such as prostitution. This has never been a political issue, but it is a very important street issue, and an issue related to female identity. These are not issues that we discuss here and then go out onto the streets; we understand them there and then deal with them.

**Alice Cresicher:** Before the elections for the constituent assembly in Bolivia, Mujeres Creando wrote their own constitution. What criticism do you have of the new government?

**María Galindo:** We had expectations about the process, because the constituent process was an opportunity to generate a space for social discussion. But this space was never sovereign. The issues were defined by the government and by the NGOs, and not by the people or the social movements. There is an enormous distance between the immediate interests of society and what was discussed at the constituent assembly, as you said: they are not talking about this society, it seems like they are talking about another society. They focused on the distribution of power. That was the only real topic at the constituent assembly.

And for us, who were working on real politics, on everyday issues, motherhood and fatherhood: nothing. And I am not talking about an issue of rights, but an issue of essential ideas. If you leave motherhood and fatherhood within a patriarchal family, then change is impossible. When the constituent assembly tried to find a more interesting forum, they got involved with sectors of the government or the Right. There was a lot of manipulation. The result of the constituent assembly was an intellectual meta-interpretation of real social expectations. For example: There are three million Bolivians who are forced to live outside the country because the country’s production system has no land for them, not even in the informal economy. These people had no say in the constituent process. This is not just exclusion; it is an omission in a pathological and neurotic understanding of Bolivian society, because three million people represent the country’s fourth largest source of income, i.e. we are talking about something extremely relevant that society just does not want to recognize.

On the other hand, indigenous culture has been over-valued. For me, indigenous culture is an entity that has an unlimited identity, and I think it is very dangerous to impose such limits, because they will become racial limits, cultural tyranny. Indigenous culture in Bolivia is so extensive and so varied that a Bolivian migrant in Bajo Flores could just as easily be part of it as not. The constituent process has set territorial limits on indigenous self-government, as well as identity limits on indigenous culture by means of language and a highly generic concept known as “customs and habits.” Acknowledged customs and habits always represent the dominant view. Community justice, for example, according to the constituent assembly, will be based on customs and habits, as will political representation. However, there is a purist
position that claims the way to question Western culture is to reclaim native culture.

There is a list of historical contradictions that end up as cultural fundamentalism. For example: gays and lesbians have nothing to do with customs and habits. And a good thing too. Questioning customs and habits in Bolivia nowadays is seen as encouraging a Westernizing colonial state, but this is not the case. For me, using a approach based on ethnic identity to react to a racist, hierarchical society full of unresolved exploitative relationships seems like historical manipulation. Moreover, the identities proposed by the constitution are fixed, but identities are not fixed, they are multiple and mixed.

As feminists, we did not want to just say “no” with the Right. On the other hand, we felt it was very important to do something that was not just shouting “no” from the balcony without an alternative suggestion. So it is not about whether the constitution is perfect or not. The problems are the omissions, the reactionary places such as the patriarchal nuclear family and the privileged position of the military that we are not prepared to accept. A military society can never be a liberated or liberating society, and Bolivia has confirmed itself as a military society by implementing mandatory military service. The only option was to write our own constitution based on our own dreams. We do not want to be seen as enemies of indigenous culture, but we do oppose ethnic fundamentalism and the self-governance model. The self-governance model is a bureaucratic response to an non-bureaucratic issue.

Alice Creischer: For The Potosí Principle you are planning to work on women as objects of trade.

María Galindo: I am interested in working on the idea of women as a trading currency. It is an idea that has been repeated frequently in relations between peoples, in particular in relation to conquest and colonialism. In this relationship of conquest and domination, the partnership between conqueror and conquered was formed through the trading of women, and this trading of women has generated other types of generation: bastard, blancoids, half-castes—

types of generation that are neither the conqueror nor the conquered. The role of women as reproductive beings is crucial: “I give this to you so that we can make an alliance.” But the sons and daughters of this woman create peoples who have no place, generations that have no place except for the conditions that are imposed on them to belong here or conditions that others place on them to belong elsewhere. It is an in-between space that you are not allowed to mention. You can speak of the conquered and the conqueror, but the space in between has been unmentionable to date. I think that it is a very important place, very fertile for many things. The various hierarchies, for example: The wife of the dominated has a value because the dominated can exchange her for alliances with his dominator. If this woman is the wife of the dominator, she has the value that the dominator places on her. But the daughter of the woman traded with the dominator has no value. In Bolivia, there are four or five categories of women: indigenous, chotas, cholas, and birlochas. Men are cholos or gentlemen, tout court. There are four different stages for women, quite subtle and not so rigidly differentiated, but each stage means that you are worth relatively less: If you are an indigenous woman, you are a chola. You can be a partner to an indigenous man, or a servant to a white man. If you are the daughter of this woman, but you do not want to belong to these men, you are a chota. You are worthless to the indigenous man because you have rebelled, and you are worth even less to the dominator. The daughter of the chota is a birlocha. Her model is supposedly a Western woman. What she wants is to be with a white man. She is worth very little to traditional society. There are other ways of explaining it, through dress for example. The interesting thing is that these emotional, and class differences do not exist for men. It is a female problem because of women’s relationship with the subordinate position of “original culture.”

Not enough work has been done on these intermediate spaces between colonizer and colonized, not even by us. I am working on this matter, and essentially I think that it relates to two issues: it is about political mechanisms to
control women's bodies, which exist in all patriarchal societies, and cultural mechanisms to control the ownership of women, a sort of subordinate control. Any woman who leaves the scope of cultural dominance to occupy the intermediate spaces is a dangerous woman for both dominator and dominated, because she is questioning the concepts of maternity and cultural continuity. It is an unspoken role, because it is an uncomfortable role. It can be clearly seen in wedding paintings where the Inca hierarchy submits the pure indigenous girl to the conqueror. The next picture shows the daughter of the indigenous people with the conqueror. Who is she? The question is left unanswered. There is a wide range of intermediate spaces. Chota, birlocha, and cholita are insults. They are not dignified places, and that is why they express a complex political issue that indigenous culture chooses not to reflect, but to drown and ignore.

*The interview was conducted in Vienna, March 18, 2009*

Read the essay by María Galindo: "No se puede descolonizar sin despatarcalizar," pp. 242–44 (Spanish).

---

1 Translator's note: Bajo Flores is a marginal district of Buenos Aires with many occupied buildings. Bajo Flores is mainly home to immigrants from Bolivia, Peru, and Paraguay.

---

Now please visit the Laundromat once more and look at the picture above the washing machines regarding aspects of a fantastic garden with flagellating monks. Take a look at these artificial plants with the same bias as the monks in the picture—as inspectors busy with the bookkeeping of resources and making an effort to control them, along with their own nature. In ecstasy, the monks envision themselves in a sterile heaven (Maria gives Ildefonsus, a defender of the dogma of immaculate conception, a coat. She is assisted by St. Leocadia and St. Lucia, on whose plates one sees their eyes, which they poked out to evade marriage). The obliteration or sterilization of the female body is a logical, ultimate step of controlling and exploiting life.

**St. Ildefonsus Receives His Vestment**

The painting is divided into two halves. From Heaven, the Virgin Mary is presenting Ildefonsus with a priest's outermost vestment or chasuble. Seen on the right is St. Leocadia, a martyr during the time of the Christian persecutions and patron of Toledo. To the left one can recognize St. Lucia, who is carrying her eyes on a plate after having gouged them out to avoid marriage and preserve her virginity.

One of the central hagiographies of early medieval Spain, the legend of St. Ildefonsus quickly spread across the rest of Europe and Arabia. The various accounts concur that Mary appeared to Ildefonsus in the cathedral of Toledo. His investiture was the reward for his defense of the dogmas of the Immaculate Conception that he submit-
The **Historia natural y moral de las Indias** by José de Acosta is regarded as one of the most accurate geographical descriptions of South America. Following the chapters on the exploitation of minerals and pearls, the work contains detailed accounts of the foodstuffs, the plants, and the manner of their preparation and cultivation:

"Of the Indian bread and of maize. Of Yucas, Cacavi, Papas, Chuñus, and Rice. Of divers Rootes which growe at the Indies. Of divers sortes of greene Herbes and pulses, and of those all Pepinos and Pine Apples, Strawberries of Chile, and Cherries. Of Axi or Indean Pepper. Of the Plantain. Of Cacao and Coca. Of Maguey, Tuna, Chochenelle, Anis, Cotton. ... Of various sortes of fruit Trees, of Cocos, Almondes of the Andes, and Almondes of Chachapoyas. Of diverse flowers, and of some trees which yeele only a flower, and how the Indians use them."^{2}

It is impossible to read this vivid description without being reminded of the different boom industries, which, in the wake of the exploitation of the silver mines, unleashed waves of intensive cultivation of tobacco, cocoa, sugar, caoutchouc, guano, cotton through to the present day monocultures of soya and maize, and which have effectively rendered various regions virtually uninhabitable. It is against this backdrop that we must perceive the monks in this garden of gigantic plants. For it is crucial to recognize that the control of life was an essential factor within the logic of exploitation; namely, as a means by which "male-centered systems of exploitation have attempted to discipline and appropriate the female body, demonstrating that women's bodies have been the main targets, the privileged sites, for the development of power-techniques and power-relations."^{3}

---


also interesting is the analysis of the picture and texts fields above the miracle performed by the Virgin Mary; they, and the relationship between text and image convey information pertaining to the cult. For example, there is a miracle related to a woman from foreign parts who makes a pilgrimage to the Virgin Mary. Nowadays, the people who celebrate the feast of the Virgin of the Nativity of Chuchulaya are labor migrants. One can also recognize places in the village that are today places of mythical remembrance. The picture of the Virgin of Chuchulaya represents the memory and identity of the village. The historical value that this work gains in its local context allows one to reflect too on the cultural policies of museums. Regardless of the condition the picture was in when taken or stolen from a museum, it would lose its cultural meaning. The viewers would see it, but they couldn’t conceive or understand it. Nevertheless, the reevaluation it receives thanks to restoration and preservation allows the viewers to regard the picture from their own local perspective.” (Gabriela Behoteguy)

**Virgen de la Natividad de Chuchulaya**

After an attempted theft, during which the cut-out canvas was considerably damaged, it was possible to almost completely restore the Virgen de la Natividad de Chuchulaya in the workshops of the Ministry of Culture in La Paz under the direction of Carlos Rúa and with the help of research conducted by Gabriela Behoteguy (2010). As it is easy to see which areas could not be restored, the canvas now also tells the story of its own updating. Who is allowed to restore a picture? To what extent may one intervene in the picture? Is a picture still the same after it has been restored? What the negotiations of these questions between the involved parties (owners, museums, ministries, sponsors) reflect are not least the power- and cultural-political conflicts in dealing with the colonial past—between Spain and Bolivia, for instance, but also in regard to domestic politics between Sucre (the historical capital) and La Paz (the seat of government) itself.
As the last point in this branch, you can go to a circle of threads in the middle of the exhibition. There you will see photos describing the historical path of the Virgin of Candelaria from Tenerife to the town of Qaachakke in the Andes. “According to a story from my village, the Virgin of Candelaria appears in the mines of Potosí, as the Holy Virgin; she saves buried mine workers and brings the dead back to life in her hands,” writes Elvira Espejo. Opposite the picture of the Virgin of Candelaria there is a tied-up bundle. It’s the “hombre de oro,” a monster that has plundered the mountain’s riches and is now shackled with the cloth. Elvira Espejo is engaged in researching and preserving indigenous textile techniques: “In Bolivia, 90 percent of the resources are exported. … In view of the global context, I started systematizing my investigations on the production chain in the field of textiles. I studied the process ranging from the resource to the manufactured product. This investigation itself is a battle against the destructive industry that pollutes the environment and simultaneously leads to hunger and misery. Thousands of hands are replaced by a machine, and the people remain jobless. Constant migration from the land is triggered, people looking for work all go to the cities, where even more problems and despair arise. What will life in the urban reality be like?” (Elvira Espejo)

Camino de las Santas: The Path of the Saints

Elvira Espejo

From the perspective of my homeland, Qaachakke, I tried to understand the historical connections between the two cultures, the European and the Andean, to better understand the society and culture of modern life. Around the year 1312 there appears on the island of Tenerife, in the Canary Islands, a Virgin known as La Morenita (“the dark-skinned”). This Virgin is stolen by the Spaniards, and with the Conquest of the Americas later appears in the Andes, where she is known as the Virgen de Candelaria. Starting with this fragment of history, I set about analyzing the paintings and sculptures of the Virgen de Candelaria in the Andes, how she arrived there and how she is interpreted, seen both from inside and outside the local context. It is worth pointing out that given the Andean people’s modes of appropriation and interpretation, representations of the Virgin in painting had little impact, while the sculptures did.

For the Qaachakke people the Virgen de Candelaria means “Mother Earth” or “fertile woman.” A legend of my people tells that the Virgen de Candelaria appeared inside the mines of Potosí, as a Virgin who saves miners from accidents in the mine and brings dead miners back to life in her arms. In other words, it is understood that the Virgen de Candelaria was present in the Cerro Rico de Potosí as Mother Earth, who in those times was known as sumax urqu. For the indigenous people in the surrounding areas she is wila qullu, or “red mountain,” and another legend from these parts calls her putus mamita, the “mother of Potosi.” Another example is the Virgen de Candelaria of Puno, whom they still bless as the Virgen de Candelaria Pachamama. As the Mother Earth this Virgin is associated with the fertility of the land in the whole Andean region. But nowadays Mother Earth is exploited by humans. That is where the idea of the sick Mother Earth comes from. She is sick from all the damage caused by the extraction of wealth, of oil and because of capitalism, which is now pure consumerism, with no responsibility for the future. This causes harm all over the world: poverty, hunger, migration, pollution countless problems that are difficult to deal with. However, as our universal heritage the Virgen de Candelaria is intangible. This is one more reason why I ask: If the policy worldwide is to see patron saints from the Spanish perspective, then what does this mean for the Andean peoples and for their land nowadays? I still have a lot of questions, which I hope I can help you with later on.

Letter to the curators, London, 2010

Elvira Espejo in conversation with Alice Creischer

Alice Creischer: You’ve shown me photographs of a fiesta in your community. To summarize what I understood of it, the men are chased by the women and sent to the church. Then they have to carry the statues of the virgins. There is also a cross in the church, and a golden figure you have referred to as the “golden man.” This figure is wrapped in cloth, because the golden man is a kind of demon. Can you run through what happens in this fiesta?
Elvira Espejo: I was talking about the Tata Quri, the golden saint wrapped in cloth. According to the interpretations of the women of Qaqachaka the golden man is a monster, because he exploited the mountain and the riches of the Virgin and Mother Earth, causing much harm. He left Mother Earth sick, full of holes, both in Cerro Rico de Potosí and the Oruro excavations. Wrapping the saint in cloth is how the women domesticate him or tame him.

Alice Creischer: You are very involved with women’s organizations that work with textiles. What is your involvement?

Elvira Espejo: With regard to the way the organization works and the people I am currently involved with, I recommend a visit to the webpage: www.infotambos.com.¹

When I was young I was very interested in the textile production processes that many companies fail to take into account. For example, analysis of the raw materials is carried out in an irresponsible manner by many companies. So, I started to do the analysis myself. Bolivia exports 85 percent of its raw materials, which is something that worries me a lot. Many of the indigenous peoples wear acrylic clothing imported from China. This led me to think that here identity is not pure, as others say. I started to make more systematic studies of the chain of textile production compared to the world’s problems...

Alice Creischer: I’ve spoken to you of a photograph of Gandhi seated at a spinning wheel, which is a photo that made a deep impression on me, since it shows the political struggle in India against British industrial imperialism. What is the political dimension for you of this involvement in textiles and their different techniques?

Elvira Espejo: I’ll give you an example. Over the years we can observe a trend towards the loss of the traditional forms of cultural expression among the population of the municipality of Challapata. This is cause for concern, since the increase in poverty appears to have a direct relationship with the decline in these cultural expressions in the region, due to the fact that the raw material is exported and then reimported at a higher price. The responsibility for this lies in inadequate education in the region or country—

it’s a complicated matter. In terms of the manufacture of traditional dress, one of the current problems is the gradual loss of skill in handling their own raw materials, due to migration or the well-known temptations of modernity and capitalism. This means that many of these communities are economically unsustainable, and it prevents the ecological and environmental aspect of these cultural expressions from being restored. The natural dyes are much less polluting and so do not cause so much damage to the environment. This is why we hope to recover natural dyeing practices, using all the raw materials the indigenous people know about, which will help to prevent the disappearance of resources such as native plants that in many places are now at risk of extinction. This is due to the interests of companies who destroy native plants when they plant vast monocultures; it’s happening everywhere with all kinds of raw materials. It’s a global problem. Exporting raw materials and importing junk is a swindle. That way poverty is never going to end.

Alice Creischer: In the work you are preparing for The Potosí Principle you’re going to hang photos of the saints and of the routes they followed to reach Bolivia, the ones the quipus tell of. Earlier, you talked about an inaccessible history. What importance has working with the quipus had for you?

Elvira Espejo: I bring in the quipus simply as hidden or coded information that can, nonetheless, tell us all sorts of things. There was a period when it flourished and nowadays it is something interpreted by experts, who are divided between those who say it could mean something and those who say it might mean nothing. In any case, there is still a great deal of information hidden in the quipus that hasn’t been deciphered yet. A quipu can allude to paths of different kinds: economics, mathematics, or other matters discussed by the experts. But I connect it with the paths that took the saints to their new destinations and I present them as concealed information which could nonetheless lead us to the photos in which these paths are reconstructed.

The interview was conducted in London and Berlin, February 2010.

¹ The Instituto de Lenguas y Cultura Aymara (ILCA) was founded in La Paz in the 1970s to promote the Aymara language and culture. It is formed of a multidisciplinary team including specialists in linguistics, anthropology, agronomy, visual and textile arts, and information technology. The team has designed an Aymara program for the Internet called “Ciberaymara” and a new software for textiles called “Sawu 3D.” (accessed August 31, 2010).
This experience is shared across the globe. Another example is the district of Mataró in Barcelona, whose local textile industry was “restructured.” Geographical research on the district reveals the historical continuity of this simultaneity. “This Map of Mataró is the attempt to unravel the strand of history to multiple stories and thus form a rhizome-like texture; it is the proposal to start with the thread dealing with the textile industry in Mataró and the themes related to it: the crisis of industrial capitalism having to do with the globalization of markets, but also, and predominantly, the way in which power and force become flesh, directly connected to the bodies and lives of individuals, which can be observed, for example, in the massive movements of people.” (Mapa de Mataró)

http://www.mapademataro.net

In the 1840s, Mataró saw a new stage of development and consolidation of its textile industry. Characteristic of the period was the use of the steam engine... which was a real revolution for the industrial world and for mechanization. ... The introduction of steam engines to Mataró, with which the city truly joined the industrial revolution, was due to a combination of favorable conditions. Principal among these was the city's location by the sea, which enabled the importation by ship of the coal essential for powering the engines. ... The standard machine at the time was known as the mule-jenny. Joaquim Llovet, Mataró. Dels orígens de la vila a la ciutat contemporània.¹

The Fàbrica Gordils I Dalmau was the first steam powered factory in Mataró (May 1838). It started out with a 20 hp capacity. It was one of fifteen steam looms that existed in the period. The factory started producing cotton thread between the end of 1838 and early 1839. The company went bankrupt and was acquired at auction by the widow of J. Viñas, who re-established it in 1869. By the end of the century it had become Hilaturas Viñas y Sanglas.

The 1892 Antilles Trade Relations Law led to a great demand for textiles, opening up as it did this market to trade with the Iberian peninsula. In Mataró the spinning mills were working to capacity, the weaving mills were doing well with one or two new industries appearing, but the most dynamic sector was knitted fabrics, which underwent rapid mechanization, with major new industries opening.

These years of plenty came to an abrupt halt in 1898 with the end of the colony, as the Antilles colonies gained their independence. In Mataró this was seen as a debacle due to the loss of these markets and the subsequent progressive paralysis of manufacturing.

Francesc Costa i Oller, La “febre d'or” a Mataró del tèxtil la segona meitat del segle XIX.²

Llar Cabanelles
This is a building in a historicist style, the work of Jeroni Boada, and dated 1871. The house had been meant for use as a hospice for the elderly. The enclosure includes a Gothic-style church, a colonnaded interior, and magnificent terraced gardens that make good use of the sloping land it is located on.

If we limit ourselves to the twentieth century, before migration became internationalized, there were two major earlier waves. The first of these corresponds to the first-third of the twentieth century, between 1900 and 1930, with the construction of the metro and the Universal Exposition as highlights. The second wave, centered on the push for development in the 1960s, runs from 1951 to 1975. Both waves have in common migrants coming from the rest of Spain, an important rural-urban aspect, and the role played by industry, construction, and services.

Anna María Cabré Pla and Andreu Domingo, “La tercera onada immigratoria a Catalunya.”³
Virgen de Candelaria de Sabaya

Luis Niño is probably one of the most famous painters from eighteenth-century Potosí. What speaks in favor of this is the commanding fashion in which Niño signed his popularized, planar depictions of the Virgin Mary, thus equating himself with contemporary Spanish and mestizo painters. Niño also painted for the city’s dignitaries. The picture selected here is ascribed to Luis Niño by the Museo Casa de Moneda. Yet it does not belong to his better-known Sabaya depictions, which he signed with his name.

"If Mary is initially a synthesis including the cult of many locations and pre-Spanish gods, the process of dissolution—once she was enthroned—starts again, for she is now already Copacabana, Pucarani, Reina, Purificada, Candelaria, and Virgen de la Gracia. These attributions have to be added to that of the Sabaya."¹

In her book, Iconografía y mitos indígenas en el arte, Teresa Gisbert draws a complex history of the super-positions of several saints (St. James, St. Martin, and the Virgin Mary) in the mythological narratives of the local contexts based on the example of Sabaya.² According to Gisbert, the overlapping takes place here not simply along the lines of the Christian/heathen dichotomy, but through "mistakes" made between the Christian icons themselves (e.g. James and Martin). One can subsequently assert that this also led to a flexibility of (re)interpretations of myths and icons in new contexts going beyond the region. Routes of trade, migration, and silver also allow one to retrace the paths of saints and their modifications. The production of Sabaya depictions of the Virgin in Potosí can be regarded as an example of such a movement of icons along migration paths.

Yet iconic and cultural syncretism is not, as is often suggested, the expression of the harmonious coexistence of different cultures in a multi-ethnic state, but a technology of governance shaped by violence. One must, however, start from the assumption that cultural syncretism also possesses a downside, or rather an ambiguity, in regard to the programmatic establishment of hegemony. It was by no means possible to completely control the mobility of icons as figures of identification and the associated multiplication of possible identifications.

Gisbert is of the opinion that the presence of indigenous deities and references in Christian painting is not only absorbed in syncretism, but may also have functioned as a moment of identification with (one’s own) oppressed culture. Hence, these references could be at the service both of Christian indoctrination and the indigenous uprisings against colonial rule legitimized by Christianity. These icons of the super-position of idols and figures of saints thus created politically charged, parallel spaces that last to the present day. Particularly in urban contexts, they function as a common denominator for communities fragmented by labor migration and are carried in the street in impressive processions on the respective saint’s day by various societies partially named according to the communities they
come from or by workers' organizations. These festivities, in which Christian and indigenous customs coexist, form the cultural backbone of what René Zavaleta has termed the "sociedad abigarrada" ("motley society") and, surrounding the urban centers dominated by the white upper class, give the reason for reconfiguring the political mass. In twentieth-century Bolivia, the processions on the saints' days and the political struggles led to indigenous and union organizations closing ranks. The political power that this closing of ranks implied for Bolivia became clear, at the latest, when the united organizations of syndicalists, peasants, and indigenous people generated a wave of protests in 2003, marching into La Paz from the migrant satellite city of El Alto to then dispel the incumbent president Gonzalo Sanchez de Lozada from the country.

MJH

Now return to our path junction. Take a close look at Document E. Alongside the lists you will see a drawing of the chronicle of Poma de Ayala (cf. no. 22) "A mine labor captain ‘rents’ a native laborer to replace one of his own who has fallen ill from mercury poisoning, so that he doesn’t die. ... These said [captains], under the pretext of renting them, rob the Indios of those they have rented, ... Although they take the complete number of Indios away, they give them to their friends or hide them or use them or receive rental money from another Indio." (Poma de Ayala) Outside the center, in the communities, the wardens must replace the lack of forced laborers in cash. They are lacking either due to depopulation or because they have fled. The money comes from the informal markets that have become established to supply the centers with coca, grain, and other goods. The farmers must produce for these markets, instead of for themselves, to earn the money to replace the mita quotas. In Potosí, the capitalization of this debit of work forces through debt obligations, ultimately leading to speculating with "Indios in one’s pocket," as described above.
In his chapter on primitive accumulation, Marx describes how national debt and its financial products become the most decisive factors in the European economy by opting for enterprises in the colonies. Can we see a model of this in the capitalization of the *mita* quotas? And can we conclude from this that the creation of value is not a natural movement of the market but generated by force exerted on the lives of people? Remember the second axiom of the Karl Marx School: "Force is the midwife of every old society which is pregnant with a new one. It is itself an economic power."

"Indio in the pocket"
Guamán Poma de Ayala,
*La Nueva Crónica y Buen Gobierno*, 1600
http://www.kb.dk/permalink/2006/poma/index/elncrafrontpage.htm
Courtesy Royal Library, Copenhagen
Go to the right to a table with the magazine NOID, the title page of which shows a Passion motif (Christ at the Pillar of Scourging). The padre of the parish of San Pedro in Potosí, where the original picture can be found, explains that the wounds on his back resemble the many gallery entrances into Cerro Rico. San Pedro is one of the oldest and most traditional mine worker districts of the city. You can read about the reasons why the parish refused to lend the picture, which is reproduced here, on the inside of the brochure.

The Looting of Potosí
Luis Víctor Alemán Vargas

The curators of The Potosí Principle project selected the painting *La Flagelación de Jesús* by an anonymous artist. However, the parish community of San Pedro decided that it would not lend the painting under any circumstances. Here we investigated why this decision was taken.

A few days after I began my research work in the San Pedro parish, one of the parish leaders told me the following story about the arrival of the painting *Cristo Flagelado* in the parish:

"The paintings [six paintings in San Pedro church] belonged to Santo Domingo church and they arrived at San Pedro church by accident. One day, some thieves were passing through the San Pedro district with the six paintings. Seeing that they were religious works, the locals took the paintings off them. They then gave the pictures to San Pedro church for safekeeping.

A few years ago (2003–04), the priest at Santo Domingo went to San Pedro church with a letter from the bishop ordering the paintings to be returned to Santo Domingo church, since that was where they belonged. The parish priest of San Pedro could not oppose the instructions of the bishop of the Potosí province, and he was handing over the paintings to the Santo Domingo parish priest when, just minutes later, the people of San Pedro arrived en masse at the church to prevent the paintings from being removed. This spontaneous local uprising prevented the parish priest of Santo Domingo from completing his task. In the last few days, the locals have again got together to prevent the paintings from being taken from the church, setting up watches manned by young people, children, grandparents, etc. Thus certain sensibilities amongst the locals still exist." (San Pedro parish, Potosí, June 16, 2009).

After a few months in the district, I realized that this was the version told to the tourists visiting the parish who asked about the origin of the paintings. There is another version told in the neighborhood, which was confirmed to me by Father Favio in my final interviews. It turns out that Santo Domingo church was repaired a few decades previously and, as the Dominicans were also in charge of the San Pedro parish, they decided to move the paintings from the Santo Domingo church to the San Pedro parish. The church repairs took several years, in which time the parish community of San Pedro “adopted” the paintings left in their care. Once the repairs to Santo Domingo church were complete, the priest responsible went to collect the paintings. However, local people refused to allow them to leave. A few were retrieved, but *La Flagelación de Jesús* and some others remained in the parish of San Pedro.

This is how the painting *La Flagelación de Jesús* arrived in the parish of San Pedro, and this is one of the main reasons why the San Pedro parish community refuses to lend the painting to art exhibitions. Even if the painting were lent to the Museo Reina Sofia with a guarantee that it would be returned to our country and our town, there would be no
guarantee that the bishop and the parish of Santo Domingo would not demand the paintings be returned to Santo Domingo church.

Furthermore, the guarantees that the Museo Reina Sofia could make to return the original painting to our country are somewhat unreliable. Nobody in Potosí, or at least nobody in the district of San Pedro, knows the chairman of this museum, or how reliable it may be. Furthermore, neither the deputy minister for culture nor the government would be valid partners in such a deal, since the administrators in charge of our heritage are the main suspects in the illegal exporting of our heritage to the international black market. Suffice to say that the churches in the Potosí province have suffered ten thefts in the last four years, which suggests that our most important works of art are being monitored so they can be stolen from churches when the opportunity arises.

In short, the application to borrow the painting Cristo Flagelado made by the Museo Reina Sofia, via the Bolivian Government, to the San Pedro parish community reflects the colonial relationship that we Bolivians have with foreign institutions, be it museums, companies, international aid agencies, etc., who decide which paintings they would like to borrow/take from the country as if shopping in a supermarket. They are abetted in this by certain upper/middle-class bureaucrats intent on lining their pockets by loaning/selling resources that belong to the country as a whole, but that are kept in specific communities, such as the district of San Pedro. Luckily, the parish community of San Pedro is not so trusting and remains circumspect in its dealings with these institutions, like the ayllus (extended family networks) in the north of Potosí in their dealings with neighboring mines (Rivera, 1992), holding their resources independently and resisting the ongoing embezzlement in Potosí.

Read the essay by Luis Víctor Alemán Vargas, "Desfalco Potosí," pp. 244–47 (Spanish).

Please put on the gloves at your disposal and take your time leafing through the magazine, glancing over the different sections, or maybe even reading some of the texts. The dummy exhibited here is meant to show the production process of the first issue. It will evolve throughout the three shows in Madrid, Berlin, and La Paz, and was initiated in the seminar "The Long Memory of Cocaine—Modernity and the transformations of value and labor" (Steirischer Herbst, Graz 2009).

The pictures that served as the starting point for the picture spread in NOID show Passion depictions from San Pedro, film stills from Jorge Sanjiné’s La Nación Clandestina (1989), and press photos from the Bolivian daily newspaper El Nuevo Día (Santa Cruz de la Sierra, 2004). They tell the story of the corporeal identification of alienated labor with the broken body of Christ: from the bloody bocamias in Cerro Rico to the embodied crucifixion through protesting coca farmers in the prisons of the Bolivian lowlands.
ological analysis of the behavior that cocaine abuse induces. Our aim is rather, by illuminating the blind spots of History and Modernity, to reveal how the global history of coca/cocaine’s political economy is intrinsically linked to the fundamental transformations of labor and value that capitalism produced. The story of these transformations links the stockbrokers on Wall Street to the miners in Potosí, describing what Walter Benjamin would have called a “tiger’s leap into the past.”

This narration is aligned with a series of photographs, "The Long Memory of Cocaine—Momento frames" (2010), that connects the Passion of Christ iconography from the seventeenth century in Potosí to its use in political demonstrations in Bolivian prisons after 1988. These demonstrations are manifestations against the violation of human rights and the anti-coca law imposed by the United Nations, following the interests of the IMF neoliberal reforms. The superposed drawings are made with procaine hydrochloride powder, the first industrially produced substitute for cocaine as a local anesthetic.

MJH

Read essays from the magazine on pp. 247–52.

On the same side of the exhibition space, all the way down the back, you can find a large picture. Take a close look at some of the figures. Only pay attention to the connection between the illegalization of people and their use as cheap labor on the construction sites and leisure facilities of Dubai. The other disfranchisement takes place via debt bondage: A worker requires two years to pay back the “outlay” for recruitment, commission, and travel costs. The crisis in Dubai will flush these serfs into the reservoir of illegal laborers.

Universalism in Art and the Art of Universalism

Part one

It is by now a well-known and ongoing scandal that the UAE has working conditions that are close to slavery. About 90 percent of Dubai’s population of 4.1 million are estimated to be migrant workers, most of them from Pakistan, Bangladesh, India, Sri Lanka, and the Philippines. In 2005, more than 600,000 of these migrant workers were employed as construction workers, while others worked in hotels and homes. Their residence permit is linked to the work contract; the employers collect their passports upon arrival and before they start earning money, the workers must first pay off a placement fee and their airline ticket. They live in so-called labor camps under unacceptable conditions. Officially, they earn $175 per month (usually a lot less) in an economy that has pretty much the same prices as in Europe. Unions and NGOs are prohibited. Security on the construction sites is often careless. In 2006, the government reported thirty-four deadly accidents on construction sites, but Human Rights Watch estimates the actual figure to be much higher. Since the major spontaneous strikes in the fall of that year, the government has promised to introduce minimum wages and safety rules—a promise that can be brought up in disagreeable discussions. But the Internet forum for workers in the UAE, Mafiwasta, has many contradictory examples:
The UAE Ministry of Labor has acted swiftly and decisively in deporting and handing out lifetime bans to 200 ETA-Ascon workers accused of violence. The workers, who earn between $150 and $277 per month for upwards of 250 hours work, had apparently demanded an increase in basic pay and annual leave with an air ticket. The company offered an increase of 2 dirhams (54 cents) per day and a return ticket every two years. It's worth repeating that again. The Ministry of Labor, no doubt eager to placate ETA-Ascon, who are run by the powerful Al Ghurair family, have agreed to compensate ETA-Ascon (consolidated sales for the year 2005 of US$ 3 billion) to the tune of 250 free work permits.4

Human Rights Watch wrote letters to the Louvre and the Guggenheim Museum in New York, urging protest against such working conditions.5 Neither institution reacted to the letters.


1 Filipina housemaids may become a rarity under a Philippine government directive to reduce the number of its women working as domestic helpers overseas, in a bid to reduce labour problems. A majority of labour problems the Philippine Overseas Labour Office (POLO) in Dubai handle involve housemaids who have run away because of unpaid salary, physical abuse, overwork and contractual disputes. Nina Muslim, "Filipinas discouraged working as maids", Gulf News, Dubai, April 30, 2007.


3 Anticipatory to the major Spiegel feature on Dubai in January 2008, Rem Koolhaas says in the Foreword to the compendium Al Manakh: "There is now the talk of three-dimensional legislation, which could define an Arab Minimum Wage and minimum working conditions." Ibid.

4 Mafiwasta, Violence Is A Red Line, March 12, 2007. The website was recently blocked by the semi-nationalized provider Etisalat.

5 "The website was blocked due to several complaints from members of the public about offensive content posted on it."

6 "The French government should ensure that the reputation of France's foremost museum is not tarnished by labor violations at the Louvre's first branch overseas. The French Ministry of Culture should make a public commitment and take all necessary steps to prevent the exploitation of migrant labor at the Abu Dhabi Louvre." Sarah Leah Whitson, the Middle East Director of Human Rights Watch, March 2006.

Please find on the wall, under your feet: evidence of "masses of people violently separated from subsistence," violently separated from an "archaic" form elsewhere. On the wall, behold "the free worker hurled onto the labor market," robbed of redundancy pay. The elements of the subjective starting point for this "archive" are real but INDEFINITE: limitless anger, contempt, pity, partial understanding/ignorance, incomplete "information" from ambivalent sources ... When the South Sea Bubble burst at the beginning of the eighteenth century it was one of the first serious stock market crashes in London. The South Sea Company had been granted the monopoly on trading with South America from the English Crown. It was speculated that after the end of the War of the Spanish Succession, the Spanish monopoly privilege on the slave trade would be awarded to England. This would have rendered the entire continent of South America capitalizable for slave trade, but the Treaty of Utrecht restricted these rights. During the Bicentenario—anniversary and crisis at the same time—the group CVA links the employment policy of the Museo Reina Sofia to the current effects of the global economic crisis, in order to ask some "productive" questions.
Dear Stakeholder,

CVA GROUP is conducting an all-round strategic review of workflow structure at the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia (MNCARS), with a focus on the potential for synergies through horizontal convergence and OUTHOUSING. We would welcome your contribution to the consultation process.

Please fill in the attached consultation form and return it to CVA GROUP, 10th Floor, London, WC1B 4BS, to arrive no later than May 30, 2010. The results of the consultation and the final recommendations will be submitted to the Trustees of the Museum.

Dr. C. Hulbeck
Chief Innovation Officer

CVA Group is an independent Crisis Management consultancy and Social Enterprise, established with support from the 10th Floor, London.

CONSULTATION DOCUMENT
EVERY COOK CAN GOVERN (C.L.R. James)
and every governor can cook

INTRODUCTION

The global financial crisis and the resulting need for fiscal consolidation both in Spain and internationally have made efficiency, transparency and best governance more crucial than ever for public cultural institutions. In particular, a world-leading Museum such as MNCARS, tasked with representing Modernity, must demonstrate responsiveness and a capacity for innovation. Fortunately MNCARS is in a strong position to meet these challenges. Elements of organizational creativity were already introduced on some levels before the present fiscal crisis began. If these resources are fully leveraged, they should allow the Museum to overcome public sector structural rigidities and assure itself of a sustainable future.

SECTION 1.

The competitive advantage held by MNCARS in an era of global ‘structural adjustment’ lies in the flexibility that already exists at several distinct levels of workflow structure. In turn, this organizational creativity serves and reflects the Museum’s fundamental commitment to cultural innovation and radical critique. We believe that the ‘crisis’ can indeed be turned into an opportunity for MNCARS, if the various ‘hot spots’ of creative instability within the organizational structure are allowed to converge. As well as leading to financial synergies, the process of convergence should drive change in attitudes and habits among MNCARS people, building up a dynamic momentum strong enough to sweep away entrenched special interests.

SECTION 2.

Specifically, the two most dynamic and flexible layers of the organization should converge in a single workflow unit. Curators and other strategic professionals should share tasks and expertise directly with outsourced logistical support staff (gallery attendants, cleaners, caterers). Operational and financial responsibility for the new unit, with its unique pool of skills and knowledge resources, should be devolved to the most efficient of the outsourcing contractors currently providing the Museum with logistical services. We refer to this in-house convergence of cutting-edge outsourced services as OUTHOUSING.
SECTION 3.

The concept of OUTHOUSING draws both on successful international practices of Public-Private Partnership, and on contemporary ‘Demoradical’ theories of life and work in the service and ‘cognitive’ sectors*. These theories highlight the affinity between the two skillsets recommended for convergence here, based on their shared experience as ‘early adopters’ of the kind of innovative working arrangements that will need to become the norm if Europe is to maintain its competitiveness in a fully global, post-crisis age.

CONCLUSION

The move towards a new way of working must inevitably involve some short-term pain, especially for those whose current jobs or remuneration packages sadly prove not to be sustainable. However we firmly believe that the convergence of workflow segments (cognitive and logistical, paid and unpaid) through OUTHOUSING represents the fairest** way to ‘spread the pain’, optimizing efficiency while deepening empathy between members of the organization. Convergence between job categories with historically different ethnic and gender mixes should also boost the standing of the organization in Diversity indices.

OUTHOUSING allows MNCARS to turn a global crisis into a true opportunity, by leveraging its strengths as an organization and seizing a unique ‘primitive accumulation’ moment in the emerging world of work and culture.

*See for example: <http://precariousunderstanding.blogspot.com/2006/07/27/chris-carlsson-interviews-alex-foti/>

**On the importance of the perception of fairness in people’s acceptance of necessary change, and in particular the link between fairness and punishment, verified by peer-reviewed science, see George A. Akerlof & Robert J. Shiller, Animal Spirits: How Human Psychology Drives the Economy, and Why it Matters for Global Capitalism, Princeton UP, 2009.

CONSULTATION FORM

Given the efforts already made by the logistical outsourcing contractors at MNCARS to eliminate unsustainable jobs and wage levels, many of the sacrifices essential to the OUTHOUSING process will unavoidably be borne by strategic professionals. This is why you are the first group to be approached for consultation.

We are particularly interested in your feedback on an option which could serve to soften the impact of OUTHOUSING at professional level. The practice known as ‘bumping’ allows an employee facing redundancy to nominate a more junior colleague whose job s/he would be willing to assume, so that the more junior employee becomes redundant instead. (This system is now regarded as best practice in the US, while in the UK employers who resort to redundancy without considering ‘bumping’ may be subject to penalties imposed by an employment tribunal.)

Please indicate below:
(1.) Whether you would be prepared to invoke the right to ‘bump’ a junior colleague if faced with redundancy

(2.) Which job or jobs lower on the MNCARS pay scale, if any, you would be willing to move to through ‘bumping’ in the context of a wider programme workflow convergence
Burn Baby Burn ... Some Thoughts on Finance and Art

Anthony Davies

In the aftermath of an oil crisis, spiraling food prices, global market instability, and the endgame of a US-led war in South East Asia, Ian Burn's 1975 text, "Pricing Works of Art," opened up a far-reaching debate on finance and art. In a framework marked by a burgeoning relationship between the state and big business (including as a source of arts funding), and new concentrations of wealth gathered around fledgling "Art Investment Funds" Modarco and Artemis, Burn takes on commodity value, property rights, and class relations. In an attempt to unpack the dynamics of contemporary capitalism, he claims: "We are no longer able to talk about art production independent of market coercion"; and further, that the demands of the market (for example for artists to simultaneously provide consistency and uniqueness, or "innovation") have permeated production to such a degree that "the fusion is complete." But how do we factor his observations into financial systems' subsequent and unrelenting drive to create new markets and sources of profit—generally, its dynamic adaptability? If, as the last thirty years have proven so forcefully, capitalism is always on the move, then what types of "fusion" are we looking for now? As the contemporary context of yet another global "crisis" in the financial markets serves to highlight, any debate on finance and art should, at the very least, lay out the corresponding coordinates and then serve to locate points of strain, antagonism, and vulnerability in the system.

Read the whole essay on pp. 256–59.

2 Modarco and Artemis were art investment funds based in London in the early 1970s. Modarco was founded in association with two Swiss banks and had an art inventory valued at US$ 30 million in 1973. See Annette Van den Bosch, The Australian Art World (Sydney, 2005).
If you now go back a third time to our junction, you should take another look at the cityscape of Potosí to revise our view that the picture is deserted. Not the picture but the city is empty; the streets leading to it, on the other hand, are full of groups of people. Our third branch is dedicated to this mobility. There are estimates that the *mita* alone set 25,000 forced laborers and their families on the move each year, plus the return migration, the refugees, displaced persons, and merchants. There are similar estimates pertaining to vagabonds and migrant workers in Europe. Take a closer look at documents C, D, and E.
Cross the room to the wall on the far left, where you will find a series of watercolors. They were created on a trip to the province of Moxos, to where the painter—standing in conflict with the new government—was deported. These sheets from the album of landscapes and customs depict persons whose invisibility has continued after the foundation of the nation of Bolivia. The *mita* has been abolished, but for more than fifty years the indigenous levies form the most important state income of a Republic that does not concede the voting right to the majority of its inhabitants. So are the landscapes deserted after all? But what do these recorded festivities mean? Are specters dancing there, released monsters of the imported creation of fear with uncontrollable local divinities? And, what people meet in these streets in the flow of travelers and festivities, who conduct trade, who talk and tell tales and share the cunning of survival with others?
Melchior María Mercado

Both the most recent and the earliest examples of the historical paintings selected for the exhibition can be regarded as chronicles. Yet the works of Guaman Poma de Ayala (1600s) and Melchior María Mercado (1900s) relate of people and everyday events never touched upon in the official historiographies; neither in the historical accounts of the conquista, nor in those of the young Republic of Bolivia.

Featured in the first watercolor of Mercado’s series is Mariscal Sucre, the celebrated liberator of Bolivia, shown pouring education, justice, and culture onto the bed of flowers that is the new patria or Bolivian fatherland. Dangling like a sword from his belt is a large pair of shears; the implication here being that this implement, previously misappropriated by the Spanish, could also sever the flow of these bountiful gifts into the nation-state, and ruthlessly root out resistance as it would weeds from its own flowerbed.

Initially acquainted with Mercado’s impressive watercolors in a facsimile edition in mid-20th, we had doubts whether to include his work. It clearly falls outside the timeframe of the other historical works, and is consequently not “colonial painting” as such. On the contrary, it is “republican.” Mercado himself was a militant and patriotic champion of early republican liberalism, who fought for the interests of the Creole oligarchy. And this brings us to our second set of serious reservations: his unwavering loyalty to José María Linares, for example, who was related to the Spanish aristocracy, and who was also being heralded as the first “civilian president of Bolivia” appointed himself dictator for life; then there was Mercado’s relationship with Mariano Melgarejo, who gained notoriety for being at the forefront of the indígenas and who entered the annals of Bolivian history for committing what was undoubtedly the most astonishingly despotic act of arbitrary rule: In 1867 he exchanged over 105,000 square kilometers of Bolivian territory, including its inhabitants, for a white horse.

However, Gunnar Mendoza, the biographer and publisher of the facsimile edition, claims that Mercado did not depict society and the economy during the first forty-five years of the Republic of Bolivia in a favorable light anticipated by the ruling Creole elite. But is not our view of the past perhaps a little distorted? After studying law in Sucre, Mercado entered military service and joined the group led by General José Miguel Velasco. In 1840, whilst in political exile, he accepted a position as lecturer for drawing and geography in Santa Cruz, before taking his law exams in 1845. In 1867 he was appointed secretary to the State Council. He embarked on a number of research trips during which he compiled sketches and surveys, and charted these regions for the new government. After fleeing from the Belzu government to Moxos, Mercado completed a large section of this “album” on the standard office paper of the time. Yet are these sketches not merely the “rogue” records of an unemployed government official? Mendoza “discovered” Mercado in the years following the imposition of the IMF’s structural adjustment program of 1985, and in his book he intimates that his protagonist had subscribed to a revolutionary ideology predicated on the late eighteenth-century French model. Does he succeed in portraying Mercado as an anti-Imperialist? In actual fact Mendoza’s compilation of Mercado’s “chronicles” can be read as a historical account of the survival of the indigenous social structures, which would even endure the violence of the bourgeois nation-state, replete with its liberal economy.

We were already too captivated by the works to question these arguments, perhaps because the paintings held so much more information on colonial and postcolonial conditions than most other “colonial painting.” The frenzied allegories, carnivalesque costumes and dances afford a keen insight into the indigenous perspective, and in direct contrast to the intentions of the author, they clearly illustrate how little the founding of a nation-state is capable of occluding the presence of colonial rule. Consequently, Mercado’s anthropological perspective is counterpointed by its own content.

Gunnar Mendoza contends that the neoclassical style adopted by the emerging bourgeois nation-states in Europe, North and South America, demonstrates the inability of the bourgeoisie to fashion a new, stylistic narrative itself. He writes that Melchior María Mercado replaced Doric columns with exotic trees, mythological allegories with indigenous costumes and dances. The syncretic alliance, that Teresa Gisbert so assiduously analyzed in the Andean paintings of the Baroque, can be seen here to crumble: In Melchor María Mercado’s work we witness the dissolution of the once indivisible fusion of humanistic, Christian, and indigenous iconography; on the one hand, the puppetlike and vacuous panoply of state, on the other, paintings, dances, costumes, and customs that the bourgeoisie can only decipher in folkloristic or anthropological terms. 

1 Melchior María Mercado, Album de Paisajes, Tipos Humanos y Costumbres de Bolivia (1841–1866), Gunnar Mendoza L, ed. (Sucre, 1991).

AC, MJH
On the long montage table standing opposite, LCD screens are apparently being manufactured. On some of them you can discern silhouettes of scenes from the Album de Paisajes, as if they were burned into the surface of the screen. Here, you can read ten of a hundred dreams that were recorded on two trips to China in 2008/2009. An excerpt from the travelogue: "It is December 2008, I am in the outskirts of Shenzhen. The credit crisis has fiercely hit this part of the country. Countless buses, battered and shabby, perform a chaotic dance on the streets, crossing each others' way. The buses are full of migratory workers on their way home, back to the interior. I'm in the Pearl River Delta. It's an area where nobody comes from; everybody comes from somewhere else. It's an area completely focused on production, where human beings are no more than instruments for a purpose." (Mathijs de Bruijne) Like feasts and their costumes, "dreaming" does not solely obey the "principle of repetition."

1000 dreams

Mathijs de Bruijne

The woman is already waiting for us in the lobby of the hotel. She looks pale and tired. We greet her and together we walk, without saying much, to the elevator. Upstairs in our room she immediately starts speaking without a pause. She talks non-stop, about the red dust that was spread everywhere in the battery factory, the illness that this dust has caused in many workers, and the denial, the persistent negation on the side of the factory and the local authorities.

Later in the restaurant I cannot understand how careful I have to be; she is monitored, after all, and has been detained several times for speaking with journalists about this problem. Nevertheless, the restaurant table is covered with documents and other pieces of evidence that she has brought with her. I already know the whole story of the cadmium poisoning, only the person connected with the story is new for me.

When we return to the hotel we notice that the discotheque has already started, the basses from the second floor mix with the sound of the nearby night market. She continues talking.

The next day, around ten o'clock she has returned to the hotel. She has taken a day off from her work. "Are you still working in the factory," I ask. "Yes indeed, from time to time, when my body allows me to do so," she answers. She feels isolated and comes across a lot of incomprehension. During her work she is not allowed to talk with her colleagues. The batteries are still being sold and the negative publicity does not encourage sales.

Yet her own daughter doesn't understand what is going on with her mother very well either. She doesn't even know how ill she is. Her daughter lives in a country far away where the women go out on the streets veiled, she tells me. Wang Feng Ping is happy that her daughter has a job; she works in a hotel.

Wang Feng Ping has come to the hotel well prepared. She tells me about her dream for forty minutes non-stop. First the short dream, followed by a detailed description of what happened at the factory. She has to tell the story; she has to make her words visible. Wang Feng Ping is a forty-seven-year-old woman who works as an engineer at the Gold Peak Battery Factory in Huizhou.

Her dream is one among a hundred dreams that I recorded in China. Over two separate periods and in different parts of this country I asked people to tell me the dreams that they have during nighttime.

All the recordings and their translations can be found on the website 1000dreams.org. After reading these dreams it becomes clear that my interest is not in making a separate analysis of the different dreams but rather my search is about carefully unfolding the context where these stories take place. Anyhow, it would be impossible to come to an interpretation of each separate story given that such analysis requires at least several dreams of the same person.

This project is about conceiving a sustainable image of life in contemporary China. Therefore this one question keeps on returning: What is really essential for Chinese citizens?
During my second trip to the Pearl River Delta in 2009, I recorded dreams of Chinese workers who came into conflict with the authorities, factory owners, and/or other people in power. For these interviews I worked together with local activists and independent labor organizations that work from Hong Kong. The dreams I recorded create a sharp image of the context where the workers have to live and work. These people come from the countryside, mostly from provinces like Hunan or Sichuan, and come to work in the textile, toy, or electronics industry. These factories cover the entire Pearl River Delta and the percentage of migrants is even higher than 90 percent in some cities.

The economic conditions, the exploitation of labor, and the ensuing consequences dominate the life of the migrant workers in the daytime as well during the night. Conflict with their bosses, blacklists with the names of organized workers, cadmium poisonings, black lung disease, and other accidents at work appear several times in their dreams. The Pearl River Delta creates harsh dreams through its strong orientation on quick profit.

Like the watercolors of Melchor María Mercado, the Chinese dreams form another picture of the country. Mercado’s images depict a country in the nineteenth century with its assorted groups of inhabitants and their habits—images from daily life not shown or described before Mercado. In the Chinese dreams from the beginning of the twentieth century, the new high-rise skyscrapers and glossy airports end up in the backdrop/background whereas the daily rough reality of the free market context stands to the fore, presenting the conditions behind the set-up facades and showing images of the aspirations, frustrations, tensions, disillusionments, and achievements of the dreamers.

It is December 2008, and I am in the outskirts of Shenzhen. Two hours ago a man walked into the hotel lobby; we went upstairs and the man, Gu Jun Yue, told me his dream:

"It was during the week that I stayed at the hospital after I got injured at work. First I stayed nine days at the factory where I worked, then I was transferred to a hospital. During my first night in the hospital, I didn’t know when I was dreaming and when I was awake. I wasn’t able to tell what was dream and what was reality. But I had one dream that made a deep impression on me. It was about my hand. When I was operated, the doctor said that my hand would probably suffer some complication later on. The night after the operation, I dreamt that my hand had disappeared. In the morning I asked the doctor about this and he said that he might have to cut off the hand, so maybe in my dream I had anticipated that.

This dream made me think a lot. I thought: What shall I do without my hand? How shall I live? How can I continue my life? After all, I still have a long life ahead, but it would be meaningless without the hand, at least only half as meaningful. A human being has two hands but the left hand is not used as much as the right hand, so if a person loses his right hand, he also loses half of his life. The right hand is the one that is in contact with things, no matter what you do. I thought about all these things in the dream itself. When I do the housework I need my right hand, it’s unavoidable. But in my dream, my hand was gone.

I had another dream during that time. I dreamt I had been operated and somehow I was at home when I woke up after the operation. My grandmother asked me to do something but my hand couldn’t do it, so my grandfather said: ‘Now you don’t even have a hand anymore, you are of no use here at home, you should think about finding a way to manage your life on your own.’

I think this dream is very realistic; in real life people often look down on you when you are disabled because of a bad injury, because you are no longer a complete person. Sometimes I ask myself whether a disabled person can only live in a lower class of society. I always think a lot, but anyway, reality is reality and I have to face it, there is no other way.

When I was in the hospital the doctor said ... I remember it literally, he said: ‘This is the wound made by the machine, from here to there, but it is too short, I will make it longer.’ He was suturing the wound and each stitch costs money, so why would he need to make the wound longer? I was under anesthetic so maybe I only dreamt this. I probably only dreamt it. When I thought about it, I wondered why it would be important to make the wound longer? I didn’t ask him, but I wouldn’t do that if I were a doctor. He said he needed to make the wound longer, so the wound was short originally. But I am the person who pays for the treatment, the operation etc. So just think about why he said that the wound was too short.

I will have to spend a lot of money on medical treatment and rehabilitation, to try to make my hand function again, to cure it. But this is not a doctor with a good attitude. There was some piece of flesh sticking out of my hand and he put it back in with his finger. He just slammed the flesh back in, he didn’t want to do more work. That was in the emergency room, I was not yet on the operating table. The operation was almost exactly like in my dream. I was scared when I lay down on the operating table, with the lights above me. The operation lasted half an hour and my hand was sutured with thirty-nine stitches. I couldn’t see my
hand during the operation and afterwards it was wrapped in plaster in order to stabilize it.

That night I dreamt that my hand was missing. I woke up all sweaty because I was so scared. I wondered what I should do if the hand had really been cut off. It would be very hard to face my family, my relatives and friends, and it would be difficult to get married. I thought about these things in my dreams, but it was like thinking during daytime and I remember everything very well. After my accident I started thinking a lot in dreams, and it felt very real; often I couldn't distinguish between dream and reality. The doctor said: 'Your hand may have to be cut off,' and then in my dream the hand had already been cut off. I was very scared when I woke up but then I saw that my hand was still there, wrapped in plaster. I couldn't move my hand inside the plaster and I had to maintain it in a certain position while sleeping, without moving it. The plaster was used to fix the joints because the machine had squeezed my bones and they had become loose. My five fingers were inside the plaster, the mold held them together to stabilize them. After this dream, my hand has always been the same in my dreams and in reality. The only difference is that it didn't get cut off as I had dreamt. I'm very happy that I still have my hand. Other people always ask me about my hand. The second day in hospital, the patient I was sharing the room with asked me: 'Your right hand got injured at work, it was squeezed by a machine, now it is disabled. What is your opinion about that?' I said: 'I don't have any opinion.'

Many of my colleagues ask me: 'Your right hand was injured, you cannot use it anymore, what do you think about that?' I say: 'Nothing.' I'm not a person who laments the loss of something that is gone. After all, I once had it, so I feel no regret. In my dreams I told myself that if one day I lost my hand I wouldn't regret it because I once had a healthy right hand, I once used it. I said this to myself in my dreams. When my friends and relatives asked me what I would do if I lost my hand one day, I said I would do nothing. It doesn't matter if I lose it because I once had it. I'm that kind of person. When I begin something, it doesn't matter so much to me if it will end or not. I once had a right hand and I used it, so I'm satisfied. In my dream, my hand had been cut off, but when I woke up I saw that it was still there.

I actually had a premonition of this accident, but I didn't think that the accident would happen to me. I'm usually a very happy person under any circumstances, but during the three days before the accident I was in a particularly good mood. Then one night I dreamt that a colleague of mine got injured in an accident. A screw got loose and fell off its place, he tried to put it back but his arm got trapped in the machine and his bones and joints got broken.

In my dream, the accident happened when my colleague tried to put the screw back in its place. Since the dream was about another person, I didn't care much about it. I didn't think this could happen to me. Three days later, on December 8 at eight o'clock, we started our shift as usual. I went to a machine and took off the cover. The screw on the coupling lever was loose. The coupling lever has an infrared ray and a sensor below it. The infrared ray must hit the center of the sensor, then the machine can function properly. But the screw was loose and when the machine started working it got loosened even more. The company doesn't take enough care of security and there is not enough protective equipment. They want to produce as quickly as possible to earn money, so they don't care much about security. The accident happened because of the loose screw. The screw held the sensor in place, so when the screw got loose the sensor started moving around and the infrared ray no longer hit the center of the sensor. So the machine couldn't receive the right orders and the accident happened. That's when my hand was injured.
It is high time to finally introduce you to the museum in this museum, which you have already crossed several times in our path description. It is not state-run, like this one, but self-organized. It has no budget but the same mission: "If we do not keep a record of our culture, then there is no record of our history." This claim to possessing and remembering a history of one's own does not tolerate a pluralistic "but"; instead, it is necessarily directed against the cultural understanding of a national elite and its historical monopoly—the monopoly which is part of the natural will to dispose of the lives of others. As is known, China provides the corporations of the world with factory facilities and a proletariat that was formed over the past thirty years by migrant workers. As is known, the knowledge of this empirical fact must stultify all theories on the purely symbolic production of surplus value in the gentrified city centers; the knowledge of the working conditions must make you embarrassed in the face of what you buy each day and wear on your skin. The aims of the museum are: "To advocate and promote migrant workers' culture, to promote the recognition of the labor value, to foster and strengthen migrant workers' self-confidence and identity, so as to improve the overall living and working conditions of the migrant workers in China."

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.


China's history of 30 years as a country with a population of 1.3 billion is also a history of industrialization, urbanization, and economic development. The main reason for this development has been the two hundred million plus migrant workers who have played an indispensable role in the country's rise and who have also made great contributions to the world economy.

In the past thirty years since China first adopted reform policies which opened our doors to the world, China has developed extremely fast in the areas of industrialization, urbanization, and economic development. The main reason for this development has been the two hundred million plus migrant workers who have played an indispensable role in the country's rise and who have also made great contributions to the world economy.

Since China's first 30 years of the Reform and Open policy era, it has been open to the world. The country has undergone rapid industrialization, urbanization, and economic development. The migrant workers have played a crucial role in this development.

In China, the history of the last 30 years is also a history of industrialization, urbanization, and economic development. The main reason for this development has been the two hundred million plus migrant workers who have played an indispensable role in the country's rise and who have also made great contributions to the world economy.

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.

Each country or nation has its own path, but we do find common principles when looking into the histories of different nations. The oppression that these migrants face from the part forces of capital and power is comparable to past colonial exploitation.
China’s three decades of reform and opening up have contributed to its rise as well as to the making of its new working class. However, the creation of a new working class is not necessarily concomitant with an emergence of new workers. Instead, it is a process of economic, societal, institutional and cultural transformations accompanied by the working class’ own awareness raising and the reflection of their identity. The culture of this new working class reflects these workers’ own recognition of their status as well as their desire for a more equal society. Just as Bolívar’s oil painting carries the memory of migrant workers, Chinese migrant workers’ culture reflects the realities of China’s new workers and will also become a collective memory.

Las tres décadas de reforma y apertura que ha vivido China han contribuido al desarrollo del país, pero también a la creación de una nueva clase trabajadora. Sin embargo, la aparición de nuevos trabajadores y la creación de una nueva clase no tienen por qué ser necesariamente simultáneas. La nueva clase se crea más bien a través de un proceso de transformación económica, social, institucional y cultural que viene acompañado de la aparición de la conciencia de clase y la reflexión sobre la propia identidad. La cultura de esta nueva clase trabajadora refleja el reconocimiento de su propio estatus así como el deseo de una sociedad más igualitaria. Del mismo modo que en las pinturas de Bolívar se encuentra impresa la memoria de los trabajadores migrantes, en la cultura de los nuevos trabajadores migrantes chinos se refleja su realidad y se convertirá también en una especie de memoria colectiva.


**Mapping of the Thirty Years History of Migration**

- 1978, Reform and opening-up
- 1992, Deng Xiaoping’s southern tour
- 1993, The detention and repatriation regulation was abolished
- 2003, The abolition of the “Labor Contract Law”
- 2009, The financial crisis hit

1978年，改革开放
1992年，邓小平南巡
2003年，收容遣送制度取消
2008年，《劳动合同法》实施
2009年，金融危机

1978, Reform and opening-up
1992, Deng Xiaoping’s southern tour
2003, "The detention and repatriation regulation was abolished"
2006, "The implementation of the "Labor Contract Law"
2009, "The financial crisis hit"

1978, Reform y apertura
1992, Viaje al sur de Deng Xiaoping
2003, Abolición de la ley de Detención y Repatriación
2008, "La cuestión de la ley de Contratos de Trabajo"
2009, "El impacto de la crisis económica"

1978, Reform und Öffnung
1992, Deng Xiaoping’s Reise in den Süden
2003, "Abwertung des Systems "Verhaftung und Rückführung"
2008, "Verabschiedung des Arbeitsvertragsrechts"
2009, "Auswirkungen der Finanzkrise werden spürbar"
打工全图

二十一世纪・中国
Sun Heng, co-founder of the Migrant Workers’ Museum,
Talks to Matthijs de Bruijne and Max Jorge Hinderer

"In the past thirty years since China first adopted reform policies, which opened our doors to the world, China has developed extremely fast in the areas of industrialization, urbanization, and economic development. The main reason for this development has been the 200,000,000 plus migrant workers who have played an indispensable role in the country’s rise.

In this museum, you will encounter a small picture in which a figure with bound eyes is spurred on by an angel to set a machine in motion. It is the copy of a picture that was hanging in the church of Jesús de Machaca before it was stolen. (You can read about what really happened in the next point on our route.) The motif is from a popular emblem collection of the seventeenth century, an overwriting of the erotic flirtation between Cupid and Psyche on the subjugation of the soul before Jesus. In Jesús de Machaca, one of the central places of the region to recruit the mita, the machine, in which the soul and its supervisor are yokes, would have been familiar due to the mills used to obtain silver, to which animals and humans were yoked.

As if the axis of the wheel set in motion in the picture were to continue, you will find a small book on floor higher that served as the model for this picture. It is already opened to the next episode: Jesus turning a figure. The soul blows the dust from the hand. But which eternity opposes this dust out of which everything is created? The completed figures stand in the background, serially and made under the division of labor, like in a department store.

Amor divinus

The picture was hung along with another, smaller picture on the left-hand side of the altar, directly next to the picture of the chariot. Opposite, on the right-hand side of the altar there are also two small pictures with similar motifs. Therefore, we presume that this picture belonged to one and the same commission and stems from the same painter. In May 2009 two pictures were stolen from the church. One of them was the picture described below:

Moving from countryside to urban areas, migrant workers are the link and bridge between the two worlds and are the driving force of China’s economic progress. They are actually holding up the whole nation, and we wish to honor their history.

The museum is being established by the Migrant Workers’ Home, an NGO based in Beijing. Oxfam Hong Kong has been financially supporting the running of the museum. The museum has also received support from various local governments, including the Cultural Bureau of Beijing, the Cultural Hall of Chaoyang District of Beijing, and the Ficun Village Committee. The museum officially opened on May 1, 2008."

Read the interview with Sun Heng, pp. 259–62.
The model of the picture is from Hermannus Hugo’s *Pia desideria*. It is an illustration from a highly popular, religious emblem book printed in 1628 by the Plantin Press in Antwerp. “Hugo’s *Pia desideria* would become the most influential emblem book published after Alciato’s *Emblemata liber* (1531); the book was reprinted forty-nine times, and ninety translations and adaptations were published all over Europe.” The *Amor divinus* genre is an example of the influence of the Counter-Reformation on emblematic literature in the Netherlands. In 1608 Otto van Veen published a collection of 124 emblems at the Plantin Press in Antwerp titled *Amorum emblematum*, with individual scenes of Cupid and his power. The book was extremely popular in the seventeenth century and received throughout Europe. Not least, it led to Isabella, the archduchess of the southern Netherlands, to come up with the idea, in the wake of the Counter-Reformation, of having Van Veen’s profane emblems of love reinterpreted in a religious way. For the *Amoris divini emblematum*, sixty emblems of divine love, Van Veen transformed the boy Cupid into the divine Cupid by dressing him in a classical garment, adding a halo and placing a small girl next to him, Anima, the Soul.

The relation of divine Eros to the Soul is a new motif in Christian edifying literature, a further way to describe and assert the subject that is divided into the one obeying and the one giving orders, both subordinates of the divine power apparatus.

We assume that in Jesús de Machaca the machine, in which the Soul and its supervisor are harnessed, was quite well known. It represents a mechanism of power transmission deployed in both mines and silver processing. Animals were usually used for this work, but also slaves and enforced labourers.

In the next emblem in *Pia desideria*, Cupid is throwing a figure. The Soul blows the dust, the material of the figures, from her hand. In this edification, it is about the same dust of which all are made, it is about transience. But the completed figures are standing—serially and made under division of labor as in a factory—on shelves behind him, partially ready with praying arms and hands. Cupid is sitting at a wheel that turns the potter’s throw. Or can one presume that the axe previously driven by the Soul from below is now the wheel of this manufactory? And can we continue by concluding that these figures tell of a different eternity: the eternity of permanent reproducibility as well as of the production of the motifs themselves and the power that feeds them into global circulation?

AC

---

1 “The development of the love emblem in the Netherlands, from c.1600 onwards, can be seen as a manifestation of the successful literary relationship between the northern and southern part of the Low Countries. The commercial success of Plantin’s first Dutch translations of emblem books, published in Antwerp, continued after 1600 with the publication of original Dutch volumes published in Leiden and Amsterdam. As the genre evolved, the playful and often Petrarchian tone of the first volumes made way for greater seriousness. In 1615 the love emblem acquired a new dimension with the publication of Vaezius’s *Amoris divini emblematum*, a free adaptation of his previously published *Amorum emblematum*. Yet, the relationship between the profane love emblems, Vaezius’s *Amoris divini emblematum* and Hugo’s *Pia desideria* have never been studied systematically, although some partial efforts were made. The way in which the *Pia desideria* was used to help shape and form the Counter-Reformation in the South, as well as the way in which these emblems manifested themselves in the North have not been the focus of recent research. …” Emblem Project Utrecht: http://emblems.let.uu.nl (accessed August 31, 2010).

We now arrive at the last point of this long departure path of so-called primitive accumulation. Directly to the right of the entrance there is a wagon. The wagon responds to the picture of a chariot from the parish of Jesús de Machaca. You will learn the reasons why the parish refused to lend the picture on the flipside of the photo hanging from the wall with the magnifying glasses.

Chariots are widespread motifs in Andean and European painting. They actually stem from the feasts of the Renaissance and draw from ancient myths. In a church context, they serve to glorify Christian dogmas or to legitimize power relations. The chariot of Jesús Machaca forms an entire hierarchy of prophets, church fathers, allegories, famous saints, Mary, and Jesus—time and again contaminated by both indigenous motifs and humanistic ideals. In Latin America, the chariot again departs from painting, making itself independent as a component of feasts and street parades.

This wagon is from a demonstration staged by a group of domestic workers who organized themselves to fight for the equal rights of domestic labor and for the rights of women in domestic work, no matter what their residence permit status. Until the 1990s, migration to Spain was purely female. Then men arrived due to the construction boom—but that is over now. But domestic work remains, for in its variegated forms (care and domestic work, educating children etc.) it forms the foundation of social and capitalistic production. Reproduction work as a central element of society is dovetailed with all other areas of production, be it companies, universities, the military, or career-oriented people. In the end, they are all dependent on the poorly paid work of these women, who usually come from Spain's former colonies.

One of the slogans in the picture is: "Without us, the world does not revolve." In order to visualize this principle, as well as domestic work in society, the women developed their own symbol, on flyers, posters, and their jointly painted picture: a system of cogwheels set in motion by female domestic workers. Obliged to the stock of images of the classical labor movement, domestic work now takes on the central position in regard to factory labor.

A much-discussed question when looking at the picture from Jesús de Machaca was: Who actually sets the wagon in motion? The four evangelists in front of the wagon, the siren twining around it, or the four persons under the wagon moving its wheels with their hands? We say: It is these four representatives of "The Wretched of the Earth." Without them, the world would grind to a halt.
Why the Pictures from Jesús de Machaca Are Not Coming

In the 1980s a famous series of harquebus angels was stolen. After the curators had visited the church in December 2008, a further theft of four small paintings was reported in February 2009. The robbery was well planned. Together with the paintings from Jesús de Machaca their registration files were stolen from the Ministry of Culture in La Paz, therefore leaving no juridical evidence that they had ever existed. As the curators had been granted access to the registration files, they were not free of suspicion.

Max Jorge Hinderer in conversation with Reina J. González:

Max Jorge Hinderer: The mallku (the representative of the indigenous community) told us that the very same people from the Ministry of Culture those from the Heritage Office came and said, “From what we can tell, everything is as it should be,” and the indigenous people replied, “But what are you saying? We live here, and our paintings are missing.” It was clear that the mallku was very annoyed because from his perspective the people from the ministry didn’t have either the capacity or sensitivity to attend to his problem. Thus, why would they want to lend their pictures?

Reina J. González: When Roberto Choque, deputy minister for decolonization, went to speak to the community about The Potosí Principle, on the basis of the work done on Jesús de Machaca, they received him very positively, and they even reached an agreement. But when they left the meeting, at which they had decided to lend two paintings, they went to the church and found that one of the paintings in question had recently been stolen. This changed absolutely everything, as the deputy minister was unaware of the theft, and he returned quite annoyed about his lack of information. He was told that the community was reporting the theft, but the report filed by the experts who went to make an assessment stated that the painting was there. I think that the authorities have been negligent. Working together with the deputy minister we finally determined that the Heritage Office did not have the registration form for the painting. As you can imagine, this generated problems that fall outside the scope of The Potosí Principle project. This is an example of the many instances of theft which remain unsolved, and for which no one has been found guilty.

Triunfo del Nombre de Jesús

The curators: We had the opportunity to visit the Church of Jesús de Machaca, where one can find beneath a chariot a sort of construction with the depiction of an African, a Chinese, and an indigenous person. ... Hands turn the wheels setting the chariot in motion.

Teresa Gisbert: This refers to the then-known four continents—without Oceania. Down here we see the four figures, as well as a siren and a triton, the image of a cazique and that of a priest. It was a stroke of luck being able to view these pictures, for it is not easy to gain access to the Church of Jesús de Machaca. These are spectacular images. The chariots were inspired by Rubens.

The curators: Were the chariots included in the canon of image production?

Teresa Gisbert: We have the Corpus Christi in the collection of Cusco. The chariots, however, are not that widespread. We only find them only in the indigenous parishes. The cazique sits up front, with the chariot behind him. The series of the Corpus procession is well known. I’ve seen the chariot that is still being produced in Cusco. But today it is no longer a cart but a truck. It is embellished with silver ornaments giving it the impression of a chariot, except that it is mounted on a truck. Therefore, the pictures of the Bolivians are in a way ideals: Jesús de Machaca, Achocalla, or Guaquí. In the lower area, the hellish, or human, aspects are depicted, sometimes also the four continents, as well as the demon or the siren. Then come the religious orders, and at the top the Spanish royal court, on the one side holding the ceremony of the Immaculate Conception, on the other that of the Eucharist. The glorification of Spain as the pillar of faith is a frequent motif in the churches on Lake Titicaca. These are also chariots, but idealized ones, while the chariots in Cusco are real.

Interview with Teresa Gisbert, La Paz, January 16, 2009
In the Church of Jesús de Machaca, we came upon pictures of chariots on both sides of the altar: *Triunfo de la Inmaculada* and *Triunfo del Nombre de Jesús*. From the late sixteenth to the early eighteenth century, chariots were frequent motifs in Andean painting. They served to glorify specific dogmas or orders. This chariot was dedicated to the order of the Jesuits.

Tracing this motif back to Europe, we are aware that in antiquity war and festive chariots for gods or kings existed. During the Renaissance, they were taken up as mythological allegories or as means to praise the ruler. Albrecht Dürer made etchings depicting Emperor Maximilian on a chariot. The motif was used in illustrations and paintings of the Reformation and Counter-Reformation, and the Pope entered hell on a chariot.2

Isabella of Spain commissioned Peter Paul Rubens to create a tapestry for the Descalzas Reales convent in Madrid, depicting the Triumph of the Eucharist, the Mystery of Transubstantiation, and the Victory of the Church over Idolatry.3 “The chariots ("Los carros de Triunfo") were political compositions in the way they represented the monarchy as defender of the Immaculate Conception and the Eucharist.”4 This is as far as we got in our investigation of the beginnings of the export of these images to South America.

In Jesús de Machaca, neither horses, mythical creatures, nor dignitaries—as is the case with the urban Corpus Christi procession in the picture of Cusco—pull the chariot, but the four evangelists. Their sashes lead to the mouth of a siren beneath the chariot. It has three levels that are occupied in a dense and orderly way. On the first level, we see the sixteen prophets, then the Church Fathers. A priest, probably Ignatius of Loyola with a book in his hands, holds the triumphal flag. Behind him, a figure, most likely John the Baptist.

The chariot seems to end with a mythical figure—a devil or Neptune, from whose head a king emerges and gazes at a small papal figure. It’s the genealogical tree of Jesus: at the bottom, Abraham or Isaiah with a Shofar (the horn causing the walls of Jericho to crumble), then King David or Solomon, from whose crown the tree continues to grow, then Maria, and finally the Infant Jesus.

We then see the monstrous, supported by an architecture of angels, saints, ornaments, fruits, and a Janus face—all appearing as equals. There are mythical creatures unknown to us, a sign of the sun on the breast of a standard-bearer, and we ask ourselves, what the moon through which the weightlessy passes could mean?

The last resolution of the Council of Trent had to do with the defense of image worship. The Church needed to counter two accusations: 1) The worship of images deemed as animism, and the pictures themselves worshiped as if they had a soul. 2) Church painting as paganism, with motifs of classical mythology allegedly assisting Christian iconography. Images, however, had become the most important medium of evangelization for centuries, and numerous humanistic motifs went on to serve as models for image production in South America.

Do the chariots of Jesús de Machaca, then, depict a scenery in which indigenous and classical motifs encounter each other and thus threaten Christian iconography? Teresa Gisbert is untiring in her attempt to reveal this conspiracy. She takes account of syncretism and the merging of indigenous and humanistic motifs in Andean painting and architecture. The siren in this picture is one of thirty-two other sirens to be found in the Andean region. In regard to the pre-Colombian motif of the siren, she shows that “70 percent of the sirens that symbolize an erotic seduction can be found around Lake Titicaca” to which Jesús de Machaca belongs. With astounding meticulousness, she reconstructs a religious universe of the Andean people after the *conquista*, in which gods, demons, elements, and astrological phenomena of the pre-Incan, Incan, Christian, and humanistic worlds merge.5

In Gisbert’s view, the chariot paintings in Jesús de Machaca and the neighboring sites mark a break, an intermediary step: “Once war chariots, then festive chariots, they now become transcendental vehicles meant to synthesize mankind, located between heaven and hell, guided by the Catholic Church.”6 But their pandemonium is conveyed in festivities and processions.

In painting, however, the motif of the chariot subsequently shrinks to a mere column, bearing the monstrance or the Virgin Mary, at whose feet the monarch battles the enemies of faith, a genre of painting popular in the viceroyalty. The clerical administration re-established the hegemony of signs by including the indigenous signs in the apparatus of their emblems, or by persecuting defiant signs through the inquisition, sending visitators to abolish sacred sites, pictures, textiles, receptacles, instruments, and to punish persons.

This method of maintaining hegemony was implemented wherever clerical administration encountered local autonomy. It did not commence with the history of colonialism; it took place in southern France in the thirteenth century and in the Philippines in the sixteenth century. Yet with the onset of colonization, it became part of an overarching economic dynamism of the global circulation of regimes of thoughts, commodities, and workforces.
On the History of the Church of Jesús de Machaca

The inscription on the picture makes it clear who commissioned and painted the picture “El comisario Don Juan de las Infantas y Mongovejo, cura de este pueblo, con las perfecciones y adorno que se manifestan, la bendió y celebró su dedicación Día de Corpus en tres de junio, año de mil setecientos y seis.” (The commissioner Don Juan de las Infantas y Mongovejo, priest of this village, has blessed it [the church] and consecrated it on the Feast of Corpus Christi, June 3, 1706)

“Don Juan Antonio de las Infantas y Mongovejo cura de este pueblo hizo pintar de idea este Triunfo del Nombre de Jesús, Año 1703—Juan Ramos Contreras Faciébat y laborabat.” (Don Juan Antonio de las Infantas y Mongovejo commissioned this depiction of the Triumph of the Name of Jesus in 1703, executed by Juan Ramos Contreras)

From the interview with Roberto Choque Canqui and Reina J. Gonzales, January 15, 2010, Vice-Ministry for Decolonization, La Paz, Bolivia.

Max Jorge Hinderer: We were very excited to discover in your books detailed information about the economic circuits linking Potosí and Jesús de Machaca which are intrinsically connected with the building of the church. Is it true to say that the church at Jesús de Machaca functioned as a center or nucleus for a whole village of tribute-payers built by the Guarachis?

Reina J. Gonzales: The churches were always used to educate and discipline the tribute-payers. A part of the people had to live in the vicinity of the church in Jesús de Machaca. What I would like to know is what was the real contribution of the tribute-payers to the building of the church. It is very difficult to find and collate information about this. We know who was the first to order the building of the church, Gabriel Fernandez Guarachi, and which of his sons took charge after his death and who carried out the construction work. All the data about the architecture and the painting is there, but a part of the archives was lost. I am still working on this.

Excerpt from Roberto Choque Canqui, Cinco Siglos de la Historia, Xavier Albo, Esteban Ticona, eds (La Paz, 2003); chapter on the Church:

“All the heavy construction, made from lime, quarry stone, and brick, was estimated at a sum of 150,000 pesos. The remaining, complementary part of the work, consisting of altarpieces, the great altar, monstrances, pulpit, doors, statues, paintings, lamps, etc. was estimated at 43,520 pesos, adding up to a total cost of 193,520 pesos. ... It is hard to evaluate the true cost and scale of this work, begun in 1679 and completed in 1707, with all its necessary components. ... To give an idea of what such an amount would have meant, in the eighteenth century a villager of means could free himself from his obligation to fulfill his annual mita in Potosí by paying 52 pesos, which was also supposed to be the cost of contracting a substitute (minka). That is, if we assume a sufficient equivalence of values and ignore other notable costs and outgoings—such as the free labor provided by the villagers—the money invested by our Jesús de Machaca chieftains in the construction was equal to the annual cost of 3,722 mitayos.”

Continue reading about this on pp. 262–64 (Spanish).
On Invocation, Adoration, and Relics of Saints, and on Images of Saints

The conflict between Catholics and Protestants surrounding iconoclasm was triggered in 1522 by Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt's writing *Von der Abtuthung der Bilder*, causing cases of iconoclasm in Wittenberg. Although Luther distanced himself from the iconoclasts, in 1523 Zwingli took up the Old Testament ban on graven images in the *2. Zürcher Disputation*, and described iconoclasm as idolatry. Zwingli's program had an impact on the southern German region and initiated the Strasbourg iconoclasm. Calvin also drew upon the aniconism of the Old Testament:

"There is absolutely no difference, it is stated, between the heathen-Jewish idolaters and those Christians who believed the images bore divine power. ... Believing to destroy real graven images, the Calvinists, since the beginning of the 1560s, and especially during the Dutch iconoclasm in 1566, destroyed innumerable artworks."¹

During the last third of the sixteenth century, the theoretical legitimation of iconoclasm commenced on the side of Catholic theology. The arguments referred to the signifying and referential character of Christian art and its biblical foundation in the theophanies, and the didactic value of iconoclasm as indoctrination of the people. At the same time, the issue was to respond to the allegations of the Reformation. The signifying character of the image was also to be stressed in the case of "pilgrimages, relics of saints, and the so-called brotherhoods."² The ban "on profane depictions, pictures of fables, and untrue tales, ... and, of course, particularly indecent, lascivious images... [is] the response to the paganism, the cult of beauty in the late Renaissance, as it was still carried out insouciantly in the Vatican Belvedere and the palaces of the cardinals.... Common sense was: no more profane, apocryphal, or lascivious images."³

The reform draft was formulated particularly on the side of the French delegation in 1562 and passed in Trent in 1563.

The reformatory prioritizing of scripture as a medium was triggered by printing, giving it a pictorial turn. Throughout the world, the Counter-Reformation produced hundreds of printed picture compendiums, which became binding canons in regard to painting and proselytization. This is how the Council responded to the allegations that, in the pictures of saints, the object of worship was already merged with the picture—the signified with the signifier—to form a magic thing, and that the modes of the Renaissance and of mannerism had contaminated Christian iconography with classical motifs. Image animism and image autonomy were to be officially counteracted. Yet at the same time, they are precisely the accomplices of proselytization, enabling the new gods to be experienced, in a syncretistic iconography, as the continuity of one's own annihilated faith.

The Tridentine picture decree triggered a flood of tracts and prescriptions in all parts of the Catholic world, in which the respective local dogmatism seems to conceal the actual complicity like a façade.

---

² Hubert Jedin, ibid., p. 473. See also Alberto Pio von Carpi, *Tres et viginti libri in locos luctuabatuum variarum D. Erasmi Roterdami*, quos censet ab eo recognoscendos et retrac tantos (1531) as well as the writings of Pérez de Ayala in Spain. An extensive monograph on this was written by the jurist Konrad Braun: *De Imaginibus* (Mainz, 1548)
Servicio doméstico activo (SEDOAC)—Active Domestic Service: The Association of Domestic Workers in Madrid

Rafaela, Marlene, and Mary from the SEDOAC association in conversation with Konstanze Schmitt

Rafaela is from the Dominican Republic, where she did her educational, social, and cultural work. She has been in Madrid for twenty years. For four years she had no papers. Now she has acquired Spanish nationality. For a few years now she has been working forty-hour weeks in domestic service for a private family.

Marlene is from Colombia, where she was a secretary. She fled the insecurity of her own country in search of a “better life” and more financial stability. She has been in Madrid for eight years. Marlene works forty hours a week cleaning banks for a temporary employment agency for a monthly salary of €880. She does so to allow herself to make social security contributions. As her salary is not enough to live on she has to work on an hourly basis in private houses.

Mary was also a secretary. She left Colombia during the economic crisis in the 1990s. She spent several years working in Costa Rica. She has been living and working as a live-in domestic employee in Madrid since 2007.

Konstanze Schmitt: The association SEDOAC was set up in 2006. What prompted the group to be set up and how does it work? What are your objectives?

Marlene: We met each other at some workshops organized by another association related to care work. We started talking to some other domestic staff and we found we were in some pretty tough situations; there are some very bad employers and families out there. There are live-in staff who barely get food to eat. We said no. And we had the idea of setting up an association for domestic staff, to make ourselves heard, to make ourselves seen and to claim our rights. SEDOAC has been a legally established association for a year and a half, and I am the treasurer.

Konstanze Schmitt: Attending your meeting yesterday, I realized that it is a larger space: it was not only women from SEDOAC, but also Agencia Precaria and other women’s groups.

Mary: The workshop at the La Karakola feminist social center where we meet on the second Sunday of every month is called “Territorio Doméstico” (Domestic Territory). It is a place where we listen, provide support and help, and get involved with all aspects of our work, with what the government wants to do with foreigners, etc. “Territorio Doméstico” is not a collective, but a place for building, with very different women and groups participating. What unites us is that we are all, in some way or other, involved in care work and domestic service. We want to get stronger and join up with other groups to make us stronger, and to fight for our rights. Sometimes there are fifty women, sometimes twenty. And we come from many different countries, such as Bolivia, Peru, Colombia, Ecuador, Dominican Republic, Morocco, Bangladesh, and, obviously, Spain. As there has been a big crackdown recently some women without papers no longer turn up, for fear of being arrested and deported. I have been here for three years as a live-in carer for the elderly, and I have no papers.

Konstanze Schmitt: What are your political objectives?

Rafaela: One of the main motives is our working conditions. Domestic service is a very poorly paid profession and, besides that, we do not get the same benefits as other welfare systems. We are in a special system that means we do not have the right to unemployment benefit, sick leave, a minimum wage, or paid vacations. The law gives us
absolutely no protection. Along with other domestic service associations, we form part of a national platform of domestic workers. We want domestic work to be covered by the general system, for it to be valued as highly as any other job. I consider myself to be a worker, and my rights should be respected. We are also fighting for the legalization of people in our sector who have no papers. The current government has a dual strategy; on the one hand, they are promising more rights for domestic workers with papers, and at the same time introducing intermediary companies to operate as temporary employment agencies. On the other hand, they are criminalizing workers without papers. But these are the very women who end up in domestic service, not just because it is one of the few options for them, but because employers are always looking to pay as little as possible, and that is why they look for women from new countries, not women who are already organized.

In 2005, the Zapatero government legalized 800,000 people without papers. Now, the climate has changed. Previously, you could be legalized by being established. If you had been in Spain for three years and you had an employment contract, they gave you a residence permit. Now it is much more restrictive, and we are afraid that Spain is bringing its immigration laws in line with European regulations. We believe that the policies of the government and Europe want to split us into “the good ones” with papers and “the bad ones” without. We cannot allow this to happen.

But our criticism goes beyond that; the Spanish State and the Spanish economy have profited from us for years, to do a job that no one paid a real wage for. Now it is time for them to provide the money required to give us dignified working conditions. Now is the time for them to pay to bring us into the general system, and to recognize our right to sick leave, and to implement the financial aspect of the Dependency Law. I am also talking about professional training.

It is thanks to us that Spanish women managed to get out of their houses. Some people criticize us for perpetuating gender roles. But it is not the domestic workers who perpetuate them, it is the people who employ us. This is the work that we were given.

Marlene: We also have an education project, mainly aimed at new arrivals, so that we can raise their awareness and let them know about their rights.

Konstanze Schmitt: What do you actually do? What strategies do you use?

Marlene: Let me give you the example of Latifa. Latifa is a girl from Morocco who worked as a live-in, until they fired her for no reason and refused to pay her wages. At the Sunday meetings, we told her that she had to report them, but Latifa was scared. Of course she was. Firstly, because at the time she did not speak Spanish very well, and secondly because she had no papers. Then, one of the girls at Karakola called Latifa’s former employer pretending to be a lawyer. They filed the complaint, followed it up, the settlement process was a success and they had to pay Latifa. This shows that you can file a complaint, even if you do not have papers, but you have to know who to complain to, because if you go to the police without any papers, they will deport you.

Mary: Without the girls at Karakola we would not be where we are now. They lend us their space, they advise us, they help with our projects and our dreams. They are always with us. They use their influence, for example by getting lawyers to advise us on the current legal situation. We are always looking for partner associations and movements to help us fight against precarious employment.

Konstanze Schmitt: You mentioned the issue of domestic work being invisible. What do you do to protest about this issue, and to raise awareness?

Rafaela: The first time SEDOAC went out onto the street was in November 2008. We were claiming our rights, confronting rumors about intermediary companies, something which was being negotiated in government without our input. We denounced the fact that undocumented employees are treated as slaves, and we chanted our slogans for the first time: “The world would stop without us!” and “No more slavery!” We also did some street theatre on the issue of domestic work. This gave us a lot of strength. There were not many of us, but we were able to break the silence. At the same time we issued a leaflet on “advice for powerful domestic workers,” which we handed out in the streets, inviting women to our meetings. On March 8, we got together as a group for the International Women’s Day demonstration, for the third year running. And on March 28, for International Domestic Workers Day, we took to the streets with associations and individuals who want to join in our fight.

Konstanze Schmitt: Mary, what is it like as a live-in worker with no papers?

Mary: Well, the two things kind of depend on one another. Women without papers do not have many options. I cannot do cleaning work by the hour like Marlene, it would be very risky for me. I try not to move around too much, and I take taxi cabs whenever I can. I do not go out at night. I always try to go along slowly. I avoid stations and places where there are lots of migrants. Once I got caught in a raid in the Metro. They arrested everyone who looked Latin American, but they did not check me because I am fair-haired and blue-eyed.

The drawbacks of being a live-in worker are obvious: It is very difficult to have your own space and time. There are people who think that because you are there twenty-four
hours a day, you can work all the time. You have to set boundaries, including for your personal life. I am caring for an elderly man. Like other live-ins, I have to put up with sexual harassment at work from some employers. But living in helps me to save money. My dream is to return to my country and to set up a project.

**Rafaela:** Yes, there are a lot of expenses here. Even I—and I am in the “privileged” position of earning €950 a month for a forty-hour week with a contract, insurance, and vacations—spend €550 on accommodation. I cannot save anything. I work to live and to send something back to my family. My mother is ill and has no pension.

**Konstanze Schmitt:** It sounds like you are in one of the "global care chains" described by Arlie Russell Hochschild and other sociologists. Women who emigrate for work, often as carers or domestic workers, leave the care and education of their families (children, parents) to other, poorer women or family members. What are your experiences?

**Rafaela:** The people migrating to Spain up until the 1990s were women. The men came in the early 1990s, with the rise in construction. But all that has passed now. On the other hand, there has always been demand for domestic staff in Spain. It was the women who went, they made the chain in two ways: Your family depended on you. So all you could do was work. You feel responsible. I paid for my sister to do an economics degree. She worked for a little over a year at a law firm, then I told her to come to Spain. She is here now, working as domestic staff. The fact is that she earns eight times more here than in the Dominican Republic. It is another chain: we bring our sisters, our mothers, and our aunts here to work.

I also think it is very common for there to be an emotional chain in domestic service: You leave your children there, and you get really lonely. There is a great deal of solitude in migration, especially among live-ins, and eventually, whether you like it or not, your affections are projected onto the people you are working with, especially if they are children. There are families that take advantage of these feelings to further exploit you.

*The interview was conducted in Madrid and Vallecas, October 10/12, 2009.*

On March 28, 2010, domestic workers demonstrated in downtown Madrid for labor rights and rights of residence. The women of Territorio Doméstico, a platform of organized domestic workers, individuals, and activists, wheeled this wagon through the streets. It was a stage set for several scenes of an agitprop performance staged within the frame of the demonstration: “Latifa’s Story,” “Sans Papiers in Europe,” and “Arrested”—scenes in which domestic workers give an account of oppression and resistance in their daily lives.

*Read the manuscript of the performance “Triunfo de las domésticas activas” on pp. 265–66 (Spanish).*
Existen los derechos humanos para tener derechos sobre los humanos
On your ongoing outward voyage along the permanence of primitive accumulation, you have now arrived in a second narrative. After entering, please make an immediate right. Inside or next to the installation featuring the canopy, there is a table with a book on it. Feel free to sit down and begin to leaf through its pages. It is a chronicle composed of two parts. The first, entitled *Nueva Corónica*, is devoted to the history of the indigenous world before the *conquista*; the second part, entitled *Buen Gobierno*, depicts the society of the viceroyalty of Peru under the reign of Viceroy Toledo: it makes a mockery of the concept of good government. The author, Guamán Poma de Ayala, probably spent twenty to thirty years writing this chronicle. In one of the last chapters, he describes an audience he himself had with the Spanish king. He furnishes himself with a *persona*—that of a descendant of an aristocratic Inca dynasty—that gives him the authority to bring a petition before the King of Spain to end the genocide perpetrated against his people. He requests that the king listen to him. He tells him that his entire power is nothing without the riches he has looted from America. He confines himself the mandate to speak. And this mandate begins with the very project of recording these events. The chronicle is one of the most important historic sources on the history of the territories of the viceroyalty of Peru before and after the *conquista*. There is virtually no other source produced by an indigenous contemporary witness and set down in the form of a chronicle. This one was discovered in the Royal Library in Copenhagen in 1908. Seventy-nine years later, the first facsimile edition was published in Spain.

---

**El Primer Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno**

The chronicle of Guamán Poma de Ayala was found in 1908 by the Orientalist Richard Pietschmann during research work at the Royal Library in Copenhagen. It remains unclear how it got there. The author probably gave the chronicle to an official of the viceroy in Lima in 1615, who then brought it to the Spanish court. It might have been purchased there by Gaspar de Guzmán y Fimentel (high chancellor for the West Indian colonies and prime minister), who had the right to collect manuscripts from America. In the mid-seventeenth century, library stocks were sold to the Danish envoy to the Spanish court, Cornelius Pedersen Lerche. The chronicle is written partially in Spanish and partially in Quechua.

The drawings and texts are influenced by the religious literature of the time and are also a continuation of Andean pictographic techniques "in the succession of pre-Spanish painters, the 'quellcaycamayoccuna.' The combination of picture and accompanying text corresponded with the old Peruvian use of *quello*, small panel paintings to which oral descriptions were added... a supplement to the statistical data... that were marked by means of knot combinations in the *quipu*, the knotted cords."3

The Literature of Poma de Ayala often refers to the topos of a reversed world: the violent destruction of life forms, the arbitrariness of which goes far beyond making life available as labor power. In Europe, the "reversed world" is a frequent topos at the time, pivotally employed in accounts of the Thirty Years' War—in *Simplicissimus*, in *Candide*, where the exercised terror abolishes the meaning of all actions and turns all descriptions into grimaces. This is also how we view the irony in the description of this "good government." But the reverse world gains indigenous connotations here, going far beyond this, and for the present social movements in Bolivia becoming the motto of resistance through to the present day.

At the end, the author gives an account of his audience with Philip III, in which he hands the chronicle to the king.
Two subjects are constructed: the just, Catholic king and the equal complainant, a prince who lives in self-chosen poverty in order to report as precisely as possible. But speaking and being lent an ear are also tied into other coordinates: the assumption of a rationality of power that is constantly intent on enriching itself, the assumption of a rationality of its economy in which enrichment correlates with the survival of the labor forces, the assumption of an opportunity to inform this rationality of grievances and the possibilities of reform, like attending to a one-armed bandit that should spit out more coins.

AC, AS

Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala: The First New Chronicle and Good Government

Beginning of the Chapter of the Question

His Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty asks the author Ayala, so as to be informed of everything that exists in Pirú, in the Kingdom of West Indies, for the good government and justice, and how the toil and the calamity of the poor Indians of said Kingdom can be remedied and they can procreate, and so that the Spaniards, corregidores and court officials, the padres of the parishes, the encomenderos, the noble Caziques and sub-chiefs can better themselves morally and set a good example. The question of His Majesty is answered by the author, and he speaks with His Majesty and says:

"Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty, Thou should listen to me very attentively. When I am done, His Majesty should ask. I am happy to give Thee tidings of the entire Kingdom so that it serves as memory in the world and for the greatness of His Majesty."

His Majesty asks, the author answers. Don Phelipe the Third and the King and Monarch of the world. Ayala, the author.

The author personally presents the chronicle to His Majesty.


See José Varillas: Guaman Poma (Lima, 1979), pp. 43/44.

3 Ursula Thieme: Sachse, preface to the edition; in the entire description we refer to Rolena Adorno, Guaman Poma, Writing and Resistance in Colonial Peru (Austin, Texas, 1988).
regidores and [the other] Spaniards, the administrators, assessors and officials, their servants, take the very best among the women and virgins. And that is why there are so many little mestizos in this Kingdom. And under the pretext that this one says to him that he is living with a concubine, he takes away the women and the possessions of the poor. For said reasons, because of such great ... dishonour and such damage, they hang themselves, like the Changas Indians in Andaguayillas. That is a small hill full of Indians. Such a person would rather die once and for all than to see himself exposed to such great damage.

"Tell me, author, how will the people procreate?"

I tell His Majesty, as I have written it: The padres and priests, the encomenderos, corregidores and other Spaniards and the noble Caziques should live, they should as Christians and as His Majesty demands, without going beyond that, and they should leave those to enjoy their women and possessions, and they should leave them their virgins. And above them there should not be so many kings and court officials, and they should let them procreate. And they should be severely punished, divested of their offices and benefits.

"Tell me, author, how will the Indians become wealthy?"

His Majesty should be informed that they must have communal property, which they call 'Sapci,' consisting of seed plots for maize and wheat, potatoes, pepper, mango, and cotton, a vineyard, a fabric mill, a tannery, cocoa and fruit trees. And the virgins and widows should yard and weave, ten woman one piece of clothing in a four-month period for the community, Sapci, and they should have herds of Castilian and domestic cattle for their community and Spaci. And for each Indian they should have one property.

Moreover, in each province there should be an administrator with his own wage from the seventh part, a master, the greatest nobleman in each province. If His Majesty needs it, Thou can borrow it from the ordinary people and extract Thy Royal fifth part. This will make the Indians in this Kingdom wealthy people, and it will serve God and the Royal Crown of His Majesty, and the Indians will increase in this Kingdom. [...] [Sacred Catholic] Royal Majesty! His Majesty should order Thy good government and the Royal Audiencia that they treat and honour [us] as princes, masters and noblemen of this, our Kingdom, for we have built it and served it very much. And His Majesty has become a Monarch in the world and in this New World through our vassals and mines, through the mountain of Potocí and other mines, the gold of Carauya and the quicksilver of [Huancabílca]. And therefore it is appropriate that His Majesty honour us and His Holiness give us his blessings. [...] [982] 964

"Tell me, author, how should the Indians of that Kingdom not die, not suffer from the quicksilver illness and also not endure toil in other mines?"

On this I say to His Majesty: First, they suffer such great damage through the miners, the mine owners, and the court officials who come there; such a person hangs them from their feet, whips them while they hang with their genitals exposed, and he has them work day and night and does not pay them for it. If he pays them, [he gives them] half, and the [other] half he steals from them, and he sends them to the plains, and that is why they die.

And of eleven Indians one Indian may be chosen, and it is drawn by lot. One province should rest for six months, and another province should take over the service. And His Majesty must order that every Indian, Negro or Spaniard who can treat and cure a person suffering from quicksilver illness be granted mercy and be paid. And that is how the poor Indians can procreate and not feel the toil.

"Tell me, author, how can the hidden ore veins of the Kingdom be discovered?"

I tell His Majesty that, when gold or silver, quicksilver, iron, zinc, copper, or pigment veins are discovered, as soon as they are discovered, the Spaniards immediately intervene, and they take them away from the Indians and maltreat them. And that is why they do not want to reveal them. If His Majesty would come to an agreement with the discoverer and grant him mercy, then all good ore veins would be discovered, and it would be a very wealthy Kingdom, and His Majesty would be rich, richer than all [other] kings. And His Majesty will be the greatest Monarch of the world; if His Majesty would have all this obeyed, Thou and Thy Royal Crown would be very wealthy. Everything would serve Thee having the entire Kingdom in the world at Thy disposal and that they benefit God and Thy Royal Crown.

Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty, I say that the Indians in this Kingdom are perishing, and they must perish. In twenty years from today there will be no more Indians in this Kingdom who can be at the service of Thy Royal Crown and defend our holy Catholic faith. For without the Indians, His Majesty is worth nothing, because Thou must keep in mind: Castile is Castile through the Indians. His Serenest Emperor and King, whose soul is with God, was powerful through the Indians of this Kingdom, and also the father of His Majesty was a Monarch with great power and famous force through the Indians.

Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty! It is appropriate that for the tribute of spices, agricultural crops and other things the price is paid as it was converted to money by Don Francisco de Toledo, and for the rest one should give a dec-
lation, or if livestock dies or if the agricultural crop does [not] recover in that four month period, they should not have to pay for it, so that they are not punished. [...] 

[983] 965
[they are] the Kingdom, and also His Majesty.

For Thou should consider that a Kingdom may lose such a great value that His Majesty, for whom it was worth so much, will be lost, and that all Indians will become extinct, for their villages are already depopulated. Where there were once a thousand souls there are now not even a hundred, and all [are] old men and women, they can no longer procreate. Even if there are still living Indians, they marry old women who cannot bear children. Moreover, they are pressured to do hard work, and they are plagued and robbed, even of their daughters and sons and the married women.

And there is no relief, because all make common cause with each other: the judge, the corregidor, the assessor, the encomendero, the administrator and other Spaniards, the mestizos and the visitators of the Holy Mother Church, the vicars and priests. All are against the poor, all favour the Spaniards, who possess the title 'Don', and the señoras, who possess the title 'Doña.' They take from all the poor, they not only take from them, but violently, against their will, force their way into their property, possessions and land, pastures and houses. To write this down means to mourn for it. None of them inform His Majesty.

I shall tell the truth about the worth and price, the benefit, the income and the service, which one has had and should have; and the Indians are being lost, and the entire Kingdom will be lost. His Majesty should know that Thou hast had Thy benefit from the Indians, from what they pay in each four-month period, two times a year, in money, maize, wheat, clothes, chickens, and other items. Moreover, they do service in the mines and the households of the cities, in the tanbos and royal inns, and they repair bridges in Thy Kingdom. And they keep country roads and side roads clean, and from them Thou receives the fifth part, the tithe, the feudal dues, and the sales tax. [...] 

[988] 970
The author answers:

Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty! His Majesty should know that the Indians of the quicksilver mines must rest for a year, and the mines shouldn't rest, they shall serve His Majesty.

"Now tell me, author, how should the Indians rest and the mines work?"

I tell His Majesty that the Indians serving in the households of the cities should be exchanged, and these Indians should take over the work for a year, and the others should go into city service as someone resting from the mines. For those in city service are exposed to no danger. And that is why they should go down to the said mines, and they will work. And I tell His Majesty even more: He who loses all his Indian vassals loses everything.

"Now, author, explain that which you have just said further."

I tell His Majesty that His Majesty has income from the Indians. And I am a Prince. I am here for their sake, and if they perish, the earth will become barren and empty. And that is why His Majesty must demand, under express threat of punishment, that the noblemen and ordinary Indians not be maltreated and that the young Indian boys, until they are older than twenty, not go down into any gallery of the quicksilver, silver and gold mines and also not smelter or go to the quicksilver furnace, for they, because they are at a tender age and young boys, will immediately be stricken by the quicksilver illness. And for that there is no cure, and the Indians die and perish. [...] 

[991] 973
His Majesty asks:

"Now tell me, author, since you are the grandson of Tupa Ynga Yupanqui, the tenth former King, and son of his personal deputy and viceroy, why don't you act in favour of them in my name and therefore look after them?"

Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty, I look after the Indians of this Kingdom as their Prince. I have sustained great poverty and made an effort for thirty years at the service of God and His Majesty. I look after the Kingdom, and that is why I write this chronicle, for it to serve as a memory, and it should be stored in the archive so that the court can pass judgement on it. [...] 

[998] 980
His Majesty must know that Thy government, Thy Excellencies, the Viceroy of this Kingdom, have been governing for twenty years, or at least twelve, for the good government and justice and ought to recognise the bad ones and the good ones. For in no other way can a settlement be reached, and otherwise he could not punish all those who mistreat Thy vassals, the Indian noblemen and the poor Indians. And if necessary, he should punish the priests and ban them from those Kingdoms. And that is how the Indians can then procreate, increase and fill Thy Kingdom with their descendants for the greatness of and the service to Thy Royal Crown.
Prologue (epilogue) to the reader, His Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty, Don Phelipe the Third, the King and Monarch of the World:

I say to His Sacred Catholic Royal Majesty, crying and screaming, by shouting loud to Heaven and praying to God and the Virgin Mary, to all saints and angels, I say that God sends us so many punishments, misfortunes and destructions, and His Majesty should not allow us to perish and Thy Kingdom to become depopulated.

"The political subsoil is the shadow of political uncertainty that a country produces"
Luis Tapia

"The history of human rights has many facets that in discourse appear as tensions related to various lines of development. On the one hand, human rights are perceived from a naturalist perspective: these rights are forthcoming simply by the fact of being human. On the other hand, human rights can be seen as a conquest and a historical construct. It may even be the result of an accumulation of rights that multiply and are acknowledged. Part of this history is based around the workers' movements that have fought for suffrage, political citizenship, and social rights, and that have historically appeared under certain types of circumstances and in relation to certain models of social regulation and the production of social order. Several mechanisms have universalized this, but even popular struggles to produce a social order can display the characteristics and elements of exploitative and exclusive structures.

The right to ownership is at the very heart of human rights thinking, and yet, for example, it is not present as a core value in any of the thirty-five or more cultures recognised in Bolivia."

Read the whole interview on pp. 266–67 (Spanish).

"Subjectivity should lie on the side of those demanding rights"
Christoph Menke

"On the one hand, the subjectivity is established through assignment of rights, e.g. through the declaration of the Pope that the Indios are also human beings. But as soon as that was enshrined into law this self-same subjectivization became the strategy of subjugation. This contradiction is not easily resolved; subjectivization is a form of oppression. Human rights are not without ambiguity. They can be strategies of politicization, but are usually strategies of oppression. Human rights are, at best, a focal point for this contradiction. This would be far clearer if one explored the extent to which the declaration of human rights at the end of the eighteenth century was a response to the experiences of 100 to 150 years of colonial history."

Read the whole interview on pp. 268–69.
Franco in Huelva. The dictator is received by Carlists and Falangists and visits the mockup of the caravel Santa María. Archive Filmoteca Española.
You are reading this book in the immediate vicinity of another table on which many other materials are collected. They all "describe in an autobiographical perspective the state of primitive accumulation," as it took place in Spain during the transitional period from 1975 to 1985 and how the conversion of the Francoist state was accompanied by large-scale appropriations of public property. In the case of Huelva, this took place against the backdrop of the 'Lugares Colombinos.'

If you look towards the top of the canopy, you will see that these places today are a collection of different patrons, framed by the quay from which Columbus set off, where the Monument to the Discoverer Faith now stands. Beside this landmark of discovery, we see the agribusiness that developed from strawberry plantations (planting under plastic) where Spanish, African (Moroccan, Malian, Senegalese, etc.), and Eastern European workers rub shoulders in an arbitrary labor market that requires documented and undocumented workers. The strawberry producers, victims of price dumping by Central European food consortiums, only have their control over this labor market as a means of servicing the bank loans on which their plantations are built. Agribusiness, cleanly conceived in Californian university laboratories, spews its waste onto Columbus's sites. On the other side of the Monument to the Discoverer Faith we see the largest industrial hub of Franco's Spain, imposed on the Huelva estuary by the dictator just a few meters from the city on account of its "unlimited, low-cost drainage capacity" (Decree 153/1964 of January 30). It is a chemical business that for many years generated millions of tons of industrial waste which was pumped straight into the estuary, and which is today dumped in the 1,200 hectares of marshland that surround the city. And there then are the efforts of local people, who have been fighting this demented production model since the 1970s. The torch is currently borne by the Asociación Mesa de la Ría, a people's movement that has been criminalized by local politicians still defending an obsolete, Francoist industrial model." (Isaías Griñolo)

There is an art—and many a museum is so full of it that it yawns—that, in order to enter controlled global circulation must be as universal as a currency or a brand. Any local meaning would devalue it. How does an artist come to commit, in a close reading, to precisely this devaluation? He or she comes to do so because he or she lays claim to this mandate to speak, and refuses to renounce his or her own capacity to authoritatively judge social actions to be right or wrong. Below the books on the table there is a new petition to the current king of Spain.

On Political Poetry Today

On March 4, 2006 the daily El País reported on a case of censorship: The opening of the exhibition Las fatigas de la muerte I. La lógica cultural del capitalismo químico by Isaías Griñolo in Seville was cancelled due to "pressure exerted on the side of several entrepreneurs of Polo Químico de Huelva." The Caja San Fernando (today's Cajasol) gave in to this pressure and subsequently withheld the already completed catalogue, in which the results of more than two years of research by the artist were summarized. Around four years later, immediately after the press conference on the show at the Museo Reina Sofía and prior to the official opening, Isaías Griñolo received a fax from the legal department of the firm Pertibérica demanding that the artist remove all details from his contribution to the exhibition that would discredit the reputation of the firm. Otherwise, "corresponding legal measures" (medidas legales que correspondan) would have to be taken. The same, they stated, applied to the material used on the Website of the Asociación Mesa de la Ría de Huelva (http://www.huelvadenuncia.org). In this case it was possible to retain the said "materials" for the exhibition, the public, and the website.

Griñolo's persistency goes back to a tradition of resistance against the official narratives of national industrial progress in Huelva. The machinations of Pertibería which he relates in his chronicles on the economic interrelations and ecological consequences in his hometown are but one element of a collective counter-narrative, imparted by environmental and human rights activists, artists, and poets. Griñolo's installation is flanked by two poems. The first is: QUIENES NOS REPRESENTAN EN REALIDAD NOS REEMPLAZAN by Antonio Orihuela ("Those who represent us,
replace us in reality"). Another one, by Jorge Riechmann, hangs from the ceiling: QUISE ESCRIBIR PAÍS PERO DECÍA PUS ("I wanted to write land, but only pus came out"). Both address the discrepancy between the statement/voice of those affected and the national/official representation. At the public artist’s talk during the opening at Museo Reina Sofía, Griñolo pointed out that this discrepancy tends to be continued in the art institution. “It is important to make an appeal to the art audience and the institutions in regard to what poetry can be in Spain today.”

In this project, we have repeatedly encountered methods with which political contents are often and preferably formalized in the context of art. They are adapted to the formulas already present in the neoliberal art institutions: the formalized political gesture and abridged pamphletizing. The traditional separation of form and content in the art business, which avoids content (political reality) in favor of form, amounts to structural violence. The concrete political content is in danger of entering into a double-bind relationship to its reception. If the content is too close to the political reality of where it is located, it is upgraded as a gesture in the neoliberal range of tolerance (art as the alleged place of free expression of opinion), yet abstracted, i.e. removed, from its urgency. Once the content is legitimized as form, the reduction of the form to a political urgency would in turn endanger the aesthetic moment of artistic identity.

Griñolo, however, insists on a political contradiction: on the one side, the yawning presence of the political statement in the neoliberal institution neutralized to an artistic gesture; on the other, the necessity of putting concrete contents in museums down to their own political conditions: “In order to say something about your immediate surroundings you have to speak in the first person, and in my opinion you can only do that if you know what you are speaking about as well as the back of your hand. Speaking in this way, it’s inevitable that the fiery nature of street language emerges; there are messages that are on the street and which shout out that the situation has got to change, and now.” For the Asociación Mesa de la Ría de Huelva, the productive contradiction consists in itself becoming the pustule (pus) in an institution of artistic representation of a land (país), i.e. Spain.

In his text on “Mercado Energético Puro,” Griñolo writes about the counternarrative to “industrial progress as a national success story,” and in a militant study relocates and elaborates The Potosí Principle in Huelva.

Read the essay by Isaías Griñolo on pp. 270–72 (Spanish).
Now cross the room diagonally toward the far left corner in order to follow the next stages of Guamán Poma de Ayala’s chronicle. You see two tables with various video sequences. Behind them, you see drawings from the chronicle: the author’s journey, the audience with the king, the delivery of the petition, drawings illustrating the colonial mode of government. The audience constructs two subjects: the just Catholic king and the complainant, his peer, a prince. But this audience is tied up with yet another set of coordinates: the assumption that a rational power exists that seeks to enrich itself at all times; the assumption that a rationale for its economy exists in which this enrichment correlates with the survival of its laborers; the assumption that this reason can be enlightened regarding grievances and possibilities for reform the way someone would service a one-armed bandit so that it continues to spit out coins. These assumptions reveal that the author has a perfectly clear idea of the European form of government and its mercantile interests while also hoping that this interest in enrichment outweighs the government’s bestiality. The author puts on his plea to a ruling rationality open to being enlightened like an alien dress. It enables him to appear, to deliver his indictment, and to give testimony. And yet this complaint in a borrowed dress is at once so powerful that this dress itself is presented as the official robe of a monster.

The tables with the video sequences bring us to another response to this chronicle. In Beijing, there are central offices where petitions can be submitted. Most petitioners come from the provinces. Their cases concern the expropriation of land, violations of labor law, poisonings, accidents at the workplace, arbitrary arrests, and instances of maltreatment. The petitioners are arbitrarily admitted or turned away; they are frequently beaten, arrested, or chased off. The right to petition is an old law the new state would seem incapable of adapting. The authority acts without any governmental logic. Every day, a right is staged between the counter windows as though in a theater, but it is never granted. A gap emerges between the law and its power. It corresponds to the gap between the experience of injustice and the impossibility of having justice done. It can make you insane or it can politicize you; being politicized can lead to your being declared insane, or it can make you insane. Something leaks through this gap and becomes visible in the public space.

You see excerpts from Zhao Liang’s film archive. He has dedicated himself to the lives and protests of the petitioners since 1997. You also see pieces of the petitioners’ apparel, official robes that dress this “nothing but the body” so poorly, as though the notes of protest had been written directly on their skin.
Film Sequences
from the Archive “Petitioners”

Film 1
First woman
Some 20 years ago, her son was beaten and injured so badly that he has since been disabled. Despite her filing charges, the perpetrators have escaped prosecution because one of their relatives is a court employee.

Second woman
Her father and her son were badly injured in a traffic accident. Since then her son has been disabled. After her attempt to press charges was rejected by the local authorities, she took her case to the highest court in Peking which awarded her compensation. She could have used the money to have her son medically treated. But the judgment was ignored by the local authorities. She has been arrested several times and now her son has been abducted.

Third woman (with cap)
They wanted to open a Buddhist temple but were refused permission by the government.

"Many of the petitioners are arrested or thrown into mental asylums."

Fourth woman (with a letter)
She relates the story of a woman from Tianshui region, in the administrative district of Danyang, who works for a government agency responsible for distributing grain. After filing charges against her boss, she was sent to a mental institution. The charges she brought against her boss were thrown out by the Central Committee for Anti-Corruption.

Film 2
Woman with short hair
She worked in a factory for forty years. A new regulation was then introduced stipulating that all employees with over twenty years’ service would receive temporary work contracts which facilitated summary dismissal. These work contracts constitute a breach of labor law.

“There are hundreds of such cases of corruption which simply go unheeded. The government behaves like the Mafia. Some of the officials issue warnings about the petitioners, claiming that they are crazy.”

Consequently she launched an “anti-corruption army.”

Film 3
A woman is talking with other women in a room. She is crying and shows photographs and documents.
She has been a petitioner since 1983 and has been beaten
several times at the instigation of the police, and once she was almost raped. She worked for thirty-eight years, without receiving any kind of remuneration. She even approached a UN office but was stopped by the security guards. Subsequently she was incarcerated in a mental asylum for four months. “I have no reason to be afraid. The mental asylum is my home.”

She cooks

“I buy the noodles and sort through the rubbish for the vegetables. Collecting refuse is my job.”

Outside/Woman with poster. She shows photographs of cutoff hands and injured hands.

Her son was murdered at the age of forty-two. Her father had his left hand chopped off.

Inside/Woman with photographs showing injured body parts; chest, shoulder, stomach. Photograph of a cadaver with long scars along the belly.

An autopsy was conducted on the body without the family’s permission.

Film 4

Woman with pink jacket and poster

Tsien Tsuan province, autonomous region of Xin Jiang

This is the eighth time she has visited Beijing. In her home province she was beaten and detained. On February 22, 2001, her husband was wrongly found guilty of grievous bodily harm and sentenced to nine years’ imprisonment by a court in Shlez (Shi Hezi). She has appealed the verdict in a higher court. Although the verdict was quashed, this was not recognized by the courts in Xin Jiang. She herself was then sentenced to a term of hard labor and detained in a mental asylum. She was given drugs designed to poison her.

“Is it possible to have a ‘harmonious society’ in which there are so many corrupt officials? Or is the society being forcibly ‘harmonized’ through repression? Please forward these cases to the central civil service.”

She does not want to leave China, but would rather resolve the cases here because she loves her country and has confidence in the Party.

Her husband was released after serving eight and a half years. But the court still has not quashed the original miscarriage of justice.

“The province of Tsian Tsuan has become a law unto itself. The Central Government has no influence there any more.”

Woman next to the fireside

Aged just thirteen, her youngest son was sentenced to life imprisonment. She has been living in Beijing for the past three years without a roof over her head. Between 2001 and 2002 she was arrested four times.

Woman with child. The child holds a protest poster

There is a rule in the army: After a certain time, soldiers

Left:

Corregedor: ¿tienes pendencia sobre los reales, quién de le leer más / 491 / 498
(The corregidor and encomendero argue about the reales, who should get more)

Right:

Corregidor tiene preso y amenaza a don Cristóbal de León, segunda persona, porque defendió a los yndios de la provincia / 494 / 496
(Corregidor of the mine: “Why does the judge so cruelly punish the noble caciques in the mining with so many different punishments, with such little fear of justice and compassion for the poor?”)
must pay bribes to their commanding officer in order to remain in the service. Because her son refused, he was incarcerated for three days and badly mistreated. On his release he suffered a nervous breakdown. No one was willing to pay for his treatment. The family had to sell all their possessions to afford the medical care for their son. Finally, the army agreed to pay 150,000 RMB in damages. But then her husband was beaten to death outside the railway station. Her son is still languishing in a mental asylum.

"You students must change the situation here in China."

Film 8

*Woman with pink jacket alone in a room*

"The people who used to live here have been arrested. We are all that remain. Can you film that?"

*Husband*

"I come from Pai Lai (Taillai) in the province of Hei Lang Jang (Hei Longjiang). The local authorities seized my house and property. We were evicted. My son was then forced to join the army. The authorities killed all our livestock: a donkey, 36 chickens, a dog."

*Wife*

"The provincial government instructed some people to follow us to the station and kill us there."

*In the background*

"The houses we once lived in have been demolished."

*Woman pointing to a broken window*

"The police have smashed in the windows."

"The government tears down the houses, confiscates our possessions, and steals things from us. The police beat us up."

"Today we had to flee when the police arrived. We can't return home because the local authority would then arrest us or send us to a labor camp."

*Another woman in the background*

She and two other female teachers were detained for six and a half months. Subsequently one of the teachers died. She has been demanding action over this murder for the past fifteen years.

*Wife*

"We were evicted from our house on April 22, 2001."

*Husband*

"Whilst my wife was detained in the Party school, I wrote a poem for her."

*Woman reading the poem*

"When the government took possession of her house, she had no choice but to join the petitioners. Her son remained behind in the province. They are not allowed home anymore."

"The doors to the courts only open for money. We have been helped by kind people rather than by the government. The corrupt officials should be thrown out of government to improve the lot of the people."
Husband

“I can clearly recall the registration number of the car used by the people who beat us—it was BB059. They stamped on my face and almost beat me to death. I was unconscious for five hours. We were taken to hospital and stayed there for six days. Then we were homeless.”

Wife

“At the beginning everything was okay with the Petition authorities. Then the local government bribed the officials at the Petition authorities.”

Woman on the right

“We can’t sleep as the police always come at night. For the past three days we have been on the run.”

Husband

“When my son’s body was inspected and all these wounds and scars were found, the local authority promised us a new house.”

Voice in the background

“Once, when someone brought us some food to eat, the police threatened him with prison if he did it again.”

Woman on the right

“On September 30, three officials from the Petition authorities were waiting for me in the toilets. They knocked me to the floor and tried to abduct me. But some other people came to my rescue.

You can read an excerpt from an interview with Zhao Liang on the film Petition and the functionalization of art in China on p. 273.
Now to the third station on this path: if you look up, you will see four groups of suspended paper patterns in front of four canvases. Go upstairs to the platform and direct your view towards one of the arrangements. Situate yourself in the position in which the pieces compose the correct form of an angel.

The church of Calamarca holds the most complete surviving serial painting of harquebus angels, which appeared all over the viceroyalty of Peru from 1600 on. Today, these motifs are widely disseminated and popular as souvenirs. The angels are dressed as lansquenet, majestic soldiers, and carry rifles. Please read on the photograph beneath the silhouettes about why the community did not want to lend its pictures to us. You can also see engravings from a book on drills by Jacob de Geyn; applied to the backs of the pictures, they show the military exercises, the parading, and the cleaning of the rifle on which the angels might be based.

A relationship is established between weapons and uniforms that is "comparable to a king presenting a shot. All eyes are fixed on him and not on his weapon. Even if he proves himself inept at handling the weapon, his audience will cheer his ineptitude, for his power derives not from the weapon but from his dress," the analyst of these angels says. In her study, she seeks to chart this distance between the body and the regalia. It is a space of power that comes into being at this juncture. "Let us look, for example, at the sleeves: they are very wide so as to provide a lot of space in which the arms might change positions without our being able to detect it with any precision. ... Perhaps these angels show us their hands as though they were their own even as they might belong to other bodies hidden beneath their costumes. Whatever their hands may do, it has been sanctioned by the law.

Next to the magnifying glasses you will find a table of contents and references. All of the texts mentioned there form the ‘fabric’ out of which the dresses of the angels were made.” (Sonia Abián)

Why the Pictures from Calamarca Are Not Coming

The pictures in the church of Calamarca were restored in 1994. It is the most complete, preserved series of paintings of harquebus angels in existence. Other important angel depictions can be found in Yarvicolla, Sora Sora, Oruru, the San Martin church in Potosí, and in the northern Argentinian villages of Casabindo and Uquia. Harquebus angels are the most popular motifs in Andean painting, widespread at festivities and as reproductions and souvenirs. There is a great demand for pictures displaying this motif on both the national and international markets, posing a potential threat to the pictures remaining in the communities. After being restored, the Calamarca pictures were displayed in Paris in 1998 and in Montevideo (El Retorno de los Ángeles) in 2000.

The municipality of Calamarca no longer wanted to lend the pictures because they had been restored and no further benefits from exhibits in Europe were to be expected. Moreover, the rumor spread that only copies had been returned to the municipality after the pictures had been restored by the Vice Ministry in La Paz.
Angels with Harquebuses

Sonia Abián

Paintings of angels are found particularly along the Collasuyo routes between La Paz and Cusco, but also from Potosí to as far away as Jujuy, Argentina. It is the subject par excellence of Andean painting. The Calamarca Master was probably connected to the workshop of José López de los Ríos. No documents exist that refer to the painter.

In the seventeenth century the Cusco School underwent a crisis in the painters' guild, and the indigenous and mestizo artists separated from the Spanish painters. However, they did not lose sight of the objective of evangelization, which was to produce a religious effect amongst the indigenous people. Their compositions are not only a sign of a syncretism, but also an interface that sets out a form of government.

The angels have always had two functions: one of contemplation (to proclaim God in heaven) and another of administration (to carry out missions on Earth, as in this case).

The Calamarca Master makes them less celestial, arms them with harquebuses and dresses them in majestic robes. To paint the faces, he attended to the strict official recommendations of Francisco Pacheco in his book Art of Painting. However, when this inspector of sacred paintings of the Inquisition Courts in Seville gets to clothing, the canon becomes more lax: "From the will of their Lord, the needs of men, and the variety of ministries they practice, thence the angels take their attire."

What class of needs of men require such distinguished attire? What is their mission?

Missing in the paintings are the typical signs that allow us to identify the angels' missions. God may have charged them with a team mission. Everything points towards that mission that all angels share: to guide men towards God. On God's capacity for guiding men, St. Thomas says "The guide will be greater according to the greater perfection the guide communicates." According to this fragment, the quality of the guide depends on effective communication, and the robes and arms in these paintings contribute to this. The former confer dignity, and the latter allow them to be a guide or to communicate, at a distance. St. Thomas compares this system of divine government with that of a monarchy: "This is why, in the case of a king, to have agents in his government is not a sign of his imperfection but of his dignity.

By means of the hierarchy of his subordinates, his power shines more brightly." That is to say, the greater the number of agents, as in this case, the greater the dignity of God.

Why is it that in the Andes the dignity of God demands more angels than in Europe?

In Europe, for several centuries, the kingdom of God had been normalized. Perhaps for this reason, it was enough to have Raphael, Michael, and Gabriel. In the Americas, meanwhile, the situation recalls the days of the earliest fathers of the church, when a host of angels had to confront the pagan gods. Having won on that occasion, the majority were sent into retirement, and just these three remained active. But now they all had to be brought back into service. Their names in the paintings have the appearance of a call-up.

Why does the Master give them weapons?

Up to the fifteenth century, only the American gods had as much power as the harquebuses. Now this power has changed hands, and the Master grants it to the angels. Yet at the same time he reduces the scale of the wings. What is the relation between the wings and the weapons? For the American newcomers, for whom the kingdom of God is still a mystery, the wings are insufficient to legitimize their power. The power of the harquebuses, on the other hand, has been recognized, and their effect is linked to the lightning bolts of the god Illapa. Wings and weapons have the same role, and belong to the same apparatus of legitimation. In the Andes, what the angels lose in terms of wings they gain in terms of weapons.

Why are the angels' smocks so broad?

The smocks do not follow the outline of the body, as is usual in the case of military angels where a belt or breastplate pulls them in at the waist; instead they separate from the body to form a large mass taking up the available space. They look like they have been inflated. We cannot see through them, but we can imagine how much space there is beneath them.

This separation between the body and the smock has been manufactured with great care. To create it the number three has played an important role: each figure is divided into three parts by way of the smock being open at the front in the shape of a triangle, a three-sided shape. The outline of the smock forms another triangle, with its base at the hem and its vertex at the angel's head. The sleeves follow a curved line, as though drawn with a compass, which ignores details of the body such as the shoulders, to avoid blurring this triangularity. The degree of openness of the legs defines a module which, repeated three times, gives
the total width of the lower part of the smock. This module is what endows the smock with a sense of autonomy with regard to the body, and the powerful impression of dignity that emanates from these figures. This dignity is thus related to the clothing's capacity for increasing the sphere of action of the body that wears it.

The *Trinity* (the highest dignity) is the “smock” of God, whose sphere of action—the largest there is—is formed by the number of his bodies: three. These smocks also seem to have been made to fit three bodies. They inform us, moreover, of the operation of both *Dignitas* and *Potestas*.

**Trinitarian angels and dignitas**

*Dignitas* is a concept from ancient Roman law, and refers to “one who occupies a post, or behaves as though he does.” The condition of dignity is this distance between the body and the perceived image of the body. This *distance* allows control of the image itself. The Italian philosopher Giorgio Agamben analyzes dignity as something independent of the one who bears it, like an *external image.* Here too the number three appears key. The Trinitarian measurements of the clothing were *body–distance–smock.* The juridical measurements, according to *dignitas,* would now be *body–distance–external image.*

**Trinity and potestas**

Another concept from Roman law, *potestas,* defined those citizens whose sphere of juridical action extended beyond their own body, and stretched to the bodies of others, who became their property. If slaves, women, animals, and children had one thing in common, it was that their sphere of action coincided with the limits of their physical body, while their Masters possessed, in addition, a juridical body. The way to represent a body with such characteristics can be seen in these paintings. Though the smocks appear too broad in proportion to the angels’ bodies, they are a perfect fit for the measurements of this other body.

The space between the smocks and the bodies of the angels is not, therefore, a void, but the shape of a juridical connection.

*Trinity, dignitas,* and *potestas:* underlying all three concepts is the same apparatus comprising three pieces, *body–distance–image.* The function of this apparatus is to provide its bearer with an elevated image of dignity and power, to multiply the number of positions he can occupy and thus expand his *Spielraum* (or sphere of action). But this can only happen if an excluded position exists, upon which he builds up his dignity and power and from which he extracts its profit. To produce and oversee this latter position, represented in the colonial context by the indigenous people paying tribute to the Crown, is the true mission of these angels, and a common thread is also found in contemporary images.

**October 8, 2009, balance**

Above the names of the angels in each painting, there is a small triangular object. Each seventheenth century Spanish harquebusier regiment carried a bandolier, from which these objects, known as “the 12 apostles,” hung. Each one contains the right amount of gunpowder for one shot. The “charge” no longer hangs from the bandolier in these images, as it has been used. In the case of Gabriel and Uriel in particular, we can observe a black streak emerging from it. Now it hangs from the back, transformed into colored strips.

The march of the Spanish regiments from Italy to Flanders was known as the Kermese, a spectacle without equal in the sixteenth century. It is said that the nobility, intellectuals, and elegant people of Paris came out in their carriages to watch them pass along the road. Pierre de Bourdelle wrote: “They passed by as arrogantly as princes, and so gallant that every one appeared a captain.”

The regiments were made up by, among others, a company of harquebusiers. Upon their return to Spain they were granted prestige but remained poor. Some found a new role in the conquest of America.
The **Aparatoángel**

Sonia Abián

The *Aparatoángel* reveals the original purpose of the harquebus angels up to the present day. In the viceroyalty of Peru they keep watch over the process of evangelization and the exploitation of human and natural resources, at the same time as they produce the necessary subordinate individuals to achieve this. But now the angels Gabriel and Letiel look after the domination of the male image, while Uriel and Laciei keep watch over territorial borders. Both these functions entail exercising violence towards different groups.

The original paintings of the four armed angels have been broken down into their component parts, rendering an apparatus visible. Standing in front of each angel, we need to find the position from which all the parts reassemble themselves and reconstruct it. Only then do we see the angel as the Calamarca Master composed it. We do not recognize the parts of *Aparatoángel*, but we experience their function: an image is created, and power and distance with it. The layers that make up the apparatus work together to seduce us and so convince us not to abandon our frontal viewpoint, to which we remain subjected as if before a magic lantern.

But as soon as we look to one side we make out what is behind the object of our observation from a moment before. There is a space of action located between the *physical body* and the clothing. This space is the *juridical body*, which in the *Aparatoángel* is shown by the succession of elements that make up the angels’ clothing, together with the respective separations between them.

Upon approaching the designs, we note that each layer is made up of images and texts. They are taken from laws, studies on the history of art, and newspaper articles. Images and texts create the required conditions to extract profit from relations with other people. The articles are like casual finds that show the collateral effect of this power upon us. But this collateral effect is part of the intention. The designs thus make up an archive of laws and means for preserving the juridical body and providing it with continuity.

For example:
At the beginning of the seventeenth century serfdom was abolished in the viceroyalty of Peru, except for cases in which the physical service of the indigenous people “was essential to sustain those provinces,” that is, the areas that supplied the forced labor for the Potosí mines. (Real Cédula de Aranjuez, May 17, 1608. *Recopilación de las Leyes de los Reynos de Indias* [Compilation of the Laws of the Kingdoms of the Indies], Law 4, Book VI, Chapter XVII)

But when the exceptions become confused with the law there is no need to make them explicit. In Spain there is a law concerning the civil protection of the right to reputation, personal privacy *and to a person’s own image*. This law, however, forms part of a general tendency towards prioritizing the social domination of the male image.

Physical and juridical bodies work as a team. Each juridical body has five corresponding layers: smock; breastplate, tunic and pants; wings and hat; weapons and hands with lace cuffs. The final layer is an index in which we can consult the sources used. Below is an extract from this. In most cases only the subject of the articles is mentioned.

**Layer 1: Smock**
The design of Gabriel and Letiel is based on sixteenth-century tiles found in El Escorial. The red binding cloth with images of the Annunciation to Mary links together a series of articles concerning two cases of violence against women in Huelva and Seville, Spain.
The design of Uriel and Lacie is the same as in the original paintings. In Uriel's case it is completed with harquebus fuze, while Lacie's smock incorporates Spanish and European Union flags and colors that have been displaced. They contain a collection of articles about the arrival or sinking of migrant rafts, as well as the deportation of migrants. The articles on all the smocks are superimposed on political news or adult classified listings.

Sources: Newspapers La Vanguardia, El País, El Periódico, Que!, ADN, Público, and 20 Minutos.

Layer 2: Breastplate, tunic, and pants
The designs display statistics and maps. Gabriel: maps of prostitution in Spain. Each Playboy bunny represents one country of origin of the prostitutes. Uriel and Lacie: each candle tied to the index fingers represents internment centers for immigrants in Spain and Italy and one in Greece. Letiel: each circle stands for 3,971 women murdered in Spain.

Sources: History of mining in the Bolivian Andes


Book VI Chapter III: On the Converted and Unconverted India Villages
Book VI Chapter IX: On the Commissioners of Indies
Recopilación de los Leyes de los Reynos de Indias. 1680
Digital archive of legislation in Peru:
http://www.congreso.gob.pe/Refnry/LeyIndiaPhtm (accessed August 31, 2010).

Genesis, Exodus, Deuteronomy, Numbers
The Bible

Institute for Women: Statistics for deaths due to gender violence

Origins of prostitution in Spain

Internment centers for immigrants

Layer 3: Wings and hat
The wings look like they are made from lace, since they do not belong to the physical body but the juridical body.

Layer 4: weapons and hands with lace cuffs
The harquebus angels bear different arms from those depicted in the Calamarca paintings. White trails—phylactery—which in the history of art are images that announce the word of God; the Holy Spirit, which has often been represented as a ball shot from Mary's head or chest; and the lily, borne by the Angel Gabriel at the Annunciation.

Sources for the phylactery:
Gabriel, legend: "Because you're worth it!"
Text from advertising campaigns for different companies promoting cosmetic products aimed at women.
Uriel and Lacie, "SVE Integrated Outdoor Surveillance System"

Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus
The Bible

Sources for Lily:

Sources for Holy Spirit:
Letiel: judicial trial against Judge Gardin; map of mass graves from the Franco regime.
Newspapers: La Vanguardia and El País

Hands with lace cuffs
Sources for Gabriel and Letiel:
Judgment in the Córdoba-Torino case. Mass graves from the Franco regime.
Adult classified listings
Newspapers: La Vanguardia and El País

Sources for Uriel and Lacie:
Computer graphic: Border trenches, Ceuta and Melilla enclaves

Catholic Dictionary
The Bible
Our “angel analyst” notes that the number three plays an important role in the cuts of the uniforms. “The open frock coat divides each figure into three parts . . . The contours of the dresses form a triangle. The arms follow a circular line that forges bodily details so as not to destroy the triangular shape of the figure.” She relates this number that regulates the body, its distance from itself and its outward image, to attributes of Roman law, of power and dignity. An image of the Trinity is affixed to Gabriel’s back. What is extraordinary about it is not the three-faced head, but the central presence of Mary. “In representations of the Trinity, Mary usually appears further down and outside the triangle formed by the Holy Spirit, the Father, and the Son. In this depiction, Mary appears in the very center of the triangle of the Trinity. . . . The faces of the triangle form negations: Father is not Son is not Holy Spirit is not Father. . . . Within the triangle, we can read affirmations: Father is God and Son is Holy Spirit is God is Father is God. . . . Mary’s location is in this second group of affirmative propositions, but it is as though she were not here, for she cannot participate in the propositions, as none of the words are commensurate with her. This absent presence is what Giorgio Agamben calls an ‘inclusive exclusion.’ The propositions define God by affirming him. Mary’s image permits the definition even of what remains outside God.” (Sonia Abián)

Trinidad

The curators: Within sacred visual art, was there an organizational classification of content, or a particular program that had to be developed? What did the councils propose?

Teresa Gisbert: The Council of Trent was important. But there were things that the Council of Trent had rejected in Europe. For example, the depiction of the Holy Trinity as a single body with three heads. In Europe this was something monstrous. But not here, because there was a god called Tanga Tanga who had three heads and so this kind of representation was tolerated here. The Trinity with a single body and three heads is relatively common. So there was a level of tolerance, since what was prohibited in Europe certainly was not here. Then there were the angels, who according to the Book of Enoch, were the ones who controlled atmospheric phenomena, the movement of the heavens. You can see that in almost all the indigenous churches there is a series of angels, and the only way of explaining why they are only in the indigenous churches, which means the rural ones, and not in the cities, is that this was their way of substituting their worship of the stars. So they tried to blend and reconcile this with Catholicism.

However, it wasn’t so simple in the case of the series of angels with harquebuses. To this day there is a major cult of Santiago (St. James). This comes from Sunuti huasi: the rebellion of Manco II, an Inca crowned by the Spanish. Once he had been crowned, he declared, “now you must leave,” and the Incas fought against the Spaniards to expel them once and for all. The Spaniards took refuge in a church with a straw roof, a very fragile building. The indigenous people shot at them with arrows of fire and the Spaniards cried “Santiago, Santiago, Santiago.” A great storm came up, and so they identified Santiago with the lightning, the god of storms, whom they call Illapa, the lightning bolt. While the Spanish see Santiago as the vanquisher of the indigenous people, the indigenous peoples see him as the punisher, the lightning in the storm, the tempest.

In Cusco there are several versions of Santiago who is not the usual mata-moros (“moor-killer”), but mata indios (“Indio-killer”). However, we haven’t found a single instance of this Santiago Indio-killer in Bolivia. He represents this moment, and at this moment and with this event both ideas come together and are definitively joined. Both the indigenous people and the Spaniards worship him—some as one thing and the others as another, but no one has a problem with this.

The interview with Teresa Gisbert was conducted in La Paz, January 16, 2009.

Hardly any other motif shows the rigidity of the Christian dogma in regard to the subjectivization of women as clearly as the Trinity. Subjugation under the regime of the representatives of God functions like the release of the female body in analogy to the natural exploitation of nature and its resources.

In his genealogy of capitalism’s basic structures, the Argentine philosopher León Rozitchner, in his book La cosa y la cruz, relates the abolition of the female body and desire through the dogma of the Trinity to its economic exploitation. He develops a materialistic critique of the alienation of the concept of “woman” starting from the body:
"The intellect of the One is the abstract transformation of the qualitative content into its displaced contrary. At the end, as Holy Spirit, it reencounters the most diffuse, prior to all that is incarnate; it is the flesh, what is nearest and all-encompassing, yet refined, ethereal, ungraspable, expansive, gaseous. All that is material, solid, diffuses in the air and dissolves to constitute what words understand as Spirit and Word, the phantasmal, life-breath, voice spirit."

This strategic naturalizing of the Other and its entanglement with the economic processes of the history of capitalism appear time and again in the project. In the works of Sonia Abián, Ines Doujak, Elvira Espejo, María Galindo/ Mujeres Creando, among others, it established one of the most important narrative threads. The question of the Trinity has been a pivotal theme of theology since Augustine. Inclusion/exclusion and the abolition of Mary in the dogma of the Trinity is a proposition that Sonia Abián has particularly delved into.

The Trinitarian Apparatus
Sonia Abián

There is a common thread that connects the Calamarca angels with the representation of the Trinity. It concerns the concept of dignity and the Other. The description of these angels focused on the breadth of their attire and attributed the source of the dignity of their figures to this characteristic. In my work El Aparato Angel, this source is found located in a concrete space between the physical body and the clothing of the angel. This space functions as the medium of a power which is simultaneously human and divine. This is where the Other is legally produced, and its subordination is normalized in order to obtain profit from it without obstacles. This is why this space can also be designated the juridical body.

The Other has no external image. Both human and divine dignity require it in order to be able to govern. In his book, The Conquest of America, Tzvetan Todorov says that the manipulation of images was one of the decisive reasons why a Spanish minority was able to overcome an indigenous majority. The manipulation of the image reveals, according to the writer, "that the mental universe of the Spaniards had a place reserved for the Other."

In the Holy Trinity, this Other is to be found physically present. It is the figure of Mary. Without her, the Son could not have been transformed into the instrument through which God guides humanity. Though she is indispensable, Mary remains outside the apparatus of divine government. She is determined by her immediate Otherness.

The painting depicts the Trinity in two ways: one is anthropomorphic, a male figure with three faces, and the other is abstract, a triangular form made up of nouns and verbs related to each other. ... Mary is located in the middle of the text. Since she appears as an image and has no corresponding word, she remains outside. Her function there is to designate what the Trinity is not.

The place of Mary as Other is not the invention of this painting. From the start Mary was included in the divine plan by way of an exception: by the sublimation of her sexuality. About the exception in general, the philosopher Giorgio Agamben says that it is a "special case based on a norm." If the exception excepts Mary from the sexual act as a way of making her worthy of being the mother of the Son of God, we may deduce a norm that establishes the unworthiness of women, which confuses her image with her body, with the intention of making her material. By interrupting the link between Mary and sex, that is, by the temporary abolition of the normal unworthiness of women, Mary is invested with worth. The excluding inclusion of Mary in the Trinity corresponds to this relationship between norm and exception. In this way, the norm establishes women as a population production unit.

It is high time that we take a moment to pause and consider what is happening on this route. No doubt: the state is at issue, its violence and its laws, which condition and accompany the process of accumulation; at issue, too, is the possibility of a mandate against it and what its source of legitimacy may be. But that is too simple. It is to pretend that this violence is something exterior.
Take another look at the drawing of the diver on the back of the facing wall. The Spanish treasure ships attract so much attention, calling forth such desire, that they become the targets of innumerable attacks by buccaneers in the Caribbean—based on the Cayman Islands and Barbados—in the service of the other European powers. Many ships sink. The Council of the Indies orders that each fleet carry divers to retrieve the coins from the bottom of the sea. The constant compression during their dives causes a rash between the divers’ shoulder blades and discoloration of their hair, which is why they are called “angels.”

The drawing probably proposes a technical invention designed to provide better access to the bottom of the sea. The suit can be pulled over an entire iron armor. The tubes pump air into it, creating a sort of compression chamber. The cane in the hand is a weapon of defense against sea monsters.

At the same time, the Council of the Indies orders that the exact number of mita laborers that are missing upon arrival at Potosí be tracked. If even one is missing, the contemporary witness Antonio Ayanz writes, “a judicial officer, receiving a daily allowance, is sent from Potosí to bring replacements in equal numbers for the missing workers from each province.” The image this government seeks to convey of itself is a government so obsessive that it counts each coin and each laborer. And it is so all-powerful that it balances the loss of coins by staking laborers and lives.

Continue reading the report by Antonio de Ayanz pp. 274–75 (Spanish)

So let us come back one last time to the lists on the other side of the wall: “Between 1680 and 1730, the viceroyalty of Peru underwent a reform of the rent system in connection with the Nuevas Leyes de Indias. This date coincides with the production of the Calamarca angels. Previously, rents had been paid not individually but by the communities as a whole. From now on, by contrast, every individual body became visible to the crown, and the padrones come into being, registers of the indigenas that identify and classify them. These levies were imposed not only on persons, but also on products such as wine and coca, resulting in a transformation both of India society and its markets. Haciendas emerged which sold products produced by the indigenas to their producers, leading them into chronic debt and dependency. This process entailed the occupation and expropriation of the land.” (Sonia Abian)

The Nuevas Leyes were the result of a process that began with the bull Sublimis Deus sent by Pope Paul III to the Spanish king in 1537, which stipulated that the Indios were not slaves. It continued with the disputations of Valladolid between Las Casas and Sepulveda about the recognition of the existence of an indigenous soul. But this recognition immediately leads to an effort to missionize these souls. The production of images is the most important medium of this humanization. The images are like contracts that identify the new soul and seal the legitimacy of this subjection. Can we conclude that art merely fulfills a function in this ensemble of forms of violence associated with man’s “becoming human,” in the sense that the promise of the status of a subject at once implies this subject’s subjection?

Read the bull Sublimis Deus, p. 275 (Spanish)
A Beautiful Image
David Riff in a letter to Dmitry Gutov
Berlin, summer 2009

The painting you chose is by a Sevillian painter called Lucas Valdés. It isn’t actually from South America, but from Spain, from the early eighteenth century. It pictures the artist’s studio, the interior or the workspace per se, a sad, drab, empty space with only a small window on the left. There are no implements or furnishings; a spatial tabula rasa. This archetypal interior contains only two figures, a painter (lying on the floor), and an angel who is finishing the painting. The fallen painter’s feet probably remind you of Mantegna. Is that what you liked so much? Or maybe there are other reasons. ... I like this picture because it looks like the archetypal art space, some prototype of the white cube, a cell that imitates the space of the commodity form, a space that could be filled with anything, where anything has a value. I am always surprised at how violent this space looks when it is inserted into our post-Soviet everyday.

But let’s get back to Seville. You could say that Lucas Valdés’s painter was struck down by divine inspiration, that he overloaded on the ecstasy of expressing divine truth and the glory of its power. That would make sense. He is, after all, painting an icon, a miraculous image of San Francisco de Paula, an image so glorious that it cannot be finished by human hands. In a contemporaneous painting near this one in Seville, an image of the same saint stops an earthquake from destroying a town. The image catches the buildings in mid-crumble. But at the same time, the same painting has this weird commentary that tells you: there were no angels involved.

Our painting of the “fallen artist” tells you the cult image does not come directly from one of God’s executives, but was actually made by copying a print, that we see on the windowsill on the left horizon. Part of the print run, presumably made at the Platin Press in Antwerp, might have made its way back to Seville, another to the colonies in the Andes or the Philippines. The print is not in perspective. Fully frontal, it looks like a mechanical reproduction glued to the canvas, destabilizing what is otherwise a very coherent three-dimensional space with total flatness. But at the same time, this flatness breaks open the space of history: a space of a global art of purportedly “powerful images” circulating from Manila to Potosí, a space produced socially in the course of an unbelievable violence, the violence of primitive accumulation. Maybe it is this awareness of pro-
duction—with all the violence that the term entails—that has thrown the painter to the ground?

Or is the angel punishing him for deviating? The angel is a censor, but more, a figure of art's total desubjectifica-
tion: a divine agency, a totality, an utterly foreign force. Not the painter but "It" is painting. The angel doesn't have to
look at the reproduction. In fact, he is looking at the painter
full of automatized Christian pity, the pity of the master for
his new slave. This pious, utterly heartless pity is a more
noble version of giving the Indios souls and then sending
them to the silver mines to an almost certain death: "Poor
dogs, they want to treat you like men!"

Speaking of which, I have just re-read that famous virtu-
oscic ride through hell, the chapter on so-called primitive
accumulation in Capital Vol. 1, and it really gives you the
background of the kind of violence and human expendi-
ture we are speaking about, just like the criminal privatiza-
tions of the catastroika in the 1990s are the process that ulti-
mately produced all our art spaces and white cubes. So
many episodes of expropriation and displacement! So
maybe the painter on the floor is enacting the doubtful pro-
letarian freedom not to be, the hidden guarantee of capital-
ist subjecthood. The individual—even when he or she is
stripped bare of everything—still has possession of his
"soul" and his innate capacity to work in a virtuosic man-
ner, which he can then alienate or sell to some passing angel
who will suck him dry, consuming and disposing of him as
material, but material that has a name, a slave recognized
by his master. A slave with the basic human right to be
exploited.

Karl Marx School of the English Language
continued:

KC: So being ugly ...
DG: When we deal with this horrible violence ...
KC: Can you describe?
KB: Is it indescribable ...
DG: ... it is ...
KB: Or do we just stop our ability to see the world ...
DG: So. The instrument of painting is not enough.
KB: But it can depict the whole picture of what is going on ...
DG: Of course, you can depict some aspect ...
KC: But what about Goya? When I was a child and I saw
the paintings of Goya, it was the horror ...
KB: ... and it was the great painterly manner ... and I would
like to emphasize that this private property is the flipside
of slavery and serfdom.
DG: You have to stop ...
KC: Let's remember Viennese Actionism, which I don't like
at all.
DG: You have to change your profession.
KB: Marquis de Sade: the famous thinker of violence.
DG: It is ...
KC: And Dostoyevsky.
DR: Institutionally.
DG: Institutionally art.
KB: Homer describes the violence of the fight.
DG: But in mirrors, mirrors ...
DR: But it hasn't attained.
KB: Private property can exist under slavery, feudalism, and
capitalism.
DG: Comrades, comrades.
KB: This is what Marx is writing about.
DG: Any kind of virtuosity ... looks like shit ... in front of this
subject. So in this case, it's better not to be an artist, it's bet-
ter to be Marx and to do it directly.
DR: It's not art?
DG: It is art but ...
DR: It's art!
DG: It is only art because Marx didn't do ...
DG and KC: ... art.
DG: If you are trying to do art, the result will be like this
artist. You will be lying on the floor and waiting for an
angel.
KC: So, what are you insisting on. You are insisting yourself on going beyond art's limits? So you want to stop to be an artist?
DG: No, no, you see...
KC: Or you yourself want to remain within the limits of this artistry?
DG: Yeah, absolutely. You have to make your decision. If you are going to be a painter...
KC: What is your decision?
DG: You see...
DR: You have an idealistic dispositive of art.
DG: Yes.
KC: This is the point of our argument.
DR: It's what, it's God?
KC: Yeah, it's God!
DG: No! The law...
IB: But we are talking about society. About human society.
DG: Human society?
IB: Human society! We are now talking about human society.
KB: Human society is also the subject of gravity.
IB: We are talking about productive forces.
DG: Absolutely.
IB: We are talking about property. We are not talking about...
DG: No.
KC: ... he begets, but in a very...
DG: You see, your strategy...
KC: ... longer perspective. It's like when the second coming will be.
DG: No, not the second coming...
KC: So if we don't persevere in its coming.
KB: Dima, it will be.
DG: No! It says here.
IB: It's a basic understanding what a social formation is about.
DG: The workshop of Verocchio. Verocchio had a workshop...
KC: Ты как то в социуме живешь. Ты не можешь просто где то жить на клацке земли.
DG: In English.
KC: I can tell you what I think.
DG: I like it. This is my idea. Why do you look at me like that? I can look at you like that!
IB: I...
DG: You see, this phrase...
KC: But what precedes this phrase?
DG: A law of nature.
KC: It's torn out of context.
DG: Comrades!
DR: The only thing that is interesting to you is this metaphysical structure.
DG: It's not metaphysical. It's a very practical question.
KC: You sound like a justification of opportunism.
DG: I know all these accusations.
DR: It's worse.
DG: My justification of opportunism is a hundred times closer...
DR: You're sitting here, reading Marx.
DG: Okay.
DR: You have this text in front of you.
DG: You can't change...
KC: Dmitry, this is the phrase...
DG: ... you can't change the laws of nature.
KC: What is revolution then? Why revolution is needed?
IB: It is a part of this law.
DG: Of course!

Read the interview with David Riff about the biennalization of the art scene in Moscow, pp. 276–78.

"You can't smooth out these contradictions with emotionality. You can't just say, we don't give a damn about your hypercapitalism, we hate you, we will leave the culture industry, we will sit in our autonomous area and only do art and discourse. That's impossible. But precisely this impossibility is what we will do."
¿Cómo podemos cantar el canto ajeno en la tierra del Señor?
How can we sing the alien song in the land of the Lord?

Having reached the end of our second path toward a departure from this power of history and the beginning of the final route, we must persist in inquiring into the continuity of this corrupt alliance between beauty and humanity (Christianity and mercantilism/human rights and the free-market economy), which has served since the conquista as a legitimating narrative: to this day, wars are waged and images exported and imported in its name.

Return to the entrance. To the left of the door, you see a Spanish caravel cruising between two shelves holding messages in bottles. Its cargo consists of monsters, and it is not entirely clear whether they are indeed merely being transported from Europe to America, or whether this cargo describes a relation of violence continuously leaping back and forth between the two continents. In 2004, during a retrospective, enraged Christians destroyed more than ten bottles. The attack on the exhibition was the goal of a smear campaign conducted by the Church and by conservative and reactionary associations in Buenos Aires (for decades, the artist has been a tenacious enemy of clerical repression). Yet the show also found committed defenders—a rare alliance of the educated middle classes, parts of the government, and human rights groups. It became an example of artistic freedom being safeguarded against the Catholic associations, whose collusion in the crimes of the Argentine dictatorship is very much alive in today’s public consciousness.

There is a small work that responds to the Infierno in Caquiaviri, transforming hell into paradise. Stickers showing flowers and butterflies—the kind that children like to buy—are stuck to a reproduction of the picture.

Letters to the Pope

Léon Ferrari

Years ago Pope John Paul II baptized nineteen children in the Sistine Chapel, at the foot of Michelangelo’s Final Judgment, and invited the children’s parents to meditate on the fresco, which illustrates “the happiness of those who have chosen Jesus Christ” and the “desperation of those who have rejected Him.” The latter, he added, “for disobeying God, are headed toward eternal condemnation.”

This news item (La Nación, January 9, 1995), the reproduction of the artwork, the Pope’s invitation, and the resulting meditation produced a coming together of people who felt linked by common motives and conduct, much as had been the case in the Sistine years earlier, when Buonarroti’s painting brought the condemned together. From there came the idea to organize an association, the CIHABAPAI, which would concern itself with the afterlife and request the Pope to annul that judgment. The attached letter, signed by 150 artists in support, writers, and people concerned over the updating of the apocalyptic threat that unfurled from the lips of John Paul II, was dispatched last Christmas.

In the absence of any reply having been received, the request will be repeated on a date to be determined with the new signatures received in its support.

From: Página 12, January 6, 1998

121
Dear Sir,

The end of the millennium approaches. Very possibly, the Apocalypse and the Final Judgment are approaching. If it is certain that those who will be saved are very few, as the Gospel warns, the beginning of an endless hell approaches for the majority of humanity. In order to avoid this, all that need be done is to return to God the Father's justice as dictated in Genesis. If He punished Eve's disobedience by suppressing our immortality, it is hardly just that the Son return it to us, so many centuries later, to prolong suffering. If one part of the Trinity dictates a sentence whose punishment ends and is completed with death, another part cannot open every case, add another sentence, resuscitate the cadaver, and apply an additional punishment that is infinite times greater the sentence already completed by the sinner once dead. The justice of the Son contradicts and violates that of the Father. The existence of Paradise does not justify that of Hell: the goodness of the few saved will not permit them to be happy knowing for all eternity that girlfriends or sisters or mothers or friends and also strangers and enemies (neighbors which Jesus ordered us to love and forgive) suffer in the land of Satan. We ask you therefore, to return to the Pentateuch and process the annulment of the Final Judgment and of immortality.

Respectfully yours,

CIHABAPI (Club of the impious, heretics, apostates, blasphemers, atheists, pagans, agnostics, and infidels)

---

Dear Sir,

Article 5 of the "Universal Declaration of Human Rights" (1948) states:

... no one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment.

Article 1 of the "Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment" (1984) qualifies as torture:

any act by which severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person for such purposes as obtaining from him or from a third person information or a confession, punishing him for an act he has committed...

It further adds:

Each State shall punish these crimes with the appropriate penalties.

The latest latest? edition of the Catechism of the Catholic Church (1998) shares the condemnation:

Torture which uses physical or moral violence to extract confessions, punish the guilty, frighten opponents, or satisfy hatred is contrary to respect for the person and for human dignity (n. 2297).

The same Catechism permits the infliction of torments:

The teaching of the Church affirms the existence of hell and its eternity. Immediately after death the souls of those who die in a state of mortal sin descend into hell, where they suffer the punishments of hell, 'eternal fire' (n. 1035).

To the suffering of the soul, the Catechism adds that of the body:

The resurrection of all the dead, 'of both the just and the unjust' [Acts 24:15] will precede the Last Judgment. This will be 'the hour when all who are in the tombs will hear [the Son of Man's] voice and come forth, those who have done good, to the resurrection of life, and those who have done evil, to the resurrection of judgment [jn. 5:28–29] ... and they will go away into eternal punishment, but the righteous into eternal life' [Mt. 25–31, 32, 46] (n.1038).

Whether or not the suffering announced by Jesus materializes, and whether or not it corresponds to judge it
according to our laws, the believers' fear of future torture is already a torture; a present mental agony that our laws and the Catechism forbid.

In light of these convictions held by the Church that repudiate torture in life but accept it for the souls of the dead and the bodies of the resurrected, and alarmed by the Vatican's declaration that "Hell exists, it is eternal and full of evildoers," we ask: a) that the repudiation of torture proclaimed in the Catechism be extended to the afterlife; b) that steps be taken to achieve respect for the human rights of the multitude of souls who are suffering, some in Golgoth, in the land of Satan.

Putting an end to the agony of millions, to evacuate and demolish Hell and calm the faithful, could make your desire that "the Church pass into history as the defender of mankind" a reality.

Respectfully yours,
CIHABAPAI (Club of the impious, heretics, apostates, blasphemers, atheists, pagans, agnostics, and infidels)
cihabapai@hotmail.com

First we would like to guide you to another instance in which artistic freedom was defended. Cross the room. In the vicinity of the magazine NOID, you find another scene from the Passion. This time, the body is covered not by wounds resembling the entrances to the mines but instead by the golden patterns created by the technique of brocading. Under pressure from the great number of orders to be completed, artisans developed templates that are applied to the body. Instead of adapting to the body, this technique forces the body to adopt a posture in accordance with the models and to recede behind the pattern that turns its dignity into a reproducible and interchangeable surface—a body subject to advanced capitalization, a monetary subject.

The picture is attributed to Francisco Moyen, who, convicted by the inquisition, died in 1761 as a prisoner on a ship that sank before the European coast, loaded with the royal "fifth" of the silver and gold production. His files were found in Santiago de Chile in 1813. In the young Chilean Republic, Moyen's case was used as an example of the repressiveness of Spanish colonial rule and as an argument against rehabilitating the Inquisition. This liberal discourse presented us an artist, male, white, inspired by an irrepressible urge for freedom. At this point, however, we cannot conceive of Moyen's case as an act of artistic freedom suppressed by censorship. We would like to bring it back into the debate over the conditions of artistic production and the continuity of its function as an ideological vehicle in bourgeois liberalism. As one of his belated defenders writes: "as long as the world is the way it is," Moyen is really more of a merchant than an artist, that is to say, a person subject to advanced capitalization, surrounded by a forest of crosses he is compelled to bear: globalization, persecution, trial, and bankruptcy.
Persecution

In common with the silver, the icons, and the paintings, their merchants and painters also circulated around the world and along the same routes. One fascinating case in point involves the French painter Francisco Moyen. He is described by José de Mesa and Teresa Gisbert, for example, as a leading painter whose enlightened, or Protestant, views became a problem. In the Museo Santa Teresa, Moyen is presented as a satirical painter, whose works are adjudged to have been critical of the regime. Moyen’s canvases furnish striking examples not only of the internationality of Potosí’s painting tradition, but also underscore the fact that a non-indigenous Christian culture existed in opposition to interests of the Counter-Reformation.

Born in 1720 in Paris, Moyen hailed from an artistic family, and was regarded as a highly educated man, who even in his early years had worked for various European royal courts. He invested his family inheritance in private trading expeditions between Rio de Janeiro and Lisbon. He first came into conflict with the law when he inflicted serious injury upon the corregidor of Oruro during a duel in Buenos Aires. He was forced to flee to the Convento de Santo Domingo. However, under the protection of the future corregidor of Porco, he was able to travel to Potosí, tasked with preparing the technical drawings for a mining plant in 1748. On his journey—from Buenos Aires via Jujuy—he was alleged to have indulged in satirical songs and made heretical remarks about the Catholic faith’s interpretation of the Ten Commandments. This, at least, was the charge laid against him at the Tribunal of the Inquisition, before which he introduced himself as a “merchant, musician, and painter.”

Perseverance

Over 100 years later in 1868, Moyen’s story fuelled a political debate over the forthcoming celebrations to mark the Centenario of Independence in various Latin American republics (1910): The historian and politician Benigno Vícuña Mackenna, a champion of the bourgeoisie ideals underpinning the European revolutions of 1848/49, published Moyen’s biography and an account of his trial as a paradigmatic counterweight to the revisionist assessment of the Inquisition in South America. He had become alarmed at the publication of the book by José Ramon Saavedra, La inquisición: rápida ojeada sobre aquella antigua institución, which he regarded as a defense and affirmation of the Inquisition:

“Upon seeing the work of Señor Saavedra, it occurred to us that perhaps he wished to prepare the way for the celebration of the centenary of the abolition of the Inquisition ... the same year in which the Republic would complete an age of its existence (for together in the year 1810 were joined the tomb of the former with the cradle of the latter) ... it was worthy of the most serious attention, and changed completely the ground of the controversy. ... It was no longer a question of historical facts, ... it was a question of actuality, affecting the present state of things, it was a question of propagandising of proselytism, and perhaps one with a prospect of the centenary [celebration].”

Vícuña’s biography of Francisco Moyen was consistent in drawing attention to the double moral standards of the Centenarios, marked by festivities in 1910: For these were both a celebration of Chile’s Independence and an affirmative commemoration of the Inquisition itself. And even now in 2010, during the celebrations to honor the Bicentenario, Moyen affords us a fresh opportunity to reflect on the undiminished validity of Vícuña’s criticism.
On Image Production in the Viceroyalty of Peru

María Isabel Álvarez Plata: We've talked about the production cycle in the mines, the economy dependent on them, and their contribution to the Church's evangelization missions. Due to the great demand, the latter had to be organized in an industrial fashion: Schools were needed, pictorial art was to be conveyed to many, and production was to become mass production. Moreover, teaching staff was required to train and convey knowledge.

For this reason, a large school was founded in Cusco, where there were not only painters, engravers, and copyists, but also artists who prepared canvases, some who painted faces and garments, and again others who produced sfraffiti or did glazing.

The curators: Would you say that the division of labor in the Latin American workshops was more advanced than in Europe?

María Isabel Álvarez Plata: Not necessarily. The European production sites during the Renaissance were structured in a similar way. In Michelangelo’s studio there were also different areas of responsibility. While some prepared the canvasses, others grinded the color etc. Yet we do know that he was the painter. In Latin America, on the other hand, we find a large number of anonymous works—and that’s the decisive difference. In Europe, we know the authors, but here only a few authors of the enormous number of works are known.

The curators: Do you see the largely anonymous nature of production as a precursor or accelerator of the process of industrialization?

María Isabel Álvarez Plata: I am sure that it spurred the process. In the Andean regions, we can speak of an industrial image production. The form of commercialization also differed from marketing in Europe. We possess documents proving that a padre commissioned the painter Leonardo Flores to paint a certain number of pictures. Contracts substantiate this. We also know that painters and traders, particularly art traders, sold picture scrolls and entire series—the Virgin Mary, Jesus, St. Joseph—in the villages. They cut the pictures to size on location and hung them there.

María Isabel Álvarez Plata in conversation with Alice Creischer, Max Hinderer, Andreas Siekmann, La Paz, December 1, 2009.
We have a hard time relating this description of image production in the viceroyalty of Peru to art historical genealogies. The pictures we present mostly stem from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Some are difficult to date. Others, clearly from the nineteenth century, were important to us, e.g. the *Álbum de Paisajes, Tipos Humanos y Costumbres de Bolivia* by Melchor María Mercado.

The first painters arriving in the viceroyalty of Peru were bound to different missionary orders: at first we see an Italian, mannerist influence, then Flemish and Spanish ones. In the beginning, there was a large number of pictures imported from Europe.

“The need for images was immense. ... Artists of great religious zeal traveled to the Andes to disseminate devotional images ... Fray Diego de Ocana ... lamented that the monastery of Guadalupe in Spain failed to answer his plea for prints. ... ‘If I had twenty or thirty thousand prints, I would have used them all because everyone took one to have at home.’”

This need for images was directly linked to evangelization and how the churches were equipped and furnished. From the seventeenth century onwards, large trade firms were established that transported pictures and furniture to America: “Organismos internacionales ... en Francia, Austria, Holanda, Portugal, y España.” But the majority of the pictures were produced by painters, above all in Cusco, whose workshops were like manufactories.

“Among the surprising finds in the notarial archives are contracts in which the artists were obliged to paint hundreds of pictures in just a few months. ... In face of the great demand, the heads of the studios practically had no other choice: They had to become company directors.”

Our central issue here is the industrial production of images.

In an essay, Teresa Gisbert describes the problem of categorizing Andean painting in individual schools (the schools of Cusco, Potosí, and Collao). However, there are formal criteria that can be used to characterize Andean painting: the great decorativeness, the brocades that lie over the motifs like serial patterns, the repetitive arrangement of motifs or faces (e.g. the Trinity depictions).

“This particularly applies to the ‘Cusco School’ of which more than 70 percent are indigenous works. ... In the thirteenth century, Cusco exported to the regions that are today Argentina, Bolivia, Chile, and Peru, and in individual cases to Quito and Europe as well.”

How did it come about that Andean painting freed itself from European models? Gisbert gives three reasons:

“Problems in the professional corporations due to disputes between indigenous and Spanish workers. ... The artists’ dependency on the utopian ideas of the doctrineros [priests in the indigenous parishes] and on the specific indigenous taste embodied by the respective cacique.”

And she uses the sources of the painters’ guild in Cusco to prove that there was a large portion of indigenous craftsmen in this professional organization. Conflicts emerged in regard to the conditions of pay and the contractual relationships.

In this essay, she gives an account of a row that took place between the indigenous and Spanish painters in Cusco in 1688. The indigenous painters refused to participate obligatorily in erecting the triumphal arch on the occasion of the Corpus Christi festivity, the reason being, as it appears, previous disputes connected with unpaid wages.

“Some of the Spanish painters were called capataz (master). They hired indigenous painters as subcontractors to assist them in producing the large picture series that the monasteries had ordered. ... Since the Spanish didn’t want to take the risk of not having a sufficient number of workers in the end to carry out such huge orders, they bound them by means of contract clauses such as the following: ‘The guilty person is obliged to a reimbursement of the desired amount ... and agrees to pay the fine.’”

Gisbert cites another document in which she points out the breaches of law against which the subcontracted indigenous artists went on strike, for example:

“The painter Francisco Sánchez declares that his brother, Tomás Ojeda, locked him and his colleagues up so that they would fulfill a certain contract on pictures, which, as the plaintiff accuses, were then sold by Ojeda.”

She concludes that these labor disputes with the indigenous artists, who in Cusco were in the majority, led to their refusal to take professional exams laid down by the royal audience in Lima—something which might ultimately have resulted in the division of the professional corporations.

“We know about the indigenous painters through a message from Simón Zevallus, the head of the corporation of silversmiths, painters and others, to the registry of tax-paying artists from 1786. ... It is possible that the interested indigenous painters had united in this form.”

Hence, the formal characteristics of colonial painting (e.g. mainly two-dimensional or lacking perspective, and the serial nature of the brocades and motifs) resulted from the industrialization and division of artistic labor processes. Were they also signs of indigenous and corporative dissidence?

“The artist became the ... assistant of the priest, the viceroy and the encomendero;” is how the Peruvian art historian Cossio del Pomar generally assesses the status of artists, and he adds: “The artist revealed also the conditions of the formal abstract rhythm that impelled the Colonial soci-
Let us go to the center of the room, before the wall bearing the map of monetary circulation, where we will examine a very explicit example of global programmatic painting. The picture tells the story of the failed attempt to missionize in Japan. You are seeing twenty-three Franciscan and three Jesuit monks who were crucified in 1597 at the behest of the emperor Hideyoshi Toyotomi. The crucified monks form a horizon of sorts. Between them and the stages of their martyrdom appears a landscape in which their executioners and the devout who collect their blood as a relic act in such harmony that you might think they are bringing in a great harvest. The massacre of Nagasaki is one of the great saints’ narratives of the Counter-Reformation; in it, the failure of the mission becomes an imitatio Christi. It spawned a wave of pious literature that can be traced from Antwerp via France to Portugal and on to America—the usual path along which images circulated. Only in the case of this motif may we speculate that its circulation ran in the opposite direction, from Manila to Mexico and hence to the rest of America and to Europe.

Behind the picture you can see, instead of a European engraving that served as a model, a copy of one of the wall paintings in the Cuernavaca Cathedral, Mexico. It is dedicated to Felipe de Jesús, the first saint from Mexico; his execution, however, took place in Nagasaki. The circulation of the images is a steady companion: “During the second half of the sixteenth century, the Spanish crown ... bankrolls the first staging posts in the Pacific and begins to deport Chinese and Filipinos ... to Mexico and Peru. The Spanish monarchy abandons ... this development of the enslavement of Asians in Mexico and Peru. But the illegal trade in Filipinos and Chinese to Mexico grows, increasingly complemented by free labor migration movements, which then continue through the second half of the seventeenth century.” (Ferruccio Gambino/Davi Sacchetto)

**The Martyrs of Nagasaki**

The evangelization of Japan was indeed carried out in a “foreign country,” where military subjugation and evangelization were separated. It utilized the weakness of the Emperor and evangelized the rebelling Daimyōs. The princes—warlords—allowed evangelization, because from it they promised themselves a connection to the Portuguese trade with China. Fifty years later, the Spanish governor of the Philippines sent Franciscan missionaries to Japan. Since the occupation of the Philippines by the Spanish in 1587, Japan had seen itself latently threatened by a European invasion. There is a text panel in the middle of the picture describing the legend of the massacre. The legend has it that the
San Felipe, en route from Mexico to Manila, ran ashore in front of the Japanese coast in 1556. The captain insulted the Japanese when they confiscated the freight. He threatened them by saying that he was a vanguard of the Spanish military. The missionaries were then arrested and taken to Kyōto, where they were sentenced to death along with other Christians in 1597.

The front part of the picture appears to relate this story. On the left, we see the San Felipe, an argument, and Christians locked up in a house. It could be their detention and transfer to the city of Meako, which followed their sentencing in Kyōto. On the right, we see a procession of people moving to the horizon of the crucified. The crucifixion took place on the Tateyama hill in Nagasaki on February 5, 1597.

The trade relations included the exchange of Japanese silver and copper for European firearms. Toward the end of the sixteenth century, it is said that "around 1/3 of the silver and copper on the Western market ... came from Japan." The firearms brought back were of great importance to the Japanese/bushi/daimyō. The firearms intensified the wars between the regional princes; competition between the warlords boosted the sales of resources to Europe. But Japan (as opposed to Rwanda, Congo, Nicaragua, and Afghanistan) was soon capable of manufacturing firearms on its own. Harquebus troops emerged. A stabilized government (initially under Oda Nobunaga at the end of the sixteenth century) possessed the monopoly on the production of these weapons. Hideyoshi's subsequent seizure of power was based on a fragile balance of power between the clan leaders. In 1588 the monks, peasants, and city-dwellers who were engaged in the civil war-like clan battles, were disarmed, and the land was newly surveyed. Under Japan's long isolationist policies starting in 1616, foreigners were only allowed to enter a trading base on the artificial island of Dejima in front of the Japanese coast. When the English Commodore Perry forced access to Japan in 1857, he encountered neither Christians nor weapons.

"One of the reasons for quick spreading of the 26 Martyrs around the world is the Jesuit propaganda. As the Franciscans were founded long before, they have already many Saints and Martyrs, but for the Jesuits, Paul Miki and companions were the first Martyrs beatified, so they (we) used it a lot to promote vocation, especially missionary vocations."

The affirmation of the massacre of Nagasaki can be traced in engravings and pictures from Antwerp via France to Portugal and America. "In Mexico on the frescos of the cathedrals in Cuernavaca, in Peru on the tiled panels of the sacristy of San Pablo de Lima, in Recife on the tiled panels of the Capela Dourada of the Santo Antônio monastery." However, with this motif one can also presume that a circulation in the opposite direction occurred, from Manila to Mexico and from there to the rest of America and Europe.

The dating of the picture was uncertain until its renovation for the exhibition. The banner on the bottom edge of the picture relates that the Martyrs were beatified by Pope Urban VIII on September 14, 1627 and canonized by Pope Pius IX on June 8, 1862. Thus, it would stem from the second half of the nineteenth century. But the banner could also have been added on the occasion of the canonization. The text of the story of the saints at the center of the image is from an older source:

"The text in the painting of the edict follows Froiss' record (written in 1597) close enough as to think the painter read this or a translation: The picture of Cuernavaca Cathedral is a huge one. ... I don't know the author or the date, but it seems to have been made in the seventeenth century, probably in occasion of the beatification of the 26 Martyrs, among whom as you know, there is a Mexican, Felipe. ... I think it is safe to suppose ... that there is a clear Asian influence in the picture of Cuernavaca, and ... it could have been made in the Philippines, from where [it] could have been copied in the Cuernavaca walls.

The wall picture in Cuernavaca Cathedral is dedicated to Felipe de Jesus, the first saint from Mexico who died a martyr's death as a missionary. During renovation it became clear that the picture is probably from the late seventeenth century and was partially painted over in the nineteenth century.

---

1 See Louis Froiss, Relazione della gloriosa morte di 26 noti in croce 5 Feb. 1597 (Rome, 1599).
2 Steffi Richter, Geschichte der Gesellschaft und Kultur Japan; lecture at the University of Leipzig 2008.
5 de Luca, Twenty-Six Martyrs Museum correspondence.
"The circulation of images is a steady companion." That is a sentence you should keep in mind as you walk into the room in the back on the left, back to the large picture that broaches the issue of illegal guest workers in Dubai. On May 28, 2008, a press conference was held in Berlin to publicize an agreement between the directors of Dresden State Art Collections, Berlin State Museums, Bavarian State Picture Collections, and the Dubai Culture and Arts Authority about the creation of a universal museum. During the conference, the three museums presented themselves as a spectral union, a specter from the nineteenth century. At stake was "Germany's self-presentation as a nation of culture." The nation of culture thinks that it is an anonymous space. Instead of political rights it offers identity. This specter met another semantic monster: the liberal "melting pot" of a globalized society. But this second monster isn't quite up to the task of making the fact magically disappear that 85 percent of the population in Dubai work under extremely precarious conditions. Administrative assistance was required—the transfer of the "know-how" of a national culture; the "nation of culture" lends corporations and clans the aura of statehood, legitimizing their social crimes. It is not a population that legitimizes the state—this empty space does. Things in this empty space exist in and of themselves, without dedication or history. That renders them logically and aesthetically true, in the interest of the power that effaces the history of things and the violence it took to loot them.

On September 15, 2008, the press conference was restaged at the Temporäre Kunsthalle, Berlin—the same press releases were issued and the same journalists were invited. Sample the press release brochures behind the picture.
Universalism in Art and the Art of Universalism

Since the financial crisis arrived in the United Arab Emirates (UAE) in fall 2008 we have been able to observe how it has been handled. Business models and government strategies have not changed at all during this period.

"The Dubai Model... has been cultivated mostly by semi-public companies based in Dubai and Qatar: Emaar, Sama Dubai, Nakheel... DAMAC, and Qatari Diar. These corporations have established a euphoric construction zone of shopping centers, Mediterranean-style homes, and luxury hotels within the largest swath of the globe barely touched by globalism. This once-ignored void... can now be listed alongside other world-class luxury destinations. ... Emaar claims that among its built and proposed projects, it will 'cover' 1.5 billion people more than China's population."

The above quote is from the compendium Al Manakh which shows the topography of a new belt of luxury quarters and business-oriented cities that begins in North Africa and ends in China. These insular economies are the result of consistent neoliberal international finance policies: free trade zones and luxury tourism in countries where the majority of the population lives far beneath the poverty level, but whose GNP is high due to global investment funds and their local sweatshops. But Mediterranean-style villas, wellness oases, malls with good public transportation are not enough for the new class of nabobs and their executive employees. Dubai has added a Healthcare City with the best clinics and a Knowledge City with branches of elite universities including Harvard and the Sorbonne to its numerous free-trade zones. We don't think the current implementation of art systems in these optimized residential realms is merely about commerce but rather that it is about laying claim to a political space that is critically joined to the powers that have allowed it to be. The Abraaj Capital corporation offers an art prize of one million US dollars for artists from the MENA Region:

"Abraaj Capital is empowering artists to play their part in the renaissance of our societies and cultural heritage. ... Well-functioning societies are not built only on net profit margins, indeed, tolerance, mutual respect, community involvement and free flow of ideas are essential components in addition to economic growth, and the arts provide a privileged medium to foster such things."2

If art is connected to a legitimizing function (for instance as a placebo for freedom of expression), then that means everyone who participates in this area has the chance to decide whether they want to obey this function or oppose it. This is not a voluntary appeal for a boycott or intervention, but first an appeal to focus one's attention on the fact that a political space is being opened that invites all those concerned, and that includes us, to react. It can also be the beginning of a discussion about a political self-image within the current internationalization of art systems that cannot be satisfied with including all the regions in the hegemonic world of art. This transfer from the fringes to the centers is not emancipatory per se. The UAE is an example.

Read more on pp. 279–280.

2 "The future of exhibitions lies in commerce. Dubai is probably the place where this will happen, under the enlightened despotism of its emir." Daniel Birnbaum, Dubai, Texte zur Kunst 66, June 2007.
structures you see in the *Vista de Potosí* had ceased. Investments—additional expenditures of technology and labor—no longer appeared profitable. At the end of the same century, Potosí was a ghost town of no more than 8,000 residents. In 1719, the Spanish king signed a draft decree to abolish the *mita*, but an exception was made with regard to the mines. And yet we cannot understand this festival as purely a political investment at stake was the need to conceive of and prove oneself as this culture, especially when it becomes apparent how fragile its existence is, how marginal it’s power, how extinguishable its history.

In the meantime, the functionaries at the conference held by the Dubai Culture and Arts Authority have been pensioned off or replaced, and as the crisis has set in, the project has been canceled. Both occasions—the press conference announcing the creation of the world’s largest museum and the festival celebrating the entry of a viceroy—tell us something about a general mission of hegemonic culture: the production of a subject. However, this time the subject is not tied to its immediate subjection. It is, first and foremost, an image (of itself)—not the body bearing the entrances to the mines, but rather the brocading behind which the bodies disappear. It is created in order to help the relations of power and their processes gain a view of themselves. The image of a subject acts autonomously; in contrast with the actual subject, it is entirely free, and insists on this freedom as an ideal right. It is a state, a corporation … and as we have seen, the museum, too, gains a view of itself and acts like this spectral subject, enraptured by its existence, blind for its being a product, free from legitimation or the need for it. Have you noticed something? What we have been trying to do this entire time is to lead you and ourselves out of the belly of a fetish.

**Why the Painting *Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí* Is Not Coming**

*(A speech play)*

*The artist Sally Gutiérrez Dewar filmed the painting under its conservational conditions in the Museo de América. The following text is taken from an interview María Galindo conducted on the terms of the loan of the picture. (Names changed by the editors)*

**Sudaca:** We are in the Cristobal Colón Museum of Hispanic Culture in Madrid, with the museum director. Thank you for meeting us. What is the Cristobal Colón Museum of Hispanic Culture?

**Museum Director:** In my opinion it is the most important museum in the world to be dedicated exclusively to America, from prehistory to modern times. No other museum can boast this. There are some great European museums with collections of American objects from the pre-Hispanic era. And naturally there are all the museums in Latin America that hold objects on their own cultures. But this is the only museum dedicated to America and to all the ages of America.

**Sudaca:** Is it a colonial claim, saying that Spain has a museum of America that America does not?

**Museum Director:** No. No, because this is a very common historical process. You have to place yourself within the context of the collections made by European monarchs, who collected from all of the European schools, as well as other areas. There are museums, such as the British Museum, the Louvre, the great Prado art gallery, whose magnificent collections were built on the basis of royal collections. The Cristobal Colón Museum compiles and collects a series of objects that were initially linked to Spanish colonies and that were brought over by scientific expeditions in the eighteenth century. And at that time you have to remember that America is Spain.

**Sudaca:** America is not Spain.

**Museum Director:** Yes, in the eighteenth century, America is Spain.

**Sudaca:** We are not in the eighteenth century.
Museum Director: Of course not, that is why I am talking about collections put together in the eighteenth century, just like there are many Spanish works all over America.

Sudaca: But we do not have the collection of a Spanish museum in America. It does not exist. Not in Bolivia, not in Mexico, not in Buenos Aires, not in any capital city in America.

Museum Director: Of course not, but that is completely logical. Since the time of independence, the countries of America have been working to forge their own identities, and these identities are based on the recognition of being different from the rest.

Sudaca: How was this museum created?

Museum Director: When the Spanish civil war ended, a museum unit that ended up being the Cristobal Colón Museum was set up on the basis of the Archaeological Museum of the Indies. In 1992 the museum abandoned traditional chronology: Mayans and Aztecs. We decided to change the museography, and in this sense it was a complete innovation.

Sudaca: Explain the break you mentioned before, between the Archaeological Museum of the Indies and the Cristobal Colón Museum. What did this conceptual redefinition involve?

Museum Director: Essentially in the presentation of the American cultural process, not from the point of view of the exotic, but of the anthropological. That is the basis.

Sudaca: And how do you think that the museum handles the issue of colonialism and the entire processes of expropriation, pillaging, and looting?

Museum Director: This issue is not handled by the museum.

Sudaca: You have omitted it.

Museum Director: Of course, because it is not part of the issue we are discussing: a description of the cultural process. What you are talking about is a very specific issue, about which there are currently many meetings with UNESCO. It is an issue that is on the red list.

Sudaca: So, colonialism per se is not part of the museum narrative.

Museum Director: Everyone is free to form their own opinion. The museum presents the facts, providing the elements for each individual to form their own narrative.

Sudaca: Beside the painting of the Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí it says the following: "Entrance Of Archbishop Viceroy Morcillo Into Potosí. The festivals held in cities to receive viceroys when they took their positions brought together all elements of local society, who attended the official ceremonies of submission and voiced their hopes for the benefits of good governance. Oil on canvas, Royal Audience of Charcas 1716, Melchor Perez de Holguín, Potosí, Bolivia." How long has this painting been in the museum?

Museum Director: If I remember correctly, this painting was acquired in 1945.

Sudaca: Would it be fair to say that it is one of the museum’s major pieces?

Museum Director: It is a very important piece. Yes. Remember that—as I mentioned before—in the eighteenth century, America was Spain.

Sudaca: America has never been Spain, and if America had ever been Spain, our relationship would not be what it is today. But that is another issue in a vast political discussion.

Museum Director: Of course, but it was part of the Spanish Empire.

Sudaca: In a colonial relationship of subjection.

Museum Director: Of course, countries and politics always involve the exercise of power. There is an exercise of power right now with the rest of the world. Every country tries to exercise its power in one way or another. What country are you from?

Sudaca: Bolivia.

Museum Director: Bolivia. Right. Bolivia, which has a major political issue with the Santa Cruz de la Sierra region, right? Let us imagine that, in fifty years time, Santa Cruz de la Sierra is a separate, independent country. It would be perfectly valid to say that, if someone in La Paz today commissions a piece from an artist from Santa Cruz de la Sierra, buys it and puts it in his home, that painting is Bolivian.

Sudaca: But I am asking how this painting was obtained by the Spanish State. Why does this painting belong to who it belongs to?

Museum Director: This painting was privately owned in Spain, and it was bought from these private owners.

Sudaca: And how did these private individuals obtain it?

Museum Director: That is what I am talking about: in the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries, people came and went from America, and with their belongings they brought and took...

Sudaca: Are the past owners of this painting documented? Who did it belong to originally, where was it originally? Was it taken from a convent, from the Casa de Moneda?

Museum Director: Only what has been explained. We know when it was painted, because of the inscription on it. It was dedicated to Archbishop Morcillo, who appears in the history books. When the viceroy of Peru died, he appointed the then archbishop of La Plata, Morcillo, on a temporary basis. He was appointed acting viceroy of Peru,
whereupon he set off from La Plata to Lima to take possession as viceroy. When he passed Potosí, the miners, the big mine owners in Potosí, threw these parties for him, these welcome parties. What they were trying to do, obviously, was curry favor, ensuring his support when he got to Lima.

Sudaca: And where was the work displayed, after it had been commissioned?

Museum Director: We do not know.

Sudaca: What is the earliest record of it?

Museum Director: If I am not mistaken, the painting itself was acquired in 1945 from a private owner here in Spain. Before that, we have no idea.

Sudaca: But who was the painting bought from?

Museum Director: I cannot remember their name, but it is in the documentation. A private collector who currently lives in Toledo. As I said, we do not know where the painting was before we got it.

Sudaca: Do you know about its early years? Who commissioned the painting?

Museum Director: Yes. Its history is on the cartouche here: “To this imperial town on the day of Mark the Evangelist at three o'clock in the afternoon, let it be known, on April 25, 1716 came his Excellency the honorable Don Fray Diego Rubio Portillo, Archbishop of La Plata and Viceroy of this Kingdom of Peru of the most honorable town of Robledo, in La Mancha the most honorable and favored gentlemen of this town, in accordance with their status, came to receive his Excellency.” What happened is that at some point this was destroyed. Now we are trying to recover as much as possible. You can read the name of his nephew there. It was the archbishop’s nephew who commissioned the painting. And I reiterate that it was a very common process for these people to bring back many works among their belongings when they returned to Spain.

Sudaca: But, in theory, this painting was done to hang over there, right?

Museum Director: Honestly, I could not say.

Sudaca: How much has the painting been valued at?

Museum Director: The works in state museums do not have prices.

Sudaca: But it is valued for insurance purposes if it is lent out, for example, isn’t it?

Museum Director: But such valuations are made specifically for such special circumstances, in consideration of where it is going, where it is going to be kept, how it is going to be transported.

Sudaca: Would you lend the picture to be exhibited in its native country, Bolivia?

Museum Director: The only potential issues relate to the physical aspects concerning conservation of the painting. In fact, the Reina Sofía Museum has recently asked for it to be included in this exhibition, but we told them that it would not fit through the door and therefore we would have to take it out of its frame. This would represent a serious risk.

Sudaca: You would never lend it to Bolivia.

Museum Director: Why do you say that?

Sudaca: Because if you are not prepared to lend it to the Reina Sofía, I imagine that the people of Bolivia will never get a chance to see this painting.

Museum Director: You are not going about this the right way. It is not the case that we are not prepared to lend it to the Reina Sofía. We are bound to protect and ensure the conservation of the works kept in the museum. We give a technical opinion, not a political one, about where it goes and where it does not go. What often happens is that copies are made of it. The museum has always been happy for that to happen.

Sudaca: Is there an open discussion on cultural heritage in relation to pieces held by you, but that are of greater importance to national processes or cultures in their countries of origin?

Museum Director: No.

Sudaca: For example, this painting, have there been any negotiations to return it, or take it, to Bolivia?

Museum Director: No, never.

Sudaca: Has Bolivia ever claimed it as its own cultural heritage?

Museum Director: No. Never this painting.

Sudaca: This painting unquestionably belongs in Bolivian society. What do you think?

Museum Director: My opinion applies absolutely to all of the works in this museum: It is part of Spanish cultural heritage until someone can demonstrate the contrary.

1 "Sudaca" is a pejorative term for South Americans. This racial slur is used mainly in Spain when the intention is to refer disrespectfully to South American immigrants.

2 The first document to mention the painting is a letter from Tomás Amunós dated Toledo, April 26, 1945. The missive is addressed to Señor Tudela, Deputy Director of the Museum of America, which had just been set up by Franco’s government. The letter deals with the negotiations to purchase the painting that were undertaken before and after the war. The price of 50,000 pesetas agreed before the war had been countered by an offer of 100,000 pesetas from a family member in Peru. Another letter dated August 6, 1945 mentions an offer from the Museum of America for 30,000 pesetas, and the painting was sold for this price on February 14, 1947.
The Festive Entry of Morcillo

"The festive entry of a lord-paramount ... into a city belonging to his territory was associated with a legal relationship and was of special importance to the visited city. The city gates were already decorated in honor of the prince. ... Of crucial significance for the festive entries were ephemeral architectures, i.e. structures made of ephemeral materials that were torn down again after the end of the event. They included honorary portals, display scaffoldings with living pictures, and temples."1

From the seventeenth century on, the entry began to lose its legal significance and served representational purposes. In this case, the entry festivities were a desperate investment.

Bakewell describes the deceleration of silver mining after its industrialization through the mita and the amalgamation process on the one hand as the exhaustion of a resource, and on the other as a result of the shortage of indigenous laborers due to flight or the high mortality rate. "Many of the dams and aqueducts built to provide hydraulic power for milling were allowed to fall into disrepair. ... Entrepreneurial energies were directed rather to opening up new mines in other parts of the district."2

In addition to being a political investment, the festivity is also about "glorifying the loyalty and the virtues of the Spanish Crown in its vice royal representative. ... We will see here how this apparently so simple reason turns into a complex discursive apparatus."3 The emblematic program of the festivity is dedicated to urbanity, freedom, and glory. These are "allusions to generosity and civility in their concreteizations as urban community ... the unfolding of magnificence attains a special meaning for Spanish cities, when all groups relevant to the city take part in the festivities, for this symbolizes the success of Spanish enterprises in America: the mission of civilizing and Christianizing."4

Potosí is an example of artistic and economic trends operating diametrically opposed to each other. The festive entry of Morcillo also shows us that in this diametrical relationship, the artistic mission attains a double bottom. One highlight of the festivities on the occasion of the entry of the new viceroy is the masquerade in the evening. An Indian boy magnificently dressed as a mine worker pours liquid silver from a dish. It reminds us of the Soul in the hell of Caquiatiri, doomed to spit out silver coins forever.

In an inscription in his picture, Melchor Pérez de Holguín cites the specifications of the contemporary chronicler of the city, Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela. It is assumed that both may have witnessed the festival. The following excerpt from the Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí can serve as the picture's legend. Even more so, it reveals the enormous effort that the entrepreneurs and officials put into this investment, and how the city was enraptured by itself. Perhaps both, text and image, will lead us closest to questioning the self-understanding of artistic work in the current hegemony.

Arzans wrote his chronicle in a period of decline, "... weaving from the history and still young legends of Potosí a baroque tapestry of words that is the baroque equivalent of the altarpieces wrought from local silver."5 AC, AS

Continue reading the text by Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela on pp. 280–81 (Spanish)

---

4 "Referencias a la generosidad y cortesía en la concreción cívica de la comunidad ... el despliegue de magnificencia cobra una especial importancia para las ciudades españolas cuando cuentan con un participar de todos los grupos relacionados con la ciudad, ya que esto simboliza el éxito de la empresa española en América, el civilizar y evangelizar." Ibid., p. 151.
Why the Quipus Are Not Coming

Quipus ("knots") are mnemonic instruments for recording statistical records and numbers. They consist of a main rope to which other ropes are attached. These ropes are of different colors and are knotted individually or in groups. The combination of colors and modes of knotting marks a specific meaning related to the decimal system. Quipus served to provide statistical data on inhabitants, soldiers, livestock, estates, and inventory, even referring to historical events and astrological calendars. They were also used to calculate taxes. Each level of the knots corresponds with the superordinate administrative district. Most quipus were destroyed by the Spanish conquerors in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, as well as during a campaign to eliminate idolatry. The historical quipus still preserved from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries are no longer readable today.

The Ethnological Museum in Berlin claims to house 320 (or 380, depending on which method is used to determine what counts as one) of the 700 quipus worldwide. They were donated by Arthur Baessler, who purchased them in 1898 along with several thousand other objects from the draper Wilhelm Gretz. Gretz and his wife Erna lived in Lima from 1873 to 1904. Upon returning to Germany in 1904 they brought back a collection of around 300,000 archaeological objects, which they then sold in the following years to the emerging ethnological museums in Berlin, Cologne, Leipzig, Göttingen, and Hanover.

"As early as 1874 your grandfather [i.e. Wilhelm Gretz] had excavations conducted by natives, usually three or four persons, who had obliged themselves to work only for him, and this took place until 1904. The sites were in all different regions of Peru—and after they had completely combed the sites, they brought everything to your grandfather in Lima, who paid them for the time they worked and then sent them away to work again. Then the excavated objects were sorted at our home; most were often worthless and thrown away, only the really beautiful and artistic things were included in the collection." (Erna Gretz to her grandson Aribo Gretz).

The way in which the graves were opened, the mummies partially hidden of their shrouds and cloaks, and masses of burial objects sorted, was widespread at the time. Numerous temple grounds and burial sites of the most various cultures in Old Peru were destroyed as a result of the illegal excavations. The practice of illegal excavations still exists today, even if the laws have changed. Opening graves without permission of the local authorities is internationally judged to be a crime. Under this aspect, Gretz would be a grave robber today. What gives rise to thought is that shortly after Wilhelm Gretz brought his extensive collections out of Peru, the Peruvian government banned the export of archaeological artifacts.¹

We initially received a positive response from the Ethnological Museum in Berlin to our request to borrow a quipu for the exhibition—as far as the stops in Madrid and Berlin were concerned. For the last stop, in La Paz, the museum demanded an official confirmation by the vice minister of culture that the quipus would not be retained there.

Regarding our question of whether the quipus in this museum were not themselves loot, we were referred to the Berlin Declaration, a codex for museums to furnish an expert report for all objects proving the legality of their acquisitions.

¹ Claus Deime, "Zur Geschichte der Sammlung Wilhelm und Erna Gretz," Archäologie des Aben Peru (Hannover, 1999), p. 44.

"Declaration on the Importance and Value of Universal Museums"

The international museum community shares the conviction that illegal traffic in archaeological, artistic, and ethnic objects must be firmly discouraged. We should, however, recognize that objects acquired in earlier times must be viewed in the light of different sensitivities and values, reflective of that earlier era. The objects and monumental works that were installed decades and even centuries ago in museums throughout Europe and America were acquired under conditions that are not comparable with current ones.

Over time, objects so acquired—whether by purchase, gift, or partage—have become part of the museums that have cared for them, and by extension part of the heritage of the nations which house them. Today we are especially sensitive to the subject of a work's original context, but we
should not lose sight of the fact that museums too provide a valid and valuable context for objects that were long ago displaced from their original source.

The universal admiration for ancient civilizations would not be so deeply established today were it not for the influence exercised by the artifacts of these cultures, widely available to an international public in major museums.

Calls to repatriate objects that have belonged to museum collections for many years have become an important issue for museums. Although each case has to be judged individually, we should acknowledge that museums serve not just the citizens of one nation but the people of every nation. Museums are agents in the development of culture, whose mission is to foster knowledge by a continuous process of reinterpretation. Each object contributes to that process. To narrow the focus of museums whose collections are diverse and multifaceted would therefore be a disservice to all visitors.

Signed by the directors of:


Read more on the questionable permanence of the concept of the universal museum in the self-image of contemporary museums on pp. 281–82.

The Ethnological Museum in Berlin is to relocate to the reconstructed Prussian Schloss (palace) and form a part of the Humboldt Forum. Last year, the group Alexandertechnik intervened against these plans with an Anti-Humboldt Conference.

Read more about this on p. 283.
Nation Branding

"Nationbranding" was a workshop in the context of the Anti-Humboldt Congress, organized by Alexandertechnik against the Humboldt Forum in Berlin, July 2009.

Nation branding... aims to measure, build, and manage the reputation of countries (closely related to place branding). ... It is based on the observation that the 'brand images' of countries are just as important to their success in the global marketplace as those of products and services. Increasing interconnectivity through advances in information technology, coupled with an increasing importance of the symbolic value of products, have led countries to emphasize their distinctive characteristics.

Taken from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nation_branding

Nation branding and the Humboldt Forum in Berlin: The former GDR Palace of the Republic is broken away. An initiative of German aristocrats was founded at the beginning of the 1990s that was dedicated to the restoration of the former Prussian palace (which had been demolished by the communist German government after 1945 in order to eliminate Prussian ideology and its enthusiasm for war.) The aristocrats' initiative made an official and formalistic argument: an historical architectural ensemble should be rebuilt. Yet this is inseparable from an ideological production of an unbroken historical unit between Prussia and Germany. At the beginning the lobbyists had no idea of what exactly should be housed in the new rebuilt castle: a shopping mall, a hotel, a multiplex cinema? This helplessness indicates an emptiness or a hole in the reconstitution of this unity. The Humboldt Forum is a new idea to bring (not only) the ethnological collection from the Berlin suburb of Dahlem into the palace. This idea makes all the helplessness euphoric, but it gives us the following brain-teasers: Why is looted art from colonial expansion so useful to plug the hole of a national unit? What relation exists between nation branding, national identity, and colonialism?

Participants of the congress: Kerstin Stakemeyer, Johannes G. Raether (for Rosa Perutz), Max Hinderer, Alice Creischer, David Riff, Anthony Davies, and Jorge Luis Marzo.

Anthony Davies: I'm going to talk about nation branding or rebranding national identity from a British perspective. What I'll do is argue on the one side that the new archaeological concept of culture, education, and finance on the one hand, and what might be called regional, city, and national branding on the other. Of course, there are many archaeologies, but I'd like to highlight the way in which much of the so-called economic growth and development that we've witnessed in Britain over the last two decades might be recast in the light of the current financial crisis as a chaotic and largely uncoordinated response to an ongoing crisis in capitalism. And this would of course include nation rebranding exercises. So "development," the knowledge economy, the Dot Com boom, the New Economy, the Third Way, the intensification of sponsorship, corporate alliances and partnerships, the creative industries, the globalized contemporary art market, the creative economy, cultural entrepreneurship, culture-led regeneration, business incubation in educational institutions... I could go on.

Read the contributions by Anthony Davies, David Riff, and Jorge Luis Marzo on nation branding in England, Moscow, and Spain in the international essay section on pp. 284–86.

In front, near the work by Isaías Gríñolo, you have already noticed a ladder that leads past the sky made of greenhouses to a small window. Next to it is a handle that allows you to rotate various lenses. The lenses tell the story of another pageant: these are photographs documenting the celebrations of the Día de la Hispanidad, the day of the discovery of America, taken on October 12 last year. Through the lenses you can look at the slogan on the neighboring wall. It is a statement issued by the group PRPC, which is protesting against the planned Seville biennial.
In Seville cultural politics has suffered a programmatic capitalization of contemporary artistic expression since 2004. The BIACS Foundation (International Biennial for Contemporary Art Seville) has captured the largest part of the public funds for culture production plus private sponsorships to launch a major city-branding project, to battle the self-image cold turkey the city suffered after the World Expo '92. Therefore they legitimized their project by employing big names of the (critical) contemporary art world, such as Harald Szeemann, Okwui Enwezor, or Peter Weibel.

The bankrupt BIACS Foundation last December announced the biennial for February 2011 and declared an agreement with the Abu Dhabi Authority Culture and Heritage Foundation, related to the royal family, as their partner for the upcoming event. To date, with less than a year to go before the fourth edition of the biennial is supposed to take place, there is no news on the issue.

Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales

When The Potosí Principle invited the PRPC to contribute to the project with a text we thought that the best thing to do would be to revise and annotate the illuminating interview that the president of the BIACS Foundation, Fernando Franco, gave Jesús Álvarez for the local ABC newspaper on Sunday, December 20, 2009. The interview in itself reveals the megalomaniac of a project that has failed many times and for the first time admits its bankruptcy and dependence upon and abuse of the cultural budgets of public institutions. These are the first three notes for what should be a longer, collectively written text. We will continue to accumulate reflections, comments, and news about the brief conversation between the interviewer and interviewee that help to situate our discursive insertion in The Potosí Princi-

ple and the attention that our opposition to the current cultural policies represented by the BIACS model for the city of Seville deserves. The various expansions to the apparatus of notes may be read in the Madrid, Berlin, and La Paz exhibitions of the The Potosí Principle project and on the following websites:

http://potosiprinicipleprocess.wordpress.com/
http://www.prpc.e-sevilla.org

Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales (PRPC) was formed as a discussion platform on cultural policy, questioning this radical step of rationalization and privatization of public funds for cultural production via the BIACS Foundation and private investment lobbies since the beginning of the Seville biennial. It has established an online platform at: http://www.e-sevilla.org

Read more on pp. 286–89.

Human Rights Watch has assembled an entire dossier on labor conditions at the construction sites on Saadiyat Island, Abu Dhabi's cultural showcase project featuring branches of the Guggenheim Museum and the Louvre. They wrote to the museums and the architects, including Jean Nouvel’s office, asking them to put an end to these conditions, but received no response.

What happens when we use a national holiday as a lens to look at the cold turkey suffered by the self-representation of a city, a withdrawal a biennial is supposed to mitigate—and then the sponsor succumbs to the same symptoms afflicting the bankrupt city?
Let us connect this question to a story about the mother of all biennials. A brochure produced for the pavilion of the United Arab Emirates (UAE)—they first presented in Venice in 2009—reads: "[A]rts and heritage are vital to the success of Dubai’s expanding economy because they are the key building blocks of civil life and public dialog. [T]hey ... lead to innovation in areas such as hospitality management and entrepreneurship, causing a positive impact on the economy ... building its reputation as a world class cultural destination." This text is no less explicit than other city- or nation-branding drafts produced in Berlin, London, Moscow, or Seville. What interests us is the claim that culture is a pillar of civil life that can transform even a real estate developer dressed up as a state and with working conditions resembling modern serfdom, as Human Rights Watch repeatedly stresses in its reports on the UAE (2004/2008), into a "civil society." What is at stake here is not the expression but the generation of civil life, in accordance with the canon of a Western bourgeois society. In this canon, art takes up the role of the critic, as a form of self-reflectivity. "The UAE Pavilion will confront the art world’s widely held doubts about the very project of representing a nation. Playfully and provocatively entitled ‘It’s Not You, It’s Me,’ the UAE as a whole can be seen as an exhibition about exhibition making.”

We cannot but repeat that this cultural self-reflection engenders the state as a social subject in the first place, and it uses the cultural technique of critique to engender it. We can trace a historical line from here back to bourgeois culture as the outward form or identity of the nation-state. How can we imagine a rereading of the genesis narrative of bourgeois culture that includes the formation of the nation and the colonial conditions on which it is based? And can we lead you, and ourselves too, out of the belly of the fetish without ending up in yet another digestive chamber, which is to say, without becoming a piece of evidence of its liberalism?

---

Let us come back to the washing machines of the Archivo Caminante embedded in the museum’s wall: “Might semiocapitalism and its industries function like a gigantic laundry? Might its museal institutions be transformed into gigantic washing machines that, through their systems of exhibiting and cataloguing, aim to bleach and even purify [...] genocides, poverty, and the destruction of nature?” asks the author, attesting to two parallel processes that took place in Argentina after the crisis: normalization and soyazation. The so-called “centers and peripheries” are not static; they adapt to the global circulation of investment, expropriation, poisoning, and expulsion. The upward revaluation of the “peripheries” is accompanied by security discourses in the urban centers that get massive media coverage and aim to bully, and by a neoliberal culture whose profession it is to appropriate and neutralize political experience. Both security and liberalism are part of the mise-en-scène of intact government in the era of the laundries. They are a sedative for the semantic “disarrangement” between the commodity and the images and objects in the museum, and for the bruised nerves of the effaced history of their value formation. As so often with such museums, the process of its construction is attended by gentrification and the expulsion of urban life from which no value can be extracted.
The Soy Children Revisited
Eduardo Molinari

"One of the problems of the politics of subjectivation that artistic practices face has been the anesthesia of our vulnerability to the other, an anesthesia all the more devastating when the other is represented by the ruling cartography as hierarchically inferior, because of his or her economic, social, or racial condition, or on any other basis. But vulnerability is the precondition for the other to cease being a simple object for the projection of pre-established images, in order to become a living presence, with whom we can construct the territories of our existence and the changing contours of our subjectivity. Now, being vulnerable depends on the activation of a specific capacity of the sensible, which has been repressed for many centuries, remaining active only in certain philosophical and poetic traditions. These traditions culminated in the artistic vanguards of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, whose activity produced effects that have left their mark on art across the twentieth century. With it, the other is a living presence composed of a malleable multiplicity of forces that pulse in our sensible texture, thus becoming part of our very selves. Here the figures of subject and object dissolve, and with them, that which separates the body from the world. This is the resonant body."

Semiocapitalism imposes its artistic dynamics, organizing cultural industries. ... In accordance with the privatizing experience of the 1990s, a new modality appeared in our ways of circulating and traveling; toll roads. To circulate we need an authorization or we must pay.

On the way to the Bicentenario, three tolls organize the functioning of the recombinant transgenic culture: The first toll is the exchange of history for memory; transforming energies of sociocultural experiences and their search for new institutional forms are obstructed and normalized. The toll-exchange ensures that all our energies concentrate on remembering (and displaying memories of) past struggles instead of continuing them in the present. The result of this exchange is the transformation of these memories into kinds of mummies (similar to those exhibited in museums trying to account for the death of Native American cultures), and also, the loss of the historic dimension of our present existences, since history after crossing the toll barrier is only past. [...]

The second toll is the anesthesia of the resonant body. I have already talked about the erosion of the concept of representation, in its political, economic, and artistic dimensions, and about the present impossibility or nonsense of trying to represent the realities that surround us, or the subjectivities of resistances. The paradigms of militant, activist, and/or artist are in question. The matter is not to represent the fighters, but to be present together, to be living presences, with our own voices. I am talking about the relations between bodies, ideas and ideals, about incarnations.

Overwhelmed by the presence and visibility of aesthetics and practices different from the ones mentioned above, curators, theorists, managers and officials created the categories of art and politics, art and activism, or “artivism.” In their attempt to normalize entrance to institutions and temper it with ethical judgment, elevated members of the Argentine contemporary art system were not very friendly. However, there was no going back, and although in 2010 it is a fact that the artistic field has expanded, as regards the incorporation of new actors—previously disdained—there has not been a true democratization, nor are there more spaces for discussion and debate. Indeed, exhibition and sales spaces have been opened. In this part of the cultural route, the toll is still very expensive: The political is accepted as an artistic topic, but if the images are part of an incarnation, different from those of the artist who produces objects for sale, or if they constitute a serious criticism of the institutions (public or private) or finally question the material conditions of work without fees or contracts, the lack of interlocutors evidences that the silence of the 1990s is heard again. Normalization is still a goal.

The transgenic culture recombines these three operations (history for memory, anesthesia of the resonant body, and creation of the category art, and politics) and generates the conditions for the legitimation, distribution, and circulation of artistic images. [...]

Hasta la Victoria Ocampo!
This sentence was used for an “artivism action” during the serious social conflict of 2008 between the soy producers and the government. It was printed as an ironic comment by the artist Roberto Jacoby on flags and T-shirts, making a "transgenic recombination" with Che Guevara’s words (“Hasta la victoria siempre!”) and the name of the Argentine oligarchy’s writer and intellectual Victoria Ocampo. The joke is as funny as it is politically ambiguous, especially because of that context. But the most interesting point is that he was selling the T-shirts for "20 pesos" at the demonstrations of both groups that were in conflict, on the same day in different parts of Buenos Aires.

Extract from: Eduardo Molinari, Los niños de la soja (Buenos Aires, 2010).

Mundo al revés
We have arrived at the last one of these long paths toward a departure from the labyrinthine digestive organs of the institution and the timelines of history. Will we manage to leave?

Go back one more time to the *Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno* ("New Chronicle of Good Government"), and open page (617)/(603). The episode is about two priests squandering the loot they have taken from Indios with other drunkards. "And so there are among the lowly Indios, the mitayo, many ‘dons’ and ‘doñas.’ What an excellent Don Juan—the world is upside down! He invites the drunkard to be his guest, and he too will be, like them, another drunkard, a dishonor to his table as a padre in this kingdom." Guamán Poma de Ayala uses the expression "the world upside down" when he writes about people calling themselves don or doña who have no right to. That is what happens in a world where all social structures have been destroyed.

And now back to the drawings by Melchor María Mercado. Look at the folio *Mundo al revés*. The oxen stands behind the plough, goading his human beings. Are both merely moral aphorisms that equate social order with sound governance? Or do they conceal an inversion?
Next to the news from the archive of the current crisis, the Crisis Chronology, you will have noticed a small drawing, a Leviathan, also by Guamán Poma de Ayala, a "worm of conscience. . .
This worm is a grim sorrow and a fruitless remorse the wicked there will always have, and it will never come to an end as long as God will be God and in all eternity without cease. Meditate upon this punishment," he exhorts the reader. "Meditate upon how the Indios and Indias in this present life bear with such great patience so many evils from the Spanish, the padre, the corregidores, the mestizos, mulattoes, and negros, the yanaconas and the Chicaconas, who deprive the Indios of their lives and rip their hearts from their bodies. Meditate. Meditate upon the townsmen to whom the Indios are assigned as encomienda. . . . One such townsmen sends an Indio on a journey of nine miles without paying him, and he commands that he be visited, and the noble caciques must come see him, as must the abovementioned corregidores and judges, the parish priests and the visitors of the Holy Mother Church. Meditate upon the hearts of these people, upon what such a man thinks." This passage in the chronicle demonstrates that a stowaway has accompanied the iconography of hell on its passage from Europe to America: the possibility of turning the threat around and pointing it at those who install it as a regime. It gestures toward the motivations of the social uprisings taking place simultaneously in Europe and in the viceroyalty of Peru, toward the egalitarianism practiced by the Grim Reaper, the advent of the age of justice before the Last Judgment. Simultaneous acts of resistance in Europe and America against the same exploitation circulating around the globe.
Now walk to our last picture, which we have not described yet. It is at the center, across from the hell of Caquiaviri. It is the picture of a battle. Take a look at the horizon. The city seems to be surrounded not by people but by signs. That is how unrepresentable the insurgents are for the painter. Edgar Arandia, director of the Museo Nacional de Arte, La Paz, writes:

“The subsequent indigenous uprisings of the eighteenth century began in Chayanta, an indigenous community located very close to the mines of Potosí. In 1754, Viceroy Toledo had imposed excessive daily labor requirements upon the mita. This plan worked for nearly a century, based on an excessively long working day. That was why the indigenous population fled the vicinity of the mines for distant areas. These living conditions paved the way for the eruption of indigenous uprisings, as did the contention over who was a cacique between Blas Bernal and Tomás Katari, who was murdered on January 15, 1781. The indigenous rebellions broke out, thus, in Sorata, Tupac Amaru’s rebellion in Cusco, leading up to the first Siege of La Paz in early March 1781, led by Tupac Katari and his wife, Bartolina Sisa. Olivares’s painting is a replica made in 1888, almost a century after the siege. The original work undoubtedly served as a model for others that circulated around the viceroyalty as a narrative document on a single plane, typical of popular painting of the time. In his picture, the painter attempted to represent the walled city and its subdivision into sectors constituting the Indian town and exclusive neighborhoods for the Spanish. This sort of division of the city became part of the imagination of the Spanish residents and the traumatic memory of the siege, shaping the creation of the Republic of Bolivia in 1825 and with it the exclusion of the indigenous population.”
The importance of the work derives from its exhaustive description of the siege and the placement of the colonial and indigenous troops, the latter being shown in the half-light behind the Choqueyapu River. The main buildings demonstrate the social organization of the time, with Plaza de Armas and the Cathedral, the Society of Jesus, Santo Domingo, Las Concedidas, Santa Teresa, San Agustín, San Juan de Dios, and in the indigenous district, San Francisco, San Sebastián, San Pedro and finally the Cabildo, the only administrative building, highlighting the importance of the Church as a political instrument.

On the left of the work is a sheet of paper with the history of the siege and still, in the half-light, the distribution of food between the insurgents in the bottom right, beneath the hanging of the priest Antonio Barriga, who was executed in El Alto, from where the indigenous troops descended to harass the royalist troops. You can see Sebastián Segurola on horseback, accompanied by his lieutenants, Mount Illimani and various people executed by hanging, unidentified except for the priest Barriga.

The picture represents an important part of the imaginary in the city of La Paz, inhabited by people of Spanish descent, and the indigenous town of Chukiwayu Marka, which exist in permanent conflict. Between 1990 and 2006, indigenous revolts and marches entered the city of La Paz from the east and west. On several occasions, the intimidated governors organized groups to 'defend' the city against 'the indio mob,' only recreating the rift between two worlds struggling to integrate.” (Edgar Arandia)

The depiction of the Cercos (Siege) de La Paz is a striking illustration of how historicist projections can be turned against themselves. In 2006, the fervor under threat of the creole hegemony became a visual document of the successful mobilization of the indigenous uprising, symbolically sealed by the democratic election of Evo Morales, the first indigenous president of Bolivia.
The Dubai In Me

Christian von Borries

The film was shot on location in 2009 and deals with the business model of Dubai. It includes footage of the online platform Second Life as well as DVD material gathered at the 2008 Cityscape real estate fair in Dubai. It shows similarities between those rendered realities and the real world in Dubai. It has a special focus on The World island development, and it was partially shot there.

On the other hand, it is searching for a description of the real work conditions in Dubai. The film includes quotations by the French philosopher Jacques Rancière, reflecting on how to make a documentary film. The film ends with an epilogue, shot in the greenhouses of Almería and near the six-meter-high fence of the autonomous Spanish port of Melilla in North Africa, showing similarities with a global business model found in Europe as well. In this sense, "the Dubai is in all of us."

The world media, mindful of "problems of the Dubai miracle," reduce the workers’ conditions to the plight of personal destiny. No effort is undertaken to analyze specific causes within the system. The film heard many personal stories of slavery, death, and suicide, but refrained from retelling them.

Power structures cannot be boiled down to the consequences of personal ethics, as the categorical imperative (whereby personal action is subject to a universal law) would suggest.

**THE DUBAI IN ME – RENDERING THE WORLD**

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aXgbU71nuV8

http://www.the-dubai-in-me.com

Now: Take the sheet, quickly put it in your pocket, take a run-up, sprint past the security posts, past the screening device, through the first and the second entrance, through the courtyard, past that gigantic gaping jaw of the cafeteria, there, through that gap—ah, out into the street.

Afterword: We know—and colonial painting tells us again—that there is no form of articulation in artistic production (the language of colonialism) that is not per se untrue, borrowed from power and turned against itself in the speaker’s own mouth, a hybrid. And what needs to be shown is that it is possible, temporarily but time and again, to inflict a détournement upon these effective powers within their own demarcations, within their own imagery. This can also concern a political activity that is one-sided and polemical, that interferes in what is none of its business, that is illegitimate, that gains its possibility and its freedom in losing the possession of truth.

Jorge Sanjines in Conversation

We saw the picture Cerco de La Paz at the Museo Casa Murriño in January 2009—directly opposite a picture of the execution of the freedom fighter Murriño—an individual, a national hero on his way to the scaffold. In contrast, the indigenous besiegers of the city of La Paz on the horizon of the picture are rendered abstractly as an anonymous crowd, as signs.

In the exhibition at the Museo Reina Sofia, the technicians were only able to adjust the spotlights in such a way that the picture’s frame cast a shadow on this gathering of signs, making them almost unrecognizable.

Jorge Sanjines: Bolivia has always been one for first steps. The first cry of freedom in the continent wasn’t actually made by some creoles in 1809, but by Tupac Amaru and by Tupac Catari, who were the first to rise up against the powers that be in 1780. The creoles were still celebrating the king of Spain. However, the radicalism of Tupac Catari, who went further than Tupac Amaru, declared: “Spaniards out! Creoles included!” But this first call for independence is still not recognized, due to the same process of discrimination and racism that dictates the dominant history. The later revolution, in 1810, was the product of deeply conservative creoles who wanted to grab the economic influence of the Vatican. Nothing else. Murriño, for example, was a very wealthy landowner who was anxious to get the Spaniards off his back in order to take power himself. Meanwhile, the Quechua and
Aymara joined forces in 1780 to expel the invader altogether. This is the first, still unrecognized push for independence in Bolivia. Here we should not be celebrating July 16, but instead one of the dates of the siege of La Paz, a military adventure that cost the colony more deaths than any of Bolivar’s battles: half of the population. La Paz had around 20,000 inhabitants and some 10,000 died during that siege. Did any battle for independence bring about 10,000 deaths at one stroke? This should be researched. In a sense the clandestine nation is the one that surrounds La Paz and turns it inside out. The clandestine nation is the one that says “No! No more!”

Read the interview with Jorge Sanjinés on pp. 290–92 (Spanish).

World Upside Down

Email correspondence between Peter Linebaugh and the curators, December 2009

The curators: “Mundo al revés/World upside down” is a central term for us. The mestizo chronicler of the sixteenth century, Guamán Poma de Ayala, in his El Prímer Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno describes the indigenous world after the conquista as a mundo al revés (world upside down). On the other hand, related to the recent uprisings in Bolivia in 2003, “El Mundo al Revés” has been a headline for the social struggles. So this term seems to make it possible to articulate a breakdown of a particular order of living and society through the invasion of another power, and at the same time the demand for a “world upside down” seems to have become a way of turning around power relations and dispositifs that is often described in celebrations and festivities manifesting an indigenous cultural and political identity. What sort of relations do you consider at stake between the “world upside down,” the moment of celebration, and anarchism?

In your book you describe histories of insurgency of sailors, slaves, and former commoners.1

Thinking about if these insurgencies were religiously motivated, we rather have the impression that the religious narration—that the kingdom of God began at that very moment—allowed a form to narrate the insurgency itself. A global simultaneity of resistance seems to occur: indigenous insurgencies in the viceroyalty of Peru in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries that seem to direct themselves against the same power structures as the insurgencies of peasants, slaves, sailors, and craftspeople at the same time in Europe, Britain, or across the Atlantic.

Peter Linebaugh (December 9): I will make just a few observations which I hope respond to the spirit of your questions, even if they do not answer each one completely. Our book originated at a conference in Philadelphia for the English historian, Christopher Hill, and it was to him and his wife Bridget that we dedicated our book. His book from 1968 was called The World Turned Upside Down: Radical Ideas during the English Revolution. Our book hoped to extend the ideas that Hill had identified outside of England and across the Atlantic. Marcus and I were also influenced by the liberation theology of South America and the Caribbean, a theology which relied on the reading of the Bible by the poor.

The book of Acts in the New Testament describes Paul’s organizational agitation in the eastern Mediterranean during the first century of the common era. Paul faced opposition in Thessalonica, though women and the multitudes listened to him sympathetically. The well-to-do stirred up a riot against him, and went to the rulers of the city crying: “These have turned the world upside down.” There is the origin of the phrase. In particular, Paul and his followers acted contrary to the laws of Caesar and followed a different “king.”

Two traditions, making a huge historical generalization, emerged, which you identify as celebratory and anarchist. The former is associated with the carnival tradition, the occasional holiday when the poor are permitted to let off steam, for a beggar to wear a crown, etc. One of these was the Christmas holiday which the Puritans wanted to shut down. However, it was defended in a song written in 1643 called “The World Turned Upside Down.” The other tradition was revolutionary because it sought to make the social inversion permanent. That was the tradition that interested us. Its aspiration was social equality. When the armies of King George III surrendered to George Washington and the independent colonies which were to become the USA the band played “The World Turned Upside Down.”

The higher law which Paul identified in Thessalonica was the same which inspired Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. in the Black Freedom movement in the USA. Our book showed how both the Baptist faith and antinomianism of that struggle arose in the English revolution among common people for a common project. We showed how transatlantic slavery was made possible by the defeat of the
Levellers and Diggers\textsuperscript{2} by the militant leadership of the Atlantic bourgeoisie led by the Puritan, Oliver Cromwell. That defeat is commemorated in a wonderful song sung by Billy Bragg and Leon Rosselson called "The World Turned Upside Down."

It is not surprising, then, that both the songs of the world turned upside down and the goal of human equality has persisted through the ages and circulated among the oppressed throughout the planet.

\textsuperscript{1} Peter Linebaugh and Marcus Rediker, The Many-Headed Hydra: Sailors, Slaves, Commoners and the Hidden History of the Revolutionary Atlantic (Boston, 2001).

\textsuperscript{2} The Diggers were one of many English groups in the seventeenth century fighting against what Marx in Capital described as a historical example of primitive accumulation: privatization and the theft of communal land by the Church, the nobility, and the bourgeoisie in order to utilize it for globally traded cash crops. With their ability to read the Bible, they developed a concept of a shared communist existence free of domination.

\textbf{The World Upside Down}

\begin{center}
\begin{verbatim}
In 1649
To St. George's Hill,
A ragged band they called the Diggers
Came to show the people's will
They defied the landlords
They defied the laws
They were the dispossessed reclaiming what was theirs

We come in peace they said
To dig and sow
We come to work the lands in common
And to make the waste ground grow
This earth divided
We will make whole
So it will be
A common treasury for all

The sin of property
We do disdain
No man has any right to buy and sell
The earth for private gain
By theft and murder
They took the land
Now everywhere the walls
Spring up at their command

They make the laws
To chain us well
The clergy dazzle us with heaven
Or they damn us into hell

We will not worship
The God they serve
The God of greed who feed the rich
While poor folk starve

We work we eat together
We need no swords
We will not bow to the masters
Or pay rent to the lords
Still we are free
Though we are poor
You Diggers all stand up for glory
Stand up now

From the men of property
The orders came
They sent the hired men and troopers
To wipe out the Diggers' claim
Tear down their cottages
Destroy their corn
They were dispersed
But still the vision lingers on

You poor take courage
You rich take care
This earth was made a common treasury
For everyone to share
All things in common
All people one
We come in peace
The orders came to cut them down
\end{verbatim}
\end{center}
1. Juan Eusebio Nieremberg
   *De la diferencia entre lo temporal y lo eterno*

2. Maestro de Caquiatiri
   *Inferno*
   Dibujo / Drawing / Zeichnung: Quirin Bäumler

3. Eduardo Molinari / Archivo Caminante
   *Los niños de la soja*

4. Anónimo
   *Imposición de la casulla a San Ildefonso*

5. Karl Marx School of the English Language /
   David Riff / Dmitry Gutov
   *The Rosy Dawn of Capital*

6. Lucas Valdés
   *Retrato milagroso de San Francisco de Paula*

7. Chto Delat
   *The Tower: Songspiel*

8. Anónimo
   *Felipe V, convertido en Santiago Matamoros*

   Lucas Valdés
   *Santiago batallando con los Moros*

   Anónimo
   *Antonio López de Quiroga*

9. Marcelo Expósito
   *143.353 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados)*

10. Gaspar Miguel de Berrio
    *Descripción del Cerro Rico e Imperial Villa de Potosí*

11. Harun Farocki
    *Das Silber und das Kreuz*

12. Anónimo
    *Plano y perspectiva del horno en que se había sacado azogue de la mina de Santa María de Chilapa, en casa del oidor de México*

13. Anna Artaker
    *WORLD MAP*

14. Alejandro Duránd
    *Máquina hidráulica o vestidura para cubrirse un hombre dentro del agua*

15. A) Padron de los Yndios Yanaconas ... que residen en esta villa de Potosí Provincia de Porco
    B) Padron de los Yndios Yanaconas ... residentes en la Parroquia San Lorenzo
    C) Padron de los Yndios Forasteros de agregados en el curato de Siporo
    D) Sumario de las Personas a quien van repartidos Yndios que son los Siguientes
    E) Carta de la “gran confusion en la cobranza de Tassas, y entero de la Mita de Potosí”

16. Ines Doujak
    *Eviva el cotillo*
    *Witches*

17. Maestro de Caquiatiri
    *Muerte*
    Dibujo / Drawing / Zeichnung: Quirin Bäumler

18. Anónimo
    *Virgen del Cerro*

19. María Galindo / Mujeres Creando
    *Ave María, lleno eres de Rebeldía*

20. Anónimo
    *Las Novicias*

21. Anónimo
    *Virgen de la Natividad*

22. Elvira Espejo
    *Camino de las Santas*

23. Luis Niño
    *Virgen de Candelaria de Sabaya*

24. Rogelio López Cuenca
    *Mapa de Mataró*

25. Anónimo
    *La flagelación de Jesús*
Index Color Plates

13. John Barker / Max Jorge Hinderer / Jorge Hurtado Gumucio
   NOID: The Long Memory of Cocaine

18. CVA (TIPPA)
   Crisis Chronology

19. Melchor Maria Mercado
   Álbum de paisajes, tipos humanos y costumbres de Bolivia (1841–1869)

18. Matthijs de Bruijne
   1000dreams.org

20. Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers

25. Anónimo
   Santísima Trinidad

26. León Ferrari
   1492–1992. Quinto Centenario de la Conquista
   Sin título

27. Francisco Moyen
   El Cristo de las cruces

28. Anónimo
   La Masacre de Nagasaki

29. Alice Creischer / Christian von Borries / Andreas Siekmann
   Dubai – Erweiterte Horizonte: Die Museen schaffen eine neue Öffentlichkeit

30. Melchor Pérez Holquin
   Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí

31. Sally Gutiérrez Dewar
   Grabación del cuadro Entrada del Virrey Morcillo en Potosí

31. Lager
   Ethnologisches Museum

31. Konstanze Schmitt
   Día de la Hispanidad

31. PRPC (Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales)
   Sin título

32. Mariano Florentino Olivares
   Vista del Cerco de la ciudad de La Paz, 1781

33. Christian von Borries
   The Dubai in Me

50. Atribuido a / ascribed to / vermutlich Juan Ramos
   Amor Divinus

50. Monika Baer
   Amor Divinus (Copia / Copy / Kopie)

50. Hermanus Hugo
   Pia desideria emblematis, elegiis et affectibus SS. Patrum illustre

21. Juan Ramos
   Triunfo del Nombre de Jesús

31. Konstanze Schmitt / Stephan Dillemuth / Territorio Doméstico
   Triunfo de las domésticas activas

22. Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala
   El Primer Nueva Corónica y Buen Gobierno

55. Isaías Griñolo
   Mercado Energético Puro

23. Zhao Liang
   Petitioners

24. Maestro de Calamarca
   Ángeles arcabuceros

152

Sonia Abián
   El Aparatoángel
Principio Potosí

Existe una acumulación originaria que sólo existen derechos humanos para hacerlo humano. ¿Cómo podemos cantar el canto en la tierra?
COLOR IANAZEDO. Ay, que por siempre he de arder. V/n, ay, quien corresponde.
AY QUIEN BOLEVER, ay, que grito, y me responde, ay, que á Dios nunca has de
The discovery of gold and silver in America, 
the exploitation, enslavement, and extermination of masses 
of the aboriginal population,

the beginning of the uprooting and killing 
of the last Indians,

the bringing of Africans into a system for the commercial hunting of 
black slaves, organized the long drawn 
of the era of capitalist production.

D. Oteo 10
Maquina hidranteo que positura para cubrirse un hombre dentro del agua.

Este es el vestido a efeco cotejado que se ponen lebe para la armazon

De Capuzas armades y Calzones de piel interior.

A el Cuerpo

B La trompa o abertura, de cuerda que detiene para que aspire mientras la biste el hombre de los pies.

Después de vestido

C. D. Tulos o Canices flesibles para la respiracion

E. Jueelos Con que se arropa el cuerpo por mas de las Canices a la cual pide el otro 3Juan. Hien la respiracion, con la Canices vestiption que necesita.

F. F. Contapers con las de abor por la vuelta del lacoo

G. Bordo Con los puntos de fies en los dos extremos así como para afirmar con pura defensa de la sucesa Marinas.

Con esta Maquina. Entre el lacoo al fondo del mar la laca Tropa. Brazos de agua, apantado de sus Contactos que a forman unos las cuillas pendientes de un hilo, que 3Las a la protrasia las que sonllan de flomo en cantidades y que quedan de la frente al lacoo. Al cual con trupos la hasta y la quiera.
Padrón delos Indios
Forasteros que con el Título de Vá
conas del Rey, y por esto quedan agregados en este Pueblo para que asistan, a las obligaciones como los originarios:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nombre</th>
<th>años</th>
<th>SEXO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Alanis</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Alvarado</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Aguilera</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Acosta</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alonso Bautista</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ave María
llena eres
de rebeldía
Mujeres
Creando

Principio Potosí
La imagen muestra una escena religiosa con figuras sAGRadas, likely relacionadas con la historia o cultura de la región. La imagen puede ser interpretada como una representación artística de eventos o personajes importantes en la historia de la zona. La iluminación y los colores están cuidadosamente seleccionados para resaltar ciertos aspectos de la escena. En la parte inferior, hay detalles que parecen ser inscripciones o firmas, posiblemente indicando el autor o el lugar donde se realizó la obra. La ubicación precisa de la imagen no está claramente indicada en el texto proporcionado.
Ave María
llena eres de rebelión

Nuestra
Granada
NOID
The Long Memory of Cocaine

Texts by John Barker, Max Jorge Hinderer and Jorge Hurtado
La 3PCE cultiva el entorno de excepción cultural.
CUIDAD FÍSICA /
FÍSICAS

De mínimo formato. Que me ejan suerte. Cuando me piden. Cuando nos juntas. Cuando nos juntas.


PRPC Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales SEVILLA
www.prcp-e-sevilla.org
Donde la BIACS presenta la cultura como una celebración excepcional

La PRPC afirma el estado de excepción cultural
Principio Potosí

Ensayos, Entrevistas y Fuentes / Essays, Interviews and Sources / Essays, Interviews und Quellen
The Gazprom Tower Project: Everything Changes for the Better!

Dmitry Vorobyev and Thomas Campbell

What follows is an attempt—in mid-story—to briefly capture some of the key moments in the attempt by the Gazprom corporation and St. Petersburg city hall to build a 403-meter-high skyscraper near the downtown area of the city, an UNESCO World Heritage Site. At present, no one knows for certain why Russia’s economic and political powers that be have decided to erect a building that will certainly have a negative impact on the city’s historic (low-rise) appearance. Many tower opponents argue that the tower is a symbolic or vanity project for the ruling elite, which, like other newly wealthy “Asian despots” (in the Middle East and East Asia), wants to visualize its more or less unchallenged power in this way. In reality, the conflict is more interesting because this as-yet-nonexistent skyscraper has generated a highly divisive debate (verging on low-scale partisan warfare) on such questions as historical preservation, economic and architectural modernization, and the role of political institutions and “civil society” in deciding these issues.

The tower controversy has revealed the class and ideological fault lines in Petersburg society: marginalized opposition parties pitted against the new nomenklatura represented by Vladimir Putin’s United Russia party; conservative local architects versus international architecture superstars; romantic but mostly powerless connoisseurs of the city’s almost-sacred “cultural legacy” (the “intelligentsia”) against fellow citizens who see the skyscraper as a short circuit into a future seemingly denied by the weight of so much “dead” (built) history.

The focus of this conflict is a small island in the mouth of the Okhta River, where it empties into the Neva River. At present, a visitor to the site will be greeted by a 10-meter-high fence bearing the inscription, “Okhta Center: The Impossible Is Possible.” Behind this fence, archaeologists sift through the buried ruins of two pre-Petrine Swedish fortresses, while a group of workers and engineers supervised by the Dubai-based firm Arabtec Construction prepares the site for construction of the tower, which is scheduled to be completed in 2012 as the first phase of the so-called Okhta Center development.

This ambitious development project was conceived in 2004 as a joint venture between Gazprom Neft, a subsidiary of Gazprom, and the city hall. Gazprom was formed from the Soviet gas ministry in 1989 as a partly state-owned company and has since that time served as the flagship of the new Russia’s natural-resources-fuelled economic revival and as a springboard for the political elite, having produced a prime minister (Viktor Chernomyrdin) and a president (Dmitry Medvedev) from among its former chairmen.

Our story begins, however, with a loophole in Russian legislation that allows companies to register and pay taxes in a municipality other than where their production facilities are located. In 2004, Gazprom began establishing a presence in St. Petersburg. It invested in a major reconstruction of the city’s central heating system, leased a large plot of land in the Okhta neighborhood as a future site for its subsidiaries, and bought the controlling stake in the city’s premier league football club, Zenit (which patriotically won the UEFA Cup in 2008). Petersburg had already started at this time to reorient its economic policy, luring such major foreign firms as Ford and Nissan to build plants in the area by offering them substantial tax breaks. The city also set out to court the petroleum company Sibneft (recently acquired by Gazprom and subsequently renamed Gazprom Neft) to move its registration from Omsk (in Siberia) to Petersburg. This process took almost two years to complete. In the meantime, Gazprom cemented this friendship by proposing the development of a 300,000-square-meter office complex on the Okhta with a 300-meter-high skyscraper as its centerpiece. The proposal was immediately pounced upon by the city’s town planning council, who argued that a building of this size would be at odds with the city’s new height-zoning regulations, which in part were dictated by the obligations it had undertaken as a World Heritage Site. Gazprom chair Alexei Miller urged the council to “wake up”: “In the past few decades, no internationally significantly architectural landmark has been built in our city.” The debate was thus instantly (and, perhaps, falsely) framed as a standoff between out-of-touch “conservatives” and forward-looking “modernizers.”

In 2006, Petersburg governor Valentina Matviyenko succeeded in luring Sibneft/Gazprom Neft away from Omsk by working out a deal in which a substantial portion of its tax payments would be rerouted by the city into various “strategic investment” projects, including construction of the so-called Gazprom City complex and a new stadium for Gazprom-owned FC Zenit. When the city’s legislative assembly discussed this scheme as a bill, opposition parliamentarians dubbed it a gigantic “tribute.” Matviyenko and Miller were undeterred by such criticism, however. Although the city had initially agreed to partly fund Gazprom City, it now planned to wholly subsidize construction.

Events then begin unfolding quickly. An invitation-only competition for the overall design of the complex (with the skyscraper as an obligatory element) was announced. The results were presented at an exhibition in the Academy of Arts. Visitors to the show were handed ballots and encouraged to vote for their favorite project; those who could not make it to the show were allowed to vote online at the newly created Gazprom City website. In reality, a jury of Gazprom and city officials and celebrity architects was to have the final say, but the whole process was marred by scandal when three of the four architects (Norman Foster, Kisho Kurokawa, and Rafael Viñoly) quit the jury, citing the incompatibility of the projects presented with the city’s historic (Unesco-protected) skyline. The UK-based firm RMJM was awarded the design contract. Their copywriters described the firm’s concept in ethereal terms: “RMJM’s designs for the development propose a new spire for the city. The inspiration for the design comes from the concept of energy in water—the site is located on the River Neva, with the form of the building deriving its shape from the changing nature of water, ever changing light, reflections, and refraction. The five-sided tower twists as it rises to delicately touch the sky.”

Many Petersburgers misunderstood this bit of poetry, however. In addition to vigorous debates in the press and harsh criticism from local architects and well-known cultural figures such as filmmaker Alexander Sokurov and Hermitage Museum director Mikhail Piotrovsky, the proposed skyscraper sparked a series of protest actions by grassroots environmental and preservationist activists, as well as open letters and petitions to Putin, Matviyenko, and other high officials—a campaign that continues to this day. The liberal Yabloko party submitted a petition for a citywide referendum on the project, which was rejected (this would be the first of five such unsuccessful attempts). Yabloko would pay for this active stance by being ejected from the ballot for the upcoming elections to the legislative assembly.

In 2007, Gazprom showed that it was serious about its intentions to build a skyscraper. It demolished the existing buildings at the proposed construction site, inked a contract with RMJM, and announced tenders for an engineering and geological study and general planning and construction
work. It also began rebranding the development, changing the name from Gazprom City to Okhta Center. The newly minted Okhta Center (sporting a fresh-blue stylized pentagon logo that alluded both to the buried Nyenskans fortress at the site and RMJM’s design for the tower) was no longer an “administrative and business” complex, but a “social and business” center—in Miller’s words, an “entire micro-city” that would feature, in addition to office space, a contemporary art museum, skating rink, theater, and sculpture park. Under pressure from legal challenges to the project, however, the city revised the financing scheme. It would now split the costs of construction, although Gazprom would retain property rights to the tower.

This was not the only challenge. The World Monuments Fund placed Petersburg’s “historic skyline” on its watch list. Living City, a grassroots preservation movement bade partly in response to the threat of the tower, collected over 11,000 signatures on a petition against construction of Okhta Center and overturning the city’s existing building height restrictions. Unesco’s World Heritage Committee demanded that city authorities temporarily halt the project and threaten to exclude the city from its listing if it went ahead with construction.

Forty-nine prominent members of the city’s intelligentsia published an open letter calling on Matviyenko to give up the project. On September 8, 2007, several thousand Petersburgers took part in a March to Save Petersburg, the first of its kind. (To lessen its impact, authorities restricted the march route to a relatively sleepy neighborhood at a remove from the bustling downtown area.) Members of the town planning council spoke out against the tower after a presentation by RMJM architects, but in the minutes of the meeting, prepared by the city’s head architect, Alexei Viktorov, it was reported that the council as a whole approved the project; this “fact” was reported widely by Okhta Center’s PR office. This tactic—in which criticism of the project are either espoused as (tacit) “support” or interpreted as wrong-headedness or deliberate political sabotage—would become a trademark of the campaign to promote the skyscraper. For example, after Okhta Center representatives met with a Unesco delegation in Moscow, it was reported (by Okhta Center’s spinmeisters) that Unesco had agreed to hold regular consultations as the project was implemented. Another tactic that appeared in the arsenal of the pro-skyscraper forces was a massive rhetorical devaluation of the city (as an “open air museum” that could not cope with the demands of modern economic development) and the Okhta neighborhood (which was labeled “depressive”); the only recipe for this dilemma was, allegedly, the construction of the tower. In the words of RMJM architect Tony Kettle, Okhta Center was “more than a skyscraper”; its true purpose was to “regenerate” the neighborhood and the city. Moreover, beginning in 2007, Gazprom and the city launched an equally massive campaign featuring billboards, planted newspaper articles, tweaked opinion surveys, and TV spots starring local celebrities such as Marlinsky Opera director Valery Gergiev.

The apothecary of this outpouring of “popular” support for the tower would be an open letter, in 2009, to President Medvedev, signed by forty-two cultural figures and pop stars: “The designers of Okhta Center have succeeded in creating a project that combines the centuries-long traditions of Petersburg architecture and innovative ideas. ... Thanks to the construction of Okhta Center, Petersburg will become the business capital of Russia. Major global companies will be able to locate their headquarters in the city, and Petersburg will receive additional investments, which can also be used to preserve the cultural and historical legacy we all take pride in and cherish.” Similarly, in advance of the scandalous September 2009 public hearing to discuss whether city hall should grant Okhta Center an extraordinary height-zoning exemption (during which tower opponents were beaten by “security guards” and subjected to multiple searches by police), local “activist” Marat Kozlov and his Right Bank organization submitted 20,000 signatures to Governor Matviyenko in support of the tower. During this same period, previously inconsequential “social organizations” began to plead with the governor to make their dreams come true: “It is wrong to take the future away from Petersburg and its residents. The city has to live and evolve. Moreover, the city must be a comfortable place to live for all its citizens without exception.”

This impression of grassroots enthusiasm for the skyscraper was reinforced by the periodic publication of opinion surveys conducted by local sociologist Roman Mogilevsky, which invariably showed that the majority of Petersburgers were behind the project and that their ranks were swelling every day. (These results have been challenged both by other sociologists who question Mogilevsky’s methodology, and by a number of other surveys that showed that, at most, a third of Petersburgers unequivocally favor the project.) It was no wonder, then, that Okhta Center felt this mostly unseen army should be embodied in living flesh. At the first public hearing on the project, in June 2008, half the seats in the hearing room were occupied by paid “extras,” who were recruited through local casting agencies. Who is this trick of advance intelligence on anti-tower activists attempted to stop the hearing by crowding the podium and refusing to leave. After a half-hour standoff, OMON riot police entered the hall and dispersed the activists, detaining several of them in the process.

This artificially induced landslide of grassroots support made it seem natural that the city and Gazprom would make a series of decisions that seemingly kept the skyscraper on track for completion in 2012. Among these was the awarding of the engineering design and building contract to Arabtec Construction, a Dubai-based firm most famous for its work on the world’s tallest building, the Burj Khalifa. Matviyenko declared her approval of Dubai’s construction practices after a visit there in March 2008: “Of course, it’s summer there year round. Of course they have a cheap workforce there, and there is the sheik, who signs off on a project one day and the next day building begins. We don’t have that here yet. Nevertheless, it should give us pause for thought! We should carefully study this know-how and use all the positive elements in our work.”

To an outsider observer, it might appear that the whole conflict centers around an aesthetic issue—that is, whether a twenty-first-century skyscraper should rise up on an exhilaratingly flat nineteenth-century neoclassical preserve. From this point of view, it makes sense that Russia’s culture minister and the speaker of the upper house of its parliament both publicly joined the growing opposition to the tower in the past year. But in fact, other, nonaesthetic obstacles have appeared in the path of what Matviyenko once approvingly described as “aggressive development.” The first such obstacle is her own city hall, which has in a matter of a few years gone from full financing of the project to selling off all its shares in the development company and leaving the cost of construction entirely to Gazprom. Unesco also continues to threaten the city with removal from its heritage listing. Archaeologists, who claim to have uncovered a “Petersburg Troy” at the site, demand an end to the project in order to wholly preserve these previously unknown treasures. Local experts have challenged the strange argument made by Okhta Center and RMJM that the tower would not impinge on many of the city’s “postcard” views by showing in fact that the building would be sorely visible from most of these vantage points. These same experts have also studied the project’s recently published economic feasibility study and concluded that it has little
chance of commercial viability. Meanwhile, oppositionists and residents continue to press forward with lawsuits that question the legality of the city's waiver of height regulations for the tower, the September 2009 hearing, the project's financing, and the re-zoning of the historical preservation area protecting the fortress remains. Finally, Petersburg's beleaguered civil society continues to make its presence felt. A second rally to save the city, in October 2009, brought out the largest crowd for a political demonstration in recent times; the protestors demanded Matviyenko's resignation, seeing her as the tower's most vigorous lobbyist. Activists have also employed several "new media" tactics in their campaign against Petersburg's top-down "modernizers": from a "wear a blue ribbon" drive to symbolize their defense of the city's skyline, and a pirate webcam mounted on a nearby building to provide 24-hour monitoring of the building site, to an electronic petition on the site Bashne.net ("No to the tower"). Confusingly, state-controlled Channel One has recently entered the fray with a series of broadcasts portraying the tower in a negative light. More confusingly, the speaker of parliament's lower house, a top United Russia official, has also weighed in on the question, suggesting that construction be moved to a less controversial location in the city.

Nevertheless, Gazprom continues to force the project, thus demonstrating the apparent truth of architect Tony Kettle's words that Okhta Center is "more than a skyscraper." Or, as Alexei Miller told a newspaper reporter in 2008: "We will build this project! We will build this project, I simply promise you! You understand, I simply promise you: we will build this project! I promise you—and we'll invite you! We will build this project." It thus becomes harder for Gazprom and the city to manipulate public opinion, and their logic of the automatic infrastructural improvements the tower would bring ("Everything changes for the better") looks increasingly hollow.3

We should not end on this farcical note, however. In fact, such architectural mega-projects, even when they are not realized, act like a battering ram on fragile social, political, and economic realities. Mega-projects like Okhta Center simplify the permissions procedures for a multitude of smaller-scale but no less destructive redevelopment projects; they set a precedent for similar zoning "exemptions" and encourage the city to redraw historic preservation districts and public green spaces to suit the needs of "investors." Major investors like Gazprom make city hall dependent on this model of modernization and thus further the spread of the corrupt practices that emerge to force it through.

Despite its flirtation with "public input" (which in this case began with the "popular ballot" on the winning design for the project), the administration is thus compelled to seek a monopoly on decision-making and questions of public aesthetic taste. Finally, the brutal modernization embodied by the Gazprom tower project thus enables a paradigm shift that occludes and delegitimizes other paradigms, from a seriously conceived and consistently implemented historical preservationism to a grassroots-driven regeneration that would be able to embrace real architectural innovation.

1 "Everything Changes for the Better" is the current slogan of the Okhta Center development company.
2 In 2009, the BBC's Panorama program painted a slightly different picture during its expose of the horrible living conditions of Arabtec's Immigrant workers in Dubai. "Sewage had leaked out all over the camp, and workers had to create a network of stepping stones to cross it and get back to their accommodation blocks. One toilet block had no water supply and the latrines were filled with piles of raw feces. ... The authorities also reported that the camp was overcrowded with 7,500 laborers sharing 1,248 rooms with poor ventilation."
3 Especially after this past winter in which city authorities proved unable to perform such elementary functions as snow removal. It is no wonder that Marat Kozlov and his Right Bankers recently set out to clear snow in an Okhta neighborhood playground, and that Okhta Center's website trumpeted this triumph of civic virtue.

143.353 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados)
Marcelo Expósito

"Donde hay resistencia, allí se debe filmar"
(SERGE Daney, a propósito de Straub/Huillet)
"También otros tienen ojos y están atónitos"
(El modelo Antígona de Sófocles, Bertolt Brecht)

El 8 de octubre del año 2000, un desconocido Emilio Silva Barrera publicó un artículo en La Crónica de León, un modesto diario local español. Su título era: "Mi abuelo también fue un desaparecido". El artículo anunciaba que el autor tenía la intención de abrir la fosa común anónima y sin localización precisa donde yacían enterrados su abuelo y otros trece civiles asesinados por pistoleros de Falange en octubre de 1936, a pocos meses de comenzar la Guerra Civil española. Se cumplen ahora por tanto diez años de ese acontecimiento menor que hubiera de precipitar con el tiempo lo que actualmente estamos viviendo en España como un verdadero terremoto psicosocial: el movimiento que se denomina a sí mismo de "recuperación de la memoria histórica", cuyos dos resultados más ostensibles vienen siendo, por una parte, el haber desencadenado una oleada de exhumaciones de restos de desaparecidos en la primera década de la represión organizada por los militares sublevados contra el gobierno de la República Española; y, por otra parte, el debate público —que no se había dado nunca antes en la historia española de manera tan intensiva, ni siquiera a lo largo de los 35 años de postdictadura y democracia formal que median entre la muerte del general Franco y la actualidad— sobre la necesidad de investigar la verdad de los mecanismos precisos que adoptó la represión fascista en la España de las décadas de 1930 y 1940, de aplicar la justicia frente a la inmensidad de los crímenes cometidos —que no pueden ser calificados sino como crímenes contra la humanidad— y de restablecer el sufrimiento infligido a las víctimas durante décadas con una reparación.

Cuando una fosa común se excava, cuando el cadáver de un desaparecido en España se exhuma, una poderosa imagen se materializa. Las imágenes mostradas con frecuencia en reportajes televisivos, en crónicas periodísticas o en textos de estilo literario, suelen poner el énfasis en la sacudida emotiva
que desencadenan en las personas el encuentro con un familiar al que se hizo desaparecer. Es una forma de buscar la empatía del espectador o del lector mediante la identificación sentimental con las familias afectadas durante sesenta o setenta años por los crímenes sobre los que se fundó la última dictadura militar española. Pero conviene no dejar de observar la forma en que comúnmente se describe el proceso de localización de fosas y se documenta una exhumación en los canales de información de los que se han dotado las numerosas asociaciones por la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica que han surgido en todo el país: mientras que, por un lado, los datos se organizan y se expresan de manera general con empeñada exhaustividad enumerativa y las imágenes documentan casi con distanciamiento y frialdad, por otro lado, se tiende a multiplicar los puntos de vista, el número de voces que hablan desde la multiplicidad afectiva pero sin ser reductibles a la mera empatía emocional. El efecto de sentido que ese modo narrativo produce consiste en hacer observar de manera minuciosa un proceso que requiere la puesta en común de incondicionalidad de competencias y saberes, tanto especializados como informales, tanto escritos como orales de históricos, viejos testigos de los acontecimientos, familiares y amistades implicadas, médicos forenses, abogados, antropólogos, arqueólogos, colaboradores voluntarios procedentes de todo el mundo, y un largo etcétera. Así, lo que se muestra es la representación compleja y no simplificada del proceso que lleva a un desaparecido regrese, no para conducir inquisición, sino para restablecer una verdad: la de su existencia real, y para impugnar con ello una sostenida negación: la negación que la memoria colectiva española parece haberse autoimpuesto acerca de la dimensión alcanzada por los crímenes de las humanidades cometidos contra profesionales, militantes, simpatizantes, militares y civiles de izquierda, republicanos, revolucionarios, reformistas o progresistas, en España de las décadas de 1930 y 1940.

Se trata de un método de afectación de la conciencia del espectador fuera de cualquier identificación de corte humanista: sin la excusa de una imposta aproximación emotiva con las víctimas, quien observa este proceso, viéndose ubicado a una distancia justa frente a los datos y las imágenes, queda fuertemente interpelado así: ¿qué actitud adoptar y qué hacer hoy frente a esa verdad revelada?

La imagen del esqueleto de un desaparecido español asesinado por la violencia fascista que aparece exhumado de una tumba NN en cualquier punto del territorio peninsular, condensa a la perfección la tensión apócrifa entre mecanismo y política que contiene la visión de las Tesis sobre la Historia de Walter Benjamin. Aun siendo conocida, merece la pena detenernos en ella por un instante.

Articular el pasado históricamente no significa reconocer "tal y como propiamente ha sido". Significa apoderarse de un recuerdo que relampaguea en el instante de un peligro. Al materialismo histórico le toca retener una imagen del pasado como la que inmediatamente se presenta al sujeto histórico en el instante mismo del peligro. Y éste amenaiza tanto el patrimonio de la tradición como a sus propios receptores. Para uno y otros el es uno y el mismo: a saber, convertirse en instrumento de la clase dominante. Así, en cada época es preciso inten.tar arrancar de nuevo la tradición al conformismo que siempre se halla a punto de avasallarla. El Mesías no viene solamente como el Redentor; viene como vencedor del Anticristo. El don de encender la chispa de la esperanza sólo es inherente al historiográfo que esté convencido de que ni siquiera los muertos estarán seguros ante el enemigo si es que éste vence. Y ese enemigo no ha cesado de vencer.

Esta tesis de Benjamin elabora una inestable cadena de equivalencias: el recuerdo es revolucionario en la medida en que rescata un fragmento del pasado que se encuentra en peligro; ese rescate, cuando sucede, cobra forma en una imagen que relampaguea de repente como la chispa de una esperanza: un foco en el pesimismo que redime el presente y a la vez derrota al enemigo histórico de clase. Y esa derrota comienza a infligirse, para cerrar el argumento, en el momento en que se logra arrancar de las manos de la clase dominante lo que ha de ser recordado, pues se encuentra sometido o bajo amenaza de que se lo haga desaparecer. La relación entre pasado y presente deja así de ser lineal, en contra de lo que querría el historicismo común. Por el contrario, el pasado sobredetermina el presente tanto como éste tiene la potestad de extraer de aquel imágenes redentoras o memorias cuya evocación alberga la potencia de resultar revolucionaria, ejerciendo así una redención retrospectiva que no repite ni imita, sino que actualiza el pasado en el presente. Tal y como afirma Emilio Silva en la entrevista incluida en nuestro video: entre los vivos y los muertos exhumados, a los que se hizo desaparecer en el pasado, se produce un diálogo. Un esqueleto revela a los vivos alguna verdad mediante una lengua corporeizada: un cráneo astillado por un disparo a corta distancia, un anillo de alianza, un recuerdo privado o un indicio para la posterioridad que se sostuvo apretado en un puño. Ahora bien: esa lengua incorpora también una paradoja: su propia dimensión epifánica. No siempre es fácil apercibirse con exactitud de aquello que los muertos expresan, ni de todo lo que pueden llegar a decírnos. Un recuerdo que relampaguea en el instante de un peligro opera sobre la conciencia igual que lo hace la visión de la cabeza del niño en el momento de su alumbramiento o la contemplación del cadáver de un desaparecido que es sacado inopinadamente a la luz: por mucho que racionalmente se conozca de antemano que están ahí agazapados, ocultos; por mucho incluso que su llegada se espere, haya sido anunciada o incluso buscada, el momento preciso de su aparición produce inevitablemente una conmoción: es un instante epifánico. Esa imagen refugia en el mismo tiempo es nefasta: produce un efecto que parece situarse más allá del verbo, en un estadio diferente al de la palabra. Parecería incluso ubicarse en un más allá de la política, dejándola por un instante en suspeso pero sin negarla: al contrario, esa conmoción es más bien una bisegra que articula la relación entre un proceso político previo, que la origina, y uno posterior, que ayuda a desencadenar de manera determinante.

143.352 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados) es un proyecto pensado inicialmente como contribución a la exposición Principio Potencia inaugurada en el Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía en mayo de 2010. Los argumentos centrales de dicha exposición (por ejemplo: la continuidad arquetípica del proceso de acumulación originaria entre los diferentes momentos posibles donde situar el inicio de la modernidad, y la manera en que se entrelazan indiscutiblemente modernización y colonia-lismo: esto es, la explotación y el genocidio como fundamentos de la modernidad capitalista) se sostienen mediante el siguiente modus operandi: se pidió a una larga lista de artistas y activistas de varias partes del mundo que realizaran proyectos que construyesen a una serie de obras (fundamentalmente pinturas) provenientes de varios momentos del Barroco español o del Barroco colonial latinoamericano. Nuestro proyecto en particular parte de confrontar simultáneamente el cuadro Santiago batallando con los moros (1690) del sevillano Lucas Valdés y una pintura de autoría anónima que data de mediados del siglo xvii, donde se representa al rey español Felipe V con los atributos de Santiago Matamoros. La primera de esas imágenes está depositada en España, en el Museo de Bellas Artes de Córdoba; y la segunda en América, en el Museo Nacional de Arte de La Paz. Esta ubicación de las imágenes a uno y otro lado del Atlántico permite a nuestro proyecto plantear la pregunta de cómo circular, actualizándose en el tiempo (histórico) y en el espa-
ció (geopolítico), ciertas articulaciones específicas entre el poder y las representaciones visuales; y situar esa pregunta en el momento en que se celebran los bicentenarios de la independencia de la mayoría de los actuales Estados-nación de América latina.

Para acometer una lectura de ambas pinturas —Santiago batallando con los moros del sevillano Lucas Valdés y Felipe V convertido en Santiago Matamoros de autoría anónima—, este proyecto ha recurrido a las herramientas principales de las que se ha servido el movimiento español de recuperación de la memoria histórica para implementar su peculiar “modelo Antígona”, modelo que consiste en multiplicar la desobediencia, tanto a la ley no escrita (el silencio sobre cómo hacemos cargo de la magnitud del genocidio perpetrado en los orígenes del franquismo) como a otras leyes escritas (por ejemplo, esa desobediencia exige explícita o tácitamente que se revoque la Ley de Amnistía dictada en 1977, apenas dos años después de la muerte del dictador, impuesta de facto como una ley de “punto final” para todo tipo de responsabilidad individual en los crímenes por motivos políticos cometidos por los aparatos represivos durante los primeros años de la dictadura militar y sus prolegómenos en la Guerra Civil). Una desobediencia practicada a través de las herramientas que no son otras que la excavación y la exhumación. ¿Qué significa, por tanto, en ese mismo sentido, exhumar en una imagen? ¿Qué tipo de verdad aparece o retorna cuando se exhuma de ella un indicio, un fragmento, un significado anteriormente enterrado, silenciado o hecho desaparecer? Es por ello que hemos decidido trasladar inmediatamente nuestro punto de vista hacia el sitio originario del mito de Santiago, el mito que ha sido durante siglos el motor de una cierta idea de hispanidad: ese lugar es la Catedral de Santiago de Compostela, erigida sobre el enclavo donde supuestamente el apóstol —mano derecha de Jesús—, a quien la creencia popular atribuye incluso ser hermano del mismísimo Hijo de Dios —, fue enterrado con la cabeza cortada y colocada debajo de uno de sus brazos como resultado de su martirio en Palestina, tras haber invertido largos viajes y años de dedicación a la cristianización de la Península Ibérica. Hemos viajado hasta Compostela junto con otros varios miles de peregrinos de todo el mundo que hacen el camino durante el actual año jacobeo. Al profundizar en ese enclave fundacional, nuestro proyecto inicia un largo, sinuoso e irregular tránsito, que nos hace atravesar la construcción histórica del mito de un Santiago que ayuda a derrotar a los musulmanes en la “reconquista” de la península por parte de la cristianidad. Hemos
tomado como referencia originaria la primera imagen gráfica que se conoce de Santiago Matamoros, así como su representación escultórica instalada exactamente en el altar barroco de la Catedral, allí donde se estructura un eje vertical entre los supuestos restos del apóstol conservados en la cripta subterránea (abajo) y el óleo de Dios en el que confluyen los arcos de la bóveda principal (arriba). Hemos intentado entender así cuál es el arquetipo formal y simbólico (la estructura vertical ciega-tierra de la que desciende el Soldado de Cristo sobre un caballo blanco para ayudar a aniquilar a los infieles y enemigos de la cristianidad; el Santiago que porta una bandera y una espada con la que golpea sin piedad desde su montura, mientras cabalga, a quienes se ven arrollados por la cabalgadura, que yacen en el suelo) que hizo históricamente de Santiago un “modelo genocida” al transformarse en el Matamoros de la América colonizada.

Hemos observado el trabajo minucioso de limpieza del Santiago batallando con los moros de Lucas Valdés por parte del equipo de restauración del Museo Reina Sofía, para que el cuadro fuera expuesto en Principio Potosí; y, a través de la filiación familiar entre Lucas Valdés y su padre Valdés Leal, nos hemos detenido en el momento en que la pintura española constituye históricamente el epígrafe de las directrices emitidas por el Concilio de Trento para instaurar un uso de las imágenes artísticas que contribuyera a la restauración de la hegemonía católica en la Europa atravesada por el conflicto abierto por la Reforma Protestante. Apoteosis iconográfica barroca de la Contrarreforma versus iconoclasia protestante: la lucha ideológica en el seno de la representación visual. De las dos piezas clásicas de pintura barroca de Valdés Leal instaladas en 1672 en la Iglesia del Hospital de la Caridad de Sevilla, la primera —In ictu oculi— cita en su título un pasaje de la Primera Epístola de San Pablo a los Corintios: “En un instante, en un abrir y cerrar de ojos, los muertos serán resucitados incorruptos, y nosotros seremos transformados”; mientras que la segunda, Finis gloriae mundi (El fin de las glorias terrenales), representa un paisaje de cadáveres y esqueletos acumulados tanto en tumbas individuales como en fosas comunes; paisaje que reverbera en La procesión de la muerte de José Gutierrez Solana, pintado en 1930. Que esta pintura de Solana fuera incluida en el Pabellón de orientación moderna construido para representar a la República Española en la Exposición Internacional des Arts et Techniques dans la Vie Moderne de París de 1937, podría explicarse sin duda porque cierto eclectismo estético parecería responder adecuadamente al objetivo que ese pabellón tenía de hacer confluir el mayor número de fuerzas en el campo de la cultura, para producir así un artefacto de propaganda que ayudase a decantar la opinión pública y la ayuda de los gobiernos occidentales a favor de la República Española, atacada ferozmente por el levantamiento militar fascista desde un año atrás.

No obstante, una observación más detenida del pensamiento artístico-político del artífice del Pabellón, el joven comunista José Renau, nombrado con escasos veintinueve años de edad director general de Bellas Artes del gobierno de la República Española, nos permite extraer algunas conclusiones más complejas sobre el siguiente dilema: el porqué del eclecticismo formal —fotomontajes incrustados en muestras de artesanía y arte popular, abstracción junto a realismo, sincetismo de estilos moderno y barroco— de un pabellón que estaba inspirado claramente en un dispositivo vanguardista de propaganda tan radical como fue la arquitectura semótica del pabellón de la Unión Soviética para la Exposición Internacional de Prensa (Prensa) de Colonia en 1928, un trabajo colectivo diseñado y construido bajo la dirección de El Lissitzky. Un opúsculo publicado en el año 1937: “La función social del cartel”, nos da la clave. En él, Renau interviene contundentemente en los debates que en el área prosélita de la cultura se sostenían a propósito de cuáles serían las mejores maneras de contribuir, mediante las herramientas de la cultura, al sostenimiento del gobierno republicano en los prolegómenos de la Guerra Civil. La intervención de Renau ataca con fuerza al corazón del sentido común históricamente instalado sobre las relaciones entre arte, política y activismo social, según el cual la progresiva politización del arte habría de conllevar siempre el empobrecimiento de su exce- lencia estética. La entrada de la práctica artística en la contienda política, sobredeterminada en 1937 por la agresión golpista a la República y el ascenso de los fascismos europeos, de acuerdo con Renau, suponía una oportunidad, no para una simplificación, sino para una mayor complejización del lenguaje de la vanguardia. Mayor sofisticación que, en el caso del arte de propaganda español durante la Guerra Civil, debería lograrse mediante la articulación de tres elementos o la conjugación de tres diferentes materias primas: los logros experimentales de la vanguardia en su anterior fase autónoma, la eficacia en la comunicación de masas alcanzada por la publicidad comercial capitalista, y el anclaje en el imaginario singular de cada pueblo que, en el caso de España, Renau localizaba en la representación visual barroca, encontrando así en el Barroco un efi- caz precedente histórico de articulación desprejuiciada de arte y propaganda. En nuestro proyecto, un
lugar común visual de la lucha contra los fascismos europeos, el Guernica de Pablo Picasso, deja de ser el icono esencializado por el idealismo estético, para ser devuelto a su contexto (fue una de las obras principales producida ex profeso para el Pabellón republicano de 1937) y a su condición de artefacto de propaganda que, a la manera deseada por Renau, sincretiza la estructura de la representación barroca, el realismo antinaturalista del lenguaje de la vanguardia y la dimensión privilegiada del cine como medio de comunicación de masas.

Este proyecto, en definitiva, se plantea de un modo anti-idealtista la polémica histórica sobre las relaciones entre las imágenes y la política. Propone explorar sin tapujos de qué maneras las representaciones artísticas constituyen y pueden buscar constituir momentos y articulaciones materiales específicas de conflictos sociales, políticos y económicos. Opera mediante desplazamientos semánticos entre conceptos e imágenes: entre el anónimo de las tumbas y donde aún se encuentran masivamente las víctimas del genocidio franquista y la amplitud con que se señala el yacimiento de los restos del Patrón de España; entre la restauración como ejercicio de recuperación de imágenes pictóricas por el aparato museográfico y las restauraciones políticas o culturales (proponemos excavar en la imagen del Rey Juan Carlos I, designado por Francisco Franco en los años sesenta como su sucesor a la Jefatura de Estado, designación que avaló su retorno a España en los años ochenta convertido, no obstante, en un símbolo de la transición democrática; y del Guernica, un cuadro que originalmente pretendía ofrecer una imagen del asesinato masivo de civiles por parte de la internacional fascista europea que interviene en España para apoyar el genocidio del general Franco); entre las dos componentes de la gran doble negación instalada en la conciencia sociohistórica española: el genocidio colonial clásico y el genocidio fascista moderno.

***

El 22 de septiembre de 2008, la Plataforma de Víctimas de Desapariciones Forzadas por el Franquismo hizo entrega al Juez de la Audiencia Nacional española Baltasar Garzón de varias listas que componían un total de de 143.353 nombres de personas cuya desaparición durante la Guerra Civil y los primeros años de la dictadura militar se podía acreditar. Una puesta en común más sistemática de esas listas, así como la aplicación de criterios estándar en la definición de "víctima" y una acotación temporal estricta, acabó por redondear esa cifra: 123.000. En las fechas en que este proyecto se realiza, las Asociaciones para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica han localizado y excavado a lo largo de diez años en todo el territorio de España unas 150 fosas en las que se han encontrado los restos de aproximadamente 1.500 personas. La excavación que se muestra en este proyecto fue filmada en 2007, y tuvo lugar durante dos años en un terreno de 3.000 metros cuadrados de superficie del que fueron exhumados 309 cadáveres. Esa superficie se encuentra a unos metros del Monasterio de Uclés, sede histórica de la Orden de los Caballeros de Santiago, visitada por los Reyes Católicos para solicitar la ayuda del santo Matamoros para el sitio de Granada, último enclave musulmán en la Península: desde 1493 —el año posterior a la toma de Granada—, la expulsión de los judíos del territorio peninsular y la llegada a América de la expedición marítima capitaneada por Cristóbal Colón —son los propios Isabel y Fernando quienes administran esa Orden de Caballería. En 1496, tras estallar la Guerra Civil, el Monasterio fue asaltado por partidarios de la República y convertido en hospital del viejo Cuerpo Médico del Ejército Popular hasta el final de la guerra; fue en esa época cuándo el terreno de la hondona a los pies del Monasterio se convirtió en improvisado cementerio. Cuando las fuerzas golpistas tomaron la zona, el Monasterio se transformó en prisión donde fueron internados los representados políticos se ha documentado la muerte de 316 personas entre 1940 y 1943 con edades entre 3 y 72 años, de las cuales 160 fueron fusiladas y 156 murieron como consecuencia del hambre, los malos tratos, las torturas y la enfermedad sin asistencia médica. La Asociación para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica de Cuenca exhumó pacientemente todos los cadáveres, como quien tira, uno a uno, del brazo de quienes fueron arrojados a los pies de los caballos.

VERDAD

JUSTICIA

REPARACIÓN

Quinto capítulo de la serie Entre sueños. Ensayos sobre la nueva imaginación política, editado por Oriol Sánchez, edición de mano por Jonathan Darby y Jordi Juncadella.
cal narration has been constructed. In Spain nobody spoke about Baroque. Wolfflin, Burckhardt, Panofsky, the German and English historians began to ask: What is this strange thing that was happening between the Renaissance and the Enlightenment in Southern countries? Wolfflin was the first one who described that issue in terms of Baroque. The Baroque definition comes from enlightened intellectual who somehow wanted to establish a new classical style, because there you had the style of the republic in France, because of the romantic national discourse in Germany, so all the Southern countries inhabited this term. The Spanish reception of the Baroque came along when Cuba and the Philippines were finally lost in 1898, so the whole Spanish empire disappeared.

Max Jorge Hinderer: The Spanish discourse about Baroque is historically related to the breakup of the Spanish colonial system?

Jorge Luis Marzo: In 1898 when the US took over Spanish colonies in Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Philippines, there was this deep reflection among the intellectuals in Spain. We had an empire; we lost the empire, and now? What can we call the old times? So, some intellectuals conceived the idea of the Baroque not as a style but as a thing that could have several facets. The idea of Baroque came along with very different things. Firstly, wars took Baroque all over the world; secondly, it was connected to the economy. So, war and economy were the cart tracks of Baroque. But Baroque was also definitely the first national style in history. It came along with the Spanish empire as a kind of first ever global nation branding.

Max Jorge Hinderer: You describe Baroque as something that is posthumous to the epoch of nation branding that we are trying to define.

Jorge Luis Marzo: Absolutely. The intellectuals in Germany and England at the end of the eighteenth century began to speak about the “bad style.” They didn’t call it Baroque. The classic terms weren’t appropriate and so were not applied. It was totally out of reason, like an accumulation of things without any order. It was a negative reaction against Spain, against these feudal countries dominated by absolutism, religion, by insanity, by poverty.

Andreas Siekmann: By Catholicism.

Jorge Luis Marzo: Exactly.

Correspondence of July 9: Can you tell us about the *Legenda Negra* as a strategic instrument of other European forces, to delegitimize the colonial governance of Spain?

*Legenda Negra* was an effort made by France, the Netherlands, and England to depict a horrifying picture of colonial Spain, which was mostly true, but nothing different from the activities of those countries in their own colonies. Europe has always used Spain as an alibi to misdirect its own responsibilities in the creation of modern exploitation, often charged with behaving irrationally in opposition to modern economic values created by the Netherlands or England. Because Spain used most of the Andean and Mexican gold and silver to finance its wars in Europe, all this money went to bankers in Genoa or Antwerp and then to the rest of Europe.

That money bypassed Spain (Legenda Roja) is true but more because of a lack of a serious administration than from what was spent on loans and payrolls.

The amount of silver and gold that was poured into Spain forced some artisans to develop new skills. When the Bourbons took over the Spanish Monarchy and tried to implement a classicist and enlightened architecture by imposing work on stone instead of silver or gold, a big problem arose since few artists knew how to work with this material.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Would you say that from the perspective of Wolfflin or Burckhardt the idea of creating the Baroque was the idea to clean up their concept of Renaissance?

Jorge Luis Marzo: It was difficult for them as it is for us now, to create one single label for the whole thing and to reduce it to a style. You are confronted with a whole political cluster: the Jesuits, the Counter-Reformation, the Habsburg economic structure. ... On the other hand, a coherent definition was necessary in the struggle for a new national narrative, not only for Spain, but for the whole European intellectual discourse.

Alice Creischer: We should not leave out *Mestiza* America.

Correspondence of July 9: The idea of *mestiza*—even in the most racial terms, as José Vasconcelos showed in Mexico—has also been used to create social hegemony, to the point that now many Spanish-embedded intellectuals claim that America is *mestiza* because Spain had the same conditions at the end of the Middle Ages, since it was a combination of Christian, Muslim, and Hebrew societies. It is simply forgotten that Christians exterminated or expelled both Muslims and Jews between the fifteenth and seventeenth centuries. The fact that many traces from those cultures still pervade Spanish society must not conceal the fact that they were murdered in a perfectly designed plan.

Jorge Luis Marzo: *Mestiza* America is an expression that some nationalist intellectuals, especially from Mexico and Peru in the 1940s and 1950s, began to develop as a critique to these terms coming from Europe. In the nineteenth century many intellectuals from Mexico started to think about their culture as *mestiza*. The narrative of it is very simple. The Spanish conquerors didn’t bring their families to America; they had to have intercourse with the indigenous women. From this point on, the tradition is based on the idea that Spanish colonial rule was less racist than the others. Nobody speaks about rapes, about massive violation. But in South America, in Mexico and Peru these terms are reality for most of the people. They were born under certain circumstances as Spanish, Creoles, Indios, black people, Chinese people. If we see the narrative which is constructed upon this, we can join both terms again: *mestiza* and Baroque. *Mestiza* was the result of the conquerors. The Baroque system, which is a system of representation, is like glue. Nothing can be outside the circle. It is a system of total representation and administration, in which everything is written down.

Alice Creischer: Max mentioned—according to your description above—that in Bolivia *mestiza* is a very “excluding” term in the eyes of the bourgeois white class.

Max Jorge Hinderer: If you make a distinction between the *mestiza* population and the indigenous population, in Peru you may have 30 percent indigenous and 60 percent *mestizos* or more. In Bolivia you talk about 60 percent indigenous, and 30 percent *mestizos*. Our experience in Bolivia was that Baroque and *mestiza* is a mixture. Since the late 1970s the building of a new right-wing national identity after the 1952 Bolivian revolution was very much based on the idea of Baroque *mestiza*—at least in terms of art history. This Baroque *mestiza* became a cultural background for creating a national identity parallel to the neoliberal restructuring of the Bolivian economy and state system. In the middle of the 1980s this produced a new reception of Baroque *mestiza* on the backdrop of a “structural adjustment rhetoric,” liberalizing indigenous identity but subjecting it to middle/upper-class overall mentality.

Jorge Luis Marzo: Actually, Baroque and *mestiza* are a sort of contradiction. Baroque is a colonial style, never acceptable by neorepublics. *Mestiza* is the political legitimation to become a nation. Baroque *mestiza* is a political strategy. I do not think we can speak openly about social classes in America, because then we should speak about social mobility. And because there is no social mobility in all the most American countries, the term *mestiza* is so important. So this exercise is a political strategy to mix with people: Baroque is based on the same premises. And I guess in the 1960s the neoliberalists were going for that—in Mexico for sure.
Andreas Sickmann: How are these terms connected with the way that Spanish culture sees itself?

Jorge Luis Marzo: The national narration of Spain is a narration of loss. There was a big empire in the fifteenth, sixteenth century, which went downhill from the seventeenth century up until the present day, or at least until 1975. But the idea of culture is being retrieved from this imperial decline; culture was kept out of society in order to save it from deteriorating. This gap results from the fundamental strength of Baroque—the dissociation of culture from society. What is the discourse to really being able to project this idea of culture dissociated from society? It is the idea of an exception, which is so present in Mexico, Chile, and Argentina.

Andreas Sickmann: Think of Franco’s ideology about Spain as exceptional, as having followed its “vocación imperial,” as different from Europe—not modern, not part of progress. Hispanidad as a program to revitalize the Golden Century of the Empire, unifying all Spanish-speaking countries, was shared by Juan Perón and Augusto Pinochet.

Jorge Luis Marzo: Exactly, but how can we understand this idea of a gap between culture and society in the present? The Ministry of Foreign Affairs commands 82 percent of the Spanish government’s cultural budget rather than the Ministry of Culture. Culture means promoting an image of nation. In the 1980s the Spanish government created the slogan: “Culture will create citizens.” In other words, citizens are not the ones who create culture.

In Spain culture is based on foreign affairs and diplomatic parameters to an extreme extent. The idea is that Spain creates culture just by itself, just by being what it is. Baroque is about this; Baroque doesn’t need a social practice. It is by itself. It is essential.

Andreas Sickmann: There is a narrative of continuity between the narration of the Siglo de Oro and the contemporary cultural understanding of oneself?

Jorge Luis Marzo: I think these are two entangled situations. The gap between culture and society is the true continuity from the Baroque age until now. Antoni Tàpies was paid by Franco’s Ministry of Propaganda. Is Tàpies Franquist or not? Probably he was not Franquist, he de-ideologized himself to become part of the system. That is the problem.

Alice Creischer: Tàpies was part of the humanistic system of painting all over the world as a universal language, which was a part of the Cold War ideology. Perhaps we can trace it here to the universalism of the Baroque age. Which sounds very exotic for us at first, but might make sense in the Spanish context.

Jorge Luis Marzo: In the fifteenth century, Spain was a mixture of cultural and historical developments. The country had come from a seven-centuries-long civil war against the Muslims, had expelled the Jews and had reunited the two most powerful kingdoms (Castile and Aragon) in a sort of single entity, forming the basis of the first modern nation in Europe. At the beginning of the sixteenth century, the Spanish monarchy inherited the Habsburg Empire in the figure of Emperor Charles V, who boldly finished off some incipient forms of popular democracy. From that point on, Spain was devoted to counterattacking Lutheran reforms anywhere in Europe, fostering the Counter-Reformation by means of mercenary war and the religious politics of education and imagery born at the Vatican-driven Council of Trent between 1545 and 1563. Those circumstances were rapidly exported to America. The long-lasting tradition of war, religious intolerance, and a deep feeling of being ‘chosen by God’ to spread faith, mixed with the necessity of finding resources and markets, marked the path Spain took in America. Most of the humanist debates that were central to the religious conflicts in Europe at that time never found a place among the Spanish intelligentsia, except for some cases such as Erasmus, whose followers were always suspicious to the Inquisition. Probably the most important impact was Machiavelli who, with his theory of management of power, strongly affected the conquerors’ mentality: the ability to (mis)use information as a central device of power. The management of information in relationship with the new vast amount of land and people was central in order to establish both the origin of modern capitalist exploitation and modern cultural anthropology as a weapon to infiltrate the mentality of others. Accumulation of signs and data was the core of the new system, greatly enhanced by England and others in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. But besides that, we can see all along the strong and true emphasis of missionaries when teaching the people about the new city of God, described as cleansed of contamination and so on. The Baroque system is based on ethics. It is not practical. Culture is always more important than society. Culture is allowed to be mobile, society is not. And the Church was the only institution that could handle it.

Max Jorge Hinderer: What role does the Bicentenario play in the nation branding of Spain?

Correspondence of July 9: Spain is probably the only former European colonial country that has not yet developed a deep interpretation of its imperial past. ... There are several reasons for this situation: the increasing influence of Spain in American economies, which blurs critical perspectives; the traditional formalism of the Spanish Academy which is transmitted by the idea that what happened in America is just a natural extension of the motherland; or the lack of a real exchange of professors, students, and programs, beyond the fact that thousands of upper-class Latin American students attend Spanish universities.

Jorge Luis Marzo: The Bicentenario does not play an important role in Spanish nation branding. Some reflections about the colonial history will come up, if it is paid for by the government. Probably there will be some shows, but there will be no interest. The official message will be a universalization of the Spanish origins of South America. But everybody will forget the misdirections that were created by the national identity narratives in the twentieth century. I’ll give you a last example: Mexico. Go to the Anthropological Museum in Mexico City, which is the largest anthropological museum in the world. Look at all its exhibitions, the different sections and shows about the culture and past of Mexico. Then go to the street and exactly the same people are right there. You understand the gap? It is the ethics of remembrance. The ethics of memory. On the one hand, you are part of us, but in the museum. On the other, you are poor, and living your own culture.

The interview was conducted in Berlin, July 9/12, 2009.
My work begins as an investigation into the world-wide system of trade that began to unfold during the second half of the sixteenth century. The continually growing system of global trade that has developed since then has now been in existence for almost 450 years and has come to play an increasingly central role in people's lives all around the world. Many of the problems that people from all parts of the world are confronted with on a local level are connected to this macro-level development and for this reason can only be approached and solved on a large-scale, global level. What makes this problem even more complex is that the nexus of interconnections established by the global economy is becoming more and more closely knit. But the various groups and networks that share a common point of contact and exchange are often unequal partners, where frequently only one side stands to profit from the situation. For this reason this relationship must be characterized as being based on exploitation. In light of the pervasiveness of this situation, an in-depth analysis of this complex system and a conscious attempt to change it in the name of justice and equality is arguably one of the most important tasks that we are confronted with today.

My current work focuses on the late sixteenth century as a way of looking more closely into the origins of the present world economy. During the same period that this world order was established by trading power and economic dominance, a new "image of the world" also came into being in the form of world maps, which in more modern but not fundamentally different form are present all around us in atlases, school text books, and classrooms. While printed world maps in the age of Google Earth might now appear to be themselves historical, the two-dimensional representation of the Earth's surface still remains the underlying model for our way of imagining the form and layout of the oceans and continents.

The connection between the expansion of global trade and the broadening of the scope and progress made in cartography is evident: the system of worldwide transportation of commodities was made possible by merchant vessels that were dependent on exact nautical charts and maps. The precursors to this new scientific cartography that began to flourish during the sixteenth century were—next to classical sources and medieval world maps (mappae mundi)—primarily the so-called Portolan Charts—nautical maps, mostly of the Mediterranean and Black Seas, that, with the exception of some city names, were devoid of any information about the inland but rather concentrated on detailed descriptions of the geography and towns along the coast.

A further factor that influenced the modern worldview was progress made in the area of printing that, beginning with the last part of the fifteenth century, made widespread dissemination of the maps possible. We know that Martin Waldseemüller's world map, which was published in 1507 in all likelihood in Strasbourg, was produced in an edition of 1,000 copies (of which only one still exists today). It was the first map to show America as an independent continent separated from Asia by the Pacific Ocean and was also the map that is credited with giving America its name. Before the wide distribution of geographical maps facilitated by editions of this scale, most Europeans had no idea about what the world looked like outside of their mostly limited immediate experience.

One of the fundamental problems that has to be solved in creating a map of the world is the projection, that is the rendering of the three-dimensional spherical shape of the Earth onto the two-dimensional surface of the map. In 1569, Gerardus Mercator (1512–1594) published a world map in Duisburg that was entitled "Nova et aucta orbis terrae descriptio ad usum navigantium emendatam accomodata" (new and expanded description of the Earth improved to be used for navigation). With this map, Mercator presented a solution to the problem of projection that to this day is still in use and has shaped the image we have of our world. As one can already read in the title, the projection that would come to bear his name was made explicitly to improve nautical navigation.

The simplification consists in the so-called conformal projection of the map which means that both longitudinal and latitudinal lines are straight and perpendicular to each other. The distance between two points can be drawn on the map as a straight line, with longitudinal and latitudinal lines always crossed at the same angle. This way, the angle as read on the map can be directly used for navigation. For example, when crossing the Atlantic from Andalusia to Vera Cruz, one could draw the correct angle towards the destination on the map and then simply follow this course for the entire journey. While this so-called loxodrome or rhumb line is not the shortest path, it is the easiest one to navigate.

The disadvantage of the conformal projection, that to this day remains standard for nautical charts, is the resulting distortion of the Earth's surface. Only the equator is shown exactly as it actually is. All other latitudes on the map are represented as equally long even though their actual length in fact decreases the more distant they are from the equator. In order to preserve the constant angles of the conformal projection, the longitudinal lines must also be stretched along the north–south axis. This results in the lines and surfaces being more distorted the closer they are to either poles. Relatively close to the North Pole, the island of Greenland (2.2 million km²), for example, appears with the Mercator projection to be almost as large as the continent of Africa (30.3 million km²).

Through the distortions in the projection of the area, regions closer to the poles such as Europe appear in proportion larger than regions along the equatorial lines, which by and large run through developing countries. In response to this distortion, the German historian Arno Peters (1916–2002) pointed out that the Mercator projection corresponded to the Eurocentric worldview. In 1974, he presented his Peters projection oriented towards fidelity of area. The map, however, was mostly rejected by cartographers and has in general not caught on. In addition to the rise of seafaring made possible by improvements in the art of navigation and cartography during the second half of the sixteenth century, the silver from Potosí was the second precondition for the development of the Early Modern economic system.

The discovery of vast deposits of silver in the Cerro Rico and the founding of the city of Potosí in 1545 at the base of the "Rich Mountain" marked the beginning of silver production in Spanish America. The enormous significance of the exploitation of silver in Potosí becomes all the more clear when compared to European total production at the time. In the sixteenth century, in the years between 1523 and 1556, European silver production reached its peak with about 45 to 50 tons of silver per year. During this time, Potosí alone produced an estimated 60 tons per year more silver than all European regions combined. During the 1570s, this trend began to increase even more dramatically, with an estimated production between 1580 and 1610 growing to between 190 and 230 tons per year.

One of the conditions that made this enormous increase in yield possible was the organization of the forced labor system, the mita, that the Spanish
viceroy Francisco de Toledo established. The mita, which remained in power until 1700, forced the indigenous population to send 1/7 of their working population to work in the Potosí mines every year.

The second important measure that was put into place by the viceroy was the introduction of the amalgamation process developed in Mexico that relied on the use of mercury and significantly facilitated the extraction of silver, making it possible to exploit ores that contained even a very small amount of silver. After the peak of silver extraction at the beginning of the seventeenth century, production began to steadily decrease in Potosí to 150 tons (1620–40) and then to 130 tons (1640–50) but only in 1660 did it fall to below 100 tons. Not until the second half of the seventeenth century, more than 100 years after its foundation, did Potosí lose its position as the largest exporter of silver in the world to the Mexican silver mines in Zacatecas and Guanajuato (then a part of the viceroyalty of New Spain).

Up to that point, however, the silver from Potosí—extracted by tens of thousands of Indians working in forced labor under deadly conditions—was the basis for the development of global trade. Even though the quantity of silver extracted in the sixteenth century was less than during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries and cannot even be compared to production today, at the time in Europe it was truly a revolutionary innovation that fundamentally transformed the monetary system. The silver deposits from the Bolivian highlands put an end to the scarcity of precious metals that up to that point had inhibited world trade, finally providing sufficient material for the production of money. The silver that was multiplied through Spanish–American production was accepted in trade all around the world and made it possible for the Europeans to buy goods in markets outside of Europe, where there was no interest in trade with European goods. The availability of sufficient amounts of silver coins was thus one of the preconditions for the significant expansion of trade between the Americas and Asia (predominantly with India and China), making it possible for the Europeans to take part in trade in markets that had already been established in Asia.

The actual form material the silver spread throughout the world was the Spanish peso worth eight reales (real de a ocho). The peso was first minted in Spain as part of the coinage reform of 1497 but was at first of comparatively little importance. Only under Philip II's reign (1556–98) did the peso begin its triumphant advance through world history. His 8-reales coin showed the emblem of Spain on the front and on the back his coat of arms divided in four by a cross. In the "new world" the first pesos were minted in 1536 in Mexico City. Then, because of the increase in silver extraction in Potosí, the peso production increased enormously, and, beginning in 1575, coins were made directly in Potosí at the local mint, the "Casa Real de la Moneda." During the first half of the seventeenth century, between 5 and 6 million pesos were produced there every year. Due to these vast quantities, the quality of the coins was often rough. Because of this, the idea spread in Europe that the coins were minted while being shipped, and for this reason even came to be known as "ship's money."

A large portion of the silver coins was shipped first to Havana and from there across the Atlantic to Spain. Due to the many wars that Spain was engaged in at the time, the silver quickly flowed into the various areas where they were fighting. In addition to this, the negative balance of trade that Castile had with Italy, France, the Netherlands and England also led to the exportation of colonial silver into these countries. From here, a large portion of the silver was further exported to Asia. At the beginning of the seventeenth century, this was further facilitated and expanded through the creation of the British and Dutch East India Companies. The merchant vessels of the East India Companies transported the silver around the Cape of Good Hope first to India and from there to China.

However, a large part of the silver that made its way to China was not from Europe but rather came directly from the Americas. Ever since the establishment of the important base of trade in Manila on the Philippines, galleons regularly ran between Acapulco and Manila bringing silver coins with them on their journey across the Pacific (see note 1). In Manila, the coins were exchanged with Chinese merchants for silk and other goods who in turn brought the silver coins to China.

In this way, the silver coins from Potosí traveled both to the east across the Atlantic to Europe and around Africa to Asia and to the west directly across the Pacific. In spite of the poor quality of the minting, the peso thus became the first and perhaps the most important global currency of all time. Its worldwide distribution made it possible for the establishment of a unified global economy.

My work WORLD MAP attempts to show the connections between the historical global developments I mentioned above—seafaring and cartography on the one hand and the constant interrelationship of trade between Asia, Europe, and the American continents using the peso as a global currency on the other. The work is a hand-drawn reproduction of a world map that was published in Siena, in 1600, by Arnoldo di Arnoldi (1570–1602). The original basis for di Arnoldi's map was released in Holland in 1592 by the Dutch cartographer Petrus Plancius (1552–1622) who, among other things, was an advisor for the Dutch East India Company. My reproduction of the map is confined to the coastlines as they were thought to progress at that time and the network of rhumb lines crossing the oceans on the map. In addition, rubbings from a historical silver coin that was minted in Potosí between 1586 and 1591 mark the sea routes on which the silver traveled eastward and westward from Potosí around the world.

The choice of rubbing or fotottage as a technique of representation based on contact with the real object can also be understood as a counterpart to the allegorical representation that is often considered a characteristic of Baroque art from the end of the sixteenth century that was exported from Europe to the "New World." At the same time, the development of scientific cartography also meant in many ways the decline of the allegorical representation of the world.

The WORLD MAP is an example of these new forms of representation reflecting the cartographical capacity and knowledge of the period. With the rubbings of the coin—which were of high mintage, makes it a contemporary of the map—the map is a reference to the beginnings of the global economy that was developing at the same time.

1 Flynn/Giraldez mark the beginning of global trade with the Spanish conquest of the Philippine capital Manila in 1571, which in turn served as the base of direct trade between the Americas and Asia: "For our purposes, global trade emerged when all important populated continents began to exchange products continuously—both with each other directly and indirectly via other continents—and in values sufficient to generate crucial impacts on all the trading partners. It is true that there was important intercontinental trade before 1571, but there was no direct link between America and Asia, so the world market was not yet fully coherent or complete." See Dennis O. Flynn, Arturo Giraldez, "Born with a 'Silver Spoon': The Origin of World Trade in 1571," Journal of World History, Vol. 6, no. 2, 1995, p. 201 (pp. 201–221).

2 Most significantly Ptolemy's Geographia (c. AD 100–175) from which the system of longitude and latitude was adopted.

3 In addition to classical sources, medieval world maps were significantly influenced by Christian theology. A good example were the so-called T and O maps with an O-shaped round earth surface divided into three areas by bodies of water in the form of a T: a semicircle on top representing Asia and two quarter circles below with
left and right respectively Europe and Africa. The vertical T represented the Mediterranean, the city of Jerusalem is in the center of the circle. The T and O maps were not so much a geographical study as much as they were the expression of a certain religious worldview.

4 The mathematical basis for the exact calculation of this stretching distortion was only developed after the publication of Mercator's world map. With Mercator's own knowledge he was able to construct but not mathematically calculate his map. It was not until 1590, thirty years later, that the English mathematician and cartographer Edward Wright (1561-1615) demonstrated the mathematical basis for the Mercator projection in his work *Certain Errors in Navigation*, which helped to make significant progress in the production and practical use in navigation of the Mercator projection. That same year, a world map by Wright was published in the second volume of Richard Hakluyt's *The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques and Discoveries of the English Nation*. After Jodocus Hondius' map published in 1597, also based on Wright's calculations, Wright's map is thus only the third world map based on Mercator's projection from 1569. The extent to which Mercator's solution was ahead of his time becomes easier to understand when one considers that it took a further 100 years after Wright's publication for Mercator maps to be widely used.

5 For a critical analysis of Peters' work see also Mark Monmonier, *How to Lie with Maps* (Chicago, 1996, first published 1991), pp. 96-9. While showing understanding of the political motivations behind Peters' work, Monmonier criticizes it as an inadequate solution to the problem of the projection. Peters' suggestion is also known as Gall-Peters Projection because in 1855, more than 100 years before Peters' work, the Scottish minister James Gall (1808-1893) proposed a similar idea. Like in the Peters' projection, the tropical areas appear to be elongated along the North-South axis, and the map was criticized by his contemporaries because of the scale and the representation of the angles were off. For this reason, Gall's suggestion is thus often left out of the history of cartography. The fact that Peters was apparently unaware of Gall's attempt is further proof for Monmonier that Peters' knowledge of cartography was insufficient and that his suggestion should be rejected. In contrast to Peters, Monmonier saw the twentieth-century preference for world maps based on the Mercator projection not as an expression of Eurocentrism but rather as, at least in part, an aspect of the Cold War: Both the Soviet Union with Siberia and China's northern borders appear much larger in the Mercator projection. In this way the influence of Communism, seen from both sides of the conflict, could be exaggerated in propaganda with respect to the amount of landmass that it controlled.


8 From 1568-81 viceroy of Peru.

9 North, *Kleine Geschichte des Geldes*, p. 74. Data concerning the exact amount of silver produced in America and Europe at that time varies considerably but the immense significance of silver from Potosí is undisputed.

10 See also Andre Gunder Frank, *ReORIENT: Global Economy in the Asian Age* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, and London, 1998), and www.reorient.net, (accessed March 30, 2010). Frank's work presents an economic history where not Europe but rather Asia takes center stage. He criticizes the Eurocentric historiography that portrayed the "ascent of Europe" as virtually pulling itself up by its own hair (for example in Max Weber's version). At the same time, he also criticizes models such as Fernand Braudel's according to which Europe had created a "European global economy around it" and in this way had created a modern, capitalist world-system that was entirely centered on Europe and based on the exploitation of the resources and riches of its American and African colonies. Instead, Frank defends the thesis that Europe used its silver to enter into a market that had already existed for a long time in Asia, that was already larger, more productive and competitive, and that up to 1700 expanded faster and was capable of supporting a growth in population that was two times larger than the population growth in Europe until 1750. Only in the eighteenth century did changes in the global economy, demographics, and environment bring about the "downfall of the East" that eventually left space open for the "ascent of the West." Following this, Frank sees the current growth of East Asia with the Chinese economy in the center as a return to China's "traditional" dominance in the world economy.

11 In 1800, the British East India Company (EIC), a conglomeration of influential merchants in London, was granted by Queen Elizabeth I the rights to a monopoly on trade with Asia. Two years later, the Dutch state granted the *Verenigde Oostindische Compagnie* (VOC) even further reaching privileges. Both companies developed into enormously powerful institutions. They achieved a volume of trade that till then had never been possible and introduced new forms of business transactions. The VOC for example was the first company to sell stocks.

---

La Mit'a

Roberto Choque Canqui

Su evolución

[...]. Finalmente, la mit'a minera de Potosí, fue instituida por el virrey Toledo en 1573, constituyéndose en servicio obligatorio para la categoría de los indios originarios que tenían derecho a la tierra. Nació así el nuevo grupo social, llamado "mitayo" —castellización del término quechua *mit'a* "el que está de turno"—, constituido por estos miles de indios originarios que "cada siete años" debían trasladarse por un año con su familia y sus llamas hasta Potosí, para trabajar allí sobre todo como peones y cargadores (apirí) en el acarreo de mineral dentro y fuera de la mina, con frecuencia día y noche, durante una semana intensa y recibir por ello un módico jornal de cuatro reales (o incluso menos, para trabajos menos duros) para dedicarse después a otras actividades durante dos semanas. En la práctica, como veremos, los turnos se fueron estrechando, debiendo retornar a la mit'a antes de cumplirse los siete años y, ya en Potosí, debiendo retornar a los socavones sólo después de una semana de descanso.

Este trabajo temporal obligatorio de los mitayos no llegó a sustituir totalmente al de los indios *janaconas* que desde el descubrimiento del Cerro Rico ya se habían establecido allí de forma permanente logrando cierta especialización minera sobre todo como barreteros o *vara indios* y en el trabajo en los ingenios. Muchas de sus actividades no podían ser realizadas por trabajadores nuevos sin experiencia, a los que se reservaban sobre todo los trabajos más bastes y duros. En los ayllus de la provincia de Paca jes este fue sin duda un mecanismo de explotación que afectaba incluso a la misma existencia física de la población originaria. [...]

El número de indios que registró Toledo en cada pueblo de la provincia de Paca jes era bastante apreciable y, en base a éste, se calculaba la séptima parte de la población originaria con destino al servicio de la *mita* minera de Potosí; es decir de "cada siete indios" uno era destinado al servicio de la *mita*. La llamada "gruesa de la mita", compuesta de los "séptimos" de todos los pueblos de esa provincia, estaba dividida en tres partes: una, llamada "mita ordinaria", estaba destinada a cumplir su turno (o tanda) y las otras dos terceras partes eran "para descansos y remudas". Posteriormente, en los años 1683 y 1689, el virrey Duque de la Palata realizó un nuevo empadronamiento. [...]

233
Capitanías
Al igual que en otras provincias sometidas a la mita de Potosí, existían dos categorías de capitanes: el capitán general a nivel de provincia, nombrado generalmente entre los caciques pudientes y capaces, y los capitanes enteradores, o chicos, de cada repartimiento o pueblo, elegidos entre los indios principales. Ambas categorías de capitanes tuvieron que sobrellevar toda la carga de la conducción y el control de los mitayos a su cargo y también los factores distorsionantes creados por los corregidores, curas y los propios caciques en la asignación de mitayos para las labores de las minas de Potosí. El origen de la figura del “capitán general” hay que buscarlo en la visita general del virrey Toledo. Este nombró seis capitanes generales con la misión de llevar la cuenta de los Indios que acudían anualmente al asiento de San Diego de Tupipuqu (lugar de concentración de los mitayos de Potosí)” e informar a los corregidores sobre las incidencias que dieran lugar a los corregidores enteradores” (Cañete Argüelles Fábrega 1993: 66). Para la mita se utilizó la división dual:

“La parte de Collasuyo, que es la del Collao, que está poblada de las naciones contenidas en las capitalías, se dividían en dos bandos, que llamaron Urcusuyu y Umasuyu, que quiere decir gente que habita en los altos de los cerros, que tienen este nombre urcu, y los umasuyus en lo bajo y llano, ribera de las aguas que en esta lengua llaman uma; otros dicen que significan los urcusuyus gente varonil y esforzada, porque por este nombre urcu se entiende lo masculino, y los umasuyus lo femenino y no para tanto. Y siempre fueron los urcusuyus de mejor presunción y mayor cantidad, y el inca les daba la mano derecha en los lugares públicos y eran preferidos a los umasuyus en reputación” (Capoche 1585: 159: 139-140). […]

Gabriel Fernández Guarachi y la problemática mitaya
En enero de 1660, los caciques y principales de las provincias que “mitaban” a la Villa de Potosí, entre ellos nuestro Gabriel Fernández Guarachi, se quejaron al Rey por la opresión que vivían con todos los demás de su “nación” por sólo obedecer lo que su Majestad tenía mandado de ir a trabajar a ese cerro “la saca de metales y su beneficio.” Añadian que esta carga había sido impuesta por Francisco de Toledo cuando había gran número de indios, pero ahora los pueblos se encontraban sin habitantes, algunos muertos por los agravios y otros se habían huido lejos o se encontraban entre los infieles. Los caciques manifestaban su sentirimiento de indefensa frente a los azogueros y corregidores por causa de la falta de indios, pues estaban sumamente apremiados y obligados a responder al riesgo con su dinero, y correr con todos los gastos por la reducción de los indios ausentes sin que los azogueros como beneficiarios les ayuden por ello, mientras que los caciques que no cumplían eran castigados sin contemplación con azotes y cárceles (López Beltrán 1988: 271-275). Es decir, la mita no solamente afectaba con su peso a los capitanes y a los mitayos, sino también a los propios caciques que se esforzaban con cumplir con sus obligaciones de reclutar mitayos y cobrar tributo. […]

La “disipación” de mitayos en Machaqa
Con relación a la “disipación y ruina” del pueblo de Jesús de Machaqa, además de los muchos que se han muerto en la villa de Potosí con asma y otras enfermedades de los azogue y vapores infestados de los negrillos metales, el protector de naturales, a nombre de Diego Charca, resalta otro componente local: las invasiones y motines de los indios urus “bucus sumas y eruytos”, a los que considera rebeldes y tiraños por sus atrocidades y robos crucentos, especialmente en cuanto al robo de “ovejas y carneros de la tierra” en manadas. Algunos indios de Machaqa han muerto por defender sus sembradas, cosechas, pastos y estancias, situación que ha dado bastante ocasión de que los temerosos se hayan aprovechado para ausentarse y huir de su lugar de origen dejando yerbas y desiertas las estancias y pueblos. A ello se unen los muertos en Potosí y en el mismo pueblo con enfermedades contagiosas como resultado de todos los trabajos de importante calamanía y “tan notoria la que se conoce en el ayllu hanoaco y urus”.

No había memoria ni vestigio de ellos. Los padrones elaborados no estaban claros porque no había cacique legítimo ni extraño del dicho ayllu que haya podido inquirir ni rastrear alguno que lo sea. El propio Don Gabriel Fernández Guarachi viendo tantas ruinas, combatido y asentado por extremos de su pueblo, hizo dejación del cargo de gobernador y cacique ante la real audiencia de la plata el año 1626, “dando causas bastantes y se le admitió dejación con provision que obtuvo para ello con calidad que diése información de las causas contenidas en su petición y la principal de no poder entrar las tasas de los ayllus perdidos y en particular las de los usos del ayllu hanoaco”. Como consecuencia de ello, consiguió provisión, despachada por el señor Marqués de Mancera en 18 de abril de 1631, para que [los indios aymaras] “no pagasen ninguna obligación ni tributos en manera alguna por los indios urus ni estos por los aymara… “La cual [provisión] se mando guardar y cumplir por el Maestre de Campo Domingo Ruiz de Luzuriaga corregidor de dicha provincia que presente con el juramento necesario y que mi parte en virtud de ella no se a compelido al entero de ellos por ser ayllu separado y orden expreso en ella y por que en el dicho padrón de este dicho año se ponen doce indios del dicho ayllu hanoaco, los dos ausentes por sus nombres y los diez en párrafos y en blanco por no haber memoria de sus nombres ni quien sepa de ellos como se comprueba de la información que dio Don Pedro Machaca ante Don Joseph Marqués de Mancilla siendo corregidor de dicha provincia que presente en debida forma y sin embargo de tantas y evidentes experiencias no se a podido lograr el que no se entere por los dichos uros y los ayllus perdidos por quienes entera el dicho Don Gabriel como constara por la certificación de los rezagos de tasas que remitió el escribano de la dicha provincia al señor obispo de Santa Martha.”

Efectivamente, la mita era un mecanismo de explotación forzada, que atentaba contra la misma existencia de los pueblos y ayllus. […]

La mita en el siglo XVIII
Hagamos un salto a la segunda mitad siglo XVIII, la última época del período colonial. Para entonces el esplendor de Potosí había disminuido significativamente. Su población, que hacia 1560 había logrado su pico de 500.000 habitantes, convirtiéndose en el principal centro urbano del continente y uno de los mayores del mundo, fue descendiendo hasta unos 75.000 a 100.000 entre 1700 y 1720 y de ahí bajó a menos de 30.000 hacia 1770, con un alza coyuntural hacia 1750. Desde 1692 la tasa oficial de mitayos se había reducido a sólo 4.101 debido en gran medida a la disipación de los indios de tasa y, más en general, a la decreciente población del virreinato. Diversas voces clamaban ya sin éxito por la abolición de la mita, contra la opinión de los azogueros o empresarios mineros.

Como resultado de esta contracción, aumentó, por una parte, la mayor explotación a los mitayos, y por otra, el número de trabajadores mings (miní a) contratados directamente por los azogueros al margen de la mita. Cálculos realizados para fines del siglo XVIII y principios del XIX indican que en 1802 los mitayos trabajaban con un exceso del 285% de turnos sobre los legalmente establecidos pero por ello sólo recibían un 41% de aumento sobre sus jornales legales, es decir, cobraban un promedio de algo más de 65 pesos anuales sobre los 46 legales; y para 1790 se estima que, frente a los mitayos, los miníes ya eran el 52% de la fuerza laboral de Potosí. […]
Primitive Accumulation, as Exemplified in Potosí

Alice Creischer

Precursory forms, beginnings, and justification of the mita

Peter Bakewell begins his analysis with an account of the free laborers (yanaconas) during the first phase of Potosí's silver boom. The free status enjoyed by the yanaconas within Inca society enabled them to arrive at an accommodation with the Spanish by serving as domestic staff, translators, or free laborers. By virtue of their superior technical expertise, the yanaconas were also among the first group of mining entrepreneurs. “The Spaniards during the first 25 years of silver production in Potosí have a small part in the extraction and processing of ore.” Many only held title in claims, and provided themselves with knowledgeable Indian workers.” In Potosí the yanaconas were dubbed indios varas—vara referring to a unit of measurement used to stake out land claims.

From 1550 onwards, the encomenderos from across Peru purchased claims in Potosí and dispatched their bonded serfs to commence prospecting. This practice was already in breach of the early drafts of the Nuevas Leyes de las Indias, the Leyes de Burgos of 1512/13. Under this legislation, the indigenous population within the encomiendas were not in fact the property of the encomenderos, and hence could not be sent to other regions against their will. According to the Nuevas Leyes (1542/43), the encomenderos were only entitled to tribute payments, but not to the labor of the indigenous populace. Although these laws were barely enforced in the colonies, the administration in the Peruvian viceroyalty was, from this time onwards, continually faced with the task of ensuring, on the one hand, the flow of silver to Spain and the provision of a sufficient workforce, whilst, on the other hand, having to conform, at least formally, to the New Laws. This contradiction led to the permanent establishment of so-called “worker counts,” and the compilation of reports detailing their well-being throughout the entire chapter of colonial mining activity in Potosí.

Up until the present day, these government reports have formed a constant backdrop to the cruelties of colonial and postcolonial economic activity—both as their symptom and as their witness. For they document the contradiction inherent to the capitalist system of governance, which attempts to legitimize its incessant demand for a readily available pool of labor by invoking the notion of freedom and the need for population growth, whilst, on the other hand, tending to “overuse” this workforce, just as one would overfish an ocean or denude a forest.

In July 1549, the corregidor of Potosí, Juan Polo de Ondegardor, ordered a census to be taken of the encomienda Indians in Potosí (estimated to number approximately 25,000 at the time), who were also advised that they were free and could return home. “Nearly all these encomienda workers, however, expressed satisfaction. ... Many declared that they ate better than at home ... that they had quinua, chuno, maize, potatoes, meat, and fish in Potosí, and everything they want, including coca.”

Even contemporary observers were moved to describe these reports as reflective both of the primacy of the Commission's interests and of the respondents' fear of the survey's authors. Bakewell interprets the refusal to return home as an indication of another “force majeure ... it was the Indians' general circumstances that were coercive,” in reference to the destruction of their means of rural subsistence through wars and plunder by the conquista. The first silver boom helped to fund the revolt of the encomenderos under their leader Gonzalo Pizarro (1544/48), mounted in response to the restriction of their powers under the king's new legislation.

Quotas and wages

“As if the crown were never quite willing to accept the moral responsibility of forced labour,” the mita was never officially endorsed by the Spanish Crown. Ultimately this was a continuation of the practice applied by the encomenderos, albeit sanctioned, and on a universal scale. On his five-year tour (Visita General) throughout the provinces, the viceroy and great reformer of colonial government Francisco Toledo became the first to actually stipulate mita quotas. These ranged annually from roughly 5 to 8 percent of the male population aged between eighteen and fifty. Bakewell puts the initial number of mita workers to have reached Potosí in 1573 at around 9,500.6 By the time of the next census, conducted in La Plata and La Paz just two years later, this figure had risen by between 34 and 35 percent, buoyed by the steady demand for labor. Toledo divided up the mita day into one-third working time, and two-thirds idle. In their rest period, the workers sold themselves as free laborers since the mita wages only covered the minimum number of
calories a person needed to survive, but not clothing, accommodation, working materials, or food for their families, who accompanied them to Potosí. The wages stipulated by Toledo (paid out in silver) of 2.7 to 3.5 reales per day were maintained over the next twenty years, and were not adjusted to take account of inflation.

The transfer from the communities/primitive accumulation
Toledo exploited the existing social hierarchical structures of Inca society to organize the mita. A ruling group of six leading principals ... from various points of the draft areas was appointed and given administrative authority ... over all other curacas and Indians in the Mita. Their duties were: to ensure that the due number of workers appeared; but then in general to oversee the administration of the draft in Potosí. These "captains" were under pressure to ensure fulfillment of the quotas or pay cash in lieu of the absent workers. The communities also had to supply the mitayos with provisions for the journeys. All this led to growing indebtedness: "The historiography of Africa has demonstrated the crucial role in colonial and neocolonial economies of temporary labor migrations, recruited with varying degrees of coercion. ... The costs of the maintenance during idle periods and reproduction of labor power are relegated to the sphere of the indigenous communities, while the entrepreneur pays only the costs of the immediate labor-power. Therefore, forced migratory labor is a means by which communities transfer value to the sphere of production in which their labor is applied. ... It should be emphasized that the object of exploitation is not the individual migrant but the entire community." Toledos threefold reform: the consolidation of the Indios into settlements, the tribute system, and the mita, clearly highlight this link: "The reducciones regrouped the diminished indigenous population into villages, confirming land rights ... the indigenous territory, relocated and reduced ... became means for the reproduction of labor-power for Spanish enterprises. The concentration of the population facilitated both evangelization and collection of tribute."

Let us now compare the historical criteria underlying primitive accumulation which Karl Marx identified in England from the fifteenth to the seventeenth century, with the situation in the Peruvian viceroyalty during the same period: "The primitive accumulation is a ... separation of the laborers from all property in the means by which they realize their labor ... when great masses of men are suddenly and forcibly torn from their means of subsistence, and hurled as free and "unattached" proletarians on the labor market. The expropriation of the agricultural producer, of the peasant from the soil is the basis of this whole process." Enrique Tandeuter writes: "The Andes were traversed by massive human migrations and the abandonment of precisely those villages that were subject to the Mita recruitment." Bakewell stresses that: "The large movements of people to and from the town ... cannot but have brought interruptions of agricultural cycles ... the mere fact that the Mita shifted alone annually, according to Toledo's rules, between a sixth and a fifth of the tributaries from a large portion of the central Andean upland serves as an indicator of disruption. Since at least ... Mitayos took wives with them and ... children also, it is probably no exaggeration to suggest that the Mita drew to Potosí, along with the Mitayos an equal number of dependents. So that the annual movement of population resulting from Mita may have reached in some years 25,000.""13

Population
"Thus were the agricultural people first forcibly expropriated from the soil, driven from their homes, turned into vagabonds, and then whipped, branded, tortured by laws grotesquely terrible, into the discipline necessary for the wage system."14 In Marx's view, terror is the second criterion for primitive accumulation. As an example, he cites the draconian legislation targeted at the waves of people driven from the land across Western Europe which began at the end of the fifteenth century and continued well into the eighteenth century. Terror is the expression of the administrative inability to cope with the displaced masses; only then to gradually formulate a biopolitical regulatory system of labor: prisons, workhouses, galleys, army, and banishment to the colonies.

"In the wake of the atrocities of the conquista, the colonial government was apparently facing the converse problem: At the behest of the administration, censuses were continually being conducted to take account of the dwindling labor force. In 1649 there were 2,800 new mitas recruited in Potosi instead of the expected 8,500, and even this number remained far below the stipulated 12,500. The quotas could no longer be met due to the depopulation of entire areas. Bakewell estimates that since Toledo's first general census, the population fell by half in the period from 1570 to around 1620. He attributes this primarily not to the epedemics unleashed by imported European pathogens, which had proliferated in the Andes since the sixteenth century, but to the general destruction of the indigenous means of subsistence and to the erosion of social structures and traditional knowledge. These factors were compounded by the illnesses caused by working in Potosi (lung disease, mercury poisoning) and, not least, by the destruction of the familial structures and marriages wrought by waves of rape and female enslavement.

In a bid to increase the population, the administration considered various strategies, among them a plan "to concentrate Indians in a large new town near Potosí from which labor could easily and constantly be drawn. ... Philip II ... 1568, suggested the creation of such towns as a general solution to the problem of labor supply for mining."15 This plan (subsequently resurrected by Philip III, but ultimately proving unfeasible) together with the measures implemented by the reducciones highlight a phenomenon associated with primitive accumulation, whose growing significance marks a biopolitical turn in the current discussion of this term. "Whereas Marx examines primitive accumulation from the viewpoint of the waged male proletariat ... I examine it from the viewpoint of the changes it introduced in the social position of women and ... the development of a new sexual division of labor ... the mechanization of the proletarian body and its transformation, in the case of women, into a machine for the production of new workers."16

Silvia Federici (together with a generation of feminist historians) cites the witch hunts as the preeminent phenomenon in the functionalization of the female body as a means of labor reproduction. Comparable developments in the viceroyalty of Peru lay not only in the contemporaneous witch hunts across both continents, but also in the campaign to eliminate idolatry (extirpación de idolatrías), and in the eradication of moral codes, customs, and the cultural knowledge of the indigenous peoples.

Industrial labor
The first mita workers were deployed as follows: 1,430 men in the mines, 2,350 in the refining plants (ingenios). 1,000 in the construction of new processing plants, with the remainder assigned to building reservoirs for generating waterpower.17 "The application of the technology required huge investments in complex processing plants called ingenios. Although initially human and animal power were used to move the ore-grinding machinery, shortly thereafter the ingenios began to take the advantage of hydraulic energy supplied by an impressive network of reservoirs constructed near the city. ... From this time on, ore production in Potosi was characterized by the predominance of large vertically integrated enterprises that united the work of mineral
extraction in the Cerro Rico with the refining process. For both functions, mine owners relied on coerced migratory laborers, as well as other workers recruited from the city’s free labor pool. The workers were required to meet specific quotas: “a suitable instrument to combat the indigenous population’s innate resistance to forced labor. ... The control process could be reduced simply to the measurement of ore production and an examination of the average wealth extracted from the ore to ensure that the workers were completing their quotas by carrying useless stones out of the mines.”

Failure to fulfill these quotas resulted in the imposition of physical or pecuniary punishments. By the end of the eighteenth century, the quotas had been raised to such a level that the workers would use their spare time to meet the stipulated targets, either by subcontracting other workers or co-opting their entire families. Tandeter and Bakewell both stress that the working conditions in Potosí were comparable to those obtaining in other South American mines: blatant disregard of stipulated working hours, retention of wages, debt bondage, arbitrary regulations, ill-treatment by the overseers, malnutrition, and disease.

Within the complex system of indebtedness and the mutual subcontracting of free labor and mita workers, the free laborers came to assume a key role. They were called minaga, an expression which in Quechua means “to perform reciprocal work, to work in exchange for an equivalent amount of money.” These free laborers—the successors to the janaconas—gathered every Monday at various locations around the town waiting to be hired. Due to the shortage of labor they were in a position to lay down various conditions: Cash payments in advance, working hours from 10 a.m. to 4 p.m., and exemption from working in the processing plants due to the risk of mercury poisoning. If the tasks were poorly paid or dangerous, they would work more slowly—which only lent greater urgency to the mine owners’ demands to be allowed to retain and increase the contingent of mita workers. The use of slaves from Africa proved unfeasible due to their intolerance to altitude, and for a short period Chinese slaves were imported via the Philippines—a scheme which was eventually abandoned due to the hazards and expense of negotiating the transportation routes.

“Indios in the pocket”

Within this labor trading system, there was one special phenomenon that underscored the “modernity” of the Potosí economy. It individualized and condensed, as it were, the third most important criterion cited by Marx in his chapter on accumulation, namely public debt, into a practice known as “Indios in the pocket”: “As early as the 1590s there were reports that caciques, faced with Mitayo quotas they could not meet because of depopulation of their provinces, were substituting cash payments for workers, and since their own resources were quickly exhausted, they exacted funds from Indians within their jurisdictions.”

In 1650 only 800 mitayos turned up in person in Potosí, with 800 being supplied in cash. The possibility of substituting the required labor pool for cash had two main repercussions for the indigenous communities, which conformed exactly to the mechanisms of the classical economy. Wealthy communities were able to buy out members of the mita, whereas the poorer settlements became increasingly mired in debt bondage. The wealth of the communities derived from the informal markets that emerged from supplying population centers with coca, grain, and other commodities. Yet because they were now producing goods for the market rather than for themselves in order to earn sufficient funds to meet the existing quotas, the peasants’ living conditions started to deteriorate. “As mining declined in the seventeenth century it became increasingly common that employees who received indios de fañiquera chose not to use this money to hire a minka, but merely to keep it, because that was more profitable, than spending it on working a depleted mine with a hired hand.”

Tandeter also furnishes evidence that towards the end of the eighteenth century, cash earnings from speculation with indios exceeded the profit margins derived from mining.

Marx describes the third criterion for primitive accumulation as follows: “The public debt becomes one of the most powerful levers of primitive accumulation. As with the stroke of an enchanter’s wand, it endows barren money with the power of breeding and thus turns it into capital.” Thus public debt became a key factor in the European economies due to the restructuring of the colonial enterprises into a kind of early stock company. If we recall the fundamental axiom of Marx’s theory of value, namely that rather than the reserves of precious metals, technical progress, speed of information, currency differentials, or symbolic capital, it is the exploitation of labor that creates surplus value, then we must, by extension, also ask what generates the value of the metal imported to Europe. And consequently, we must also inquire what surplus value is created by the system of coercive labor in a region that has already suffered from “overexploitation.” From these questions we can infer that the capitalization of the mita, the capitalization of a quota of laborers through debt notes or “Indios in the pocket,” and the emergent speculation with these debt notes in Potosí furnish paradigmatic proof that such value creation is not attributable to the natural movement of the market, but is generated by state driven coercion upon the lives of people. We must infer then that this coercion, or rather the option to apply it, leads to the generation of value.

A summary of the continental experiences

Marx closely links the emergence of public debt and the international stock-exchange systems with colonization. He takes as an example Holland, which— with exchanges in Antwerp and Amsterdam— was the next immediate beneficiary of the silver from Potosí, after Genoa, and the Fuggers in Augsburg. Holland invested the silver in colonial enterprises. “The colonies secured a market for the budding manufacturers and, through the monopoly of the market, an increased accumulation. The treasures captured outside Europe by undisguised looting, enslavement and murder ... were there turned into capital. Holland ... in 1648 stood already in the acme of its commercial greatness. It was in almost exclusive possession of its East Indian trade and the commerce of the south west and north east of Europe.” Marx goes on to conclude that “by 1649 the people of Holland were more overworked, poorer, and more brutally oppressed than those of all the rest of Europe put together.”

Silvia Federici calls into question the conclusions drawn by classical economists who attributed the price revolution in Europe from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century to the imports of gold and silver from America. “Gold and silver are not capital ... If they functioned as price-regulating devices, capable of turning even wheat into a precious commodity, this was because they were planted into a developing capitalist world, in which a growing percentage of the population ... had no access to land, had to buy the food that they had once produced because the ruling class had learned to use this magical power of money to cut labor costs. In other words, prices rose because of the export-import of agricultural products. ... In September 1585, in Antwerp, ‘while the poor were literally starving in the streets’ a warehouse collapsed under the weight of the grain packed in it.” She refers to the famines, the criminalization of poverty, the declining population, and the biopolitical functionalization of the female body in Europe, as a parallel phenomenon of one and the same act of coercive oppression.
Hence the question posed at the outset (How can one examine a stereotype forged by national power-political interests without trivializing the extent of its crimes?) raises yet another, namely: How can one move on from the discourse over “otherness” and its associated, identity-related dilemmas? “By the 18th century ... an international division of labor had taken shape that divided the new global proletariat by means of different class relations and systems of discipline. ... But the similarities in the treatments to which the populations of Europe and the Americas were subjected are sufficient to demonstrate the existence of one single logic governing the development of capitalism and the structural character of the atrocities perpetrated in this process.”

Los verdaderos dueños de la tierra o el desmadre de la minería en América Latina

Gabriela Massuh

"No queremos otro Potosí" fue la respuesta que dio Evo Morales a la Televisión Española durante su última visita a España en septiembre de 2009. Se refiere a eventuales estrategias de cooperación entre España y Bolivia, también a la voluntad de varios países europeos de participar en la extracción de litio, un mineral estratégico para el almacenamiento de energía del que Bolivia posee más de la mitad de las reservas mundiales. Desde que lo conduce Evo Morales, el estado boliviano se beneficia con una renta no menor del 51% de las ganancias que generan sus recursos naturales. Si se observa esta exigencia dentro del marco de la historia de Bolivia en particular y de la situación actual de la minería en América Latina en general, se trata de un caso único.

En materia de minería, América Latina ha ingresado en un nuevo proceso de drenaje por sus venas. Los nuevos dueños de la corona resultan menos gloriosos que los de la época de la colonia. Son empresas transnacionales en su mayoría de Canadá, los EEUU, el Reino Unido y Australia. Entre otras, las que operan en la región son Río Tinto, Barrick Gold Corporation, Freeport Mac Moran, BHP Billiton, Newmont, PlacerDome, Meridian Gold, Exeter Resource Corporation, Freeport Mc Moran Copper & Gold inc. y Minera Andes. El Observatorio de Conflictos Ambientales (OLCA) y la Coordinación Ejecutiva del Observatorio de Conflictos Mineros en América Latina (OCMAL) han contabilizado un total de 337 proyectos mineros a cielo abierto a lo largo de toda la cordillera de los Andes desde México a Ushuaia. Más de la mitad están en conflicto con las comunidades vecinas. El denominador común de estos conflictos es la violación de derechos humanos y ambientales denunciados por las poblaciones aledañas, reclamos sistemáticamente ignorados por estados y empresas implicadas. Contrariamente a la minería tradicional, que cavaba la piedra en busca de las mejores vetas del mineral abriendo galerías subterráneas, hoy se trabaja sobre la superficie, a cielo abierto. El nuevo método consiste en dinamitar gran parte del suelo y el subsuelo, luego se trata la piedra por lixiviación, un procedimiento hidro-metalúrgico que consiste en utilizar grandes cantidades de agua como medio de transporte para trasladar ácidos químicos (ácido sulfúrico o cloruro de sodio) y así separar los minerales valiosos de los que no lo son. El proceso requiere enormes cantidades de agua, por lo general un bien muy escaso en las zonas donde se asientan las mineras. Para acceder a ella, las empresas llegan a las vertientes de agua potable que luego contaminan con el ácido usado para tratar el polvillo. También requiere cuantiosas dosis de energía y un equipamiento que puede remover montañas enteras en cuestión de horas. Para desarrollarlo, el yacimiento abarca grandes extensiones donde se cavan cráteres gigantescos que llegan a tener 150 hectáreas de extensión y hasta 200 metros de profundidad. Este método de extracción permite que la minera se lleve no solamente oro o plata, sino cualquier metal que considere estratégico para ser comercializado. Por los daños que provoca, ninguna actividad industrial es tan devastadora como la minería a cielo abierto.¹

Para dar cuenta de la voracidad de este sistema, la socióloga Maristella Stampa adopta el término de "megaminería", que califica no sólo la dimensión fárasisca de los proyectos, sino también la sanción de leyes que liberan vastas zonas geográficas de todo control o regulación.² Sólo una economía "fuera de cauce" puede generar la renuncia voluntaria de un Estado a ser soberano en vastas zonas de su territorio. Para explicar este tipo de mecanismos Elmar Altvater, basándose en Polanyi, se refiere a un global disembodieding que implica una inversión de la función tradicional de la economía: de ser un elemento estructurante de cohesión social, pasa a transformarse en un mecanismo que sólo atiende a fines propios. Una economía fuera de cauce, "desmadrada", necesita zonas desreguladas para independizarse de toda funcionalidad que no sea la de su propio incremento.³ La megaminería es un síntoma del disembodieding de la economía, más grave que el caso de los combustibles fósiles porque sus niveles de destrucción son mucho más radicales y no tienen retorno. La devastadora aniquilación de la naturaleza, la expulsión de pobladores originarios de sus lugares de origen, la contaminación de las aguas de las que se nutren regiones enteras, la destrucción de culturas milenarias y la desconsiderada violación de derechos humanos son el precio que se paga por elementos que, en el mejor de los casos, son necesarios para desarrollar tecnologías modernas (el litio, por ejemplo); en el peor, se trata tan sólo de elementos suntuarios dentro de la burbuja de la especulación financiera (el oro). Nada le pasaría al mundo si se deja de extraer el oro. Los únicos perjudicados serían las propias mineras.

¹ Peter Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain: Indian Labor in Potosí, 1545-1650 (Albuquerque, 1984), pp. 33/44.
² Fur information on the depopulation, see the source cited here by Poma de Ayala; in his book: Late Victorian Holocaust(London and New York, 2001). Mike Davis furnishes impressive examples of the continual recording by the English authorities of the famine they themselves caused in India.
³ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 41.
⁴ Ibid., p. 45.
⁵ Ibid., p. 54.
⁶ Ibid., p. 47.
⁷ Ibid., p. 103.
⁸ Ibid., p. 70.
¹⁰ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 123.
¹¹ Karl Marx, Capital, vol.1, (Moscow, n.d.), 479; first English edition of 1885; Samuel Moore and Edward Avelling, edited by Frederick Engels.
¹² Tandeter, Corco JH and Market, p. 27.
¹³ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 110f.
¹⁴ Marx, Capital, p. 495.
¹⁵ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 122.
¹⁷ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 108.
¹⁸ Tandeter, Corco JH and Market, p. 3.
¹⁹ Ibid., p. 38.
²⁰ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 121.
²¹ Tandeter, Corco JH and Market, p. 93.
²² Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 123.
²³ Tandeter, Corco JH and Market, p. 124.
²⁴ Marx, Capital, p. 508.
²⁵ Ibid., p. 507.
²⁶ Federici, Caliban and the Witch, p. 32.
²⁷ Bakewell, Miners of the Red Mountain, p. 220.
La historia de la megaminería comienza a principios de los años 90, época en la que los países de América Latina acumulaban una voluminosa deuda con el Banco Mundial y el Fondo Monetario Internacional. Habían alcanzado prácticamente una situación de quiebra; estaban “de rodillas frente a los deudores”, como dijo Roberto Dromi, ministro argentino de obras y servicios públicos de Carlos Menem en 1991. Esta situación permitió que los diferentes parlamentos latinoamericanos estuvieran en condiciones de sancionar cualquier tipo de leyes con tal de apaciguar la presión de los acreedores. Así, paulatinamente, se fue adoptando un conjunto de recomendaciones del Banco Mundial que prometía la salida del marasmo. Uno a uno, todos los países de la región modificaron sus legislaciones nacionales a través de leyes que desregulaban la inversión extranjera, otorgaban a empresas extranjeras el derecho a recurrir al arbitraje internacional y celebraban convenios de protección a la inversión extranjera directa.

Entre 1995 y mediados de la década del 2000 también se modificaron los códigos y leyes mineras, de manera similar en toda la región. Gran parte de estas reglamentaciones no limitan el usufructo del territorio en el tiempo o lo hacen de manera difusa; cuando aparece el factor temporal las concesiones son por veinte o treinta años, lo que implícitamente significa: hasta el agotamiento. Dentro de este paquete de normas destinadas a subrayar la buena voluntad de los Estados respecto de las inversiones, existe una cláusula casi paradójica que declara a la minería “de interés público”.

Algunos ejemplos:

Argentina: La explotación de las minas, su exploración, concesión y demás actos consiguientes, revisten el carácter de utilidad pública. El Estado le confiere a las mineras estabilidad fiscal por 30 años y diversos beneficios impositivos (Decreto 456/1997 y 417/2003). “Estabilidad fiscal” significa la exención de impuestos fijando un único canon del 3% sobre el valor del metal extraído a boca de mina, es decir, el precio del metal antes de su elaboración. Otros metales se extraen y qué cantidad son detalles que el Estado no controla: son liquidiados por la propia empresa en una simple declaración jurada. Hasta la fecha, en la Argentina funcionan 65 emprendimientos de megaminería y está en marcha el proyecto acaso más escandaloso del continente: la mina Peñón. El minera de materiales, con el Colegio de Ingenieros de Minas de la Universidad de Buenos Aires. La mina Peñón produce anualmente más de 1,000,000 toneladas de metales, que son exportadas principalmente a los Estados Unidos y Canadá.

Colombia: Declara de utilidad pública e interés social la industria minera en todas sus ramas y fases. Por tanto podrán decretarse a su favor, a solicitud de parte interesada y por los procedimientos establecidos en este Código, las expropiaciones de la propiedad de los bienes inmuebles y demás derechos constituidos sobre los mismos, que sean necesarios para su ejercicio y eficiencia desarrollo (Ley de minería, Art. 13, 2001). En Colombia hay en la actualidad 38 proyectos de minería a cielo abierto.

El Salvador reforma su ley de minería en el año 2001 con el fin de reducir su canon de regalías del 4% al 2%. El Salvador, un país pequeño con prácticamente una sola cuenca hidrográfica grande, conoció con esta reforma de la ley 62 permisos de explotación minera a cielo abierto que abarcan poco más de 1,000 km², casi un 8% del territorio nacional.

México sanciona su ley de minería en 1992. A comienzos del milenio se reforman varios artículos con el fin de prolongar las concesiones, otorgar más de un proyecto a la misma empresa y desregular las inversiones de capital extranjero. La Red Mexicana de Afectados por la Minería (RMA) efectuó su primera convención en junio de 2008 en la ciudad de Tamaulipas. El encuentro concluyó con la Declaración de Tamaulipas, que manifestó: “la política gubernamental de los últimos 25 años ha entregado el territorio y sus entrañas a las empresas mineras transnacionales y trans nacionalizadas. 200 mil km², es decir, el 9% del territorio nacional, han sido entregados y regalados como concesiones mineras.”

Guatemala aprueba una nueva ley de minería en 1997. En ella se abre el acceso de empresas transnacionales; se suspende el límite espacial y temporal de las concesiones; se confiere al titular la facultad exclusiva de identificar y localizar posibles áreas para explotación, dentro de sus respectivos límites territoriales e inmediatamente en la profundidad del subsuelo, se otorga el derecho de ampliar la variedad de minerales extraídos; y se establece un canon de regalías del 1% mediante declaración jurada del volumen del producto minero comercializado, con base en el valor de cotización del producto en mercados internacionales o en bolsas internacionales (Artículos 21, 32, 62). El canon se paga únicamente por los minerales metálicos declarados, no así por las denominadas “tierras ácidas o raras” halladas durante el proceso de extracción entre las que se incluyen el oro, la plata u otros metales y tierras inertes, cuando todavía no están separados.

Los nuevos códigos mineros se repiten de igual manera en los países de la región, sin excepciones. Todos ellos se asientan sobre un credo que también da sustento legal a la agricultura industrial de monocultivos y agronegocios: se trata de la noción de que también la naturaleza debe ser eficiente. El concepto de eficiencia, aplicado tradicionalmente para calificar el rendimiento humano, pasa primero al marketing de algunos productos industriales, luego a la naturaleza y a la biología. La megaminería, los productos agroindustriales y, si se quiere, también la genómica, pertenecen a este nuevo espectro del desarrollo que celebra al ser humano como un demiurgo capaz de vencer todos los obstáculos que se interponen entre él y su voluntad. Este hombre nuevo sólo se sirve de la tecnología; puede prescindir de la fuerza humana, del tiempo humano, del trabajo humano. Éste es el trabajo nuevo donde empresas, medios de comunicación y políticos celebran como sociedad del conocimiento en un discurso único que promete progreso y felicidad para todos. La europa, es la que marca la ardua historia de su propia híbrida después de nosotros, el diluvio.

En el ámbito de la minería, el lúcido del nuevo modelo comenzó a elaborarse en el año 2000 en el programa Mining, Minerals & Sustainable Development (MMSD) encargado por el Instituto Internacional para el Medio Ambiente y el Desarrollo (IISH) para las nuevas empresas mineras más poderosas. El objetivo era elaborar una estrategia para “volver viable” la minería a gran escala en el mundo. Este programa, presentado en varios congresos internacionales, senó las bases de un conjunto de slogans destinados a prevenir conflictos utilizando cualquier forma de persuasión. En el Informe bróder preparado para la Agenda para el Cambio, un congreso global organizado por la iniciativa Mundial para la Minería (GMM) en la ciudad de Toronto en el año 2002, el MMSD siente las bases de un plan para América Latina centro alrededor de dos conceptos: claves: sostenibilidad y gobernanza. El documento omite la una verdad del caso: a mediano plazo no hay forma de evitar que los acidos que se utilizan en la megaminería no contaminen las aguas de agua potable. Aprobado en la conferencia de Toronto en mayo de ese mismo año, el documento instaura el concepto de sostenibilidad como instrumento de previsión de conflictos. Básicamente se trata de una declaración de principios, como el hecho de calificar una acción la modificara en la realidad. Sugiere crear un “fondo para la sostenibilidad” gestionado por el Banco Mundial y un Instituto Internacional para las poblaciones indígenas. Estos dos objetivos indican cuáles son, desde el punto de vista de las mineras, las principales causas de conflictos: los pueblos originarios y el daño ambiental.

Había nacido la “minería sostenible” como factor esencial para combatir la pobreza e insertar por fin a América Latina en las vías del “desarrollo sostenible”. Ésta es la base discursiva a través de la que
la megaminería pretende perfilarse en la opinión pública de los países con yacimientos. Al mismo tiempo, el cúmulo de eufemismos con los que se autocalifica hace imposible sospechar la condición depredadora de los procedimientos que aplica. El discurso es excluyente: todo aquel que se opone a protesta está en contra del desarrollo, merece la condena de hereje o, dicho con otras palabras, justifica la creciente criminalización de la protesta antiminería que ya se ha cobrado varias muertes a lo largo de toda la cordillera de los Andes. En menos de diez años, los estados nacionales de América Latina permitieron que las empresas transnacionales ampliaran y hegemonizaran el mapa socio-productivo no sólo del sector minero, sino también del pesquero, del de los hidrocarburos y, también, del de la agroindustria. Este modelo de desarrollo sostenible marca una involución respecto de los diferentes ensayos antihegemonicos que habían caracterizado al siglo anterior. Con pocos grados de diferencia respecto de la antigua condición colonial, América Latina asume por voluntad propia un nuevo dispositivo de colonialismo tecnológico que entrega a sus pueblos y países como rehenes de un sistema que, en nombre del desarrollo, los coloca en el camino de una segura muerte a crédito.

¿Se pueden suicidar las naciones? Más allá de su retórica, la pregunta se plantea cada vez que intereses sectoriales se imponen con tal fuerza que terminan por erosionar los lazos de ciudadanía de una sociedad. El discurso de la eficiencia, del desarrollo sostenible, del combate tecnológico contra la pobreza, es hoy por hoy una episteme fundacional. En el caso particular de la megaminería, el nuevo discurso se aplica como un programa publicitario que se hace más intenso en la medida en que aumenta la protesta social. Las empresas mineras, convertidas en "entes de responsabilidad social y empresas", han captado por medios lícitos e ilícitos la voluntad de funcionarios, medios de comunicación y, sobre todo, universidades.

A primera vista, la declaración de Evo Morales en la Televisión española ("no queremos otro Potosí"), parece marcar otro rumbo. La historia de Bolivia es paradójica: su portentosa riqueza minera la convirtió en uno de los países más pobres del mundo. El oro de Potosí, extraído sólo por mano de obra indígena fue, durante los siglos de la colonia, el motor principal del capitalismo europeo. En la primera mitad del siglo XX, los barones del estaño (Patinó, Aramayo y Hochschild) acumularon desde Bolivia las fortunas más grandes del planeta. La nacionalización de las minas en 1952 contribuyó a generar una conciencia obrero-minera que fue paulatinamente sojuzgada por los gobiernos posteriores siempre propensos a atender intereses personales o a doblarse ante influencias de corporaciones transnacionales. A la luz de este contexto, el actual Gobierno boliviano enfrenta realmente un cambio definitivo. Después de nacionalizar los hidrocarburos en el año 2006, le tocó el turno a la minería, actualmente en manos del Estado y de pequeñas cooperativas privadas. La convivencia entre cooperativas y mineras estatales no transcurrió libre de conflictos: un caso extremo fue el enfrentamiento de Huayuni en 2007 donde murieron dieciséis trabajadores. Sin embargo, la matrices del conflicto es de carácter territorial y no puede compararse con los enfrentamientos socioambientales entre comunidades y empresas mineras que tienen lugar en el resto de la región.

Bolivia posee un 15% de las reservas mundiales de litio, un mineral que se aplica en la producción de armas termoarmes, baterías, drogas medicinales y, sobre todo, en la industria automotriz; a escala global, el litio es uno de los recursos estratégicos más importantes del momento. Entre las compañías que durante los últimos meses asediaron sin éxito al Gobierno del litio, se encuentran Mitsuishi, Sumitomo, Nissan, Ford, BMW y General Motors. En la apertura de las Primeras Jornadas Internacionales sobre Litio que tuvieron lugar a final de octubre de 2009 en la ciudad de La Paz, Evo Morales anunció el "comienzo de la era de industrialización" del litio y culminó su presentación prometiendo que "...el Estado boliviano será propietario de la industria, mientras que las empresas extranjeras, primero estatales y luego privadas o transnacionales, deberán aceptar el papel de socios, pero no patronos."

La voluntad del Estado boliviano de reafirmar su soberanía otorgándole otro estatus a las empresas extractoras representa un cambio fundamental respecto del resto de América Latina. Sin embargo, el modelo de desarrollo extractivo no ha variado. Aquello que se reivindica actualmente en Bolivia es la exportación de bienes primarios es lo mismo que se da en el resto del continente. Bajo el régimen de Morales la exportación minera duplicó sus ingresos respecto de períodos similares anteriores. Aun así, el Estado boliviano pretende incrementar las cifras y con este fin prevé sancionar una nueva ley de minería en 2010. Hasta el momento, los debates previos a esa ley no hacen referencia especial al método de extracción relacionado con el medio ambiente. Sin embargo, actitudes del gobierno respecto de reclamos ambientalistas hacen suponer que Bolivia podría estar a punto de traicionar el postulado indigenista del "buen vivir" que llevó a Evo Morales al poder: el derecho de los pueblos originarios a tener una relación equilibrada con su espacio y su tiempo.

Ninguno de los gobiernos de la llamada corriente progresista de América Latina ha cuestionado seriamente el modelo extractivista. En la nueva Constitución de Ecuador sancionada en 2008 la presión de los movimientos indígenas logró, por primera vez en la historia, que la naturaleza figurara como un sujeto de derechos. Sin embargo, en enero de 2009 el Congreso dictó una ley de minería que, en lo que autorizaba la extracción a cielo abierto y le otorgaba garantías a las empresas transnacionales. En la Venezuela de Hugo Chávez, donde se lanzó el modelo del "socialismo del siglo XXI" y tiene lugar la Dufusal Revolución Bolivariana, la base fundamental de la economía es la exportación de petróleo.

Hasta el momento, los Estados de América Latina no han logrado consolidar ese modelo alternativo del que se usan algunos de sus presidentes en los encuentros internacionales. El desarrolloismo adhiere la idea de parásito accidental que rechaza o estratifica toda forma de vida en su naturaleza inmanente de impulso y de creación continua. En el caso de la megaminería, la noción de extracción como generadora no sólo de capital, sino sobre todo de sentido, se cumple con un grado de voracidad geográfica carente de cualquier ingrediente humano, incluso del odio, incluso de la codicia. Quienes desde hace seis siglos padezcan las consecuencias del saqueo y se resisten a desaparecer si saben de otros mundos: las poblaciones indígenas y los pequeños agricultores. Los verdaderos dueños de la tierra.
Confesionario para los curas de indios: con la instrucción contra sus ritos, y exhortación para ayudar a bien morir, y suma de sus privilegios, y forma de impedimentos del matrimonio. Lima 1583

Dios te guarde.
¿Quieres confesarte?
¿Eres cristiano bautizado?
¿Quién te bautizó? ¿Dónde y cómo?
¿Sabe la doctrina cristiana?

Di el padre nuestro, y el ave maría, y el crece en Dios Padre. Después que lo haya dicho pregunta los principales puntos de nuestra fe, cómo son. ¿Quién es Dios y dónde está? ¿Quién es Jesucristo? ¿Qué se hace de las almas después de esta vida? Y si no tuviere inquisición instruíale cosas y lo necesario de nuestra fe católica. Y si por sus preguntas pareciere que está sacramentado, pase adelante con la confesión: mas en artículo de necesidad, cuando hay poco tiempo, debe instruíre brevemente en lo substantial de nuestra fe, y luego confesarle. Y lo primero diga la confesión general, y luego le pregunte.

Primer Mandamiento: Amarás a Dios sobre todas las cosas

¿Has adorado huacas, villas, cerros, ríos, al Sol, a otras cosas?
¿Has ofrecido roga, coca, cuy, u otras cosas?
¿Y qué son esas cosas y cómo las ofreciste?
¿Te has confesado con algún hechicero?
¿Te has curado con algún hechicero?
¿Lo has llamado o hecho llamar para tus necesidades?
¿Qué te mandó que hicieries? ¿Y qué hiciste?
¿Has ofrecido a los muertos alguna cosa?
¿Has desenterrado y hurtado de la Iglesia algún difunto para llevarlo a la huaca o a otra parte?
¿Cuando pierdes alguna cosa o te la han hurtado, has ido a algún hechicero para preguntarle por ella, y que lo adivinase?
Viendo algunas cosas de animales, o de sabandijas, o de aves u oyéndolas cantar, ¿has dicho o creído que ha de suceder bien o mal a ti, o a tus cosas?
¿Has creído en sueños, o pedido que se los declaren, o declaradlos tú a otros?

¿Has dudado en las cosas de la fe? ¿O negándolas diciendo que no son verdad?
¿Has persuadido a otros a que idolateren y hagan cosas al modo de los antiguos o has favorecido a los tales que persuaden así?
¿Has dicho mal de Dios o de nuestra Señora, o de los Santos, y murmurado de ellos? ¿Has dicho mal de las imágenes e Iglesias y de la ley de los Cristianos?

Para los hechiceros y confessores

A los hechiceros se les ha de preguntar más en particular, todo lo que toca al primer mandamiento, y para esto servirá la instrucción que se da más larga de los ritos y supersticiones que vean los indios, así en común como en diversas partes, para que conforme a la tierra y nación se le pregunte al hechicero lo que suelen hacer los tales, y en general se pueden hacer estas preguntas a todos los hechiceros.
¿Eres hechicero de oficio, y que lo tienes de herencia, o lo aprendiste siendo ya Cristiano para ganar de comer?
¿Has inducido a otros indios, o indias para que sepan ser hechiceros y adinar, o echar suertes, o confesar indios, o hablar con el demonio?
¿Has acudido a todos los que te han llamado, y hecho por sus ritos y supersticiones, lo que te han pedido para curar enfermos, para adinar cosas venideras, o saber cosas perdidas y hurtadas, o lo que hace en otra parte, o para aficionar hombres a mujeres, o para otras cosas semejantes?
¿Has confesado algún indio oyendo sus pecados persuadiéndole que no se confiese a los Padres?
¿Has hecho juntas de indios de noche, o de día para enseñarles las cosas de las guacas, o has ido a los caminos para decirles dónde han de mochar?
¿Has adorado y sacrificado las guacas, o mirado las entrañas de animales para adinar, o hacer otras cosas supersticiosas?
¿Has procurado que no sepan la doctrina Cristiana ni guarden la ley de Dios, persuadiendo a los indios que sean como sus antepasados?

Sexto Mandamiento: No fornicarás

¿Has tenido cuenta con otras mujeres solteras o casadas? ¿Cuántás veces con cada casada? ¿Cuántas con cada soltera?
¿Has pecado con alguna doncella?
¿Has forzado alguna mujer?
¿La has persuadido con palabras o dádias a que quieras? ¿O has usado de tercera persona para persuadirla?

¿Has emborrachado a alguna mujer para pecar con ella?
¿Has tenido cuenta con alguna parienta tuya?
¿Qué parentesco tenías con ella?
¿Has pecado con dos hermanas? ¿O con madre e hija? ¿O con alguna parienta de tu mujer? ¿Y qué parentesco tenía con tu mujer?
¿Has pecado con mujer infiel?
¿Antes de casarte qué tanto tiempo estuviste con tu mujer?
¿Confesaste antes de casarte? ¿O estabas en pecado?
¿Has dado palabra de casamiento a alguna mujer? ¿Con juramento? ¿O sin él? ¿Fue para engañarla?
¿Has retozado con mujeres? ¿O besadíl? ¿O hecho otras cosas deshonestas?
¿Has pecado con mujer en iglesia o cementerio?
¿Has usado huacanqui para alcanzar las mujeres?
¿Has ido al hechicero o a la guaca para pedir remedio o bebedizo para que te quieran las mujeres?
¿Has hablado u oído hablar las palabras deshonesta o cantares deshonestos, deleitándose en ellos?
¿Haste alabado de pecados y hechos deshonestos? ¿Y eso si fue con mentira?
¿Has sido alcohuelte? ¿De soltero o de casado?
¿Has tenido polución voluntaria? ¿O tocamientos suyos contigo mismo?
¿Has usado del pecado nefando con alguna persona?
¿Has usado de bestialidad con algún animal?

(A las mujeres se han de hacer preguntas dichas, acomodándolas a personas. Y no se ha de preguntar de lo dicho más de lo que probablemente se entiende hecho el que se confiesa. En lenguas quechua y aymara se acomoden en las preguntas de este mandamiento con los vocablos pertenecientes a varón y mujer).

Confesionario para los curas de indios: con la instrucción contra sus ritos, y exhortación para ayudar a bien morir, y suma de sus privilegios, y forma de impedimentos del matrimonio / compuesto y traducido en las lenguas quichua y aymara. Por autoridad del Concilio Provincial de Lima, del año 1583.
Impreso en la ciudad de los Reyes por Antonio Ricardo primero impresor en estos reinos del Perú, año de 1585.

Transferido al español actual.
No se puede descolonizar sin despatriarcralizar

María Galindo

La fotografía de la escena de explotación y la contemplación turística "del otro"

De un lado de la mirada está el turista que pagando unos pesos llega al "Cerro Rico de Potosí" a contemplar al minero. El turista es textualmente un idiota que mira sin ver, que necesita poder decir que lo ha visto. Pero que está trágicamente privado de la capacidad de entender y de sentir. Está condenado a la contemplación turística del mundo del otro. Sacal la fotografía de la boca llena de coca, de la mano machacada, del casco o el martillo en una suerte de rito que no constancia de que él lo vio, de que él estuvo allí. El turista está atrapado en una contemplación morbos del "otro" que le sirve como mecanismo de autoengaño de su propia enajenación. Lo único que queda claro es que el dolor, el sudor, la pobreza y el primitivismo de la forma de extracción de mineral es lo que resulta gratificante, interesante y fotográvica para el turista, porque es el contraste lo que desencadena el sentido de la escena.

Del otro lado de la mirada está el minero, no se exhibe, sino que es exhibido. Tampoco él asume la escena como propia. No siente vergüenza de su pobreza o pudor por su intimidad. Sabe que está frente a un ser ajeno a su mundo, sabe que la mirada del turista es una mirada vacía incapaz de distinguir siquiera el rostro del minero, de reconocerlo o identificarlo como persona, por eso responde con indiferencia a su presencia. Si le tiraran unas monedas las recogería, si le pidieran sonreír o posar para la foto lo haría porque nada de lo que acontece en esa escena le conmueve, afecta o importa. Ambos: turista y minero, aunque en el mismo espacio, forman parte de una suerte de paralelismo, de trampa esquizofrénica capaz de dividir un mismo espacio en dos, uno enajenado del otro, sin pared que los divida, ni distancia que los separe. Ni al minero se le ocurre reclamar algo, ni al turista le afecta ni conmueve la contemplación de la escena de explotación. La contemplación turística de la escena y la exhibición de la escena sirve como metáfora de una relación enferma y nauseabunda entre un mundo y otro en situación de globalización. El turista y su cámara fotográfica son personajes tan contemporáneos como el minero, su punta y su martillo. No media entre uno y otro una relación de clase de la que se pueda hacer responsable al turista como causante o al minero como eslabón de cambio. Entre ambos media una compleja relación colonial contemporánea de la cual ninguno de los dos se hace cargo. No existe modo de relacionar la cámara fotográfica con la punta y el martillo, la foto de explotación que podría darle sentido a la relación termina como anécdota turística en un álbum de aventuras y allí muere, como imagen vacía que ni narra ni describe lo que muestra. Muy por debajo, y de manera casi imperceptible y subterránea, transcurre la historia y la relación colonial.

Muy cerca de ese sitio, también en Potosí, el lítio, como hermano del cerro envuelto en su inmenso cuerpo de sal, espera no correr el mismo destino trágico que el oro, la plata, el gas y el estaño. La boca voraz del amon está abierta y deseosa de comerase también este manjar. Para eso el viejo andamio colonial ha sido reajustado, reconceptualizado, modernizado y globalizado. La brecha tecnológica se prepara para operar una vez más como lenguaje incomprensible de ecuaciones plagadas de incógnitas post-geográficas abriendo para Potosí la recepción de su principio: el despojo voraz, genocida, insaciable y depredador.

La historia: una historia mal contada entre el cinismo racista y colonial, y el maniqueísmo victimista

Giuseppe Campusano, gestor, creador e inventor marcar del Museo Travestí del Perú, nos dice que toda "peruanidad es un travestismo", que el concepto de travestismo es un concepto que, más allá del sexo y el género, vale para la historia misma del Perú.

Quiero apropiarme de este concepto —que además de ser profundamente maricón, es también lindo, colorido y creativo— para huir de la trampa en la cual vivimos sumergidas en la sociedad boliviana entre el homenaje al colonialismo y la "Madre Patria", y la sacralización de lo indígena como expresión de lo puro, lo justo y lo auténtico.

Esta postura atrevida, extendida sobre la historia y la cultura, sugiere que todo es un travestismo, que hasta o desde lo indígena es un travestismo, porque lo indígena es sí mismo y como tal sólo existe como condición travestí; al mismo tiempo, y como parte de la misma trampa histórica, tampoco lo blanco hispano existe, sino lo blancoide condenado a su propia falsedad.

Que no se confunda esta postura con alguna forma de reivindicar el mestizaje como lugar intermedio y equilibrador en contraste con el indígenismo mítico y purista. Se trata de impugnarlo todo para abrirmos al desafío de una recomposición creativa y multiforme que pueda contener muchas utopías urgentes para todo el continente.

Esta propuesta de impugnación tampoco es la reivindicación de la resistencia al colonialismo para terminar apropiándose de esa resistencia. Postura que además acabaría siendo la cómoda reinvención de la resistencia a la medida de nuevos intereses.

Es una impugnación que, así como no concilia con el colonialismo ni con ninguna de sus crueles formas de aniquilación y despojo, tampoco busca el retorno mitico a un pasado originario idealizado.

Esta propuesta de impugnación empieza por declarar la falsedad de las historias que nos cuentan los museos, los libros de historia escolares, los monumentos y las banderas y escudos, impugnar nuestros referentes nacionales identitarios y nuestros referentes coloniales, impugnar nuestros himnos y nuestros relativos oficiales y contraoficiales. Es una propuesta de impugnación de los sujetos sacralizados redentores y propietarios de la salvación. Es una postura de impugnación de los fetichismos de los Estados Nacionales y plurinacionales que, sustituyendo un símbolo por otro o sumándole un símbolo a otro, caen en su propia trampa fetichista.

Ver la historia, la cultura, los personajes y las costumbres como un travestismo es poner en cuestión la mirada maniquea y simplificadora entre colonialismo y resistencia: por eso es una mirada política incorrecta, riesgosas y atrevida que asume la condición de fragmento, de pedacito, que tiene todo relato del pasado.

Así como la travestí no es un hombre disfrazado de mujer, así la historia del colonialismo no es la historia del sometimiento versus la resistencia, sino la combinación irresuelta y compleja que tiene muchas grietas y que, por eso mismo, posibilita a la vez muchas salidas nuevas, creativas, contradictorias, alucinantes y esperanzadoras.

Las mujeres: la "Maldición de Malinche"

La "Maldición de Malinche" es el amor al extranjero, la actitud de veneración del europeo blanco, de sus cosas, de su forma de vestir, de su dinero. La "Maldición de Malinche" es el odio a lo propio y la idealización de lo europeo, de lo español. Pero la "Maldición de Malinche" es también y al mismo tiempo la culpabilización de las mujeres por ese insoslayable sentimiento presente y arraigado en las sociedades latinoamericanas. La "Maldición de Malinche" es también y al mismo tiempo la inmortalización ejemplificadora de "la India traída" por excelencia. La "Maldición de Malinche" es la forma de cargar a las mujeres todos los males sociales, en una suerte
de purificación subterránea “del masculino” protagonista y héroes redentor de la historia.

La Malinche, la legendaria mujer amante de Hernán Cortés, traductora e intérprete de los españoles, que con su actuación posibilitó el arresto de Moctezuma, la mujer de dos nombres, uno español y uno indígena. La mujer integrante de dos pueblos que la regalaron dos veces, una a sus conquistadores indígenas y una segunda a sus conquistadores españoles, esa mujer de la cual casi de manera inequívoca se omita el dato más relevante, precisamente que fue regalada en señal de alianza política al conquistador. Ella es la puerta que quiero abrir para entrar a buscar alguna pista que nos permita ubicar y entender el lugar de las mujeres en el proceso de conquista y colonización. No estoy hablando de una ubicación de ese lugar en la historia, porque simplemente no sabría a qué historia apelar y no tendría sino retazos incompletos con que recomponerla. Estoy hablando de una ubicación política que nos sirva como juego arbitrario para esclarecer el lugar de las mujeres hoy y las jerarquías sociales que de ese lugar se derivan.

Colonialismo y Patriarcado: la dominación patriarcal no llegó con los españoles en los barcos, aunque a la hora de idealizar lo indígena eso quisiéramos creer

La relación colonial contada por una historia masculinizada aparece como una relación que transcurre entre conquistador y colonizado. El conquistador es el protagonista de la explotación cruel, el conquistado es la víctima y el sometido. El conquistador es el amo, el conquistado su vasallo. El conquistado es también el héroe de la resistencia, el conquistador es el que impone su poder.

En una historia masculinizada donde se entremezclan los héroes de un lado y los amos del otro, en un confuso panorama de procesas, aquello que queda sumergido y oculto es la relación entre colonialismo y patriarcado. Quedan ocultas las continuidades entre las instituciones patriarcales pre-coloniales y las instituciones patriarcales coloniales. ¿Por qué estas conexiones no fueron subrayadas? ¿Por qué no fueron evidenciadas? ¿Por qué se menospreció su peso político? La respuesta es más que obvia. Por un lado, los intelectuales que exaltan la resistencia indígena rescriben hoy, como hace cientos de años, la masculinización de la historia. Por el otro, los demás intelectuales, cultores del hispanismo, son muy parecidos en eso a sus propios contrincantes: se atienen al pacto patriarcal de silencio sobre la subordinación de las mujeres.

Por último, nombrar la relación entre patriarcado y colonialismo parece un acto de traición al hermano y a la cultura, un acto que es sospechoso de estar dirigido a debilitar la tesis anticolonial y justificar de antemano al conquistador, es decir, un acto imperdonable. También por esa sospecha de “traiición” se ha convertido en una relación innombrable que ha sido omitida del mapa político mental a la hora de hablar de colonialismo y descolonización.

Cada mujer indígena o española ocupó un lugar específico, definido justamente por esa continuidad patriarcal entre una sociedad y otra. La dominación patriarcal no llegó con los españoles en los barcos, aunque eso quisiéramos simplificaramente creer.

Me atrevo a ubicar tres grupos distintos de instituciones patriarcales que pueden permitirnos entender la relación entre colonialismo y patriarca.

Aquellas instituciones o mandatos culturales y políticos patriarcales estrictamente españoles que fueron impuestos a las mujeres españolas en las tierras conquistadas.

Aquellas instituciones o mandatos culturales y políticos patriarcales indígenas que se complementaron con instituciones patriarcales pre-coloniales del mundo indígena y que dieron lugar a una suerte de alianza patriarcal entre conquistador y colonizado.

Aquellas instituciones patriarcales estrictamente españolas adoptadas por el universo indígena como propias y aplicadas sobre las mujeres indígenas como modelo.

Estos tres grupos forman plegues distintos de mandatos, no son un todo, y, a su vez, estos plegues dan origen a una serie amplia y compleja de jerarquías sociales raciales, sexuales y genéricas que tienen expresiones y consecuencias contemporáneas. Sin el análisis de estos tres grupos de instituciones culturales y religiosas es imposible desentrañar y entender no sólo el lugar de las mujeres en el proceso, sino además las sociedades latinoamericanas contemporáneas.

El utero y la raza

La función de estos tres grupos de instituciones patriarcales básicamente está concentrada en:

“las hijas de familia” y el apellido como emblema: el control de la reproducción fue una de las políticas prioritarias de la colonización. Nos referimos al conjunto de normas impuestas a las mujeres españolas importadas a las tierras conquistadas para preservar la “pureza racial”, el linaje y la continuidad del poder económico y político de padres a hijos a través del control de la reproducción. Varias de estas normatividades se convirtieron en la normatividad de la clase dominante blanqueidea latinoamericana sobre sus hijas, y de muchos de sus imperativos, como el mandato de virginidad, el matrimonio pactado entre padre y novia, la prohibición de relaciones con lo imaginariamente “no blanco”. Varías de estas normatividades patriarcales sobre “la hija de familia” pesan sobre los conceptos de patria potestad y de familia, y son parte de los conceptos racistas de las sociedades latinoamericanas de hoy en día. Al mismo tiempo, la mujer española blanca como modelo de virtud y de belleza introduce un patrón racista en los cánones sexuales y de belleza presente hasta la actualidad. La mujer blanca es bella y decente, la mujer morena es fea y disponible. Esto es una verdad actual de la España actual poblada de “exiliadas del neoliberalismo”, es decir, colombianas, ecuatorianas, peruanas o bolivianas que apenas tocar la tierra española se ubican en la escala social más baja y se constituyen en el cuerpo disponible para la ocupación sexual de aquel español que así lo disponga.

--la encarnación de la virtud, la belleza y la santidad como exclusividad de la mujer blanca “hija de familia”.

--la servidumbre sexual de la mujer indígena: como botín de guerra, es decir como parte de los bienes que pueden arrebatarse, consumirse, utilizarse e intercambiarse entre conquistadores.

--la servidumbre sexual de la mujer indígena: como bien para establecer una alianza política entre conquistador y conquistado. Una suerte de pacto entre hombres a través de la entrega ritual de mujeres como vehículo de relación, entendimiento y negociación política entre conquistador y conquistado. Un nivel en el cual conquistador y conquistado comparten una misma jerarquía fundada sobre la subordinación de las mujeres indígenas.

--la conversión del hombre indígena en el excluyente y directo representante político del ayya y por lo tanto en el único interlocutor del mundo indígena con el poder colonial. Esto supone la figura del “hombre indígena” como protagonista de un despojo directo de la “mujer indígena”: de su voz, de su lugar, del fruto de su trabajo y de su tierra. Esa misma relación se traslada luego a la relación con los Estados Nacionales donde el hombre indígena es el único interlocutor del Estado y la mujer indígena queda mediatizada por la voluntad, la voz y el protagonismo político del hombre indígena. Por eso, por ejemplo, en el caso de Evo Morales nosotras hablamos de un proyecto de descolonización fálica y de la fundación de un Estado plurinacional que en ningún modo tiene la capacidad de perder o revisar su carácter patriarcal.

--la conversión de la mujer indígena en la inquina de su pareja, donde su relación con la comunit...
dad de pertenencia pasa por la relación con el protagonista, que es siempre el masculino: el esposo, el padre o el hijo. Y la adopción por tanto de una pertenencia subordinada en la comunidad. La comunidad deja de ser un ente de confuencia entre hombres y mujeres para convertirse en una entidad masculina. De adaptación, por lo tanto, y al mismo tiempo de la división sexual y jerarquizada del trabajo, donde el trabajo masculino vale siempre más que el trabajo femenino. Y donde, al mismo tiempo, el trabajo femenino pierde su carácter de trabajo, se convierte en obligación sexual y deja de beneficiar a la comunidad para beneficiar de manera directa al varón como pareja, padre o hijo.

Al funcionamiento de este conjunto de manda-
tos debemos el protagonismo del padre sobre la madre, el valor del apellido hispánico como emblema de estatus social, el control tiránico del cuerpo y el placer de las mujeres y la configuración de sociedades profundamente racistas. Un racismo donde el apellido y el color de la piel funcionan como datos inequívocos de pertenencia o exclusión social por la vía del control patriarcal sobre la madre.

Cada una de estas instituciones patriarcales tiene hoy en día en la América Latina contemporánea distintas formas de vigencia, pero son imposibles de explicar sin ubicar la relación entre colonialismo y patriarcado.

Enunciarlas pone en juego una manera de ver la historia y la sociedad: el colonialismo no es una relación entre conquistador y colonizado y, por tanto, entre conquistador y mujer del colonizado, sino que es una relación compleja que pasa inclusiva por la perversa alianza entre colonizador y colonizado. Denunciar esta alianza no es alianar con el conquistador ni relativizar el colonialismo en ninguna de sus formas ni pliegues históricos: es a nuestro entender imprescindible para destrabar el más profundo de los estabones del colonialismo, el sometimiento de las indias y la prohibición que pesa sobre ellas de construir alianzas con la "otra" diferente.

El mandato que pesa sobre ella de ser depositaria de la tradición, la mudez, la cultura y el conservadurismo, no es una política descolonizadora, sino profundamente colonial y patriarcal.

La desobediencia cultural: las "bastardillas"
Tomando el pseudónimo de una importante gráfica- tera colombiana, pienso en las hijas del patrón con la empleada. Ellas son las que ven en directo cómo su padre viola a su madre, las que ven cómo la humilla, cómo se marcha dando un portazo después de haber comido y "cogido" bien. Pienslo también en las mujeres hijas de madre indígena, cuyos cuerpos no quieren contener la tradición sino la huída de ella, y a las que en mi sociedad desprecia-
tivamente se las llama chotas o birlochas por ser poco auténticas, por no ser folclóricas, por ser en muchos sentidos extravagantes. Y sobre todo, aunque nadie lo diga, por ser finalmente peligrosas para el orden social que está fundado en la obediencia de las mujeres.

Pienso en las hijas del patrón que mal llevan en cuerpos gordos y menores el apellido castizo del patrón. Pienso en toda la inmensa sociedad contra-
dictoria y racista que se ha formado, poquito a poco y célula a célula, en los vientres de las mujeres indígenas a las que les han nacido hijos blancos, blancos y blancos. Niños bastardos y niñas rebeldes y preciosos. Sin dote ni legitimidad y muchas veces sin eso que se llama apellido. No bastaba con llamarse Blanca, como el color de la piel de su padre, o con llamarse Juana, como la esposa del patrón y del padre, con llamarse Francisca, como la orden sacerdotal de su padre, no bastaba, no había que tener eso tan difícil que es el apellido.

Las bastardillas, las bastardas, son las que no tienen lugar
Son las únicas que interpretan el color de la piel como muchos, reconociendo cada pliegue y cada tonalidad como partes de un pentagrama musical imposible de jerarquizar del blanco al moreno. Del indígena al blancanie.

Ellas, las bastardas, las bastardillas, las que crean sobre la mentira y no sobre la verdad, saben que el moreno es hijo del blanco, y el blanco es hijo de la morena. Rompen y rompenmos con nuestros cuerpos lo que nos tenemos, primero por hipócrita y segundo por insuperable.

Revelan el lugar intermedio, el intersticio y la rajadura de todo el orden racista, colonial y patriarcal.

Ellas por feas, por gordas, por menores, por atre-
vadas, por incontrolables, por despolitizadas, por incorrectas, irritan a la madre, al padre, al hermano, al cura y al amante al mismo tiempo.

Ellas, las bastardillas, son el sitio y el lugar donde podemos encontrar eso que venimos buscando: el lugar concreto, el cuerpo concreto donde colonialismo y patriarcado se han juntado.

Ellas, yo, nosotras, somos y son el cuerpo concreto donde así como patriarcal y colonialismo han encontrado encuentro, pueden encontrar cotocircuito, quiébre, contradicción y rajadura. Rajadura y quiébre que es rebeldía, insubordinación, esperanza, rebeldía y desobediencia cultural.

Desfalco Potosí
Luis Víctor Alemán Vargas

Potoche,1 explicaron los indios al inca Huayna Cápac que los había mandado a explorar un cerro imponente y de extraño color, ya que presumía que en él se podrían encontrar minerales, de igual o mejor calidad, que en las minas de Coloque Porco.

Los indios enviados por el inca le pidieron permiso a la deidad para alterar su naturaleza, a lo cual ella respondió negativamente indicando: "No saquen la plata de este cerro, que está destinado a otros dueños".2 Respetando los deseos de la deidad natural, el inca Huayna Kapac desestimó la idea de establecer minas en el cerro y nombró aquel territorio como Potoche.

Unos años más tarde, en ese mismo territorio, el hombre alteraría su relación con la naturaleza. Los primeros aventureros españoles que llegaron al nuevo continente, deslumbrados por los tesoros nativos, sojuzgaron al Estado Inca y a los señores de habla aymara oriundos de los Andes sudamericanos, estableciendo un nuevo esquema de gobierno orientado a satisfacer los intereses de la Corona de España.

Casi inmediatamente tomaron propiedad de los yacimientos mineros más conocidos, uno de ellos era el de Coloque Porco. Y por avatares del desti-
ño, supieron de la existencia de ingentes cantidades de mineral en el cerro de Potoche a través del indio Diego Huallpa, que ya se encontraba extra-
yendo mineral del mismo. En el año 1545, después de castigar al indio por ocultar semejante "descubrimiento" a la Corona de España, el capitán Juan de Villarroel, el capitán Diego de Centeno, el capi-
tán Santandía y el maestre Pedro Cotamito se trasladaron a las faldas del imponente cerro con el objetivo de explotarlo sellándose de la mano de obra indígena de la región, para lo cual estableci-
aron un gran campamento que más tarde sería bautizado por el rey Carlos v como Villa Imperial de Potosí.

Tal fue la cantidad de mineral extraído de este cerro en los primeros meses, que los capitanes espa-
ñoles vieron la necesidad de ampliar su obsoleto campamento, por un asentamiento más acorde con los recursos necesarios para la explotación del cerro: mayor cantidad de mano de obra indígena y, por lo tanto, mayor cantidad de edificaciones, y un
mínimo de organización en la disposición del espa-
icio urbanístico.

Fue la Corona de España, a través del virrey Toledo, la que en 1572 estableció un nuevo sistema de administración territorial por medio de las re-
ducciones españolas "que consistían en reunir en todos los pueblos de reducción a toda la población de los ayllus que vivía dispersa en comunidades y pequeñas estancias", con fines administrativos de control del tributo indígena, de acceso a la mano de obra a través de la mita y de adoctrinamiento reli-
gioso. De esta manera, se crearon nuevas unidades jurisdiccionales que incluían audiencias, correg-
mientos y capitánías de mita, reduciendo las enormes confederaciones de señores auyumas a simples provincias. En la región de Potosí, por ejemplo, la confederación de los señores de Chacras fue redu-
cida a la provincia Chacras, y las poblaciones de los Jatun Ayllus de Chaqui y Turupalka, entre otros, se vieron reducidas a los pueblos de Chaqui y Toro-
palca, cuyos asentamientos humanos se establecían alrededor de sus respectivas parroquias, aunque luego estos pueblos fueron deshabitados por los indios que regresaron a sus antiguas comunidades o establecieron nuevas. Por esto se dice que en la práctica, muchos de los ayllus originarios mantuvieron o reconstruyeron su administración autó-
noma del espacio territorial, a través de diferentes estrategias.

En la Villa Imperial de Potosí, en cambio, el orde-
namiento habitacional fue permanente y las parro-
quias se constituyeron en el núcleo aglutinador de los asentamientos humanos, y con el tiempo estructuraron los diferentes barrios de la ciudad. Las anti-
guas construcciones del campamento minero fueron derrumbadas y se construyeron nuevas construc-
tiones alrededor de las quince parroquias de indios, de los seis conventos de frailes y de la iglesia matriz existente por aquellos años.

Con el rápido crecimiento demográfico de la Villa Imperial (120,000 habitantes en 1573; 150,000 habitantes en 1611; y 160,000 en el año 1650), la Iglesia Católica se convirtió en uno de los mayores exponentes de las fuerzas dominantes, y asumió el rol primordial en la organización de los hechos cul-
turales transmitidos por los españoles, como indica Ileana Almeida:

"La red urbanística, la arquitectura, la pintura, la imaginería, la música, las costumbres, la educación, el papel de la mujer, las relaciones familiares, evidencian el predominio religioso."

La parroquia y el barrio de San Pedro

En este contexto se construye la parroquia de indios "San Pedro", cuyo año de fundación data de 1581 pues existe constancia de que en 1585 ya se encon-
traba funcionando. Fue una de las primeras parro-
quias de indios de la Villa Imperial de Potosí, por lo

cual, su construcción y acabado fueron más rús-
ticos que los de otras parroquias destinadas a españo-
les. Como sufrió varios desperfectos, en 1655 la parroquia tuvo que ser remodelada, y en 1725 se rehizo su campanario; sin embargo, aún mantiene su estructura original, compuesta de una nave con crucero, cubierta con artesonado, y sus dos portadas originales.

Esta iglesia fue construida por y para los mitayos de Potosí que trabajaban dentro de la mina, y es inte-
resante la justificación que da un vecino del barrio respecto a esta construcción:

"...los que hacían trabajar, los españoles que colonizaban, seguramente en reconocimiento (en justificación de) las faltas que hacían, han hecho construir esta Iglesia" (Mario Victoria), vecino de San Pedro, 5 de noviembre de 2009).

En la época de la colonia, esta parroquia de indios era atendida por los frailes dominicos, que tenían como objetivo evangelizar a la población indígena, tratando de extirpar las idolatrías existien-
tes en la religión andina e imponer la creencia en un solo Dios. Otro de los vecinos del barrio me comentó al respecto:

...yo creo que ha habido (en la colonia) cosas buenas y ha habido cosas malas, tal vez no en el sen-
tido de la evangelización, sino tal vez en el sentido de cómo querían hacer la evangelización, tal vez se ha intentado de un solo broche borrar lo que vivía el pueblo, su identidad cultural, entonces creo que, a pesar de todo, esos se han dado cuenta, y luego los que han venido posteriormente a evangelizar, creo que más bien han asumido con responsabilidades su rol y han empezado a evangelizar desde lo que vivía la gente, desde lo que sentía la gente."

La parroquia y el barrio de San Pedro

En este contexto se construye la parroquia de indios "San Pedro", cuyo año de fundación data de 1581

la época colonial, por lo que la mayoría de las casas mantiene algunas moliendas, algunos desmontes de minerales, hasta la actualidad han permanecido generación tras generación y han ido pasando de familia en familia.

El barrio de San Pedro y su parroquia en la actualidad

El barrio de San Pedro en la actualidad continúa siendo un barrio predominantemente minero, donde se encuentran cooperativas mineras e inge-
nios, restos de moliendas e incluso restos de las uay-
ras u hornos tradicionales que se utilizaban para fundir el mineral en los primeros años de la explo-
tación del cerro. San Pedro también tiene fama de ser uno de los barrios más tradicionalistas de la ciudad de Potosí, ya que mantiene y reconstruye muchas de las costumbres originadas en la época colonial, establecidas por la Iglesia Católica en con-
frontación con las costumbres e creencias de los indígenas mitayos. Esta identidad mestiza del barrio se ve reforzada por el recuerdo recurrente de la edad de oro del Potosí en auge, entre los siglos xvii y xviii, cuando el nombre de la Villa Imperial era sinónimo de prosperidad y pompa: "Sin distinción de clase, la propia memoria de los habitantes de Potosí parece suspendida en esa edad de oro [...]. En la pluma de sus periodistas y en el corazón de sus habitantes, Potosí sigue siendo la Villa Imperial, título conce-
vido por Carlos v [...]."

En la construcción de esta unidad territorial con identidad cultural y política propias, los lazos de parentesco y las redes sociales han sido fundamentales. Las familias san pedreas han logrado repro-
ducir su patrimonio económico sin trastocar su patrimonio cultural, que han transmitido los abue-
os y las abuelas del barrio a través de la tradición oral. Esto también ha permitido la convivencia en amistad y solidaridad entre los habitantes de este acogedor barrio, donde todos se conocen y todos se hablan.

En este contexto social se encuentra la parroquia de San Pedro, que si bien tiene la tarea de transmi-
tir el evangelio cristiano bajo las normas estableci-
das por la Iglesia Católica, se ha adaptado al con-
texto humano existente en el barrio, a juzgar por lo que indica un vecino: "han empezado a evangelizar desde lo que vivía la gente, desde lo que sentía la gente" (Johnny Llanos, vecino de San Pedro, 29 de octubre de 2009). Algo que nos permite observar esto es la participación activa de los vecinos en la vida cotidiana y en las celebraciones religiosas de la parroquia. La comunidad parroquial de San Pedro está conformada por varios grupos parroquiales que pueden ser formados por afinidad, por la calle en la
que viven o por generación. A través de esta amplia comunidad parroquial, se organizan las diferentes celebraciones religiosas del calendario festivo católico. Por ejemplo, recientemente se celebró la Navidad de antaño, una fiesta que une a la comunidad de Potosí. El grupo que organizó esta celebración fue el de las "madres solidarias", quienes desarrollaron diferentes actividades como venta de comidas, sorbos, etc., mediante las que recaudaron fondos necesarios para costear el festejo. Lo mismo ocurrió con la fiesta de San Pedro, en la cual se festeja el aniversario del barrio y de la parroquia: en esta actividad la junta de vecinos del barrio es la que se encarga de organizar los festejos que duran alrededor de una semana. También se nombra a una familia "pasante" del barrio que debe organizar la procesión de la imagen de San Pedro por todo el barrio, y se debe hacer cargo de los gastos del último día de festejo (obviamente este acto no es gratis: la familia pasante acumulará prestigio frente a sus vecinos y mantendrá una relación privilegiada con el santo y la parroquia).

A la cabeza de la parroquia se encuentra el párroco Favier Calisaya, oriundo del pueblo de Chaqui—Jatun Ayllu Chaqui antes de la reducción española—del departamento de Potosí. El "padre Favier" tiene la capacidad de comunicarse con distintos segmentos del barrio así como con personas de distintas edades, y ha sabido llamar la atención de los jóvenes del barrio, quienes lo ayudan en las muchas tareas cotidianas de la parroquia. En sus misas mezcla el idioma quechua con el idioma español con el fin de comunicar de manera "el mensaje del Señor". En muchas actividades le he visto compartir un "pijicho" de coca con los/as vecinos/as del barrio. En una de estas oportunidades yo era el encargado de repartir la coca, y dada mi inexperiencia repartí muchas hojas de coca a cada persona haciendo caer la coca al suelo y cuando, nervioso, me dispuse a recoger las hojas que se habían caído, el padre Favier me dijo: "...no te preocupes Luis, bien nos va a ir, a la pachamama también hay que invitarle, suerte es..." (reunión grupo Litoral, 15 de octubre de 2009).

Lejos de ser un párroco ortodoxo, el padre Favier es un párroco que entiende y practica el habitus cultural de los/as potosinos/as y se muestra flexible con respecto al contexto social que lo rodea.

Estas características, entre otras, han permitido la construcción de una comunidad parroquial sólida en el barrio de San Pedro, que tiene espacios de decisión propios en los que se decide sobre las actividades y los recursos de la parroquia.

Uno de estos recursos es el cuadro La flagelación de Jesús de autor anónimo, que fue escogido por los curadores alemanes Andreas Siekmann, Alice Creischer y Max Jorge Hinderer para la muestra de pintura titulada Principio y Potosí del Museo Reina Sofía, institución que patrocina la exposición. Sin embargo, la comunidad parroquial de San Pedro decidió no prestar el cuadro bajo ninguna condición. Veamos por qué se tomó esta decisión.

**Desfalco Potosí**

A los pocos días de iniciado mi trabajo de investigación en la parroquia de San Pedro, uno de los encargados de la parroquia me contaba la siguiente historia acerca de la llegada del cuadro La flagelación de Jesús a la parroquia:

"Las pinturas (seis pinturas de la iglesia de San Pedro) pertenecen a la iglesia de Santo Domingo, y llegaron a la iglesia de San Pedro por casualidad. Un día unos ladrones pasaron por el barrio de San Pedro con las seis pinturas, en esos los vecinos le quitaron los cuadros viendo que eran pinturas con motivos religiosos. Por esto, los cuadros fueron entregados a la iglesia de San Pedro por su cuidado.

Hace unos años (2003-2004), el padre de Santo Domingo se presentó en la iglesia de San Pedro con una carta del Obispo, indicando que los cuadros serían devueltos a la iglesia de Santo Domingo porque no son propiedad de esa iglesia. El párroco de San Pedro no pudo hacer nada frente a las órdenes del Obispo del departamento de Potosí y estaba entremando los cuadros al párroco de Santo Domingo; sin embargo, minutos después los vecinos de San Pedro se movilizaron y acudieron a la iglesia para impedir que estos cuadros salieran del templo, el párroco de Santo Domingo no pudo completar su tarea por esta movilización repentina del barrio. Esos días el barrio se organizó para evitar que las pinturas salieran del templo, formaron comités de vigilancia compuestos por jóvenes, niños, abuelos, etc. Por esto incluso ahora existe susceptibilidad por parte del barrio" (Parroquia de San Pedro, Potosí, 16 de junio de 2009).

Después de algunos meses en el barrio me di cuenta de que esta versión era la que se contaba a los turistas que llegaban a la parroquia y preguntaban por el origen de las pinturas. Existe otra versión del interior del barrio, que me confirmó el padre Favier en mis últimas entrevistas.

Resulta que la iglesia de Santo Domingo fue refaccionada unas décadas atrás, y como los domínicos también estaban a cargo de la parroquia de San Pedro, decidieron trasladar las pinturas de la iglesia de Santo Domingo a la parroquia de San Pedro. La refacción de la iglesia tardó algunos años, durante los cuales la comunidad parroquial de San Pedro se apropió de los cuadros depositados en su custodia. Una vez que terminó la refacción de la iglesia de Santo Domingo, el padre encargado se dispuso a recoger las pinturas en custodia; sin embargo, los vecinos del barrio no permitieron que estos cuadros se movieran y, aunque unos cuantos salieron por descuido de los vecinos, La flagelación de Jesús y otros se quedaron en la parroquia de San Pedro.

Así llegó el cuadro La flagelación de Jesús a la parroquia de San Pedro, y ésta es una de las razones principales por las que la comunidad parroquial de San Pedro se niega a prestar la pintura para cualquier muestra de arte. Porque en caso de que la pintura se preste al Museo Reina Sofía con la garantía de que retorne a nuestro país y a nuestra ciudad, nada podrá asegurar que el Obispo y el párroco de Santo Domingo demanden el retorno de estas pinturas a la iglesia de Santo Domingo.

Por otro lado, las garantías que podría ofrecer el Museo Reina Sofía de devolver la pintura original a nuestro país no son demasiado concretas. Nadie en Potosí, o al menos en el barrio de San Pedro, conoce al director del museo, ni al grado de fiabilidad de tal institución. Por otro lado, ni el Viceministerio de Cultura ni el Gobierno son interlocutores válidos para tal trámite, ya que los funcionarios encargados de nuestro patrimonio son los principales sospechosos de exportar ilegalmente nuestro patrimonio al mercado negro internacional. Basta decir que las iglesias del departamento de Potosí han sufrido diez robos en los últimos cuatro años, lo que hace suponer que se está haciendo un seguimiento de las obras de arte más importantes, para sustraerlas de sus respectivas iglesias en el momento oportuno.

En resumen, la petición de préstamo del cuadro La flagelación de Jesús por parte del Museo Reina Sofía, a través del Gobierno Boliviano, a la comunidad parroquial de San Pedro expresa las relaciones coloniales que mantenemos los bolivianos con instituciones extranjeras, sean museos, empresas, ayuda internacional, etc., quienes, como compradores en un supermercado, deciden qué pinturas pueden prestar/sacar del país, naturalmente ayudados por algunos burócratas de clase media alta que buscan llenarse los bolsillos prestando/vendiendo recursos que le pertenecen al país en su conjunto, pero que tienen su custodia en poblaciones específicas, como en el barrio de San Pedro. Por suerte, la comunidad parroquial de San Pedro desconocía y establece relaciones ambiguas con estas instituciones, como lo hicieron los ayllus del Norte de Potosí en su relación con las minas aledañas,12 manteniendo sus recursos de manera autónoma, resistiendo ante el continuo Desfalco Potosí."
Prologue:  
The Long Memory of Cocaine  
Max Jorge Hinderer

Also in what this chronicle [Pedro de Cierza de León] says, who asked the Indios why they always kept this herb in their mouths, to which they replied that they felt little hunger and great strength, that is still true today! Such that no Indio would enter the mine and engage in any work, build houses, or work on the field, without having it in his mouth, even if they see how life threatens to drain away. (Bartolomé Aranzas de Orsua y Vela)

The capitalization of labor power in the sixteenth century was connected to the use of coca, as much as the finance market, the immaterial labor, and creative industry sectors at the end of the twentieth century are connected to the use of cocaine. At the same time, in John Barker's words, "cocaine appears as the modern day equivalent of what silver meant as a motor of Western economy/finance": some kind of white gold—commodities of institutional value for the global economic system and its local ramifications. Although today both material and immaterial labor, and coca and cocaine, happen simultaneously. Rather than marks in the history of the Weltgeist, their differences are expressions of the world division of labor, and its system of exclusion and inclusion. In order to analyze the simultaneity and global implications of the commodification of labor from Cerro Rico to Wall Street, we recall The Long Memory of Cocaine.

From conquest to government  
The conquest of America was one of the most brutal genocides in world history. The retarded recognition of the indigenous people as humans came along with the assumption that becoming human would be intrinsically bound to being Christianized. This is how the indigenous population could become "free people" if they internalized the terror they had been exposed to beforehand: there was no doubt that Hell really did exist, and the conquista proved it! At the end of the sixteenth century, simultaneous to what Karl Marx described as the so-called "primitive accumulation" in England, Philip II of Spain developed a governmental strategy to transform power over life within one single despotic body, his own—the Spanish crown under the Habsburg regime—into a productive machinery that creates value processing life. In the 1570–80s he implemented a series of laws that would ultimately mark a clear difference to the conquest politics of his father, Charles V, the emperor–conqueror who subjected the New World. The onus was on Philip to become the first governor to administrate this subsection—the territorial and economic extension of the Spanish empire. And it was Philip II who recognized that the progressive theological discourse of the time would not have to stand in contradiction to the benefits of the royal economy: The new humans in the new territories can be made even more productive as free disposable laborers than merely as productive livestock—with the mita system they can become "free" productive livestock and simultaneously be indebted for being so. For the Spanish crown the "humanization" of the indigenous people was a win-win situation. For the indigenous this double-bind is the creation of a paradoxical constitution: their inclusion was based on their own structural exclusion, a biopolitical tool that persists even today.

Thus, the attempt was to capitalize life itself, transforming the tributaries from being villains into freelance subjects (humans), and their very lives and labor force becoming an investment to render surplus value in order to turn upward from the debts of the crown. With the unfulfilled promise of a free life, what basically happened is the outsourcing of the responsibility of the crown to keep those bodies alive, that harbor the labor force the crown again is tyrannizing. Yet this is not only the creation of a global proto-proletariat. It is also the beginning of a pursuit of life, though as a governmental strategy implemented into the productive body, and the basis for the design of a government of global range.

The implementation of the biopolitical complex  
At this point Philip dominated the largest parts of Latin America, the Philippines, and the Iberian territory, while also relying on the economic network of the Habsburg dynasties of Austria–Hungary and the Netherlands. Philip's governmental technology entailed the appropriation and centralization of three basic structures of social reproduction: the health sector, the cultural sector, and freedom from slavery for the colonial individuals—a right which, rather than assuring "equality before God," implemented a structural debt on the royal economy.

(v) In 1781, the Edificio Sabatini—which today treasures Picasso's Guernica and houses the Museo Reina Sofia—was inaugurated as a new monumental building for Madrid's Hospital General, an insti-
Este sacrificio es por la injusticia de la justicia
The Long Memory of Cocaine
Momento frames
(details)
2005-2010
Santa Cruz de la Sierra
Compilation of press photos
and drawings with procaine hydrochloride powder
Max Jorge Hindener
tution originally forcibly set up by Philip II in 1587 against the will of the Church. Philip’s idea was to centralize the Madrilian health and medical sector and bring all facilities together under one roof and under one crown. This assured that all health-providing institutions would have to pay their dues to the crown, so that a cure automatically produced a debt to the state.

(2) Philip II took similar measures with regard to the arts, by centralizing printing production. Cristophe Plantin in Antwerp was given the monopoly of the production of all the prints that would travel to the Spanish colonies, where they would be reproduced in the churches of the viceroyalty of Peru to then travel to Mexico and to Manila on the Philippines. Promoted to court printer in 1571, Plantin gained the monopoly on printing and on the sales of missals, breviaries, and books of hours in the entire Spanish territory, including all the colonies. Philip II, in the role of entrepreneur, thus took up a central position in the trade of books.

(3) In the same decade, Philip II imposed the mita system in the viceroyalty of Peru. On a legal level, it provided reassurance that the indigenous population of the Andes were given the status of “free people” and could no longer be taken as slaves. But the system also organized a free labor force under state rule, forcing private entrepreneurs and mine owners to employ their workers through the state and to pay taxes to the Spanish crown. However, this quasi-citizenship turned the indigenous people into debtors of the state, as they were forced to pay tribute to the crown through their labor force, the only thing they had left. This is where coca comes into play: Without coca, the Mitayos could not endure the workload they were expected to. It was coca, the divine plant of all Andean cultures, that—in altered patterns of consumption—kept them alive to do so.

Coca and the continuous double-bind So when Philip II, King of Spain, repealed the recently imposed prohibition on coca in 1573, it had nothing to do with recognizing local culture, but rather with maximizing profits. The colonial powers snatched the legal availability of coca leaves by partially prohibiting and strategically monopolizing the legal coca market. And it was not long before all the investors realized that maximum profit was not to be obtained by merely keeping the indigenous people alive for work in mining production, as well as—and this is the truly perfidious thing about it—by selling them the coca leaves that they needed to do this forced labor. As a result, the utility value of the millennia-old crop plant of the indigenous peoples underwent a transformation that cannot be retold in a linear form. Rather, this transformation can be described as a cyclically recurring principle of violence. Almost 300 years before coca and cocaine existed as distinguishable substances, the fundamental transformation of coca and the attendant violent “mercantilization” of its utility value under Habsburg rule in a way anticipated German chemist Albert Niemann’s isolation of the active alkaloid cocaine from the coca leaf in 1860. In the sixteenth century, when the value of coca leaves for production was associated with its active alkaloid (and not with the leaf as such), this led to an intrinsic division of coca into both holy plant and a fuel for the insatiable engine of modernity. The historical aspect of this inherent division is a deep rift that continues to define the double-bind relationship between coca and cocaine even today.

From Coca to Capital: Cocaine and the Potosí Principle

John Barker

In December 2009, the British Observer newspaper reported the assertion made by the United Nations illegal drugs czar, Antonio Maria Costa, that he had seen evidence that the proceeds of crime were the “only liquid investment capital” available to some banks on the edge of the credit crunch collapse, and that a majority of the estimated $350 billion drugs profit had been absorbed into the legitimate financial system.¹ He was, needless to say, coy about which banks had benefited, commenting only that the evidence came from intelligence sources and state prosecutors, but what it did do is to blow away the myth that drugs profits are laundered only through dubious offshore concerns. At the same time, Costa is a hard line exponent of the war on drugs, a “war” without which those profits would not be realized and ready for use as that “liquid investment capital.”

Coca is now the most financially significant product of the illegal drug industry subject to this war. At the same time, the dynamics of the very capitalism which has recently needed that injection of liquid capital, regardless of its origins, create the conditions that make coca growing the most rational economic choice for many small-scale Andean farmers, while it is they who are most penalized by this “war without end.” Instead, cocaine is not only functional to the creation of private capital, but the war against it is useful ideologically and in terms of the selective repression it requires and entails both internationally and internally. This involves notions of “backwardness” in the case of small-scale farming, and of the individualized racial character “defects” of particular consumers. In the United States specifically it has played a large part in creating a self-perpetuating and racist “prison-industrial complex.”²

The drug is also functional to capital as an aid to the “productivity” of certain kinds of labor in what are termed creative and financial industries. The capacity of cocaine to generate both a promiscuous enthusiasm and controlled perseverance makes it especially suited to such project-defined work. In recent years the demand has increased still further as other areas of work demand worker performance.³
This reality however, cannot be given any official or academic recognition.

In the sixteenth century King Philip of Spain overturned the Catholic Church's ban on coca in the name of labor productivity, but such pragmatism concerning the legality of coca is ideologically impossible now, with the exception of one movement in Bolivia that has fought for recognition of its cultural significance and a properly scientific appreciation of its qualities.

Bring forth the backward
It is hardly coincidental that the major producers of the war targeting cocaine, heroin, and marijuana/cannabis are countries designated as "underdeveloped," or what have also been called "backward" areas of the world. Throughout most periods of colonialism words like "savages" have depicted ideologies of racial superiority. After World War II a new language emerged, articulated in the inaugural speech of US president Harry Truman in 1948 and reasserted in John F. Kennedy's Alliance for Progress.

The institutional context to Truman's speech was the birth of the United Nations and the Bretton Woods institutions. The "moral" and "civilizational" superiority of the United States which previous presidents had proclaimed now manifested itself as science and technology. Referring to peoples of the world whose "economic life is primitive and stagnant," he said: "We must embark on a bold new program for making the benefits of our scientific advances and industrial progress available for the improvement and growth of underdeveloped areas." It would be from then on that "underdeveloped" became part of the language of political economy, at a time when it was uniquely US technology that would "develop" these others. "The United States is pre-eminent among nations in the development of industrial and scientific techniques. The material resources which we can afford to use for the assistance of other peoples are limited. But our imponderable resources in technical knowledge are constantly growing and are inexhaustible," Truman added.

Just two years later in 1950—mid-term for Truman—one Howard Fonda, a banker and president of the US Pharmaceutical Association, led a UN Commission to study coca. His study of the Aymara and Quechua peoples (assisted by a translator) concluded that poverty in the Andean countries was caused by coca chewing because it lowered the capacity to work. This flatly contradicted the seriously concerned conquistador exploiters of silver mines. Apart from its denigration of two "backward" cultures, Fonda's report was clearly self-interested and unscientific, "plagued by prejudices, unfounded speculation, and third-hand sources."

Yet this did not prevent it being ratified by the World Health Authority in 1952, and the power of such self-interested prejudice became even clearer with President John F. Kennedy's Alliance for Progress, a refreshed version of the Truman rhetoric. Its existence was proclaimed in 1961, and in the same year—with the Fonda "evidence" still unchallenged—the Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs outlawed coca except as a flavoring agent. In the Alliance's charter, "peace-loving peoples" were specifically those who promoted the "conditions that will encourage the flow of foreign investments" to the region. Between Truman and Kennedy such conditions had to be enforced by the Eisenhower administration with a coup in Guatemala to the benefit of the United Fruit Company. Since then a whole array of enforcement measures have been devoted to highly selective versions of free trade and the free flow of capital.

Despite its powers of enforcement, capitalism cannot tolerate other socio-economic modes of living. They are an afford. And in the case of opium and coca, the fact that they have been traditionally and uniquely produced in "backward" areas makes them inherently bad. There is an obvious contradiction here. Cocaine was actually synthesized by a European using those "industrial and scientific techniques" that Harry Truman boasted of, and yet its production still depends on the coca leaf. Equally, the 1961 Single Convention On Drugs which proclaimed the total prohibition (and therefore eradication) of chewing coca to be completed in twenty-five years, and made cocaine Public Enemy Number One—even though it was heroin that was the scare of the time in the USA—had a get-out clause in Article 27, by which "it is allowed to plant, transport, market and possess coca leaf in the quantity necessary for the production of flavoring agents." Jorge Hurtado points out that this clause was inserted solely in the interests of the Coca Cola Corporation.

At this point wars were monopolized by the Cold War. The year 1961, however, marks the beginning of what in our age has become one of many thematically-defined wars: the war on drugs, and subsequently on terrorism, and now—grotesquely—on poverty and cancer. It is ironic that while intellectuals engaged in realpolitik routinely talk of a "new Middle Ages" in the context of "underdeveloped" countries, their masters talk not just of wars, but pitch drug czars—the "drug czar" role was first coined by the present US vice-president Joe Biden in October 1982—against drug barons. A minority of academics and various people who have worked in drug enforcement agencies have spoken about the ineffectiveness of this "war," and that it is counter-productive in many ways. Why then its continuation, which depends on the continued illegal status of cocaine and which has not altered the demand for the drug in a performance-oriented world of capitalist work?

The prison-industrial complex
The war against drugs is thus in part ideological, or what used to be called cultural imperialism, meaning a racist association of drugs deemed to be illegal with peoples considered to be inferior and therefore in a state of "backwardness." A "war on drugs" industry has developed upon this ideology, which is a perfect representation of Marx's mordantly witty riff on the productivity of the criminal "Apologist Conception of the Productivity of All Professions." That edifice of jobs and "technical" developments has been built up around the world but, as in many other instances, the United States has been the pioneer. "This requires first of all an overestimation of the "problem" in the interests of all the bureaucracies involved. A previous drug scare at the height of the Vietnam War when heroin was "America's Public Enemy Number One," as President Nixon told Congress (although he referred generically to "drug abuse"), kicked off the language of war. It also requires ideological input from those armchair Spartans of the US' "power elite" who see decadence in their own citizens, or rather certain groups of citizens. Decadence in this case is both a mirror image of "backwardness" but also a perceived threat to "morality" and "authority." Despite the heroin "scare" the prison population of the USA stood at only 380,000 in 1975. Yet in 1973 Governor Rockefeller of New York, who had ordered the massacre at Attica prison, proposed life sentences without parole for all dealers of hard drugs and thus set the tone for what would happen when Ronald Reagan took power in 1980. On a practical level the Drug Enforcement Agency (DEA) was established in the same year. This agency became the neocolonial arm of the war on drugs industry, but it is only part of one of twelve government departmental counter-drug policy agencies that are now estimated to have $30 billion a year at their disposal.

What really tells the war on drugs story, however, is the unprecedented increase in the numbers of inmates in US prisons, which involves far greater levels of expenditure, but also produces private capital.
in the form of profits. Between 1975 and 1985 the population had more or less doubled to 740,000 prisoners. This was five years into the life of the Reagan administration, during which the US interest in Latin America involved stepping up its training of local military and police torturers. The Cold War was still the context, but it was one in which neoliberal politico-economic policies demanded an increase in internal repression portrayed as a "culture war." In this period it was not just Reagan upping the ante. It was also the Congressional Democrats competing to see who could be the toughest, and the Anti-Drug Abuse Act of 1986 ascribed to their Senate leader Tip O'Neill wanting the party to take control of the Senate in upcoming elections with the support of the current vice president, Joe Biden. Twenty-six new drug crimes with mandatory minimum sentences were included and prosecutors were given the right to appeal against sentences considered lenient. Fifteen years into the war against drugs, it coincided with an increase in drug-related violence and the rapid growth of crack cocaine (a form of freebase for the poor), as well as with the first stage in American deindustrialization and attacks on the welfare system. It was at this time that the war became overtly what the great novelist Toni Morrison labeled an attack on and extreme marginalization of black men, and what Jerome Miller called the "American gulag." More specifically, it was an attack on black men and, as it transpired, black women blinkered by a "culture of poverty," because the neoliberals psychologized being poor as a character defect.

All this was made clear at the changeover from Reagan to George Bush Sr., when a prototype armchair Spartan with a nicotine addiction, William Bennett, moved from being education secretary to head the Office of National Drug Policy Control as its czar. The agenda he and his team brought with them meant, as Dan Baum points out, that the notion of drugs as a health problem was ditched. This was in part because it was an approach that raised the problem of why and how corporate-controlled tobacco and alcohol could become legal. Instead, the real issue was "character," a notion of selectively defined decadence combined with the trademark psychologizing of neoliberalism. Its flip side was the assertion of authority. The "stern white man" must be seen to be in control and morally entitled to be so. Baum describes how cocaine (plus heroin and marijuana) were subject to a tautology: they were "immoral" because they were "illegal" and vice versa. He goes on to cite Bennett himself saying: "The drug crisis is a crisis of authority, in every sense of the word 'authority.'" This could mean only one thing: "a massive wave of arrests is a top priority for the war on drugs."

After a further ten years in 1995 the prison population had more than doubled again to 1.6 million, meaning that in the two decades since 1975 it had quadrupled. In the 1996 presidential election the two main candidates Bill Clinton and Bob Dole outbid each other on just how tough they were going to be in the "war." The prison population now stands at around 2.2 million with 5 million either on probation or parole; the state corrections budget stands at $50 billion annually. The figures broken down according to race also show that Toni Morrison was not being rhetorical. In 2005 there were 4,789 black males per 100,000 in prison compared to 786 white males. For black men between twenty-five and twenty-nine the number is 11,695. In parts of Detroit—that icon of US deindustrialization—one in sixteen males is under correctional control. Speaking some thirty-five years on from when Governor Rockefeller pioneered ever- heavier sentencing for drug possession in New York state, the New York Civil Liberties Union talked of them as the Jim Crow laws of the twenty-first century, pointing out that in addition to the racial disparity, 40 percent of imprisonment in the previous decade had been for drug offenses.

It is impossible to establish a direct connection between deindustrialization and an increase in drug convictions, but this increase has accompanied the imposition of insecure and underpaid jobs, and the "restructuring" of the social welfare system to make it more punitive. The symbiotic relation between this huge arrest-and-conviction pool and the prison business has, however, become much clearer. Eric Schlosser writes:

"What was once a niche business for a handful of companies has become a multibillion-dollar industry with its own trade shows and conventions, its own Web sites, mail-order catalogues, and direct marketing campaigns. [It] now includes some of the nation's largest architecture and construction firms, Wall Street investment banks that handle prison bond issues and invest in private prisons, plumbing-supply companies, food-service companies ... companies that sell everything from bullet-resistant security cameras to padded cells available in a "fast color selection" ... [It also has its own trade newspaper called] Correctional Building News." In the case of state prisons the construction boom has involved a process of geosocial engineering, bringing jobs and income to highly selective locations. Malone in upstate New York is an example highlighted by Lynne Duke. Once a town in decline with factories shut or downsized and where dairy farms had collapsed, now it boasts three prisons that have brought in 1,600 well-paid jobs and associated employment that services those incomes. "Military Keynesianism" has been rightly identified as the dirty secret of free market capitalism. "Prison Keynesianism" is a lesser version, but its expansion in an era of tighter social budgets is no less real. And to a considerable degree this whole edifice is built on having prohibited the products of plants grown by small-scale farmers in "backward" countries.

"An unfortunate style of crop diversification"

It is not hard to see that there are powerful interests at work in the maintenance of this particular unending war. More than that, globalized capitalism creates and recreates the conditions whereby the growing of coca and transportation of cocaine become the only rational options for people in the poorest parts of the world—rational in the neoliberal sense of individualized, calculating how human nature is and ought to be. The emphasis on the virtues of international "free" trade has increased both the necessity and opportunity for different peoples to become involved in the cocaine business. The opportunity factor is obvious—exponential growth in international trade, proclaimed as an absolute virtue has with its millions of containers, air flights, penetration of new markets and so on, created far more opportunities for the transportation of cocaine across borders.

At the same time other distinctive characteristics of global capitalism have provided motivation both for growers and transporters:

—Its intolerance of anything but itself, and of particular indigenous, non-capitalist cultures means, materially, an intolerance of non-capitalist agriculture, whether it involves communal land or peasant (campesino) farming.

—International trade is not free. The assumption of equal power amongst market participants is an obvious lie, and especially so in agriculture. While preaching equality, the West has consistently used subsidies, export credits, and import quotas to serve its own interests. Combined with an imposition of its version of free trade and its version of development as monoculture crops for export, it has destroyed a whole class of small farmers producing food for their own markets. This has been most spectacular in the case of Mexico since the imposition of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), something so clearly foreseen and opposed by the Zapatista movement.

—Risk taking by capital in order to establish the optimum allocation of resources has been its self-
proclaimed virtue. The current banking crisis has made a mockery of this claim, and the risk has been passed onto the people of the world at large. In agriculture this has been the experience for far longer. The power of wholesale oligopolies and increasingly of supermarkets has shifted the risks of small-scale farming for export still further onto the farmer. Already faced with the vagaries of climate and potential increases in interest rates and fertilizer prices, there are now systems of supply-chain management made possible by developments in IT which give all the power to the buyer.

—Where quotas favorable to small-scale producers did exist as for Caribbean banana growers, corporate lobbying—in this case by Chiquita—has undermined them so much that they can boast of its levels of exploitation in the plantations of Ecuador. This follows a pattern started in the Reagan–Bush era of undermining commodity price agreements that offered some security to farmers. At the same time, in the case of sugar for example—produced in Bolivia, Peru, and Colombia as well as the Caribbean—the United States imposed import quotas. It prompted US Congressman Thomas J. Downey to write an amazingly frank letter to The New York Times on September 20, 1989 which addressed this matter. Just as President George H.W. Bush was announcing an $8 billion solution to the “drug problem,” the Congressman pointed out that in the period 1983–89 imports of 200,000 tons of sugar from these countries fell to less than 85,000.23 The trend was already apparent in 1987 when he noted that State Department officials writing in the Washington Monthly had warned this would lead to “an unfortunate style of crop diversification.”

A-to-Bs and A-not to Bs
Thus, links between coca production and the politico-economic realities of the capitalist world are not paranoid fantasy. On the other hand, I do not intend to make anything of the well-known US green light to coca smuggling in its support for the Contra war of destabilization in Nicaragua,24 nor to claim that there are always A-to-B causal links. The fact that Mexico is a major cocaine trade route (and the associated extraordinary high levels of violence) has to do with its location, its history and experience of smuggling with marijuana, and no doubt also with a “macho” culture and political corruption. The impoverishment of selected Mexican populations since the imposition of NAFTA, however, is also a reality as monthly incomes for self-employed farmers fell by 90 percent between 1991 and 2003.25

The growing importance of Mexico as a main route followed increased drug police activity in the Caribbean, which had previously been such an important entrepot with links to marketing in the USA itself. Again, its location and history of political gang violence preceded the cocaine business, but it was also preceded by shifts in the political economy of sugar and bananas. In both cases, following effective lobbying from Chiquita via the United States at the World Trade Organisation (WTO), the EU was forced to cap its preferential trade terms for Jamaican bananas. Its markets are fully of subsidized American produce with which local farmers cannot compete. It leaves that country and other islands with the choice of tourism or cocaine. To repeat, these are not A-to-B explanations, but the capitalist ideological apparatus is highly focused on its own forms of “delinking” by which it is able to selectively moralize or produce psychosocial explanations of its own. The Nicaraguan Miskito coast has also emerged as a perfect entrepot between the northern Colombian coast and Mexico. It is a location that bears both the experience of specific government neglect and the experience that must have been gained in the period when Miskito communities supported the Contras in the 1980s destabilisation war. Yet it is also a place of deep poverty and high unemployment, and this in a country where the banana pickers are the lowest paid in Latin America.

West Africa has now emerged as a main entrepot for the transportation of cocaine into Europe. Guinea-Bissau, a favorite in the circles of “failed state” discourse and voyeuristic moralizing journalism, has been replaced as a favorite for cocaine transporters by Senegal, which has the advantage of better roads and telecommunications. In 2009 3,120 kilograms of the drug were seized off its seaboard. Again there is the geographical aspect, and a smuggling history described by Christopher Thompson which made use of satellite-equipped canoes called pirogues to smuggle people into Europe until the business moved further south.26 There is also an element of “failed state” in his account: “unmonitored coasts, poorly paid officials, porous borders, and booming informal markets.” The real historical context however, is that Senegal’s most prosperous year lies thirty years in the past.

Coca, the safest bet
“Coca just grows, it’s a weed. Farmers don’t have to worry about markets and diseases. It always gets a good price.”27

It just so happened that the very first mission from the postwar Western world following the Harry Truman speech to develop backward nations was to Colombia. It was the first World Bank comprehensive economic survey mission and began on June 30, 1949, headed by Lauchlin Currie. On August 19 the country received the first World Bank funding which was an agricultural machinery project loan. This reflected precisely the promise made by Truman to bring technological skills to backward countries. Further World Bank credits followed in 1954 and then again in 1966, this time to foster large-scale cattle ranching. Nowhere was attention given to the chronic shortage of land for small farmers in a country where 60 percent of agricultural land is owned by 0.5 percent of the population.

Then, on June 30, 1996, during the Clinton presidency and after years of Revolutionary Armed Forces of Columbia (FARC) activity, Héctor Mondrón describes how “the World Bank granted an inductive credit of $1.82 million to fund pilot projects and a Technical Unit, with the goal of ‘preparing’ a complete support project for ‘market-based agrarian reform.’”28 This “reform” is an objective lesson in the dangers of becoming indebted. Mondrón describes it thus: “And here’s the paradox: the beneficiary of the subsidy program for land purchases (in the original scheme) becomes a real ‘loser’ who receives an unpaid credit that leads him to lose the land and to be registered in the database listing people who are in arrears. In addition to no longer having land, he can no longer receive any kind of credit.” The Pastrana government from 1998 onwards “didn’t seek to strengthen the campesino (peasant farmer) economy but rather sought the subordination of campesinos and the handing over of their property to large farms.” With a sleight of hand characteristic of contemporary capitalism, those whose “development” policy entails the “maintenance and consolidation of large rural properties dismiss real land redistribution as ‘obsoleto’ or ‘antiquated.’” Mondragón argues that this has pushed campesinos beyond the “agricultural frontier” and into the jungle to grow illicit crops. These circumstances have been augmented by the dynamics of “neoliberal” capitalist globalization.29

In 1990 Colombia’s food imports accounted for just 6 percent of GDP. By 2004 it had amounted to 46 percent with an emphasis instead on large-scale production of African palm, pineapples, and coca. Given the history of coffee production, and indeed of many instances of export monocultures in the “backward” world, this is likely to end in tears. In 1997 the price of organic coffee was $1.34 per kilo.30 By April 2004 it was down to $0.89. It was a process that started with the July 1989 dissolution of the International Coffee Agreement (ICA) negotiated in 1975, a period when the articulated possibility of
a New International Economic Order on the back of OPEC’s success was sidelined by the politico-economic bulldozer of neoliberal policy for whom such commodity price agreements, which had given producers some security of income, were “ideological.”

President George H.W. Bush talked awareness-talk on the coffee-coca nexus at the same time as Congressman Downey was explicitly linking coca growing to US sugar policy. On September 28, 1989 with a team including drug czar William Bennett, he met with Colombia’s President Barca to praise him for his “heroic fight” against the drug trade and said he was prepared to resolve problems with the now hobbled Coffee Agreement. In fact he did not resolve it, so that by 2003 Gabriel Silva, the president of the National Federation of Coffee Growers of Colombia, was saying, “We’ve seen some marginal areas of the Colombian coffee region farmers switching to illegal crops.” By this time the breaking of the agreement had been cemented by the power of the coffee buyer oligopoly (consisting of Sara Lee, Kraft, Procter & Gamble, and Nestlé). This is part of a trend whereby risk is imposed still further on the farmer. In this instance the ICA has been replaced by the Supplier Managed Inventory (SMI) system whereby the supplier is responsible for maintaining the stocks used by the purchasing firm even if the stocks are held at a port in that firm’s country or its own storage.32

In the case of sugar, US import quotas were what might be called the final straw in the matter of risk being thrust onto the least rung of the agricultural ladder. The Peruvian coup of 1968 and subsequent agrarian reform, which involved the nationalization of the largest sugar plantations on the coast, was blamed by the defenders of US quotas as the real cause of the industry’s decline there. Yet it did not benefit Peru’s small farmers either. The APRA corporatist union continued to influence the sugar unions and the leadership of the cooperatives in such a way that casual laborers, nearby smallholders, and tenants as well as landless migrants from the highlands working seasonally were excluded from the “cooperatives.” Their lives became less secure.

The history of sugar production in the Santa Cruz area of Bolivia followed a similar pattern. It was kick-started by an American mission, the State Department’s Bohan Plan of 1942, which did not challenge the local oligarchy’s right to control of the sugar mills but involved the importing of Altiplano *campaesinos* to the underpopulated Santa Cruz territory in the 1950s. It was they who had all the risk taking thrust upon them: the risk of overproduction and a fall in price while faced with a discriminatory quota system, and a need for fertilizer and the debts that this involved. It meant that they—including former miners from Potosí—often gave up and became laborers on sugar farms or more of those pioneros into virgin forest.

In all these circumstances the obvious irony is that the crop with least income risk is the illegal one, coca, and this despite long periods of murderous repression in all three producing countries. “It has a secure market that guarantees a steady flow of income to the individual peasant households. This is coca’s basic advantage.”33 In Bolivia too, the collapse of the coffee price had a crippling effect on the farmer, and put paid to one element of the UN Fund for Drug Abuse Control’s Agro-Yungas program that began in 1986. According to Noam Lupu it tells an exemplary security/insecurity-of-income story augmented by the arrogant wishful thinking of UN officers bringing what Harry Truman had called “the benefits of our scientific advances.” In this case to the Yungas area of Bolivia, the traditional coca growing/chewing and coffee growing valley in La Paz province.34 The deal was to introduce four high-yield coffee plant varieties from Brazil and Colombia which required a “technical package” of fertilizer and insecticides. Several years later only half the plants were still in good condition, and then a massive infestation of Broca disease destroyed 90 percent of the coffee crops including the local Creole variety. It is like a morality tale of arrogant “development” supplemented by wishful thinking. There was no alternative plan when the coffee price fell by 60 percent in the period 1986–90.35

What was special, Herbert Klein notes, is that coca was overwhelmingly produced on small farms which were grouped into colonies or large peasant unions; these provided them with an effective voice.36 Adding insult to injury, grown in combination with food crops it requires less investment and attention than other crops once it has been planted and will only require manual labor and no special skills. ... Also the production of cocaine is not a very elaborate or difficult process ... the manufacturing process is not capital intensive, does not have large economies of scale, does not require large amounts of skilled labor, and uses production processes that are relatively easy to organize.”37 In short, there is no place for the inputs of corporate capital, no capitalist boasts about efficiency, and no small farmer indebtedness. And finally, as Klein puts it: “Thus for the first time in modern Bolivian history, a primary export product was dominated by small peasant producers.”

**Bio-tool**

This crucial security of income for the coca farmer depends naturally enough on a steady demand for cocaine. The evidence that this steady demand exists in the richer world is well known, and has sometimes prompted politicians in coca-producing countries who are under fire to tell the richer world that it is their problem. But “problem” is the most overused word in the English language, and it is also the case that cocaine is a means of production, or more specifically a component of the reproduction of certain kinds of labor in this richer world, paid for by the person doing the labor. With the growth of the white-collar economy in the late nineteenth century a new kind of intensity of labor was required and cocaine came into its own. Familiar names like Merck, Parke Davis, and Burrough Wellcome advertised it as both a performance-enhancing and a “happy” drug. Mark Kohn’s comprehensive *Dope Girls* goes on to describe how a mixture of sexual, racial, and military discipline paranoias led to it being outlawed, but that in the meantime those who used the drug were “[the individuals believed to be particularly at risk from the pressures of modern life ... those with the most refined and sensitive nervous systems, those who worked by brain rather than hand; professional men, businessmen and ‘new women’ ... trying to make their own way in the world.”38

In the present day there has been a revolution of “brain work” prompted especially by the IT revolution, and a whole section of the population—a group, but still class-differentiated—has engaged in various forms of the “digital economy.” This includes both the financial sector, which was flourishing until very recently, and the diverse “creative economy.” It is no longer an “elite” drug, although one imagines that differences in cocaine quality are still class-income based, and there are many horror stories. When freebasing was simplified to crack, the evidence of its effect on US city ghettos was well documented; less well known is that it is a younger ghetto generation that has fought back. In the streets of London, England, it is truly depressing to see a crackhead early in the morning making speeches to the street minus socks and in a puffa jacket whose zip has broken long ago.

But this is only a small section of the market. Even as a “nightclub drug,” it is—in the face of so much sociological evidence about the blurring of working and non-working time—quite likely to be found in the worlds of IT, media, or finance. Cocaine is especially suited to this work because, as I have pointed out, it can create indiscriminate but focused enthusiasm, by which I mean that the most
banal TV trailer or piece of advertising can be perceived as truly momentous. Unlike amphetamine, whose sense of excitement tends to have a serially digressive effect, cocaine will allow you to stay single-mindedly on the task in hand for long hours.39 This is particularly indispensable given the high levels of overtime in these sectors, where much work is awarded on short-term contracts. You are only as good as your last performance, and at the same time you may find your next work while having a line or two socially.

Yet how galling that a drug that is not just illegal but depends on “backward” farmers working communally (the “authentic” variety is invariably preferred over synthetic cocaine) is such an important biotool for the “cutting-edge” economy. Its productive use cannot be admitted. There is, for example, not a single reference to it in Richard Florida’s once-iconic Rise of the Creative Class. Similarly, there has been no reference made to its use in the modern-day “financial sector” when unrestrained, overconfident risk taking caused an unprecedented financial crisis for which we, the non-bankers of the world, are now paying. It has not even been mentioned as a possible causative factor, although in the 1990s there were frequent newspaper articles on cocaine use in London’s financial district. In coded language they warned that its confidence-boosting quality might become dysfunctional when combined with a “masters of the universe” view of the world.

A post-crash report by Baker and Penny also concentrates on city traders who are now “clean” or trying to be clean with reference to how “professionals in the detox business say bankers have swamped them with calls since the financial crisis widened a year ago ... some bankers are questioning whether diminished rewards of the City are worth sacrificing their health.”40 [authors’ italics]

Yes, read it twice, and, given that “sacrificing of health” refers to cocaine use, it is clear that it is functional to banking “labor” but only if the rewards are as astronomically high as they have been, and are becoming again, more than enough to buy as much of the best “flakke” as wanted at any given time. There is no mention in Baker and Penny’s article of any possible link to the crash, but rather a high-lighting of those macho fourteen-and-sixteen-hour working days with which bankers used to justify their fabulous incomes, a habit which they have taken up once more.

From coca to capital
It seems, therefore, all too fitting that $325 billion worth of illegal drug profits have been used, as is claimed by the UN’s drug czar, as “the only liquid capital” available to some banks on the brink of collapse in 2008. To get some idea of the significance of this amount, the IMF estimated that US and European bank losses between June 2007 and September 2009 amounted to $1 trillion. Senator Costa has no need to play up this phenomenon—the very existence of the war on drugs and its media support means his organization will continue to be well-financed. His revelation rather serves first and foremost to demystify money laundering. There are plenty of accounts of the microbusiness of laundering. Selective concern has been prompted by the other endless war—that against terror. A typical report by Anti-Money Laundering/Combating Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT) might concentrate on Chilean Exchange Bureau maneuvers, while others focus on notorious offshore locations. Costa’s assertions highlights the significance of drug money as capital, in other words, of realized profit to the mainstream banking world.

Figures extrapolated by Felting suggest that just 2 percent of the retail price of cocaine in the USA goes to the Colombian coca farmer, 4 percent to its processors, and 20 percent to its smugglers.41 Therefore, 75 percent is realized in the United States itself and, unless some of it can be claimed on corporate expenses, it will be a part of the reproduction of labor power borne by the worker, however privileged their job. In this way it can honestly be said that the largest portion will be realized as capital. Other estimates reckon that people working in jungle labs are paid 75 cents per kilo. These disparities and the creation of usuable capital on a large scale arise because of a self-interested, ideological, and vindictive war on drugs, drugs whose production has been made into an underpaid but relatively secure income for peasant farmers by the dynamics of global capitalism. There is no guarantee that the legalization of cocaine would necessarily or automatically benefit those same farmers. There is always the possibility of a corporate cocaine oligopoly, or that most of the price would go to consumer-country governments as tax. Yet the coalition of movements—those communally working coca farmers and campesino allies whose power was realized in the election of Evo Morales—is too experienced and too mindful of the value of all its natural resources for legalization to turn Bolivia into a one-crop exporter. Rather, legalization should offer coca campesinos the potential for a better life on their own terms, and remove one prop from the racialized war against the poor in the Western world.42

1 Rajev Syal, Observer, December 13, 2009.
4 For example, US President Taft at the beginning of the twentieth century: “The whole hemisphere will be ours in fact as, by virtue of our superiority of race, it already is ours morally.” These sentiments were later echoed by Theodore Roosevelt.
6 The main players in the Truman and Eisenhower administrations included John Moore Cabot, Henry Cabot Lodge, and Bedell Smith, who all had interests in the company.
7 Jorge Hurtado Gumucio, Cocaine the Legend, pp. 55–58.
8 He goes on to describe how cocaine is misnamed as a narcotic in order to give it a place in the “lusty native” discourse.
9 Rennselaer Lee, etc.
10 Karl Marx, Theses of Surplus Value, “The criminal produces not only crime but also criminal law, and with this also the professor who gives lectures on criminal law. ... The criminal moreover produces the whole of the police and of criminal justice, constables, judges, hangmen, juries etc.”
11 The UK is, as usual following the US lead and sending more people to prison and building more prisons at the crime rate falls.
12 Max Singer described how the numbers bump worked (or “ducking the stats”) as it is now called in the case of New York City heroin statistics in his article, “The Vitality of Mythical Numbers,” The Public Interest, no. 23, Spring 1971, pp. 3–9.
16 When the USA was engaged in a not-so-secret destabilization war against the Nicaraguan government and in the process—the evidence is well-sourced—helped the Contra rebels smuggle cocaine into the USA.
17 Bill Piper of the Drug Policy Alliance has naìve ideas about neoliberal capitalism when he says: “Drug policy was one of the few areas where Reagan stayed from his conservative philosophy by expanding the power of the government and undermining the Constitution.”
18 Dan Baum, Smoke and Mirrors (Boston, 1997).
22 This can be seen in several phenomena like the leasing and buying of large tracts of land in Africa by the capital-
23 istic corporations, either on their own or with sovereign wealth funds, the concentration of capital in the
24 biotechnology sector, and the development of "termina-
25 tor" seeds. There is pressure from large capital to control all the basic necessities of life.
26 Import quotas in favor of domestic production saw sugar imports in general fall by 80 percent between 1975 and the early 1990s.
27 It is impossible to say how much the chronological coincidence of this episode and the explosion of the "crack epidemic" in US ghettos was in any way a significant causal connection.
32 Colombia does have particular features though it is hard to know the weight of their significance. Francisco Thouni points to the delegitimization of the state which precedes the more general trend in this direction in other "underdeveloped" countries, while Menno Vellinga talks of Colombia's "production-speculation mentality with little investment in long-term equipment, a focus on commerce, quick turn-over, and high short-term profit as conducive to the illegal drug industry." Since this sounds rather like the UK it is hard to know how distinctive this makes Colombia. Menno Vellinga, The Political Economy of the Drug Industry (Florida, 2004).
33 In an instance described by Gary Marx, coffee bean selling entailed a five hour mule journey for the campesinos to the point of sale, Chicago Tribune, April 19, 2003.
35 Citing an Oxfam report by Thomas Lines on the loose arrangement in export horticulture for example, "Agreements are often verbal, so there is no written contract to break ... Such informality gives buyers flexibility to delay payments, break programs, or cancel orders, forcing suppliers to find last-minute alternatives." Making Poverty: A History (New York, 2008), p. 105.
38 Lupu's scathing account talks of a "counterproductive conditionality on credits, a narrow vision and emphasis on short-term success, blind adherence to pure economic competition model, inadequate market appraisal of viable alternative crops, and paternalistic attitudes." Dominic Streetfield also mentions how the very success of an Agro-Yungas soya project brought down the wrath of US soya farmers.
41 Feiling, The Candy Machine (see note 14 above).

Burn Baby Burn ... Some Thoughts on Finance and Art

Anthony Davies

Monday, September 16, 2008

In the aftermath of an oil crisis, spiraling food prices, global market instability, and the endgame of a US-led war in South East Asia, Ian Burn's 1975 text, "Pricing Works of Art," opened up a far-reaching debate on finance and art. In a framework marked by a burgeoning relationship between the state and big business (including as a source of arts funding), and new concentrations of wealth gathered around fledgling "Art Investment Funds" Modarco and Artemis, Burn takes on commodity value, property rights, and class relations. In an attempt to unpack the dynamics of contemporary capitalism, he claims: "We are no longer able to talk about art production independent of market coercion"; and further, that the demands of the market (for example for artists to simultaneously provide consistency and uniqueness, or "innovation") have permeated production to such a degree that "the fusion is complete." But how do we factor his observations into financial systems subsequent and unrelenting drive to create new markets and sources of profit—generally, its dynamic adaptability? If, as the last thirty years have proven so forcefully, capitalism is always on the move, then what types of "fusion" are we looking for now? As the contemporary context of yet another global "crisis" in the financial markets serves to highlight, any debate on finance and art should, at the very least, lay out the corresponding coordinates and then serve to locate points of strain, antagonism, and vulnerability in the system.

In August 2008, the Financial Times ran an anniversary special on the credit crunch or, depending on which natural disaster analogy you prefer, the "whirlwind," "perfect storm," or "big freeze." In a series of articles moving from "How it began" to "Recovery," a select group of economists and financial journalists each put forward their account of the key events that have thrown financial markets into disarray over the last twelve months. Surprisingly perhaps for an industry renowned for its lack of consensus, most agreed that—to extend the natural disaster analogy a little further —no one saw it coming and no one knows where it will end. One
undeniable phenomenon across those parts of the system where "crisis" is now said to have taken hold is the pivotal role of the consumer credit "boom." But on this the FT weathermen were wholly disingenuous: applying their expertise to comparisons with previous structural collapses in the banking sector (e.g. Japan in the 1990s and the USA in the 1920s), while omitting the recession that opened this century—which in fact offers a straight pathway to understanding the present "freak" phenomenon of the credit crunch.

Interdependence risk 2.0.

Within the context of the boom--bust cycle of the late 1990s and subsequent collapse of the New Economy, we witnessed the fall from grace of "globalization" as the system imploded spectacularly under the weight of its interdependencies. In the present collapse, the responsible party has been credit, the repackaging of debt, and the belief that spreading risk among millions of investors would somehow function as insulation against shock. In fact, the opposite has been the case and the "interdependence risk" identified by business analysts in the early 2000s has indeed returned to haunt the system a second time. This widespread miscalculation created a situation in which few if any policymakers, bankers, or economists regarded the (ultimately catalytic) phenomenon of so-called subprime defaults and the initial forecast of up to two million American home repossessions as a threat to the economy as a whole! In fact, showing signs of profound amnesia, some even passed the early 2007 market jitters off as a welcome correction. Of course, it is now clear that the entire house of cards (or bits of financial paper "spliced and diced" to create other bits of financial paper, repackaged and sold on as credit derivatives) were stacked on lenders' predatory practices in low-income communities—selling subprime mortgages to the poor. Disregarding the ethics involved, the fact that this activity was largely ignored—if not sanctioned by the infinitely compliant Federal Reserve—has seen the financial community raise its hands, declaring shock and disbelief that such a small sector of the global markets could not only have brought one house down but spiral outwards into a global catastrophe.

The result predictably has been a collapse of faith across the system as a whole and a world turned upside down: welcome to an era in which the state intervenes to rescue failing banks, the banking industry passes responsibility for failings onto intermediaries (including brokers and hedge funds), hedge funders pass the buck to the credit rating agencies and credit rating agencies claim that a "computer glitch" led to the ratings flaws that misled investors! This, as activist/writer John Barker recently argued in "Structural Greed: The 'Credit Crunch,'" provides further illustration (if any were needed) that "capitalism's claim to be the only efficient assessor of risk and allocation of resources" has been profoundly undermined.4

Art, the stable anchor

Yet in the cultural sector we find another narrative: not one of crisis, collapse, and loss of faith but of market affirmation accompanied by claims of exponential and seemingly uninterrupted growth. A case in point is the contemporary art market, where a model of unfettered globalization floats along on new concentrations of wealth and capital accumulation in the emerging economies of Brazil, Russia, India, and China (the BRICs). At a point when banks have written off in excess of $200 billion in "bad debt" and the IMF has been forced to project total losses across the board of around $946 billion, the art market has evolved into a companion narrative, a "stable anchor" much lauded by a general and specialist press fixated on art fairs, biennials, record auction sales, and the purchasing exploits of the rich. But let's take a closer look at this allegedly crisis-free, miracle market.

At the top end at least, the contemporary art market was a direct beneficiary of a strategic shift into alternative investments (e.g. real estate, investment trusts, and hedge funds) and risk balancing strategies of High Net Worth Individuals (HNWIs). In 2002 for example, HNWIs possessed 60 percent of total hedge fund assets.5 Against the continued fallout of the New Economy collapse, a backdrop of increasing global market instability and dramatic portfolio losses, many started to view alternative investments as comparatively safe because they were less correlated with stock market performance. A range of relatively new financial instruments, combined with developments in information technologies and wealth management strategies, offered flexibility and strong returns in a variety of market conditions, with hedge funds perhaps representing the "extreme sports" end of the spectrum—attaching risk and profit for example to "shorting stocks" (betting on a decline in value without owning the stocks themselves).

Within this climate some HNWIs diversified further, into luxury collectibles and new products—with "passion investments" like contemporary art, luxury yachts, sports teams, and so-called experiential travel (perversely including "Slum Tours," "Staying Among the Have-nots" and "Artisans of Leisure") accounting for over half of all expenditure on luxury items. A mass job cut in the financial sector and firms' reduction in bonuses has greatly reduced spending power of HNWIs at the $1 million plus end of the scale (even the insurance industry has pulled out of unemployment insurance for City workers...). But luxury consumption among the $30 million plus "Ultras" has continued to grow exponentially, leading the recent Newsweek special "Too Rich to Feel the Crunch" to assert that the art market is now directly correlated to the interests of a global elite class "almost invigorated by the rest of the world's economic woes."

Debt and double debt

Those economic woes currently decimating low-income families in the West and contributing to food price hikes, starvation, and riots in many parts of the world is not an unforeseen calamity but exists in a direct continuum with the fallout from the early 2000s recession, developments in finance capital, and, indeed, the investment patterns of HNWIs. At the lower end, then, the ongoing consumer credit "boom," which provided the precarious lever out of the fin de millennium mire, was given extra impetus by a series of interest rate cuts implemented between 2001-2003 (e.g. from 6.5 percent to 1 percent in the United States). Combined with two decades of financial liberalization, these not only encouraged a general expansion of credit but, with it, a massive growth in credit derivatives. These developments were manipulated using instruments outside the ever expanding financial toolkit, too. A recent article in the International Herald Tribune highlights the role the advertising industry played in changing social attitudes towards debt.6 In terms of financial products like home equity loans, for example, there was a concerted effort by the banking sector to adopt consumer advertising techniques to shift the terminology associated with borrowing against homes towards acts of "empowerment" and "entitlement." This reached a high (or low) point with the $1 billion "Live Richly" advertising campaign from Citibank, which announced: "There's got to be at least $25,000 hidden in your house. We can help you find it." In addition to subprime mortgages then, many households relied on home equity loans (second mortgages) to offset a real decline in wages. With business investment stuttering during 2001-2007, credit and consumer spending was fundamental to the "expansion" of the economy, as the financial system directly targeted the personal income and future earnings of workers as a source of profit.
Following the US lead and borrowing its way out of recession, the UK has seen personal debt pass the symbolic £1 trillion mark, with 80 percent existing in the form of loans against homes. By 2008, personal debt outstripped GDP for the first time; bankruptcies and Individual Voluntary Arrangements also stood at a record high of 120,000. It is here that the lower end of the contemporary art market comes into view, with a series of state-led initiatives enticing indebted consumers and overstretched households into acquisition schemes. A paradigmatic example is Arts Council England’s “Own Art” loan scheme (£2,000 interest-free credit, repayable over twelve months). But of course this industry hasn’t evolved enough to give us a recognizable “subprime setting.” Instead, we need to focus on crystallizing dual or “divergent” economies and forces further up the chain. In the art market, this economy essentially sees a “decoupling” within one sector—where Ultra HNWIs at the top end engage at the level of portfolio diversification and pleasure investments (in part to counter exposure to market turbulence but also to consolidate wealth and further guarantee “generational transfer” of assets), while at the lower end state divestment in the public sector shunts art production into the domain of consumer credit incentives and debt (taking a lead from the financial sector’s targeting of personal income and future earnings). This is a transfer of another kind altogether.

Booming and busted
This market dynamic is entirely consistent with other divergent economies in which the top end is totally delinked from (though of course, contingent on) debt and exploitation at the bottom—a kind of boom and bust running concurrently in the same sector. We’ve already looked at the parallel phenomena of increasing concentrations of wealth and class exploitation/subprime settings in the housing sector, but they can be found elsewhere. In education for example, where academic consultancy services, business incubation, university Intellectual Property (IP) portfolios, venture capital and overseas students markets development are shadowed by increasing student debt and bankruptcy. Here, the state and financial systems’ predatory claim on students’ future earnings (e.g. via loan repayments) should be viewed in conjunction with its land grab on their present “knowledge” production and an increasing commercialization of IP in their universities.

But let us return to the dynamics of capitalism and the art market. Arguably here, the subprime settings, the unstable and vulnerable areas that we’ve seen elsewhere are not to be found at the lower end (in art loans, for example), but further up the chain. As in the financial system, it is the dubious and predatory activities of intermediaries that prop up the house of cards. Dealers, gallerists, curators, consultants, art critics, specialist publications, and auction houses all conspire to sustain the illusion of the unique, apparently autonomous market and its potential for infinite growth—unconstrained by the travails of the broader economy. For the moment at least, they continue in combination to function as de facto credit (or credibility) ratings agencies guaranteeing both the “quality” of sales and levels of associated risk. As with Moody’s, Standard & Poor’s, and Fitch, the so-called “high priests of global finance,” these ratings are based on privileged insider information and are often tailored to the needs of commissioning clients. Unlike its financial equivalent, we have yet to witness the art “system” fully turn in on itself, but it is arguably the middle tier—where new wealth and power formations have most recently been consolidated and the deepest investment has been made in the figment of a “stable anchor”—that is most vulnerable. And hence this is where something like a subprime setting for contemporary art comes into focus.

The “reflexive” hedge
Seen in the light of other divergent economies already briefly discussed, as well as ubiquitous and crushing consumer debt, and the effect of all these on basic living conditions around the world, the recent promotion of “market reflexive” practices in what might be described as art’s “middle tier” could be read as a cynical attempt to secure degrees of separation from the upbeat narrative of the art market. Or, more precisely, individual actors “working” within key nodes of the contemporary art market are identifying strategies (e.g. self-critique) to restore critical agency and hence mitigate against the dangers of over-identification with excesses in the system. We’ve seen similar “reflexive” hedges in the financial sector, particularly leading up to the credit crunch. These were characterized, for example, by public declarations in the form of senate “hearings” bringing key players together to scrutinize failings in their respective industries (e.g. the Senate Committee on Banking, Housing, and Urban Affairs hearings on subprime mortgages in March 2007). In the midst of a full-blown crisis we also get “confessionals”—where individual players like hedge fund manager David Einhorn take us through the trials and tribulations, the compromises and heartaches of being on the frontline of an increasingly complex and out-of-control financial system. While these might at first appear to be reformist rants geared towards propping up the system, they’re more likely attempts to extricate institutions and/or individuals out of market interdependencies—prior to (well, for some at least) staking a claim on the next phase of “development.” The financial system is clearly in the process of consuming itself (e.g. credit ratings agencies attacking the greed of hedge funds, hedge funds crying foul and charging credit ratings agencies with insider dealing etc.) and in unison it would seem, artists and art critics question the market complicity of specialist art magazines, magazine publishers charge auction houses and dealers with manipulating market value. All of this serving to further highlight not just the strain and vulnerabilities in the system but where finance and art ultimately connect.

This finally brings us to the extraordinary events of September 14-16, 2008 and “Black Sunday/Monday,” when the contrast between the financial system’s collapse and an incongruously euphoric art market was never more pronounced. As former Fed chairman Alan Greenspan described the evolving meltdowns as a “once-in-a-lifetime financial crisis,” Lehman Brothers, America’s fourth largest investment bank, faced bankruptcy and frenzied media coverage screamed about a “fight for survival on Wall Street.” Over in London’s auction rooms, Sotheby’s posted record auction sale figures of £111 million for 223 works by the British artist Damien Hirst. With £50 billion wiped off the value of leading shares and 4,500 highly paid city workers in Lehman’s London office losing their jobs on the same day, it’s clear that ultra HNWIs (£30 billion plus) are indeed invigorated with the rest of the world’s economic woes. Yet with the army of HNWIs at the lower end of the scale being wiped out in financial districts the world over, the luxury spending that propped up the middle tier of the contemporary art market has reached breaking point. Now the extremes between booming and busted take over, with all the attendant antagonisms.
2. Modarco and Artemis were art investment funds based in London in the early 1970s. Modarco was founded in association with two Swiss banks and had an art inventory valued at US$50 million in 1973. See Annette Van den Bosch, The Australian Art World (Sydney, 2005).
5. The total wealth held by HNWIs has grown by more than 50 percent since 2002 (from US$26.7 trillion to US$40.2 trillion). The HNWI population worldwide has also increased by three million according to Merrill Lynch, Capgemini's 2008 World Wealth Report.
10. Gillian Tett has authored a series of investigative articles on failings at credit rating agencies in the Financial Times.

"If you aren't aware of your culture it seems that you haven't existed in history."

Max Jorge Hinderer and Matthijs de Bruijne in conversation with Sun Heng, co-founder and director of the Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Laborers in Picun, Lin Zhibin, research coordinator at the Museum, acted as interpreter.

Question: The Migrant Workers' Museum is part of the Migrant Workers' Home. Could you tell us something about the history of the Migrant Workers' Home?

Sun Heng: First I will speak about my personal experience, then about the history of the Migrant Workers' Home and then about the museum.

My name is Sun Heng. I was born in 1975 in Shaanxi province, somewhere in the mountains. My parents were farmers who worked in a state-owned farm. That means that they were employees of the state, so they were able to enjoy social welfare. At the age of twelve I went back to my parents' hometown of the province of Henan, where my parents continued working as farm workers. The family had twenty-seven mou of land, which is about two hectares. I also helped the family with the work on the fields. I studied in a normal college in a city in Henan, where I majored in music education. After my graduation I went back to Kaifeng City in Henan province to teach music in a secondary school. I only worked in that school for a year. I couldn't stand the rigid educational system in China—what you are supposed to do as a teacher and the way to teach the children. So I simply quit the job. That was very unusual, because I had what was called the "iron rice bowl." This meant having a job that was covered with insurance, and normally you did not quit that job. That was in 1998, and I went to Beijing.

In the 1990s China underwent a big social transformation; from a socialist system into what was termed a "socialist market system" with privatization, and many people lost their jobs. Also my parents; although they were workers they didn't get paid. They had to go to the market and sell their products in order to get a small income. I grew up in a socialist society and now I had to face up to a capitalist reality, so I didn't know how to figure out what was going on; I got very confused. I wanted to change the world, but I did not know how. So I fell in love with Rock and Roll music as a way of changing society.

Of course Rock and Roll comes from the Western world. But I liked the spirit it conveys. For two years I got lost in the music. Then I realized that music itself is not the purpose. In 1999 I decided to travel around China to meet people, to seek something without knowing what I was looking for. I started a trip with my guitar and I printed some music I composed. I traveled around and played on the street, in the countryside, in the subways, on the construction sites, sometimes in the university campus, meeting people, and talking with just anybody in order to get to know the society. I learned from foreign singers like Woody Guthrie and Billy Bragg. I found out that they used music to speak about social problems to the public. I admired them a lot.

After one year wandering around I learned so much especially about the life of what were called the "low class people": construction workers, domestic workers, people who cook on the street, even the policeman, all kind of people. They told me many stories of their life and I could see their optimism, although their life was not that easy. In the year 2000 I went back to Beijing and I found out that it was very difficult for migrant children to get access to public school, so that they had to go to a school for migrant children where the conditions were very poor. In particular, they didn't have music teachers in these schools. So I wanted to teach in one of these schools as a volunteer. Then I met more migrant workers, and I saw that they didn't have a life apart from their work; it was only work, work, work. They didn't have a social life or cultural activities.

That's why in April 2002 I established a group called The Art Troupe of Young Migrant Workers together with two or three other friends, including Xu Duo. We decided to perform in various places: construction sites, factories, or communities where the migrants lived. Of course it was for free. At that time we only wanted to provide some social life, some entertainment for these people, nothing else. After the performances we always chatted with the workers and they told us they were facing a lot of difficulties, for instance they were not paid on time, or even not paid at all. We couldn't help and in the end we felt very lost.

We started to think about the cause of the problems which the migrant worker cannot escape from and has to face every day.

As you know, China is a dual society—the city and the countryside are completely different. Social
and personal relationships are different in the countryside. If people who were once farmers come to the city they cannot get support from their social network in the countryside anymore; they have no support in the city. Finally we got this idea to set up a place like a home, where the workers can come and where we can help them.

**Question:** This is the Migrant Workers’ Home. Could you explain more about the general structure?

**Sun Heng:** The Migrant Workers’ Home was officially established in November 2002. In the beginning we basically gave performances with an art troupe. In the first year we had forty to fifty performances. We had a hotline through which the workers could call and ask legal questions that we would try to answer. When we couldn’t manage the case, we would try to get an answer from a lawyer or a volunteer who knew the law better. We also provided some legal and computer training. We combined the entertainment with the articulation of rights, through the songs and the content of the lyrics raising awareness for people’s legal rights. In 2004 we made some CDs. We didn’t think of publishing them officially, we just burned some CDs with a collection of our songs. And then a famous big company from China listened to our music and offered to publish our CDs. This company helped to publish the CD, which sold 100,000 copies. Many people such as university students and academics who cared about the workers bought the CD. There were some famous TV stars and pop star presenters who also tried to help sell the CD. We made 75,000 RMB profit with this CD. With this money we established a school for migrant children. We rented the campus, which was an abandoned factory that belonged to the village community, and we built classrooms.

The contract was for twenty years. The initial reason why we wanted to establish this school is because we saw many migrant children having no place to go to school and who had no place to play around. So year by year we added other functions in addition to the school.

**Question:** Did the local authorities know about your school?

**Sun Heng:** You see, in China there is not a single, uniform government. You have the national and provincial government and the municipality, you have officials in the same department with different ideas. So when you think about “the Chinese government” it is not a uniform body. And also the policies of the government are changing; many things changed after the year 2003 in particular—the new leadership (Hu Jintao) took power and many politics changed.

Now in our school there are 400 students from kindergarten to the sixth grade primary school. This school also serves the function of a community learning centre as a night school. Members of the community can come to the library and join in with the legal training and computer training.

**Question:** Who are the members of this community you are working for?

**Sun Heng:** Anybody who lives in the community Picun village has access to the services we provide. Picun is the village where our organization is located, it is a typical village in the suburbs where migrant workers live and work. Usually the people stay for years in this community of Picun. Some work in the factories in Picun village, others work during the day downtown.

**Question:** Do you offer accommodation for migrant workers?

**Sun Heng:** The workers rent rooms from the local residents. The local residents used to be farmers; now they don’t have farmland any more but they own the real estate in the village. Across China there are 240 million migrant workers who come from the countryside to live and work in the cities. These people are not considered to be full citizens like the urban residents. They are considered to be countryside people. They have no money to buy apartments or houses to live. What they have to do is to rent a place from the local residents; normally the people from the countryside cannot afford to rent an apartment, so normally they just rent a room. An average family has only eight to twelve square meters to live in.

So the villages in the suburbs become more and more like migrant workers’ communities. In Picun there are only 1,400 local residents and over 10,000 migrants, nearly ten times as many as the local residents. So that is why we call it a migrant workers’ community.

Then we found out that the urban residents just throw away their clothes and other things that are out of fashion. So we got the idea to open a second-hand shop. We ask for donations from the urban citizens and we sell them to the migrant workers for a very cheap price. The university students want to get rid of their stuff after they graduate, so we also ask them for donations for the shop. This is a way to lower the cost of living for the migrant worker, and on the other hand it is also environmentally friendly for the whole society. We have six second-hand shops in Picun village and the other villages. We opened the first shop in 2005 and year by year we are expanding. We recruit one or two staff for each shop, so it also provides employment for some workers. We make some profit, pay the staff, and the rest is used to finance our activities. When some poor kids come along they get products for free.

But then we came to realize that the mainstream culture only tells us about the positive side of the economic growth of China, so we started with the idea of recording the history of the migrant worker. Therefore in 2007 we started with the Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Laborers, because we think culture is important. If you aren’t aware of your culture it seems that you haven’t existed in history. We have to remember that the purpose of the museum is not just to record history, it is also to change history. Recording what has happened in the past gives a choice for reflection and for drawing consequences about the future.

**Question:** What kind of people visit the museum?

**Sun Heng:** I remember that we had a meeting with Xudou (the person responsible for the museum), and we made a report that we had ten thousand visitors by then. Some of the people from Picun visit the museum—migrant workers from across China who joined our other activities would come to visit, and also people we don’t know. They read some articles in the newspaper and just copied the address and came. Also many people from Beijing students, scholars, some professors. We received also several official visits; they came with big official buses and delegates.

We realized that our museum is a little remote and far away from anywhere, so we use the Internet to gain more public attention. We have a website for the museum, a set of exhibition boards, and an electronic version of the Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Laborers so we can show the exhibition in other parts of China. Every year we have a special theme in the museum. Last year we focused on thirty years after China’s economic reform and opening up. This year we are concentrating on the migrant workers’ residential status. We will do an investigation and write a report on that and exhibit it.

We also have an art and culture festival for the migrant workers once a year. The first one we did in January 2009. During this three-day festival we had music and performances; we showed documentaries, staged theatre plays, and organized workshops.

**Question:** If you are raising awareness of the situation of the migrant worker, it is a sort of counter-narration. What is presented as the official story of the migrant worker?

**Sun Heng:** There is also an official migrant workers’ museum in Shenzhen. In that museum you will see the achievement, the economic growth of China, all these typical official stories. You don’t see the workers, their lives, and their emotions. You
only see the achievements of the government.

**Question:** What kind of objects do you collect and display in the museum?

**Sun Heng:** The objects we show are donated by the workers, including photos, letters, instruments, work uniforms, the residential permission cards, the articles, the CDs, the NGO publications. Also we have collected the policies that the government issued at different stages.

We now have a research centre and the publication of books is becoming an important part of our work. It is learning by doing. We did research on children’s educational development. Now we are conducting research and a survey on migrant workers’ residential rights. This again will be presented as a report combined with an exhibition. It is more a report for internal circulation. Of course, we would like to publish it but it is a matter of money. We distribute the reports on migrant children’s education among the workers and those who are interested and have time to read it; we send them to the NGOs and share them with researchers. First we made 300 copies and then another 300 copies. They were gone so quickly we didn’t even know where they went. We can also start workshops based on this report, too. The first report was included in our children’s festival, to which we invited researchers. Now with the second report we will have a workshop and also invite scholars and even some officials. If a scholar is interested he is just one of the participants, and is not dominant. That’s why it is important to have our own research and our own platform.

In addition, we have our theatre, our DVDs, and CDs. Our plan is to have one new play, CD, and DVD a year.

So, I’ve outlined the overall structure of the Migrant Workers’ Home: We have the art troupe, we have the second-hand shops, we have the elementary school for migrant children, we have the museum, we have migrant children’s education and development projects. The school is independent; it is still without governmental support, but it should function like a normal school. We employ about twenty staff members in the school and for the other projects we also have twenty employees, so altogether we have forty staff members. Apart from that we work with the help of a lot of volunteers, students, and workers, about 200 to 300 every year.

**Question:** If you talk about 240 million migrant workers in China, could you briefly sum up the history of these people? When and how did it begin?

**Sun Heng:** This is a type of exploitation of capital to labor. The development of European countries is based on the exploitation of people in the colonies—in Africa, Asia, and Latin America. In China we do this to our own people in the countryside. After the economic transformation in 1978 this exploitation and this kind of capital accumulation at the cost of the countryside continued.

**Question:** How can we understand the function of the Hakou? Is this part of the structure of exploitation?

**Sun Heng:** In 1949 during the first process of industrialization the status of workers was very high. But there was a shortage of food, and agricultural production was very low at the beginning of the 1950s. Because of these problems not many workers were needed. One had to control the population movement from the countryside to the city, that’s why in 1958 the government issued the household registration system. That belongs to the past and now since 1978, with the free flow of capital, the household registration system has become a way of exploiting the peasants. It creates inequalities between the people from the countryside and the people from the cities.

In small and medium-sized cities it is easy for people to become an urban citizen if you have to stay and work there for a certain amount of time. And some local governments in big cities are experimenting with reforms. In Shanghai for example, after you have worked and lived there seven years you can apply for Shanghai citizenship, but of course only under certain conditions and criteria.

**Question:** The theatre pieces or the contents of the songs show the dream to create collective processes insisting on the rights of the migrant workers and insisting on overcoming the state of exploitation which is based on irregular payments without any insurance and no proper permission to stay. Would you add any further facts concerning exploitation?

**Sun Heng:** We see this as an historical moment; huge numbers of people are changing their identity from farmers to urban citizens. Now there are 240 million migrant workers. This could increase to 300 to 400 million in the coming years.

Our idea is to promote the positive elements of a new migrant workers’ culture. We use culture as a tool to create awareness among workers. We also hope that culture is a way of building international solidarity among the workers. Capital is already globalized, but the workers are separated in different countries, so we hope that the workers’ culture can be internationalized. If economic liberation is said to be so highly important, how much more important is cultural emancipation for the working class in the sense of “to read and think the liberation.”

**Question:** Do you collaborate with other similar organizations in China?

**Sun Heng:** The government organizes part of the cultural activities through cultural activity centers. These centers exist in every city as a place for music, cinema, theatre, and so on. The cultural activity center in our district supports many of our activities, especially the director.

We also have collaborations with twenty different associations in universities in Beijing, where many student volunteers come to offer their voluntary services. We have collaborations with twenty NGOs across China, working in the same field as we do, and we have cooperation with companies. These companies have Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) sections that always look for some specific issues and then they give financial support. It is more for increasing their public visibility and having a good public image. We also have contacts in the mass media. We have little contact with unions, but right now we are passing through a very interesting phase. The local government just told us that they are supporting us to establish a community trade union. It came all of a sudden a few weeks ago. While I was away, when our colleagues sent me the message that we have formed a union which was supported by the local government, at first I thought it was a joke.

**Question:** Could it be the turning point if workers themselves can organize the unions?

**Lin Zhbin:** That’s why you cannot use a rigid view on the Chinese government. China has a big population and there are many possibilities.

**Question:** But in Guangdong it is quite tough for labor organizations, isn’t it? How important are these struggles in Chinese society?

**Sun Heng:** The relationship between the workers and the companies, the capital, is one of conflict. There are many labor conflicts in the south at the moment. These conflicts are often short term and not organized. Trade unions are only active in state-owned companies, and they don’t represent migrant workers. Migrant workers normally don’t work in state-owned companies.

**Question:** Last year in Guangdong I saw how many migrant workers went back to the countryside. Can you tell us how the financial crisis affected China over the last year?

**Sun Heng:** The financial crisis first affected the coastal area, where the export production is concentrated. Many factories closed down; therefore many workers lost their jobs. So the factories that produced production material were also affected. Obviously labor relations became very tense. The government has announced that twenty-five million migrant workers lost their jobs. Five million students who graduated last year couldn’t find a job.
La iglesia de Jesús de Machaca
Roberto Choque Canqui

La documentación existente sobre el templo de Jesús de Machacha, muestra con evidencia que el poder, la economía y la voluntad de los caciques Guaráchi han sido los factores decisivos para la construcción de esta obra, considerada suntuosa. Después ellos mismos asumieron el control administrativo y la conservación de tal monumento. Desde luego, no eran los únicos que habían participado en una obra semejante. También los caciques de otras marques han coadyuvado con una parte de sus bienes y de la mano de obra tributaria aunque sin no asumir todo el costo de la construcción de su templo.

El conjunto de templos construidos en la región comprendida por Qaqaywiri (Azaxiri o Caquinaquiri), Tiwanaku, Waqi y Machaca fue muy importante para la obra de evangelización masiva de la gente amaya y uru. El templo de Qaqaywiri, construido en 1560 por los franciscanos, es uno de los primeros. Luego, se levantó el templo de Tiwanaku, en 1610. El de Jesús de Machaca se edificó entre 1679 y 1707, y finalmente el de Waqi se erigió entre 1784 y 1788, gracias a los donativos del cacique local Pedro Limachi. [...] 

La disposición de Gabriel Fernández Guaráchi
En el pueblo de Jesús de Machaca, hasta fines del siglo xvii, no existía un templo monumental y estable, sino una vieja construcción que se encontraba en ruinas y requería constantes reparaciones. Esta situación no podía continuar. Por lo tanto, Gabriel Fernández Guaráchi, cacique principal y gobernador de su pueblo desde 1620, tomó las primeras provisiones para la construcción de un nuevo templo.

Don Gabriel andaba muy ocupado la mayor parte de su vida en constantes viajes a Potosí como Capitán General de indios mitayos de la provincia de Paajes y, pese a su solvencia económica, no tuvo la oportunidad de construir un nuevo templo en el pueblo de Jesús de Machacha. Sin embargo, para cumplir su deseo, en su testamento de 10 de marzo de 1673 en la Villa de Potosí, ordenó a sus hijos la edificación de una iglesia y otras obras anexas, principalmente un beaterio para recogidas y un hospital. Dejó para ello la suma de 20,000 pesos, con la que se debían comprar cuatro haciendas, cuyos frutos debían dedicarse a fondos necesarios para la edificación del templo. [...] 

En un documento de 1706, la época en que se concluyó el templo, se indica que con la producción de las cuatro haciendas podía obtener alrededor de 16,000 pesos y 1,000 carneros de la tierra (llamas) para la construcción de la iglesia. De manera semejante -como enseguida veremos- debía precederse al distribuir la producción de otras haciendas, destinando buena parte a la construcción del templo. [...] 

La ejecución de la obra
Para iniciar la construcción, era imprescindible conseguir primero el dinero suficiente y luego los responsables debían enfrentar la ejecución de la obra. Desde el primer momento, Pedro y Diego Fernández Guaráchi (primos), con los demás hermanos y, muy especialmente, con las hermanas Lucrecia y María, se ocuparon de las primeras gestiones para coordinar y concretar los detalles de ejecución. Sin embargo, en su primer momento, la falta de recursos, la oposición del cura y la conservación de la antigua iglesia retrasaron algunos años la iniciación de la obra. [...] 

Tasación y valoración
Culminada la obra, Joseph Fernández Guaráchi, administrador general de la construcción, nos ofrece su valoración, tanto monetaria como cualitativa, en estos términos:

"En el estado en que se hizo vista de ojos tasación, y abalaustración de dicha iglesia por el año de mil setecientos y siete, se apreció en cantidad de ciento, y noventa y tres mil quinientos y veinte pesos conforme al costo que tuvo cada una de dichas partes, la plata labrada y otros ornamentos y lo dicho sea ejecutado sin tener gravado a la Real Hacienda en un marabed ni a los Encomenderos, como ni tampoco se hagan contribuidos limosnas particulares ni curridos el Ramo de fábrica y Rentas de dicha Iglesia por no tener ninguna, por que habiendo Dispuesto mi abuelo Don Gabriel Fernández Guaráche principaljndola, y proseguiéndola mi Padre Don Pedro y sus hermanos la he adelantado yo con los mismos esfuerzos hasta el estado referido." 

Esta cifra global de 193,520 pesos se refiere a la tasación final que a solicitud formal de Don Joseph realizó un equipo de funcionarios especializados. En efecto, una vez terminada la obra, los tasadores procedieron a la evaluación. Después de aportas estimaciones, los tasadores Juan de la Torre y Olasav, Joseph de Céspedes y Vicente Pauarcampa Sota Yupaquy, llegaron a las siguientes conclusiones:

Toda la parte de construcción gruesa, hecha de cal, canto (piedra) y ladrillo, se estimó en la suma
de 150,000 pesos. La otra parte complementaria, consistente en retablos, altar mayor, custodias, púlpito, puertas, bultora, lienzos, lámparas, etc., fue estimada en 43,520 pesos, sumando las dos partidas el costo total de 193,520 pesos. Sin duda fue muy difícil determinar una valoración exacta de todos los componentes de la obra. En muchos casos la tasación tuvo que realizarse a la "vista de ojos". Esta obra iniciada en 1679 y acabada en 1707, con todos sus componentes necesarios, difícilmente podría ser evaluada en su justa dimensión y su verdadero costo.

Para dar una idea de lo que podría significar entonces esta cantidad, durante el siglo XVIII un comunario con recursos podría liberarse de ir a la mita anual de Potosí pagando 52 pesos, que era lo que se presumía ser también el costo de contratar a un sustituto (wink'a). Es decir, considerando una suficiente equivalencia de valores y prescindiendo de otros notables gastos y esfuerzos - como la mano de obra gratuita de los comunarios - el dinero que nuestros caciques machaquenses invirtieron en la construcción equivalía al costo anual de 3,722 mitayos. [...]

La mano de obra

[...] Debemos recordar que los caciques disponían de la mano de obra indígena de su comunidad: mitaya tributaria y la "reserva" de la mita. El cacique tenía el poder de movilizar esa mano de obra si se trataba de una obra relacionada con el servicio del Estado y de la Iglesia. Esta mano de obra de tipo servil, como no representaba una erogación financiera, no entraba en las cuentas para ser tomada en cuenta como una fuerza de trabajo remunerado.

Artistas y trabajadores calificados

Se conocen los nombres de las principales personas que trabajaron como mano de obra calificada. A continuación presentamos la lista sistematizada de acuerdo a sus lugares de origen. Muestra, desde otra perspectiva, la envergadura de aquella empresa que concentró a técnicos y artistas de muchas y distintas procedencias:

Jesús de Machaqa (provincia de Pacajes)
- Alfonso Callí, indio, participó como maestro alfabetil desde el primer momento en la construcción de la iglesia.
- Felipe Guaráchi, indio "del Aillo Collana" (es decir, Jilatiti) y primo del cacique José Fernández Guaráchi, trabajó como maestro oficial de alfabetil.
- Yunguyo [Yunkuyu] (provincia de Chucuito)
- Pedro Saldaña, español del pueblo, escultor y experto "en el arte de la pintura", trabajó en su oficio ocho meses.

Acora [Agura] (provincia de Chucuito)
- Diego Poma, indio natural del pueblo de Acora pero que residía en el pueblo de Jesús de Machaqa, maestro oficial de platero, realizó los trabajos de la "lámpara grande" y también "el trono de plata". Huarina [Warina] (provincia de Omasuyos)
- Francisco de Miranda, español natural del pueblo, trabajó ocho meses como maestro oficial de ensamblador. Aparece ya en el testamento de Gabriel Fernández Guaráchi como deudor de 300 pesos.

Ciudad de La Paz
- Lorenzo de Avendaño, español natural de la ciudad, maestro oficial de platero, elaboró "algunas obras de plata" y también "el trono".
- Francisco Achuiuca, oriundo de la parroquia [de indios] de San Pedro, carpintero que trabajó por 300 pesos.

Ciudad de La Plata
- Miguel Fernández, español de la ciudad, maestro y oficial de carpintero, trabajó desde el inicio como ensamblador en los "retablos del altar mayor".

Ciudad del Cuzco
- Juan Quispe. Por su apellido, indio; natural de la ciudad, intervino como maestro oficial de alfabetil y cantero.
- Mateo Challoco Yupanki, indio natural de la ciudad, trabajó como "maestro escultor y oficial de pintura, durante dos años, especialmente "en hacer los bultos que están en los nichos del altar mayor" y realizó "algunos lienzos de pinturas que están puestos en ella".
- Pedro Nolasco Texe Rupai, indio natural de la ciudad, trabajó durante un año como maestro y oficial de platero, realizando los trabajos de plata "como son la custodia" y el "trono del señor".
- Ambrosio de la Cruz, español natural de la ciudad, trabajó más de cuatro años como maestro oficial de ensamblador.
- Diego de la Cruz, vino de la ciudad del Cuzco para trabajar como maestro escultor en los tres retablos (uno para el altar mayor y dos para altares del crucero).
- Lorenzo Guamán. Por su apellido presumimos que era de ancestrales indios y que provenía también del Cuzco, como el anterior junto a quien se cita. Este arquitecto estuvo "desde sus principios" y trabajó como maestro mayor en "las bóvedas... desde la portada al presbiterio y crucero, asistiendo a los oficiales que han trabajado desde veinte años a esta parte."

¿Los indios de la Iglesia?

A partir de la construcción del templo se produjo un deseo de poblamiento en torno al "templo católico" y se intentó dar una nueva funcionalidad al pueblo de Jesús de Machaqa, al que Gabriel Fernández Guaráchi ya había asegurado un contorno de media legua a la redonda en la composición de tierras de 1645. Desde entonces, en los recuentos de los aylus de Jesús de Machaqa se añade una nueva categoría que no tiene aún la condición de ayllu: son los "indios tributarios de la iglesia" en calidad de nuevos vecinos o forasteros.

Desde diez años antes de que se concluyera el templo y dos antes de que se iniciara el beaterio, el 20 de febrero de 1667, el corregidor de la provincia de Pacajes, a petición de José Fernández Guaráchi, ordenó a los indios del pueblo de Jesús de Machaqa que construyan en él sus casas, "para su manutención como para que vivan bien educados y doctrinados y para que cumplan las obligaciones de cristiano en oír misa los domingos y días festivos, confesar y comulgar [en] las cuarzasmes". Probablemente se construyeron "muchas casas", pero no todo se hizo realidad. No dudamos que la construcción del templo motivó o fue además algo así como una nueva fundación de Jesús de Machaqa, el "pueblo nuevo", como centro cívico, religioso y ceremonial de toda la marca con sus doce aylus.

La finalidad declarada del núcleo poblado era para mantener a los indios controlados a través de la instrucción en los misterios de la fe cristiana, pero el objetivo no era exclusivamente religioso. La posibilidad de mayor concentración en el pueblo tenía también virtudes para el gobierno cacicazgo y, a través de él, para las finalidades fiscales del estado colonial. Al reducir a los ausentes para ser instruidos en los misterios de la fe cristiana, se facilitaba también el control y la permanencia de los indios en el nuevo pueblo para que paguen sus tributos y acudan a la mita de Potosí. Es decir, en torno al templo —se pensaba— era más fácil implementar lo que ya había sido la pretensión del virrey Toledo con su política de reducciones.

Sobre el caso de los indios ausentes, el mismo Guaráchi pidió al virrey, doctor Don Diego Ladron de Guevara, se le despachase una provisión para su
Concilio de Trento (1563)
La invocación, veneración y reliquias de los Santos, y de las sagradas imágenes

Manda el santo Concilio a todos los obispos, y demás personas que tienen el cargo y obligación de enseñar, que instruyan con exactitud a los fieles ante todas cosas, sobre la intercesión e invocación de los Santos, honor de las reliquias, y uso legítimo de las imágenes, según la costumbre de la Iglesia Católica y Apostólica, recibida desde los tiempos primitivos de la religión cristiana, y según el consentimiento de los santos Padres, y los decretos de los sagrados concilios; enseñándoles que los Santos que reían juntamente con Cristo, rian a Dios por los hombres; que es bueno y útil invocarlos humildemente, y recurrir a sus oraciones, intercesión, y auxilio para alcanzar de Dios los beneficios por Jesucristo su hijo, nuestro Señor, que es sólo nuestro redentor y salvador; y que piensan impía mente los que niegan que se deben invocar los Santos que gozan en el cielo de eterna felicidad; o los que afirmaron que los Santos no rían por los hombres; o que es idolatría invocarlos, para que rieguen por nosotros, aun por cada uno en particular; o que repugna a la palabra de Dios, y se oponen al honor de Jesucristo, único mediador entre Dios y los hombres; o que es necedad suplicar verbal o mentalmente a los que reían en el cielo.

Instruyan también a los fieles en que deben venerar los Santos cuerpos de los Santos mártires, y de otros que viven con Cristo, que fueron miembros vivos del mismo Cristo, y templos del Espíritu Santo, por quien han de resucitar a la vida eterna para ser glorificados, y por los cuales concede Dios muchos beneficios a los hombres; de suerte que deben ser absolutamente condenados, como anti qúisimamente los condenó, y ahora también los condena la Iglesia, los que afirmaron que no se deben honrar, ni venerar las reliquias de los Santos; o que van en vano la adoración que estas y otros monumen tos sagrados reciben de los fieles; y que son inútiles las frecuentes visitas a las capillas dedicadas a los Santos con el fin de alcanzar su socorro. Además de esto, declara que se deben tener y conservar, principalmente en los templos, las imágenes de Cristo, de la Virgen madre de Dios, y de otros Santos, y que se les debe dar el correspondiente honor y veneración.

no porque se crea que hay en ellas divinidad, o virtud alguna por la que merezcan el culto, o que se les deba pedir alguna cosa, o que se haya de poner la confianza en las imágenes, como hacían en otros tiempos los gentiles, que colocaban su esperanza en los ídolos; sino porque el honor que se da a las imágenes, se refiere a los originales representados en ellas; de suerte que adoramos a Cristo por medio de las imágenes que besamos, y en cuya presencia nos descubrimos y arrodillamos; y veneramos a los Santos, cuya semejanza tienen: todo lo cual es lo que se halla establecido en los decretos de los concilios, y en especial en los del segundo Niceno contra los impugnadores de las imágenes.

Enseñen con esmero los obispos que por medio de las historias de nuestra redención, expresadas en pinturas y otras copias, se instruye y confirma el pueblo recordándose habilidades de la fe, y recapti ciándose continuamente en ellos: además que se saca mucho fruto de todas las sagradas imágenes, no sólo porque recuerden al pueblo los beneficios y dones que Cristo les ha concedido, sino también porque se exponen a los ojos de los fieles los saludos ejemplos de los Santos, y los milagros que Dios ha obrado por ellos, con el fin de que den gracias a Dios por ellos, y arreglen su vida y costumbres a los ejemplos de los mismos Santos; así como para que se exciten a adorar, y amar a Dios, y practicar la piedad. Y si alguno enseñare, o sintiere lo contrario a estos decretos, sea excomulgado. Mas si se hubieren introducido algunos abusos en estas santas y salubres prácticas, desea ardientemente el santo Concilio que se exterminen de todo punto; de suerte que no se coloquen imágenes algunas de falsos dogmas, ni que den ocasión a los ruidos de peligrosos errores. Y si aconteciere que se expresen y figuren en alguna ocasión historias y narraciones de Sagrada Escritura, por ser estas convenientes a la instrucción de la ignorante plebe; enseñése al pueblo que esto no es copiar la divinidad, como si fuera posible que se viese esta con ojos corporales, o pudiese expresarse con colores o figuras. Destiérsese absolutamente toda superstición en la invocación de los Santos, en la veneración de las reliquias, y en el sagrado uso de las imágenes; abúyéntese toda granancia sordida; evítense en fin toda torpeza; de manera que no se piten ni adornen las imágenes con hermosura escandalosa; ni abusan tampoco los hombres de las fiestas de los Santos, ni de la visita de las reliquias; para tener convivontias, ni embrigudes; como si el lujo y lascivia fuese el culto con que deban celebrar los días de fiesta en honor de los Santos. Finalmente pongan los obispos tanto cuidado y diligencia en este punto, que nada se vea desordenado, o puesto fuera de su lugar, y tumultuariamente, nada pro-
2. EUROPA, SIN PAPELES

Mercedes: (entra en escena/ en la alfombra.)
¡Esta es la historia de Yolanda. Hace tres años que Yolanda vive en Europa. Sin papeles.

Benilda: (entra en escena/ en la alfombra.)
Controlan en las paradas de autobús, o en el metro. Y en la estación de tren, ¡claro! Si pareces extrañero, siempre te controlan. Ayer, cuando volví del trabajo, me encontré con una redada policial. Tenían a todos contra la pared, como si fueran criminales todos con rasgos indígenas. Algunos estaban llorando, la mayoría callada.

Mercedes: Yo pasé así...

Mercedes y Benilda: (se pasean por la alfombra, siblando y mirando.)

Mercedes: Por suerte no parezco extrañero.

Benilda: Yo trabajo de empleada del hogar.

(Hace un gesto de limpiar cristales.)

Mercedes: De cocinera...

(Hace un gesto de cocinar.)

Benilda: De planchadora...

(Hace un gesto de planchar.)

Mercedes: De costurera.

(Hace un gesto de coser.)

Benilda: De niñera.

(Hace un gesto de mecer un niño.)

Mercedes: De camarera de pisos.

(Gesto de hacer una camisa.)

Benilda: Así lo puedo llamar también. Al principio, fue muy duro. Solo trabajaba,

Mercedes: día y noche.

(Signa con el dedo un reloj de pulsera imaginario.)

Benilda: Y los domingos, cuando libra, no salía. ¡Porque no conocía a nadie!

Mercedes: Y por miedo a los controles.

(Cruza los brazos encima del busto.)

Mercedes: ¡Estuve totalmente aislada! (Mercedes alza las manos con las palmas hacia los lados de su cara.)

Mercedes: Además, extrañaba mucho a mi familia.

Mercedes: mis hermanos

Benilda: mi marido

Mercedes: mis hijas

Benilda: Y el clima aquí me enfriaba.

Mercedes: Ahora estoy mejor. Conozco a más gente que está en la misma situación, y nos apoyamos mutuamente.

---

Triunfo de las domésticas activas
Konstanze Schmitz, Stephan Dillamuth,
Territorio Doméstico

1. LA HISTORIA DE LATIFA
(En la plaza jacto Benavente. Latifa cruza la alfombra desde el cuadro-carrero hacia el público. Se para en el borde de la alfombra.)

Latifa: Os voy a contar la historia de una chica sin papeles que defendió sus derechos.

El público: (Grita, vioírca, aplauden.)

Latifa: Sí, se puede.

La chica soy yo.

(Latifa señala con el dedo su pecho.)

Está también su jefa...

(Latifa hace un gesto de invitación hacia su derecha. Mercedes pisa la alfombra con un cartel que pone "Jefa" y se pone al lado de Latifa.)

... y la hija de la jefa.

(Latifa hace un gesto de invitación hacia su izquierda. Benilda pisa la alfombra con un cartel que pone "Hija de Jefa" y se pone al lado de Latifa.)

... y está un grupo de trabajadoras domésticas! Está territorio doméstico!

(Latifa describe un medio círculo delante suyo. Gira hacia su derecha.)

Mercedes/Jefa: ¡Estás despedida!

Latifa: ¡Y mi dinero?

Mercedes/Jefa: ¡Manana!

(Mercedes le da la espalda. Latifa gira hacia su izquierda.)

Latifa: ¡Mi dinero?

Benilda/Hija de Jefa: Eso es todo.

(Benílda le golpea la palma de la mano y le da la espalda.)

Latifa: ¡Al frente! ¡Ayudad ¡Ayudad!

(Benílda y Mercedes dan la vuelta a sus carteles y aparecen las palabras "Territorio" y "Doméstico". Empezan a cantar.)

Benilda y Mercedes: Te ayudamos. ¡Tienes derechos!

El público: (repite) ¡Te ayudamos. ¡Tienes derechos!

Latifa: Denunciamos y me tuvieron que pagar.

(Las tres mujeres se dan las manos y las alzan. Benilda y Mercedes juntan los carteles.)
(Mercedes y Benilda chacan sus palmas. Aplauso.)
(Mercedes muestra tres dedos de la mano.)
Mercedes: Hace tres años que estoy en Europa.
(Benilda hace un gesto de borrar.)
Benilda: Oficialmente, no existo.
(Mercedes golpea el dorso de la mano en la palma de la otra.)
Mercedes: No tengo papeles.
(Benilda alza la mano con el dedo índice en alto.)
Benilda: En realidad soy profesora,
(Mercedes hace el gesto de darse una inyección.)
enfermera,
(Benilda hace un gesto de golpear con un martillo sobre una mesa.)
juiza,
(Mercedes gira la mano cerrada al lado de su cabeza.)
psiquiatra,
(Benilda teclea sobre un teclado imaginario.)
secretaria.
Mercedes: Pero sin papeles, las mujeres sólo tenemos dos opciones: trabajar como empleadas domésticas
(Mercedes hace un gesto de ponerse un delantal.)
o como prostitutas.
(Mercedes levanta el pie y se alza una media imaginaria.)
Benilda:
¿Qué pasa? pregunto.
(Rafaela levanta el sacudidor cada vez que “habla” el policía. R. apoya el sacudidor en el suelo
cada vez que “habla” ella.)
“Paciencia el que te cortó la conexión”, dice
el policía, “y ahora quiero ver tus papeles”.

No pienso mostrárselos, y él me toma del brazo y me lleva afuera.
“¿Quieres ir esposada, es esto lo que quieres?”, dice, y me mete en el coche,
cierro con llave y se va.

(Se dirige a la alfombra y la sacude. Vuelve.)
Al rato vuelve y vamos a comisaría. Allí
yo muestro mis papeles a un policía que me los pide educadamente.
“Ahora sí” grita él.
“Sí”, respondo, “porque su compañero me trata con respeto y eso es lo que yo pido”.
Redacta el acta y me dice: “Firma aquí”
“No”, le digo, “conozco mis derechos”.
Primero leo, ¿Qué había puesto? Desacato a la autoridad y resistencia a la detención. No voy a firmarlo, le digo,
quiere que otro policía lo redacte. Además quiere poner una denuncia.
“La señora quiere poner una denuncia”
gritó. “¿Desde cuándo está aquí? ¿Tiene que volver a su país?”
“Yo tengo mis papeles desde 1995, y aunque no lo acta, me dice: “Firma aquí”
“No”, le digo, “conozco mis derechos”.
“En su país, ¿saben qué soy yo?”, repite.
Después, le puse la denuncia.

Me quería amenazar: “Se va a quedar toda la noche en comisaría”
“No me molesta”, dije, “yo tengo todo el tiempo”. Se cabreo, por lo menos no podía salir a azuzar gente sin papeles; es un tipo muy peligroso.
(Rafaela da unos pasos y se queda muy cerca del público.)
Os digo una cosa: él no tenía derecho.
Primero la policía no debe controlar en el locutorio, lo puede hacer en la puerta,
pero no en el local. Segundo: no me debe tocar. Y tercero: no llevar papeles no es un delito, es una falta.
(Rafaela vuelve a la alfombra y la sacude.)
El público: ¡La ley de extranjería, para la Reina Sofía!

Madrid, 28 de marzo de 2010

El mundo moderno se configura produciendo a la vez las grandes separaciones y concentraciones que caracterizan la vida económica, política y cotidiana contemporánea. Se modifica el modo de articulación de los diversos aspectos y prácticas de la vida social. Cambia la forma en que la sociedad se representa a sí misma, lo que implica cambios de estructuras, de discursos y sentidos en el seno de las nuevas instituciones.

Las sociedades modernas se erigen sobre la desorganización de las formas comunitarias, que eran formas de totalización de la vida social. La fragmentación de estas totalidades, causada por la separación-concentración en algunos ámbitos estructurales, que así adquieren mayor importancia, como la economía y la política, convertida en Estado, deja a otros ámbitos y procesos de la vida social en condiciones de desarticulación, marginalidad e invisibilidad.

Estos procesos de modernización que quiebran las totalidades sociales preexistentes no llegan a reconstituir nuevas totalidades sociales que articulen todo lo que ha perdido su horizonte y su principio de unidad y sentido.

[...] En países como Bolivia, además de las divisiones propias de una sociedad moderna, existen las que resultan de la diversidad social que hacen de Bolivia más que una sociedad, un país plurisocial, que contiene varios tipos de civilizaciones que se hallan en una situación de superposición desarticulada. A esto René Zavala lo llamó abigarramiento. Hay otro tipo de relaciones sociales que articulan formas de producción, comunidad y de autoridad local o de gobierno diferentes a las del Estado-nación que se superpone inorgánicamente a las mismas.

Hay, en consecuencia, varias concepciones del mundo porque hay varios tipos de sociedad. La superficie de la sociedad nacional sintetizada o articulada por el Estado y su base social sólo corresponde a una parte de estos territorios y culturas, como descripción y proyección de sentido y gobierno. En ella aparecen algunas pequeñas manchas que provienen de esas otras formas sociales, porque están ahí debajo.
Max Jorge Hinderer: En el ensayo *Subsuelo político* (2008), lo que usted describe es que debajo de la superficie hegemónica existe una cierta economía de prácticas y afectos que constituyen la posibilidad de autodeterminación o desobediencia. ¿Accaso el subsuelo de la superficie hegemónica mantiene el potencial de invertirla?

Luis Tapia: Es ése el modo en que yo pienso el proceso boliviano de instaurar una institucionalidad estatal y también otras instituciones sociales. Porque no han logrado destruir o sustituir totalmente las estructuras previas: se han sobrepuesto, se han establecido condiciones de dominación, pero sin desorganizarlas. La peculiaridad del caso boliviano es que, en realidad, no sólo existen fragmentos de otras culturas, sino sociedades en su totalidad. No sólo hay gente que habla aymara sino que existe una estructura comunitaria, un modo de organizar su relación con la naturaleza, una cosmopisión, una propia estructura de gobierno. A diferencia de otros países donde hay gente que mantiene su lengua pero ya no tiene su forma de autogobierno, sobre todo porque ha perdido control sobre la tierra, en Bolivia hay estructuras de autogobierno que no forman parte del Estado boliviano y no son reconocidas o incluso son negadas por el Estado. Ése es uno de los componentes importantes del subsuelo boliviano político.

Max Jorge Hinderer: ¿Existe una profundidad histórica del subsuelo?

Luis Tapia: Eso creo que difiere. En el caso boliviano, por ejemplo, veo mucha profundidad, por así decir. El subsuelo político está configurado por situaciones más antiguas que el Estado boliviano. Estructuras que han persistido tras la dominación colonial e incluso con la organización liberal republicana. Esa es una profundidad que expresa una memoria y en ese caso el impulso que ahora ha hecho que se haya planteado la nueva constitución pensando en un Estado plurinacional. Eso responde a este tipo de profundidad, que sería diferente a fuerzas que respondan sólo al tiempo de implantación de una sociedad moderna. Por ejemplo, fuerzas obreras. Pero incluso la cos (Central Obrera Boliviana) responde a muchos tipos de profundidad. Hay una larga acumulación histórica aquí, que además jalaba lo comunitario, lo indígena, la exclusión racista. Sin embargo, hay otros espacios con formas de profundidad distintas, por ejemplo movimientos juveniles. Estos despliegan una temporalidad más corta. En el reciente pasado algunos querían concretarse y de hecho se conectaron con lo originario, otros simplemente eran anti-estatales. Además, muchos jóvenes pasan algunos años en el movimiento y luego lo abandonan. Es algo que es más temporal en el sentido estricto del término. También existen acciones y espacios públicos que se configuran en temporalidades más cortas, por ejemplo, en el caso de las fuerzas crísis del Ecuador y Argentina. En particular, donde han emergido los MNO, los piqûeres, que han articulado redes de asambleas que tienen una historia pesada, pero es una profundidad histórica distinta, por ejemplo, a la de una red de afilas que se mantuvo durante siglos. También es algo que puede desaparecer después de un tiempo. Yo creo que hay así diferentes profundidades. Dependiendo del tipo de cuestionamiento que le planteen al Estado, o al sistema de dominación, y del tiempo que logren sostenerlo. Algo que no venga de hace siglos, sino que venga de hace 5 ó 10 años, pero que haya logrado arraigarse fuertemente.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Uno de los temas centrales en su ensayo sobre el subsuelo es la ciudadanía política. ¿Qué sería la relación que mantiene el subsuelo con el nivel de derechos políticos?

Luis Tapia: En muchos casos es en el subsuelo político donde por primera vez se ha imaginado un derecho o un conjunto de derechos, y se han empeorado a organizar fuerzas políticas para luchar por ellos. Incluso, a veces, se ha llegado a ponerlos en práctica antes de que el Estado los reconozca. Eso ha ocurrido con algunas fuerzas obreras cuando eran clandestinas o no eran reconocidas por el Estado, también con fuerzas indígenas, en unos lugares más que en otros, pero siempre están en el subsuelo. Los derechos no son algo que siempre ha existido. Hubo gente que imaginó algún derecho que debía ser reconocido de manera universal, o por lo menos estatal. Han generado fuerza política y movimientos para reformar el Estado. Pienso que a lo largo de la historia muchos de los derechos políticos, en particular de los derechos sociales, han sido imaginados desde el subsuelo. De ahí han surgido movimientos que han reformado el Estado.

Max Jorge Hinderer: ¿Y en particular los derechos humanos?

Luis Tapia: La historia de los derechos humanos tiene varias facetas que, en su presentación discursiva, aparecen como tensiones que responden a varias líneas de desarrollo. Por un lado los derechos humanos son pensados de manera naturalista: sólo por la condición de ser humano tendría esos dere
Subjectivity should lie on the side of those demanding rights

Christoph Menke in conversation with Alice Croischer, Max Jorge Hinderer, and Andreas Siekmann

Max Jorge Hinderer: Together with Arnd Pollmann, you have written an introduction to the Philosophy of Human Rights. How is the concept of human rights, on which your book is predicated, to be assessed in historical terms?

Christoph Menke: There are two significant dates and a debate on the relationship between the two: the declaration of the civil and human rights in the French Revolution of 1789, and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948. From the various titles you may remark that the second is a response to problems with the first. For the former conflates civil and human rights, and the ensuing period is shaped by the tension between these two concepts. Throughout the nationalistic nineteenth century, human rights were only safeguarded by civil rights, since the attainment of human rights only appeared conceivable with a nation-state. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights endeavors to draw up a global concept of human rights, which, at first glance, finally appears to deliver on the aspirations of 1789. Yet we see more of a clear discontinuity. There is an essential difference between whether one believes human rights can be realized in the form of civil rights, or whether one believes that the tension obtaining between human and civil rights must be intensified. Thus we must pose the fundamental question of how the right to rights can be established—the right of every human being to enjoy rights as a citizen of a state—and that as an explicit reaction to the experiences under National Socialism.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Can we assume that a Franco-German Enlightenment discourse preceded the Declaration of 1789?

Christoph Menke: Various sources came together: Jean Jacques Rousseau, John Locke. There is one strand of discourse predicated on a political, moral rights which must then be realized by the political arena. The other strand of discourse formulates a radical idea of political self-determination which can never only apply to a specific group, or to one person alone. Demand-
far as they were not baptized, did not lead a fully-fledged existence. But the requirement to cultivate them is an argument that first surfaces in the eighteenth century. Making the other a subject, civilizing the other through education—that is a decidedly enlightened concept. Subjectivization through the acquisition of skills, which under Michel Foucault’s concept of Discipline is described as the central idea of the eighteenth century. Today, we are confronted with an individualistic, “self-fulfillment” brand of capitalism, in which subjectivization consists of assuming self-responsibility for one’s own life. This corresponds to the paradigms of self-responsibility underpinning overseas developmental policies.

Alice Creischer: One example would be the social concepts of the Scottish school of philosophy, which discovered a sort of laboratory situation in the Indio colony.

Andreas Siekmann: Let’s return to the question of how one acquires a mandate. Is this conceivable without possessing or appropriating power?

Christoph Menke: In her commentary on the Human Rights Charter of 1948, Hannah Arendt argued that it would be wrong to compile a list of the individual rights in the first place. The only human right is the right to have rights. To believe that one can confer rights, instead of recognizing an entitlement to demand them, has been the fundamental legalistic flaw in the Human Rights Declarations and human rights policies since World War II. The asymmetry, the implied imperialism that we can identify in human rights policies is closely allied to this legalism. For one is then permitted to intervene in the name of human rights, and yet treat the other as a passive recipient of rights. Consequently, we must ask how the claiming of rights should be understood in detail. How can this be achieved by breaking with the prevailing order? Especially as breaking with the existing order is always associated with symbolic or physical violence.

This leads us on to another aspect. There is a metaphor that depicts human rights as a “door opener” for repressive regimes, yet which often only results in their integration into the global economic and legal systems. Human rights then become an instrument with which to establish an order defined primarily in economic terms. These two sides, subjectivization and globalization, are thus inextricably linked. I would now like to address this issue in relation to the problem of identity, which you raised in your list of questions.

Alice Creischer: We touched upon this during our discussions on the issue of political identity conducted as part of this project. Is displaying an interest beyond one’s own cultural boundaries not hegemonic in itself? We also observed a dialectical dilemma: Whereas in recent decades, states and corporations have struck agreements on the free circulation of goods, resources, and labor, international solidarity with political struggles is stigmatized as a projection of European values. The truth, or rather the authenticity of political demands, is now gauged by its identification with the groups claiming them. This identity-paradigm appears to fundamentally delegitimize political action, that is, action extending beyond one’s own vested interests.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Without this general politicization, however, the groups and their interests would become rivals, their rights and demands pluralistic; they then become commodities or offers that a society can either acquire or reject.

Christoph Menke: One has to take another look at this problem and the questions it raises with regard to what it means and how it is possible to claim a right. Within the context of political action, the concept of identity is ambiguous. If the act of claiming a right is linked to an identity, which is thus reinforced, then it cannot be distinguished from the mere representation of interests, and remains enshrouded within this economic and legal paradigm. Political aspirations and demands which extend beyond one’s own vested interests are absent from this paradigm. Although it is not possible to articulate demands without starting from a specific identity, the act of political articulation must of itself be possessed of a logic or an authority that extends beyond the interests of one’s own identity, and which is prepared to transform this identity within the act itself.

I feel that the 1970s slogan of “international solidarity” was often an uncritical reflection of all possible liberation movements that in fact only represented the local ruling interests. One interesting aspect of the chronicle of Poma de Ayala is that the authenticity discourse no longer plays any role. Hence this is not simply a case of the authentic versus the outsider.

In recent years, the Declaration of Human Rights has been continually augmented with ever more additional declarations—a long list of aspirations, interests, and requirements, akin to an anthology: a definition of human beings couched in legal declarations. This purportedly immutable definition is then subject to all manner of possible constellations when it enters the political arena.

Andreas Siekmann: ... and the structural adjustment programs of the IMF.

Christoph Menke: Let us return to the subject within the concept of human rights. Conceived within the framework of Europe’s democratic political structures, this refers to the juxtaposition of the many individual subjects on the one hand, and the politically abstract entity, the state, on the other. Manifested here is the ambivalence of subjectivization: It is a new form of governance, which, at the same time, has always, and continues to hold a potential, which has accompanied it from the outset, and which expresses itself in the right of the subject to demand rights. This is conferred upon the individual subject, not as a stakeholder, national citizen, or a “Me Inc.”, but as a human being. Although Karl Marx describes the degree of brutality with which capitalism destroys all close bonds, he also identifies the possibility of subjectivization as being inextricably linked to this destruction, and extending beyond any notion of identity.

One can perceive the concept of human rights as having fundamentally changed the form of power-political governance because anyone can, at any time, articulate his or her demand for rights; it is a demand that potentially challenges the prevailing power structures. This has given shape to a dimorphic form of human rights that strives either to incorporate revolts into the system, or open up the system for revolts. It therefore remains to be seen which direction the concept will take in future.

The interview was conducted in Berlin, December 21, 2001.
Quienes nos representan en realidad nos reemplazan
Isaisa Grifolino

"Escribimos como si ya habitáramos en los futuros últimos tiempos de una literatura muerta."  
Enrique Falcón

El dictador Franco llegó a Huelva el 25 de abril de 1967 para conocer el Polo Industrial de Promoción y Desarrollo. En su nombre, en el NO-DO 1270A, una voz en off dice:

"Toda esta obra de transformación de Huelva, de industrialización, de mejora y crecimiento de estas plantas industriales maravillas, no hubiera sido posible si no existiera una minoría inasequible al desaliento que mantuviera vivo nuestro espíritu."  
El Rey vino a Huelva el 31 de marzo de 1976, su visita la recoge el NO-DO 1733A; la voz en off no dice nada sobre las palabras de Juan Carlos I a propósito de esta obra.

La Transición es un periodo de tiempo difuso de la reciente historia española, luminoso para unos, oscuro para otros. Todos coinciden en algo: condena. Si navegásemos en las palabras, tal vez descubriéramos que "consenso" es algo parecido a una tierra con llagunas, un páramo que durante el día se cubre de una densa neblina tóxica y que, al caer la noche, se torna ciénaga llena de aves de rapiña aciliadas a los densos humedales para vivir entre las toxicidades. En tal ambiente, para algunos la única forma de sobrevivir es practicar una suerte de darwinismo militarizado que les impide hacerse preguntas. Si esa "minoría" militariza su vida, podrá mantener vivo su espíritu el tiempo que desee.

Las fiestas mayores de Huelva son las Colombinñas. Cada 3 de agosto nos recuerdan de dónde salió Colón. A finales de los 70, en los jardines exteriores del Monasterio de La Rábida, vi a Julio Iglesias actuar ante la columna levantada en 1892 como Monumento a los Descubridores. En el claustro mudéjar del convento, oí al argentino Horacio Guarany cantar "si se calla el cantor, calla la vida".

Aquél tiempo era el del bachillerato en el instituto. En clase divisaba el Monasterio de La Rábida donde oró Cristóbal Colón antes de salir hacia las Indias; cuando iba a la cafetería veía como el Polo Industrial se extendía por el horizonte apoderándose de la ría, de la tierra, de la mar y del cielo; a veces, presenciaba los primeros cortes de tráfico de obreros en huelga y las cargas policiales para que las ruedas ardien no impidieran entrar en las maravillas plantas industriales; lo último que recuerdo es cómo desaparecían los cultivos tradicionales para, en su lugar, llenarse de plásticos que la agroindustria de la fresa imponía como único modelo de desarrollo rural.

Desde el año 98 del siglo XIX, la pérdida de las últimas colonias supuso para España una losa que ha modulado todo el siglo XX. De ahí que el viaje que terminó por "encontrar" América, haya sido narrado a esta orilla del Atlántico como una "gesta" gloriosa. Su punto álgido fue 1992, con la Exposición Universal de Sevilla, evento celebrado en clave de "era de los descubrimientos".

El Monasterio de La Rábida y sus alrededores se conocen como "los lugares colombinos". En 1992 construyeron un ridículo parque temático sobre el "descubrimiento", un embarradero con las réplicas de las tres carabelas, visita obligada de turistas. De una u otra manera, esos lugares están hoy esponzorizados por alguna empresa de la Asociación de Industrias Químicas y Básicas (AIE) que controla la provincia.

En los archivos de la Filoteca Nacional referidos a los lugares colombinos, en tono epico, en el NO-DO 1733A, se narra la aportación de esta tierra como sigue:

Huelva, un aniversario glorioso

"El 3 de agosto de 1492, en el puerto de Palos de la Frontera, cercano a Moguer y frente al convento de La Rábida, levaban anclas las tres carabelas de amistad para realizar el más glorioso de los viajes y el más famoso de los descubrimientos. En el, orgullo de España fue aquella intrépida gesta con la que 20 naciones alcanzaron su mayoría de edad y hoy, independientes y soberanas, profesan nuestra fe y hablan nuestro idioma. Ésta es la gran obra de nuestra patria, bincada en aquel puerto andaluza y que recientemente ha sido conmemorada en Huelva."

Ahondando en este proyecto, he recordado hechos que estaban en mi memoria sin ataduras precisas. Todo estaba atado y bien atado, por supuesto, por esa "minoría". Unos hombres que en pocos años dejaron la política y se posicionaron en el mundo del capital. Los negocios eran su política. Un puñado de hombres que se muevan por la historia sin apenas ser vistos: lo único visible de ellos son sus obras faraónicas. Siempre están en los lugares adecuados apretando las manos adecuadas, sacando provecho de las relaciones que ayer adecuadamente hicieron. A veces, inadvertidamente, encuentran cierta oposición que deben aplastar con la maqui-
oria legal de un Estado democrático que se alimenta de inadecuados. Hombres que fabrican químicos tanto para la industria agrícola como para la industria militar (Fisas, 1989). Para ellos, nuestras vidas no son nada.

Un día de 2002, cayó en mis manos El Vigilante, la revista del Comité Ciudadano por la Descontaminación de Huelva. Por entonces, documentaba las condiciones laborales de quienes, desde África, venían a trabajar a los campos de fresa sin contrato laboral malviviendo en chabolas de plástico; miraba sin apreciar la relación entre ellos y los que fabrican químicos.

Para volver a mirar, he utilizado los casos, uno local y otro global, de dos hombres. Uno es Antonio Medina Lama, un hombre que a finales de los 60 se hizo con la concesión administrativa de la finca "Las Madres", 200 hectáreas que consiguió a un precio ridículo. Siguiendo sus pasos, los agricultores locales cambiaron la agricultura tradicional por la agroindustria. La tierra pasó a ser una enorme mina a cielo abierto de donde sacar el preciado oro rojo: la fresa. En poco más de treinta años se ha generado en la provincia de Huelva un monocultivo de unas 7,500 hectáreas, que arrasa montes comunales y agota acuíferos. El otro hombre es Juan Miguel Villar Mir, Ministro de Hacienda en el primer gobierno democrático tras la transición; diez años después empezó a vertiginosa carrera empresarial comprando empresas por una peseta.

Hay algo que une estas dos escalas: los fertilizantes químicos que produce la empresa Fertiberia del Grupo Villar Mir. Unos productos que se utilizan de manera desmesurada en los campos de fresas, al igual que en toda la agroindustria española. La agroindustria necesita un stock de trabajadores temporales que puedan ser contratados según cambien las condiciones climáticas.

En 1986, tres meses después del desastre de Chernóbil, la "minoría" decidió unir sus fuerzas ante los nuevos tiempos: nació la ACO. Un selecto club de dirigentes químicos a quienes nuestros representantes políticos dejan hacer sus necesidades en el patio trasero de la ciudad: ellos son hoy los nuevos amos de los lugares colombinos. Pienso en la reciente historia de mi tierra, y en mi memoria se posan las palabras de Antonio Oríhuela: "Quienes nos representan en realidad nos reemplazan. Me acuerdo de su poema:

**Huelva**

Hay sitios
en las afueras de esta ciudad
que jamás verás en un folleto turístico.
El paisaje de escombro
donde hierven, estancadas,
el agua de los colectores de las petroquímicas
y se desliza hacia el mar
el rojo veneno de las montañas de fosfoyesos.

Tienen las chimeneas toneladas de gases tóxicos
cae polvo gris sobre la piel del mundo
levantada, día tras día,
con más saña que el padrastro de un niño.

También estallan, en esta hora,
un millón de motones
que vuelven a casa,
signos de normalidad
que no impiden que las enfermedades
pulmonares
arrasen con los viejos, dejan tocados a los recién nacidos
o empañen de hollín sus pulmones, sus gasas
y se pone el sol
no sin una incierta belleza
que hace aún más hiriente
toda esta ruina
que paga
periódicos, políticos, libros de poesía
y hasta la restauración de todos los santos y santuarios de esta ciudad
antes de llevarse por delante a los que acuden a las procesiones.

Espacios de desolación
en otra mayor desolación
por la que va cayendo, lentamente, la tarde.

Los residuos industriales en Huelva son un sínfin de metales pesados y sustancias peligrosas mezcladas con fosfoyesos que, depositados a 300 metros de la ciudad, forman unas balsas de 1.200 hectáreas con 120 millones de toneladas. En la agroindustria de las fresas los residuos apenas se ven: de un lado están los fertilizantes que pasan directamente al subsuelo; de otro, los subsidiarios contratados ad hoc en momentos de sobreproducción. Trabajadores que malviven escondidos en los bosques de pinos, esperando a alguien que los contrate. Para el poder son "residuos" necesarios que quieren invisibilizar.

Desde hace años, la Asociación Mesa de la Ría trabaja para que las balsas de residuos desaparezcan de las inmediaciones de Huelva. La Asociación es una organización no controlada por partidos políticos, heredera de otros movimientos ciudadanos de lucha contra las empresas químicas. Sus trabajos como resistentes del no se extienden a muchos campos: denuncias ante los organismos competentes, recogidas de firmas, movilizaciones de sensibilización e información ciudadana. A día de hoy, las consecuencias de la presión ejercida por la ciudadanía se recogen en un auto de la Audiencia Nacional en el que se obliga a Fertiberia al cese definitivo de sus vertidos el 31 de diciembre de 2010 y a que inicie, “de inmediato”, la regeneración ambiental de las 1.200 hectáreas sobre las que descansan los residuos de fosfoyesos. Cabe una pregunta: ¿qué entiende la "minoría" por regenerar?

Cuando los trabajadores inmigrantes deciden visibilizarse como explotados ante el capital lo hacen de muchas formas: con huelgas como la de 2001 que terminó con represalias empresariales (al año siguiente no hubo contratos para los trabajadores marroquíes, entrando así en el mercado laboral mujeres de países del Este de Europa con contratos en origen); o con encierros como el llevado a cabo por 475 trabajadores sin papeles que salieron de los campos freseros para encerrarse en la Universidad Pablo de Olavide durante la Cumbre Europea (Sevilla 2002); o con acampadas en plazas públicas, como la de trabajadores sub Saharaanos en la plaza Ramón Franco de Falos de la Frontera en 2003, un incidente que refleja el carácter residual que el capital da a estos trabajadores. Los doscientos trabajadores acamparon en esta plaza como protesta laboral: acto seguido, el Alcalde de Falos instó a las autoridades competentes para que fueran retirados y metidos en autobuses con destino aAlguciras; una vez allí, el Alcalde de este municipio les compró un billete de regreso a su lugar de origen. La mercancía laboral volvió a los mismos campos de donde salió. Recogiendo los recortes de prensa de este viaje, me acordé de un poema de David Pielfort:

**DOSCIENTOS NEGROS**

Doscientos negros fueron a encerrarse en el ayuntamiento, y lo querían todo: los papeles, un trabajo y un piso también. Pero uno para cada uno, que no sendos para los doscientos.

El Alcalde les ofreció un minuto y una huelga sin hambre, porque el hambre ya lo traían en una fiambrera, y comunicó a los señores doscientos negros que podían acantonarse en el almácén de las fotocopíadoras, donde no les iban a faltar papeles.

Y doscientos señores negros se dieron cuenta que los del ayuntamiento tenían menos papeles que ellos mismos.
El consejero dijo la verdad a los doscientos negros, que si hubieran llegado una mitad antes el ayunamiento estaría regido por doscientos señores negros, y que otra vez sería.

Doscientos negros fueron a encerrarse en una bodega porque querían regularizar su pobreza. Pero la pobreza de cada uno, que no la pobreza de los doscientos.

El gobernador de la bodega les ofreció un minuto, y comunicó a los señores doscientos negros que podían meterse donde quisieran, pero que la bodega cerraría para siempre, que ya no se vendimianía en ningún campo, y que la llave de la bodega se la llevaba el capitán de recuerdo, porque el negocio ya no era negocio.

El capitán dijo la verdad a los doscientos negros, que por qué no iban al consejo regulador del vino a pedir consejo para regular sus cosas. Pero los señores doscientos negros respondieron que ellos no habían entrado en un bar en toda su vida, y que no lo harían ahora.

Doscientos negros fueron a encerrarse al Corte inglés y no los dejaron ni entrar, porque tal economical es otro país, un estado perfecto con su territorio; su moneda, que te la devuelven cuando uno no está contento; y su ejercicio de gurías. Y El Corte inglés devolvió los doscientos negros a la calle.

Doscientos negros fueron a reivindicar sus derechos encerrándose en una universidad privada. El decano les ofreció enseguida varios minutos, y asesoramiento jurídico privado, privado de luces, y así los señores doscientos negros pasaron de trabajar en el campo a pedir en un campus, y a dormir en un campo de fútbol.

El decano les ofreció como dormitorio la biblioteca, pero los señores doscientos negros apuntaron que ya estaban hartos de papeles, y que sí tenían mejor un balón aunque fuera de curtix, y una bomba manual para inflarlo.

Doscientos negros se encerraron en un pubclub, para seguir reivindicando. Y los señores doscientos negros se encontraron allí al alcalde, al gobernador de la bodega, al jefe de seguridad del Corte inglés, y al decano de la universidad privada con la bomba manual. Y el dueño del pubclub, que había sido policía y estaba esperando al señor cura y al señor juez, también en un minuto, invitó a la convención de doscientos negros a salir de su establecimiento.

El dueño del pubclub dijo la verdad, que los doscientos señores negros estaban causando psicóteror laboral a sus primas negras y al pato.

He escrito al señor defensor del pueblo, que me han dicho que es muy buena gente, pero al final es que no me escucha. Y hasta los doscientos negros se han dado cuenta. De todas formas he vuelto a escribir al señor defensor del pueblo, para que se entere que lo de negro era sinónimo de muerto social, de paria, de pobreza. Y le he explicado que da igual que los señores doscientos negros sean doscientos blancos, amarillos o verdes; pero es que están todos metidos en mi casa, y que mi piso tiene treinta metros cuadrados. Y hay un negro empotrado dentro del mueble-bar, que se ríe con muy mala leche, y se multiplica reflejado en los espejos de los entrepaños.

Señor defensor del pueblo: seguro que cuando le coja un huevo con la cadenita de la puerta atabible del mueble-bar, el negro me denuncia.

Hoy, quienes están en contra de estos modos de producir, lo único que pueden hacer es, con rabia, tirarles sus vidas a la cara.

El 16 de febrero de 2010, una comisión del Parlement Europeo vino para ver si situó los problemas generados por los residuos de fosfatos y redactar un informe sobre Fertilitera. Se reunieron en Sevilla (por qué allí y no en el lugar de los hechos?) con los peticionarios, o sea, con quienes habían pedido la intermediación de la Eurocámara (Asociación Mesa de la Ría, Greenpeace, Plataforma Mesa de la Ría y Proyecto InterSuir). Con la otra parte, es decir, la fábrica que impunemente vierte y contamina; los políticos que juegan a representarnos y permiten los desmanes tóxicos; y los sindicatos que sólo ven los puestos de trabajo y callan, se reunieron en Huelva.

Los eurodiputados de la comisión, Pascale Gruny, Victor Bostinru y Margrete Auken, invitaron a los peticionarios a una visita conjunta a las balsas de fosfatos para contrastar la información de quienes denunciaban irregularidad e inseguridad. A las puertas de las balsas, un vigilante de seguridad de Fertilitera impidió que los eurodiputados vieran sobre el terreno lo denunciado, alegando que cumplía órdenes de la dirección. El mismo día por la mañana, los directivos de Fertilitera, acompañaron a los eurodiputados a un tour turístico por esas balsas para mostrarles que todo estaba bien.

En Huelva, todo el mundo sabe que ha sido el único día que alguien ha intentado entrar en las balsas de fosfatos y no lo ha conseguido.

Asistí a las reuniones de los peticionarios en Sevilla y grabé aquella invitación oficial. La conservadora Gruny, presidenta de la comisión, terminó por negar tal invitación. Acompañó, representando a la Asociación Mesa de la Ría, a los eurodiputados en el autobús que no pudo entrar en las balsas. El socialdemócrata Bostinru declaró que los peticionarios manipularon a la comisión, y por eso se impidió su entrada; también grabé este disparate. La eurodiputada verde, Auken, dijo que éramos sus invitados y que la prensa acudía interesándose por el trabajo de la comisión. Mientras el autobús me devolvía a la ciudad, me acordé de un poema de Isabel Pérez Montalbán:

Compromiso
Compañera, desixo de mi culpa:

Tampoco existe a quien rezar en la isla.
No venden libros, páginas diáfanas que eviten la memoria, ni dioses que temer cuando arreca el deseo.

De nuevo has de enseñarme aquella vida que dejé, con paciencia de maestra: un paisaje de lunas tan distintas o el difícil mercado y sus valores. Hay que ordenar mi archivo de costumbres. Saber para qué sirven los pigmentos: el blanco de hospital, el rojo de la sangre y lo prohibido, azul es la cartería de la derecha en elecciones, azul de las carpetas policiales. Y verde es paso libre.

Seré tu alumno más aventajado. Aprendere deprisa y sin llorar todas las cicatrices de los fósiles.

El 10 de julio de 1985 atentan en Nueva Zelanda contra el barco Rainbow Warrior de Greenpeace. Es verano. Las estaciones se repiten idénticas. El poema resume la situación desde los años 80 hasta hoy. La Transición culminó con nuestra entrada en la OTAN y en la Comunidad Económica Europea. Desde aquellos años y hasta hoy, la izquierda ha ido dejando el rojo para abrazar el azul como color de su política económica. Éste es el color que hoy tira del carro de quienes dicen defender la sostenibilidad en nombre del "obrero español". La izquierda en Huelva criminaliza a quienes piden una Ría limpia y salud para todos, en ocasiones los llama "Ayatoías de la Ría". Hoy todo es azul.
Documentary Films and Art as a Human Rights Ticket in China

Zhao Liang in conversation with Hildegund Amanshausen, Alice Creischer, and Andreas Siekmann

Hildegund Amanshausen: You make documentary films, video installations, and photographs. How do you decide in which medium you want to work?

Zhao Liang: I started studying photography at the Luxun Art Academy in Shenyang in the province of Liaoning. After graduating I found a job in television, where I was able to learn a lot about film. But I didn't feel comfortable there, I didn't want to stay there for long. I quit after a year and started studying again at the film academy in Beijing. After graduating I had to find a job, and because that's difficult in the area of film, I had the idea of becoming a freelance artist. There was a "village," a city district in Beijing, where many young artists lived. My friends at the time were musicians, painters, action artists. The atmosphere was good. I actually knew already that I was most interested in film, although there was no concept of video art at the time in China. I did everything: film, video, photography, short films. My first work was a documentary film, Farewell Yuanmingyuan (Farewell Summer Palace). It's about the end of the artists' village in which I had lived. ... I have always been strongly interested in documentary film, because I find it makes sense to record the reality that surrounds me.

Alice Creischer: What we liked very much about the film Farewell Yuanmingyuan is that it contradicts the thesis widespread in Europe that artists are the harbingers of gentrification. One instead sees how the artists are driven out of the quarter to then gentrify it.

Zhao Liang: As far as I recall, contemporary art was actually forbidden in China in the mid-1980s. The young artists who lived together in Yuanmingyuan were visited by foreign collectors and gallerists. For the government, the foreigners posed a threat. They wanted to control the artists. The art scene moved from Yuanmingyuan to Songzhuang, which is also a small village in the eastern part of Beijing, and from there to Factory 798. One can read from this movement a change, in which it appears as if the government is gradually recognizing contemporary art. The government no longer feels threatened by contemporary art since it has been pursuing a politics of so-called cultural industry. This means that they grasp contemporary art as a form of economy.

Andreas Siekmann: I always have the impression that this liberalization could again come to an end at any time.

Zhao Liang: Chinese society is completely determined by the economy at the moment. Artworks can be exhibited as long as they do not refer to a social reality, or they can be exhibited because the government simply does not understand them. Works that in any way deal with social reality may not be shown. There is no progress in this respect; censorship has always remained the same.

Alice Creischer: We have the impression that states such as the United Arab Emirates are "purchasing a ticket" with regard to asserting human rights through contemporary art. We ask ourselves if this is also the case in China.

Zhao Liang: We also have a pavilion in Venice. We have artists who are very active in the international art scene. All that is no different than the Olympics, which have also provided us with a human rights ticket. Through this human rights ticket, China has gained more discourse, more power and standing in the international community, making it even more powerful. The international community believes that human rights are actually already guaranteed in China, something which is not the case. A lot of things taking place in Chinese reality are covered up by the human rights ticket.

Hildegund Amanshausen: You have been working on the film Petitions since 1996; the film was released in 2009, and you had 500 hours of footage.

Zhao Liang: At first, the work was like a diary for me. I visited people every day and filmed. I didn't know when to end this work. There was no clear idea of how to handle the entire thing. But the Olympics in 2008 and everything related to it gave me a good opportunity to reconsider the human rights situation.

When the film was screened at the film festival in Songzhuang, the audience was very excited. Many were not aware that people are living under such conditions in China. I would like to open people's eyes with my work. Everyone should know that what has happened to these people could happen to anyone.

For me, there is the same point of departure as with Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala's First New Chronicle and Book of Good Government, namely, the responsibility of intellectuals in society to want to change things and take a risk with their works. The problems I depict in Petitions simply have to be solved soon. I hope the film has an effect, that many people will watch the film, and that things will then change. I also thought about sending my film to the chairman and the minister. But I know that these people will never watch the film. Perhaps they are aware of the situation of the petitioners. Perhaps they are not able to change the situation because, although they have power, they don't have the power to change the arbitrariness.

The interview was conducted in Salzburg, August 2009. First published in Camera Austria 108, 2009, Graz.
Breve Relación de los agravios que reciben los indios que ay desde cerca del Cuzco hasta Potosí del Padre Antonio de Ayans (1596)

Cap. Primero. En que se trata de la mita de Potosí y de los daños y agravios que los indios reciben en ella.

Cosa notoria es a todo el mundo la gran riqueza de plata que a salido deste Reyno del Pirú la qual principalmente a salido del cerro y minas de Potosí. este cerro esta apartado de lo poblado de los indios que ban a él. Lo mas cerca como quarenta leguas y lo más lejos como ciento y tantas leguas y la disposicion de la tierra es de manera que la aviticion de los indios se estienda a lo largo y no al un lado y otro de Potosí (...)

Lo 4° cuando todo esta gente llega a Potosí luego se toma memoria del numero de todos y sy falta alguno y si de la gente que salió de la Provinci se huyen ciento o doscientos yndios a los valles que ay a la una y otra parte del camino luego enbián de Potosí un Justicia con dias y salarios para que se saque de la mesma Provincia la cantidad que falta y nun ca ban a buscar a los que se ausentaron a los valles y con esto y con bolber que unos de Potosí se an ydo agotando: De manera que aunque se saquen el día de oy todos quantos ay en la Provincia de chuquito ni se podrá cumplir el numero de dos mill y docientos que hasta agora ay ydo cada año y aunque Don Francisco de Toledo señaló docientos a los dos mill para supir las mermas y faltas y ausencias de las demas nunca se a tenido atencion a esto porque aunque no faltan sino veinte yndios luego embian por ellos con dias y salarios, como esto dicho y de lo que sirben estos jueces que así bien de Potosí, de algunos dias acá se de llevar sus salarios y aunque los caciques a cuyo cargo esta el dar los yndios que saltan estén agentes de toda culpa, porque ni la tienen, con todo eso están obligados a la pena que es a pagar al juez sus derechos y para poldelos cobrar, aunque no hagan nada traen bastantes recados de quien les envia y de la manera que llaman estos jueces y el nombre que les ponen no es digno de ponerle aquí.

Lo 5° aviendo ya hecho los yndios asiento en sus parroquias luego los obligan a trabajar en las minas y los que acuden a esta labor por obligacion llaman los indios de cedulas y quando un español o minero la tiene para dies o veinte yndios va a sus casas y con mucho rigor y asperza los saca azotandolos y maltratandolos porque no van tan presto como el qui- siera y si el indio que es capitan dellos no le entera el numero que la cédula reza acontece abofetello y maltratello hasta que la entere. Después que ay llevado el minero sus indios hace que entren en las minas y que saquen el metal y si no es tanto como el desea entonces es el azotallo y acocaellos con tanto rigor que afirmen muchos que los azotes de las galeras no llegan a esto. Y el pobre indio a veces no puede mas por estar la mina muy honda y can- sarse si trae mucha carga y temer se caerá y morirá. Otras, porque el metal está muy duro y el que barre- tea saca muy poco, este rigor y asperesa, temen la los indios mucho porque a acontecido y sucede cada dia matar los españoles indios a puras coces y azotes.

Lo 6° para alivio desta carga la paga que reciben cada semana son dos pesos y medio corrientes que son veinte reales, y para que mejor se entienda el agravio que con tan poca paga reciben sera bien decir lo que ellos gastan moderándolo todo lo posible. Estos años atrás a valido la hanepe del chuño a veinte y beinte y dos y beinte y cuatro pesos corrientes y a mas y la de maiz a muy poco menos hechando la quenta por un mes come un indio por lo menos media hanepe de chuño y si es de maiz mas porque este quando se cuce no crece como el chuño y que tase por esta media hanepe diez pesos que lo ordinario cuyesa mas. Gasta mas cada mes de harina de maiz por lo menos dos pesos. Come cada mes de carne una alpaca y aun es poco que siempre vale cuatro pesos, de pescado y ají y sal gastara siem- pre dos pesos, de leña o estercol y de paja que lla- man hichu para guisar de comer gasta cada semana un peso que esto cuesta mucho allá, al cabo del mes son cuatro pesos y medio. Los mas da los indios comen cada dia dos reales de coca que claro esto que tantos millares de cestos que dellen entran en Potosí cada año que toda la consumen ellos, unos pues comen dos reales della cada dia y algunos real y medio y algunos y aunque pocos, un real, cuéntanse moderándolo lo posible cinco pesos por un mes. Mas se quente por un mes un pesco de chicha, que mas bebe un indio, pero eso no entra en esta quenta ni tampoco la fruta y otras cosas que a veces suelen comprar sin solamente lo forzoso. Todo ello monta beinte y ocho pesos y medio y no se quenta lo que gastará en ellas ni las mantas que rompe en sacar el metal y en vestirse ni la tasa que paga en un año que son treinta pesos corrientes y lo que gasta con su muger y hijos en dalles de comer y ventillos que por lo menos gastaren tanto como el, y sobre todo esto acontece que el minero no le paga por enterlo lo que le deve porque dice que no cumplio ni entera su tarea y en conclusion le sale cada mes al pobre indio solo lo que gasta en su persona, con la tasa y vesti- dos mas de treinta y dos pesos y juntándose esto lo que su mujer y hijos comen y visten pasan de sesenta pesos y la paga que recibe seran quando mucho once pesos y medio. La respuesta que algunos an querido dar a esto de bien poco fundamento se porra mas abajo cuando se diga el remedio que a parecido a los mas experimentados y entendidos podran tener estas cosas y otras que se trataran.

Lo 7° Aunque teman los indios mucho las pérdi- das sobre dichas y el rigor y azotes de los mineros y otros trabajos ya referidos también temen mucho el gran peligro que tienen en sus vidas quando entran en las minas por estar tan hondas y ser las entradas y salidas tan peligrosas y desalagarse muchos terre- nos y piedras que descalbran o matan a los que topan, a otros les ban los pies quando suben las esca- leras que son de cuero, y si al que bulante se le cae algo o el por su desgracia se desliza suele descalbrar y aun matar a los que vienen tras el y asi ay cada semana por lo menos de siete a ocho descalbrados, unos quebradas las piernas, otros los brazos, otros la cabeza, y otros molido todo el cuerpo, y una semana con otra ay uno y dos muertos, fuera de los que quedan en lo hondo de las minas, hechos peda- zos, que no se sabe dellos. Allende desto muchas veces hay 30 y 40 muertos de una vez, unas veces más y otras menos por caerse y derrumbarse un pedazo de una mina y cojelos debajo, algunos suel- len quedarse mediocentros y de las minas mas cercanas los confiesan a voces y es una lastima y compasion grandíssima ver estas cosas y ellos, que las da día dos reales ds coca, que claro esto que tan- tos milares de cestos que serables indios y plu- guiera a Dios que no fueran tantos que convencidos con la falsa apariencia que el demonio les repre- senta y afilijados con la memoria de los trabajos donde pierden tanta de su hacienda y enriquecen a los demás y por el temor que tienen al rigor y aspe- reza de los que assisten a sus tareas que son los mine- ros y considerando el gran peligro de sus vidas y que dejan a pesar suyo su patria y tierra se ahorcan y desesperan y en un pueblo solo de la provincia a avido casi siempre un aorcad cada año y en otros mas, y todo esto se oculta y calla y se deje de dezir a quien podía remediarlo. Muchos indios ay que quando les cabe su mita para ir a Potosí, que por allarse con caudal aqullan a otros y lo que por lo menos dan que algunos ay que pagan mas es lo siguiente: lo primero treinta carneros rasos que valen trescientos pesos y doce ojebas de la tierra que valen cincuenta pesos mas ocho cargas mas dan
dos pares de vestidos nuevos iten dan mas los treinta pesos corrientes que pagan de tasa en Potosí que monta todo mas de quatrocientos y beinte y seis pesos y todo eso dan a uno solo indio y tienen a gran dicha y ventura allar quien quiera ir por esta paga y este tal fuera de lo que a recibido gana mas lo que le dan en Potosí.

Conforme a las Ordenanzas de don Francisco de Toledo en acabando estos dos mil y docientos indios su mita que les dura un año luego que llegan los otros dos mil y docientes que suceden en los mismos trabajos se avian de volver a sus pueblos, pero en esto no se a puesto ningun cuydado ni diligen-
cia y asi sera bien decir que tantos buebien y que tanta ganancia traen de tanta riqueza que llevaron y de lo que en Potosí an ganado.

Averiguadamente se sabe y no por via de sospecha y duda que no buebien quinientos indios y que todo el resto con sus mugeres y hijos que seran cinco mil almas unos se quedan en Potosí y otros se van a los valles que ay a la una y otra parte.


La bula Sublimis Deus de Pablo III

A todos los fieles cristianos que lean estas letras, salud y bendición apostólica. El Dios sublime amó tanto la raza humana, que creó al hombre de tal manera que pudiera participar, no solamente del bien de que gozan otras criaturas, sino que lo dotó de la capacidad de alcanzar al Dios Supremo, invi-
sible e inaccesible, y mirarlo cara a cara; y por cuanto el hombre, de acuerdo con el testimonio de las Sagradas Escrituras, fue creado para gozar de la felicidad de la vida eterna, que nadie puede conse-
guir sino por medio de la fe en Nuestro Señor Jesucristo, es necesario que posea la naturaleza y las capacidades para recibir esa fe; por lo cual, quien-
quiera que esté así dotado, debe ser capaz de recibir la misma fe: no es creible que exista alguien que poseyendo el suficiente entendimiento para dese-
ar la fe, esté despojado de la más necesaria facultad de obtenerla de aquí que Jesucristo que es la Verdad misma, que no puede engañarse ni engañar, cuando envió a los predicadores de la fe a cumplir con el oficio de la predicación dijo: id y enseñad a todas las gen-
tes, a todas diñas, sin excepción, puesto que todas son capaces de ser instruidas en la fe, lo cual viéndolo y envidiándolo el enemigo del género humano que siempre se opone a las buenas obras para que perdez-
can, inventó un método hasta ahora inaudito para impedir que la Palabra de Dios fuera predicada a las gentes a fin de que se salven y excitó a algunos de sus satélites, que deseando saciar su codicia, se atre-
ven a afirmar que los Indios occidentales y meridio-
nales y otras gentes que en estos tiempos han llega-
o a nuestro conocimientos —con el pretexto de que ignoran la fe católica— deben ser dirigidos a
nuestra obediencia como si fueran animales y los reducen a servidumbre urgíéndolos con tantas aflic-
ciones como las que usan con las bestias. Nos pues,
que aunque indignos hacemos en la tierra las veces de Nuestro Señor, y que con todo el esfuerzo procura-
rmas llevar a su redil las ovejas de su grey que nos han sido encomendadas y que están fuera de su rebaño, prestando atención a los mismos indios que como verdaderos hombres que son, no sólo son capaces de recibir la fe cristiana, sino que según se nos ha informado corren con prontitud hacia la misma; y queriendo prover sobre esto con reme-
dios oportunos, haciendo uso de la Autoridad apostólica, determinamos y declaramos por las presen-
tes letras que dichos Indios, y todas las gentes que en el futuro llegasen al conocimiento de los cri-

http://es.wikisource.org/wiki/Sublimis_Deus
Translations into German and English
Chancillo und Evangelisation: De Sublimis Deis.
J. Baungartner, Mission und Liturgie in Mexiko, Bd. 1 (1971), S. 22 (Zeitschrift fuer Missionswissenschaft)
De Sublimus Dei, May 29th, 1537
http://www.papalencyclicals.net/Paul03/s3subli.htm
"You can't just say we don't give a damn about your hyper-capitalism, we will leave the culture industry and only do art and discourse. But precisely this impossibility is what we will do."

David Riff in conversation with Alice Creischer and Andreas Siekmann

Alice Creischer: How do we start talking when the issue is under which conditions and with which double-binds cultural hegemony is generated in specific local situations, and when we cannot exclude ourselves from this process? Let's simply start with an art-historical standard work that you mentioned in our last conversation.

David Riff: I'm supposed to teach art history next year in Moscow at a media and art academy that as yet has no real art history. The students have no idea of what European and worldwide Modernism was. The still prevailing paradigm in Russia consists of a combination of a kitschified nineteenth century and a kind of Surrealism and Social Realism that mingle. The art students are still not aware of many things. In their eyes, different art probably must look like a meaningless and a historical activity. Of course, you immediately ask yourself, how do I explain who Sol LeWitt was? Even if I don't always find him great, I think it is very important to explain this to them. I'm naturally then immediately in the position of a cultural imperialist and have of course armed myself with weapons of international cultural imperialism, with a book by Rosalind Krauss, Yve-Alain Bois, Hal Foster, Benjamin Buchloh, the October group: Art Since 1900. It's a book that asserts a generally applicable art paradigm: Art must be radical in formal terms, socially critical and in some way politically committed, but at the same time, art operates with the consciousness of being totally incapable of changing anything. So I bought the book, and after already opening it I understood that I can't use it. The paradigms of Art Since 1900 cannot be localized here.

Alice Creischer: You said that you found the portrayal of Russian avant-garde in this book false or naive.

David Riff: Oh yes, some descriptions reveal an absolute naiveté in regard to this entire time. The problem is that on the one hand they had to depict the Russian avant-garde as the ne plus ultra of formal radicalism. But at the same time, they had to demonstrate that this avant-garde was not completely articulated, that it was a discontinued experiment which for political reasons could tragically not unfold, and that radicalness only fully blossomed afterwards in 1970s American Conceptualism.

Andreas Siekmann: It shows how tied to interests art historiography is, and at the same time, how universally this art history presents itself. It should actually be called "art history from an American point of view related to the IMF countries." Of course, one must deconstruct this post-avant-garde theory with its strange lines from Russian Constructivism to Minimalism. But the black square is not only a component of a universal, art historical canon, it is also integrated in a local and situational art history, on the basis of which a form of Suprematism had to be defined vis-à-vis abstract art. The moment I speak about it in this way, I can't exclude myself either from a universalizing position.

David Riff: That's precisely where I see the true dilemma. What does criticality mean in the age of its total inclusion? When someone like Giorgio Agamben comes to the Moscow Biennale and delivers a lecture there directed against the art business—what is that? This critique is championed as the normative paradigm: criticality in the heart of the system. It is absolutely pivotal but is ignored as critique and then continues to beat in the heartless world, as a kind of theology.

Alice Creischer: Could you explain that in more detail?

David Riff: The first Moscow Biennale took place in 2005, curated by Nicolas Bourriaud, Hans-Ulrich Obrist, Rosa Martinez, and others. A star team of curators with different profiles and also highly differing approaches, with an art that tended to be discursive: a lot of videos, many works with a vague criticality. But there were no conferences, no workshops, no symposiums, no long lectures by theorists. The group Chto delat* appeared there and criticized this Biennale for actually lacking a discourse, for coming to Moscow like a carnival, with its variety of forms appearing as a mere catalogue of commodities, if they are not contextualized, if you don't have the artists who, on the one hand, specifically deal with the site and, on the other, explain what makes their works discussion. One must add that the Biennale evoked a sort of state of emergency in Moscow's art scene. All of a sudden, I don't know how many international art professionals were to come to Moscow. Any discourse on the situation in Moscow or on art in general would have disturbed this nice public festival, where the main thing was to just drink vodka, walk through a snowstorm, look at this pretty bungled but at the same time apparently experimental exhibition, without thinking too much.

The Biennale 2007 was curated by the same team. But Joseph Backstein, the commissioner of the Moscow Biennale, seemed to respond to our criticism and organized a large conference together with Sven-Olov Wallenstein, which Jacques Rancière, Chantal Mouffe, Bernard Stiegler, etc. attended. Molly Nesbit delivered a lecture on Robert Smithson. And then a bit of Rancière, and the need for discourse was fulfilled. At the same time, the second Moscow Biennale quite evidently had a much closer relation to the new economy. One of the main venues was in a large office center that was not yet completely constructed, where Chinese guest-workers lived in their barracks on the next floor. The shell of the building is now being heated a bit. They cook and sleep on this construction site. To sum it up, the two Biennales were like a development aid measure in two moves. At the first Biennale, an exhibition of noncommittal and heterogeneous art occupied a traditional museum. It was a presentation on a study of faceless capitalism that doesn't bind itself aesthetically, that is experimental, creative, and flexible, a Deleuzian version of facelessness. Where sovereignty is always perceived as ridiculous or with traces of melancholy, where the glorification of power cannot exist but only an obscuring of its own facts employed by the power itself. It was the presentation of the ultimate democratic gesture. The second Biennale in turn was truly hegemonic. Instead of presenting the critical discourse as part of some kind of experimentality, it acted as an inherently critical Biennale. It co-opted the critical discourse. It completed the second thrust of the development measure and thus called into question what people who are genuinely critical are doing in the first place.

The invited philosophers were treated as extremely expensive objects. A menagerie was set up. At any rate, Agamben didn't want to be part of this circus. He called off at the last moment. But he then came on the evening prior to the Biennale opening and stayed in a not yet fully renovated wing of one of the huge new luxury shopping centers, where he delivered a speech.

The local discursive public reacted so differently, as if it had nothing to do with them—a hegemony that doesn't affect the local discourse. And you have to ask yourself what kind of criticality it
is that it is affected by nothing and is only staged, and what it actually means for a contemporary art business.

Alice Creischer: You mean that it's a circus that doesn't affect the local discourse and the social situation at all?

David Riff: You have to imagine that the Soviet Union was a country that had its own modernism, its avant-garde movements, its own history of the twentieth century. There were many art institutions in the Soviet Union, many alternative art institutions as well, there was a hermetic and small yet very, very strong underground. This underground had its own space, but a white cube was never a part of this space. Never was a meta-artistic, curatorial treatment of abandoned sites part of this spatial institution. It was always something different. The white cube only arrived in Russia after perestroika, and as increasingly used in the early 2000s, for example, when there was suddenly a gallery business—similar to an artificial tooth, an implantation in an urban space that has its own institutional history.

Interestingly, the white cubes, or art spaces, that have been set up until now are ephemeral, without the claim to eternity of the white cubes in New York's art scene—that was the entire trick, to maintain the appearance of eternity despite all ephemerality of the gallery business. Here, it is still visible how ephemeral, how circus-like the white cube implants itself, as if the entire urban body were fighting against it.

Alice Creischer: Was there even an effect triggered in Moscow by this Bienalle?

David Riff: The Biennales had an unbelievable impact in Moscow. I assume it's exactly the same at other places of the semi-periphery. Already in advance there was this whole disconnectedness, this hysterical self-runner in the hope of finding connections to international careers in the Bienalle, this unethical globalization which we have all been discussing for years. I think that this Bienalle functioned as a kind of neocolonial accumulator, as a hegemonic compact measure that changes or pushes the entire local system of contemporary art. In Moscow, prior to the Biennales there were no real institutions, no successful galleries; there was no audience for art except for a few very committed art lovers. Art was not fashionable, it was absolutely marginal. Especially in the 1990s, it was generally the case that contemporary art always appeared to be something very ephemeral, materially poor, performative, transgressive. Although a process of atomization had begun in the late 1980s, the art scene itself still possessed inner cohesion. In the past years, this cohesion has dissolved. Suddenly there was huge public interest. There was an incredible transformation in people's mentality. And that has to do directly with the need to represent. During such gentrifications, betrayals occur. Some people like to regard themselves as dialecticians in such situations. That's how they explain themselves and why they take such twists and turns.

Alice Creischer: You said that a function or a demand is associated with the fact that art is suddenly needed. Why?

David Riff: In vulgar sociological terms, the explanation is simple. Starting in 2000/2001, the first phase of privatization was almost over in Russia. There were numerous renationalizations of the resource industry and social normalization set in. This normalization possessed a central problem. The elite that had arisen in this original accumulation has an incredible need to legitimize itself. Many of these people are criminal: corrupt bureaucrats, members of the Comsomol who have massively stolen from the state—in Russia one would still say "from the people." They also had a corresponding lifestyle, meaning that they had big Jeep Cherokees, women with fat silicon breasts, showy Armani suits. This "lumpenbourgeoisie" that was suddenly unbelievably rich, this typical cliché of the new Russian, needed the appearance of legality. They had to tailor an appearance, and contemporary art is one of the best ways to show that one is a cultivated person who travels a lot, who as a patron of art has an enhanced international appearance. And maybe this interest in art is now a sign that this class of accumulation profiteers has formed to become an elite once and for all. In that case, the art boom in Moscow would not only be a trophy of the nouveau riche, but also a symptom for a class taking on a form.

Andreas Siekmann: But the state also plays a role in organizing the Biennales, as a kind of compensation of the national competition state.

David Riff: That's an interesting question. As you may perhaps know, there are two wings of political power in Russia that actually emerged from a compromise between two strongly opposing camps. The one wing is neoliberal, oriented to the West and in part social democratic as well. The other wing is the security apparatus, so to speak, that no longer advocates a Soviet but a truly reactionary cultural conservatism. There are figures like Vladimir Surkov, the deputy chief of staff of the president, the main ideologue of so-called sovereign democracy, a neoliberal with fascist traits now writing art reviews. A very eclectic type, the best example of the state's connection to artistic strategies. So for Surkov, art is a good way of talking to the people. But until now that's still a project, a potentiality with which he has fallen in love out of the feeling of potentiality, the openness of the field, and which he regards as an accumulator of his own political activity. You can recognize this by the fact that the projects done by Surkov operate with an almost Situationist repertory of activating forms. Are you familiar with the Nashi movement, whose actual architect Surkov is? Nashi means "youth," it is the Putin youth that is meanwhile dissolving and forming the technological hotbed for Russian fascism. For example, there's a poster with a woman on whose bikini pants "Vladimir, I'm with you" is written. She's standing there—so sexy, so allegedly subversive. Nashi agitates with a highly contemporary language, with pop. The similarities to certain strategies of a political art practice are quite evident in structural terms. It is clear that such a political movement with these modes of agitation in turn makes it impossible for artists to continue to refer to pop, Situationism, and traditional forms of artistic activism. Even if they are not aware of them...

Andreas Siekmann: I would like to ask you about this new art quarter or this art factory in Moscow.

David Riff: This art quarter is not a real gallery quarter. There are no studios there any more either. The process was much too fast. Production has been outsourced.

The art factory has meanwhile been interiorized. Every artist is the master of his own factories, which he built up quickly and with which he operates, and he then uses this strange site that looks like a factory but isn't one, to show his art.

Vinzavod is actually only an advertising sign and it became the most democratic exhibition venue in Moscow, attracting a young audience. Vinzavod means "wine factory" and way back it was the residence of Moscow's governor. It is a large area that was converted to a winery after the revolution. Around 2004, 2005, the grounds were purchased by an entrepreneur and his wife who own a fleet of tourist boats. They hired a go-getter of the Moscow scene, Nikolay Palazhenko, as an advisor. He rented studios to artists, who were to give him artworks instead of money for the rent while Vinzavod was being renovated and made reputable. Last spring we had the Long Night of the Galleries in Moscow. I think it was the first time that it was so hip and big. It was right after the presidential elections when everyone thought that things would now loosen up. Crowds of people hit the streets and went to various museums and especially to Vinzavod; 30,000 teenagers were standing around
with their beer bottles and wanted something from art. From metaphysical painting to Pop and Conceptual Art. They wanted to touch everything and be a part of it. It remains a mystery to me what they wanted exactly and who they were. Maybe it's the new petite bourgeoisie of a cognitive proletariat. I don't like these words. But they are the potential, immaterial, white-collar workers who go there as students to have aesthetic experiences. This is a romantic transfiguration of this audience, because it's so naive, because they are not burdened with the nightmare of history, as Karl Marx would say. At the same time their consciousness is totally submerged in this high-gloss culture that has spread incredibly. We haven't mentioned at all—a big mistake—how strongly this glamour culture, lifestyle magazines, Rolex watches, and advertisements have changed the city and one's subjectivization in it. In Russia the same process is underway that had become universalized in America in the 1980s. If you buy an expensive mobile phone you already belong to the bourgeoisie. That's what people are told. The main weapon of this process of subjectivizing oneself massively and exclusively via commodities is visual culture.

Andreas Siekmann: There is a seamless transition from visual culture to art, the Sensation exhibitions, in which the issue is an in-your-face art experience that you can consume without separating yourself. There are rumors of a Tate Modern in Moscow?

David Riff: Well, not exactly. The story is as follows. There have always been members of the Russian elite interested in art. They collected antiques or Socialist Realist paintings. Suddenly the word was that contemporary art is in, and there was a sign. Not from God but from capital. The yacht of Abramovic was suddenly in front of the Giardini in Venice. We drove by there on a Vaporetto and Dmitry Gutov said, "Look, that's Abramovic's yacht. I'm certain, because he has the largest yacht in the world."

Alice Creischer: Abramovic is...

David Riff: Roman Abramovic is the former governor of Chukokta. He earned an incredible amount of money through privatization, and then washed his hands of it by selling his business back to the state. He's the owner of Chelsea (soccer club), lives in London and on his yacht. And he has a girlfriend called Daria (Dasha) Zhukova. This Dasha grew up in America and is the daughter of an oligarch and businessman owning millions. She has the noble face of a true bourgeoisie and not that of a thief. Dasha Zhukova is interested in art, sure. So Dasha and Abramovic walked around Venice, totally inconspicuously, and the Russians were all excited because for the first time a real oligarch was there who was interested in art. They were actually only there for a day. Then nothing more was heard until rumors came up that a former bus garage was to become an art venue. The building was constructed in the 1920s by the avant-garde architect Konstantin Melnikov.

Dasha Zhukova had rented these huge grounds from the Jewish community. The way she puts it, she bought it, while the Jewish Community denies this. For there were always hopes of converting it into the largest Jewish museum in the world. But Dasha claims that a new Tate Modern is emerging. In fact the large Ilya and Emilia Kabakov retrospective was shown there. And now works from the Pinault Collection are to follow. Of course, Abramovic also purchased Lucian Freud and Francis Bacon. So, in the long run the Francis Bacon show now traveling from Tate Britain to Madrid will also come. The main advisors of the Garage are Mollie Dent-Brocklehurst, who used to be with the Gagosian Gallery in London, and Nicholas Serota, the director of the Tate.

The international press was strongly present at the Kabakov exhibition, checking out what is possible and what is not, as well as with whom one must make arrangements there. But the question again is whether these are production conditions which we are familiar with? Is that the Tate Modern? Is it possible to do something like that there or is it an ad hoc Tate Modern that is only simulated and can immediately disappear again.

Alice Creischer: It is this unrelated space in which the context of force regarding the way one works and for whom one works permanently disappears or is buffered. In this way, political experience also disappears. This applies to both the people looking at art and those producing it.

We have gained an impression of the accumulation and of the face, the art implantation, that it desires and enables. But there is this context of force, this context of pauperization in regard to this accumulation and its face. So what does this other side of accumulation look like?

David Riff: Moscow differs greatly from the rest of the country, where conditions haven't changed since the collapse of the entire Soviet social system. Very low income in state-run companies, and also the companies that have been privatized, unbelievable inflation, an impoverishment of smaller towns driving people to the cities, where they then work in the low-wage industry. There's a huge service class in Moscow working for the hyper-bourgeoisie. Just to make this comprehensible, there are more and more people in Moscow with cars, who renovate their dachas, who live in this new structure: consumer paradise, all-inclusive tours, comfort, similar to the economic miracle in Germany. Art is interesting not only for the hyper-bourgeoisie but also for this consumer-class now evolving in the Moscow republic. But of course only in Moscow. At the same time, all the people in the environs are working in Moscow, commuting two or three hours every day. One also sees more and more migrant workers from central Asia, construction workers in orange vests.

A saleswoman in Moscow earns $1,000. That's pretty good in a country where the average income used to be $500. Many rent out their old flats expensively. There's a whole class of these pensioners, that's how the intelligentsia earn their money, for example. Without lifting a finger, one has enough free time to work. That leads to conflicts with those coming from the outside, who are not as privileged. These conflicts are naturally becoming more intense at a moment of crisis. Many people have already lost their jobs and are afraid of becoming impoverished.

Alice Creischer: How can one articulate oneself in such a reality?

David Riff: You can't smooth out these contradictions with emotionalism. You can't just say, we don't give a damn about your hyper-capitalism, we hate you, we will leave the culture industry, we will sit in our autonomous area and only do art and discourse. That's impossible. But precisely this imposibility is what we will do. Right now reality is changing again, work on the construction sites is stalling, stores are empty and unrest is imminent. In earlier times it was easier to articulate yourself. The 1990s were a time in which something flared up in all its potentiality again before disappearing. It was like a piece of property on which demolition had already taken place, it was still empty, a lot of open space. I think that the artists dealt very well with this situation, doing things that could create dissent. Now that has become extremely difficult. Not only because we are accomplices, but also because one must perhaps wait a bit until the economic miracle for the few—this being full and puking—is over. Because precisely at this moment all the glamour is flaring up, all the rubbish of the past fifteen years. I sometimes wish that artists with a credible working method would come to Moscow, do projects there and show people how this kind of reality can be dealt with. But they don't even know this reality and it would be nothing but an absolutely colonial critique.

The interview was conducted in Berlin, September 29, 2008.
Universalism in Art and the Art of Universalism

Thoughts on the "globalization" of the art system, taking the United Arab Emirates as an example
Alice Creischer and Andreas Siekmann

In neighboring Abu Dhabi, museum models for Saadiyat Island, planned for 2012, are on view at the Emirates Palace, a luxury hotel that also functions as an exhibition hall. The island will feature a branch of the Guggenheim (designed by Frank Gehry), the Louvre (Jean Nouvel), a theater and performing arts center (by Zaha Hadid), a maritime museum (Tadao Ando), and a cultural heritage museum. They will all be grouped in a park with nineteen biennial pavilions designed by younger architects. The entire project is part of a $17.5 billion transformation plan with which the Emirate intends to develop a large-scale economy based on tourism, service, and finance. In an interview with the magazine Art, Thomas Krens, the Guggenheim director responsible these days solely for Abu Dhabi, says that a museum of these dimensions (30,000 m²) in this location redefines what a museum can be today: "It's about long-term survival and lasting relevance. If we're successful here, we can become a platform for global culture." With that statement, he falls into line with often formulated fears in the media of losing the connection with the global cultures of superlatives such as in China or the Gulf States and thus forfeiting historic importance.

What does this culture of superlatives look like? The first room in the exhibition shows a large portrait of patron Sheikh Hamed bin Zayed al-Nahyan with a falcon on his hand in front of the blueprint for a national museum. The models in the other rooms are accompanied by a master plan plotted on the walls, courtesy of consulting group Booz Allen Hamilton: "A major feature of the Saadiyat Island proposal is the creation of a world-class culture district that anchors the island's tourism activity by providing compelling cultural experiences for tourists and residents." The master plan lists the criteria taken into account in the planning: international benchmarking, studies on consumer behavior, demographic profiles, etc. The prince with the falcon and the master plan are not gestures critical of the institution; they are an affirmation of what has long been clear, long before the last wave of globalization spread its exploitative diversification networks across the planet: that the authoritarian system is the ideal political partner in a so-called free market. At the Emirates Palace, the strong and invisible hand celebrates itself, the rigidity of economism and of a regime that can push through such superlative projects unhindered by democratic procedures of consensus...

Dishwasher eschatology

The compendium Al Manakh that we mention several times here was created as part of the International Design Forum in May 2007 in Dubai. In the foreword, Rem Koolhaas counters the critics of Dubai's exploitation structures: "It is particularly cruel that the harshest criticism comes from old cultures that still control the apparatus of judgment, while the epicenters of production have shifted to the other end(s) of the globe." Criticism of a Western claim to supreme global moral judgment has become evident at the latest since the last US interventions and the Western world's numerous entanglements in deportation, torture camps, or arms deals. It often leads people to understand the appeal for a universal validity of human rights as hegemonic interference in the integrity of another culture, however. But what if "the other culture" turns out to be a stage in one's own exploitation structures, in an economic system that outsources its business to places where adhering to human rights does not pose a hindrance to maximizing profits? What kind of a bird's eye view must one have to deconstruct one's own feeling of what is just a private feeling, which after all can't simply be turned on and off, but is instead an inner certainty? Al Manakh practices a universalism that makes people immune to the false subjectivity of indignation. It is the universalism of the equality of categories. The statistics on "How Much is a Billion? Look at Relative Value" manage to illustrate on the same level the earnings of a construction worker, the entire sum of expenditure for construction in the Gulf, and the costs of the Iraq War. They should have included a telescope (or a lorgnette) and an electron microscope to adequately portray the dimensions of the difference. This equality of categories says, "We all participate in money circulation to the same extent." This is undoubtedly true, but the truth is as vulgar as, several pages later, the list of safety risks involved in flying Africa, and the solutions on offer that range from "The eradication of hunger and malnutrition" to "Learning how to swim" and the construction of security fences by the company Frontex. It is as cynical as the series of photographs "Workers' City," which portrays a labor camp in Dubai where stacks of bowls in a courtyard become a collective kitchen for lack of other cooking sites, where a vegetable stand turns into a miniature supermarket with "at least twenty different kinds of fresh produce," where the loneliness of the men who only see their families once every two years is reformed into a "Maleness ... counterbalanced with neatness, upkeep, cooking, sewing, soap, music, and friendship." In the world of universal equality, there is only a gradual difference between the vegetable stand and the exclusive buffet. Grading what in substance is equal is the quintessence of middle-class emancipation and its dishwashing eschatology. It only tolerates the "and" and the "is" as a true link between things, but no dialectic. It conjures the entities "life," "cooking," and "friendship" between the labor camp and the Palm Jumeirah, ignoring the twist—the rope's noose—in between that turns one into misery and the other into a poor copy of soap opera happiness. It forgets about power relationships, although it is a part of them. It has to live with the accusation of a conflict of interest.

Critical blind spots

In "Desperately Seeking Paradise," a side show in a simulated harbor basin at the Art Fair's Pakistani pavilion, three of the works shown directly alluded to migrant workers. Huma Mulji showed a camel stuffed into a suitcase as a symbol for the Pakistanis' yearning to travel, Sophie Ernst exhibited interviews with Pakistani workers about their dreams of America, and a community project displayed the results of a photo workshop with workers: flowers, parks, and fruit. The last biennial in the emirate Sharja under the motto Art Ecology and the Politics of Change used artist Tea Måkipää's work as an agenda for a ten-point program ranging from "Do not fly" and "Avoid any products with plastic packages" to "Do not produce more than 2 children." The biennial is hosted by a regime that leaves the world's largest ecological footprint. The last example shows that the categorical imperative—the possibility of one's own actions becoming general law—minimizes power relations to personal ethics. The media has meanwhile discovered the "problem" of the economic miracle in Dubai and often describes the workers' situation by focusing on one individual fate in order to emphatically fixate the attention of the readers, who identify wholly with the system perpetuating the situation, on that lone individual.

One last example: In the film A Bird's Nest for the People, Christoph Schaub and Michael Schindhelm,
director of the Dubai Culture and Arts Authority since March 2008, interview the architects Jacques Herzog and Pierre de Meuron about the construction of the stadium in Peking. They discuss the extent to which it is justifiable to "build in an undemocratic country like China that ignores human rights. ... The working conditions on the construction site are not a topic at all." It is easy to interpret this blind spot as mere self-censure in the name of the client. It seems to be a task of idealistic art to ease the insoluble conflict between being involved in an outrageous societal reality and a universal participation in Being. This is exactly the point where it puts a big blind spot in the eye by creating generally accepted images: a camel in a suitcase, the dream of America, a personal code of conduct, the beautiful drama of an exemplary fate. This universality preemptively clogs the channels of criticism with meaning, with a prestabilizing harmony in order to prevent the divisiveness that criticism produces, to hinder our own aloneness and its irreconcilability. This universality opposes the universality that demands rights, because it cannot allow negativity in a world that is everything, which in fact it is.

In an article about the history of slavery, Alain Gresh recounts the voyage of the ship Comte d’Ivrauille in 1766, where Voltaire’s drama Alzire or the Americans was performed on deck. The fate of the Inca princess Alzire touches the audience as a moral call to free the indigenous people from Spanish bondage, while in the hold the African slaves lie penned up.10 This reminds us of the story about Théodore Géricault’s Raft of the Medusa and Eugène Delacroix’s Freedom on the Barricades, which Peter Weiss believes demonstrate the difference between operatic and idealist aesthetics. It likewise recalls an entire tradition of Marxist theory of art and literature that transferred the criticism of the categories of bourgeois thought to the art production that was en vogue at the time and whose avant-garde visions would look so foolish from the hindsight of history.

But we are confronted with societal contexts that are in need of careful description and analysis in order to understand them at all intellectually and emotionally. We can remember that in these embarrassing theories lie analytical tools that remain applicable and necessary. Marxist criticism of fetishism—the objectification of social relations—has rightly been applied to the history of leftist-theory and its political epistemology. We have the impression that this process of turning their own discussions into a fetish is not a specific mark of an explicitly leftist-theory debate, but that this hardening into clusters of argumentation is also happening at the moment in debates about the self-image of "globalized art." Here, the contradictions seem to be as cemented as the moves in chess games, repeated again and again: the embarrassment of picking out as a central theme an injustice that occurs in relationships one is a part of; the phobia concerning the problem of substitution that only allows standing up for one's own interests and condemns criticism of the regional identity; respect for the "other culture" that is in fact a national mask of confidence in the ubiquitous structures of exploitation; the decline of formerly discussed artistic methods to become a mere vehicle for unreflected political information or an intolerable nostalgic transfiguration of Modernism. "Globalized Art," the art centers in Beijing, Shanghai, or Moscow, the museum districts, fairs and biennials in Berlin or Miami, take place in nations that are part of a new totalitarian capitalism. We've all been invited to these biennials; we present our magazines there or exhibit our work. Sometimes, we even play the role of major or minor functionaries. We should begin to think about this participation from a different perspective, taking into consideration all the consequences for the political and artistic self-images involved.

"Universalism in Art and the Art of Universalism. Thoughts on the 'globalization' of the art system, taking the United Arab Emirates as example." Springerin, Vienna, Summer 2008,

---

2 Booz Allen Hamilton, "Gulf Survey/How Much is a Billion?" Volume/Al Manakh, Amsterdam 2007, p. 78.
7 Tea Márikás, 10 Commandments for the 21st Century, ibid., p. 477.
8 For example, Jörg Burger, " Tod eines Sklaven," Die Zeit, April 17, 2008.

---

Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí

Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela

Teníanle hechos dos arcos triunfales (que se fabricaron con indecible presteza aunque grandísima fatiga por la brevedad del tiempo, que no lo dio más de a suplir la falta de pincel para fijar los jaspes y mármoles, el oro y colores, con vestirlos de preciosas telas, costosos bordados y ricas sedas) [...]

Sobre los capiteles, que eran de cedro dorado y espejos, se levantaban los arcos curiosamente adornados de sedas de colores varió y follajería de ricas telas y cintas, y las cornisas (guarnecidas con rosas muy vistosos y espejos con marcos dorados) sobre las cuales [...] se veían varias imágenes [...] en significación de las virtudes morales de su excelencia ilustrísima [...].

La noble infantería se hallaba en esta sazón muy en orden en la plaza del Regocijo, por la experimentada milicia de su sargento mayor el general Britas, y todos con costosos vestidos de telas riquísimas, tisados y brocados de varios colores, con guarniciones vistosas de franjas, puntas y encajes de oro y plata, joyas en los pechos y sombreros, cadenas de oro, sortijas, broches y plumas que de todas partes brillaba [...].

El día siguiente, [...] don Martín de Echavarria, del hábito de Santiago y azogueiro rico, sirvió a su excelencia ilustrísima con 1.000 marcos de plata en piña y una joya de oro y diamantes apreciada en 4,000 pesos, y todo el gremio de señores azogueiros le previno otros 1.500 marcos para servirle con ellos aquella misma noche [...]. En todo este día le visitaron los curas, los prelados, el gremio ilustre de azogueiros, los tribunales, oficiales reales y otros ayuntamientos como el de acuñadores de la moneda y los demás, y a todos recibió con mucha benignidad su excelencia ilustrísima.

Esta misma noche le hicieron los famosos minadores del Cerro una lucida y costosísima máscara [...].

Venía por delante don Andrés de la Torre Montellano, alcalde mayor de minas, con riquísimas gala de tela muy costosa, [...] y don Domingo Serrano, excelente minador, natural de esta Villa, que de tanta utilidad ha sido en el Cerro su saber en aquel ministerio y a quien aquel mismo día restituyó su excelencia (por convenir así) la vara de veedor del
rículo Cerro que se la tenían quitada, y don Miguel de Umarán su compañero. Luego se les seguía la Fama en un arrogante caballo con paramentos y cimeras muy vistosos, preciosa gafa y clarín en la mano. Tras de ella se seguían los 12 famosos héroes que celebraba la Fama, entrando en este número el césped Carlos y, don Juan de Austria y el Cid [...]. Debajo del doblete estaba un hermoso niño que hacía a su excelencia con vestiduras preciosas, adornado en su sillón con bastón en las manos. En el carro a sus pies estaba el Cerro de Potosí con sus propios colores, y en el resto seis niños vestidos de ángeles y otro en figura de niña indígena, o princesa de los ingas, con ricas vestiduras a su uso.

[...] Se detuvo aquel hermoso carro y entonó la música con gran destreza y melodía, y en particular el niño que hacía papel de princesa indiana abrazó a su excelencia ilustrísima, y luego representaron dos niños que hacían a Europa y América [...].

A la mitad de aquella loa cantada salió de la boca de una mina de aquel Cerro, dispuesta al propósito, un indiecillo vestido a la propiedad de cuando labran las minas, con su costal de metal (que llaman cutuma) a las espaldas, su montera y vela pendiente de ella (como lo hacen de las minas a la cancha a vaciar el metal) y así lo hizo derramando del costal oro y plata batida, y se tornó a entrar con linda gracia [...]. Y luego se siguieron otros pepeles, [...] y por último iba en unas andas uno de los ingas o rey del Perú con sus ccoyas (que es lo mismo que princesas o reinas) debajo de dosel, con gran majestad y riqueza de apropriados trajes.

Alegre y admirado su excelencia ilustrísima dijo haber visto en la corte de Madrid varias máscaras de caballeros, pero que ninguna de semejante riqueza, curiosidad y propiedad de papeles, y del mismo modo la engrandecieron y alabaron todos de la Europa, y a la verdad fue cosa admirable que tan en breve se dispusiese en tiempo tan calamitoso, pues el más corto de aquellos minadores gastó muchos pesos y los de más posible mucho más. Todo fue como siempre lo es, propio influjo de los astros preponderantes en esta Villa que no siente su desacceso tanto como el no poder ejecutar mayor grandesa en todo. Cuando para gusto público hay daño público, todos y en todas partes consideran mayor el daño que se padece que el bien que se espera, tienen presente el ahogo y el bien contingente, y así se experimentó en esta Villa, que aunque se pudiera esperar de todas estas demostraciones algún bien, lo mejor que hizo fue hacernos el ánimo a esperar lo peor y no por eso dejó de manifestar en todo su liberalidad.

Volvióse su excelencia ilustrísima a su posada a las 9 de la noche, y halló en ella el presente del gremio de señores azogueros, de 1.500 marcos en 30 piezas de plata de a 50 marcos, sin otros más que en particular le presentaron, que harto fue para admirar el presente cuando casi no tenían muchos qué comer. [...]

Las cuales [fiestas] desde el recibimiento tuvieron de costo 100.000 pesos en galas, liébres, arcos, banquetes y demás gastos, y de presentes (en marcos de plata y joyas) llegaron a 50,000, que sería el monto que regularon a su excelencia ilustrísima, y así fueron por todos 150,000 pesos, aunque otros hacen la cuenta de más cantidad. [...]

Hallábase todavía en esta Villa el reverendo padre maestro fray Francisco Romero, nuestro misionero apostólico [...], y uno de aquellos días entró su paternidad a suplicar a su excelencia ilustrísima con los indios recién lavados en las aguas del santo bautismo le diése cualquier limosna para ayuda de la exaltación de la fe en aquellas sus provincias donde se comenzaba a plantarla, y refiriese el número de las almas convertidas y demás circunstancias y que no tenían iglesia para celebrar los divinos oficios. Pero ¿quién diría que petición tan santa habría de merecer desabridas respuestas, y nuevas instancias un "No se puede?"


The Universal Museum: A Valid Model for the Twenty-first Century?
Tom Flynn

Introduction
In October 2002, the International Group of Organizers of Large-scale Exhibitions, also known as the Bizot Group—a forum comprising directors of forty of the world’s major museums and galleries—gathered in Munich for their annual informal discussion.1 The meeting was convened specifically to address the problem of how to confront the growing number of requests for repatriation of objects from "universal" museums and in particular the increasingly political nature of the international movement to reunite the Parthenon Marbles.

The outcome of the Group’s deliberations was the publication of a united "declaration" promoting the “importance and value of universal museums.” Significantly, although the British Museum was not among the original signatories, the declaration was circulated through the British Museum press office and the British Museum has subsequently become its most vocal proponent.2 Despite the declaration’s claims to principles of "universality" and its insistence that “museums serve not just the citizens of one nation but the people of every nation,” not a single museum outside North America or mainland Europe was included as a signatory.

The declaration condemned the illegal traffic in archaeological, artistic, and ethnic objects, but insisted that, "objects acquired in earlier times must be viewed in the light of different sensitivities and values, reflective of that earlier era." The declaration went on to outline what its signatories perceived to be "the threat to the integrity of universal collections posed by demands for the restitution of objects to their countries of origin."

Since the declaration was issued, the question of the “universal museum” has been subjected to renewed scrutiny, widely debated at industry conferences and in the media.3 As far as can be established, however, it is yet to receive a formal critical response from the International Council of Museums (ICOM), from the UK Museums Association (MA), or from any other national or international museum body.4

One notable aspect of the recent declaration was its implicit assumption that an idea born during the
eighteenth-century European Enlightenment can be reconciled with more recent scholarship in fields such as postmodernism, postcolonial theory, and the so-called "new museology" in order to function as a viable philosophical framework for the world's museums in the future.

The universal museum as it is currently being revived is fundamentally a broader *retrodataire* approach to museum management that is bent on building a false dichotomy between the custodianship of beautiful objects and a perceived impulse to disperse and destroy collections through repatriation.

### The universal museum revived

Throughout 2003, in a series of well-orchestrated anniversary celebrations, exhibitions, and media events, the British Museum sought subtly to reinforce its original eighteenth-century Enlightenment identity as a "universal museum"—a panoptic chamber within which the finest achievements of world civilization might be surveyed as a grand historical narrative. Neil MacGregor's centralizing vision involved gathering those parts of the museum's collections then dispersed around London in order to reunite them with the main collection, much of which, as *The New York Times* helpfully pointed out, had been collected during the glory days of the British Empire. "We'll be back to 1753," said MacGregor, "with the whole world under one roof."  

The British Museum's recent energetic revival of its Enlightenment origins as a universal museum can be interpreted not only as an elaborate act of birthday self-congratulation, but also as a coordinated attempt to counter increasingly frequent claims for the repatriation of key objects in its collections.

The Enlightenment carries a particularly persuasive cultural charge, for it is to this historical reference point that we ascribe the source of our modern day ideals of free citizenship, social justice, and rational inquiry, all perceived as central to the museum's purpose as a didactic institution. During the nineteenth century, those same imperatives came to underpin the scientific and industrial aspirations of the European colonial powers, who believed themselves to be embarking upon a "civilizing mission."  

It was at this point that European and North American museums availed themselves of the acquisitive apparatus of imperial expansion and assumed their modern identity as the gatherers and custodians of the world's material culture. History has recorded that the means by which many of those collections were accumulated were often less than honorable and certainly not in harmony with the ideas of the rights of man espoused by Voltaire and other Enlightenment philosophers.  

Many of the repatriation requests made to the British Museum and other universal institutions in recent years center upon the circumstances of acquisition and what are perceived by source communities to be a series of historical injustices concomitant with nineteenth-century imperialism and colonial conquest.

Modern museology has on the one hand responded to postcolonialist thought by objectifying, and distancing itself from, the specific power relations that brought many of the great museum collections into being, seeing those relations as a historical accident and an inappropriate model for future development. Meanwhile, many museums continue to utilize and communicate their collections in such a way that those power relations are subtly reinforced, thereby effectively justifying the historical record.

The British Museum is not alone in this respect, for in recent years a number of European and North American museums have faced similar demands for the restitution of cultural objects acquired during the height of the colonial period. At the top of the steadily expanding list are many of the "star" attractions of national museums—the Parthenon Marbles, the Rosetta Stone, the Ethiopian Magdala treasures, and the Benin brasses at the British Museum; two Parthenon fragments and the statue of Ramses II in the Louvre, and the Obelisk of Luxor in the *Place de la Concorde* in Paris; the Pergamon Altar and the bust of Queen Nefertiti in Berlin; the statues of Hatshepsut in the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York, to name but a few—all of which are attracting growing media attention as the issues surrounding cultural property intensify.

However, it is not only the major visitor attractions that are fuelling the debate, for the repatriation request list contains literally thousands of more minor objects, many languishing in storage, that have become the subject of no less passionate claims by smaller nations and ethnic groups for restitution to their places of origin.

As a number of writers have shown, the emergence of the universal museum was coterminous with the establishment of the modern nation-state. More recently, Donald Preziosi has also outlined correspondences between the universal museum as it evolved towards the end of the eighteenth century and the emergence of international exhibitions in the mid-nineteenth century; tracing the parallel evolution of art history and museology through that period.  

The determination of today's museum directors to once again have "the whole world under one roof" could almost be taken as an ironic comment on Enlightenment aspirations were it not grounded in a steadfast belief in universality as somehow an achievable museological aim. As Tony Bennett has pointed out, the ambition towards "a specular domination over a totality" was a notable characteristic of international exhibitions during the nineteenth century. In their heyday, these exhibitions "sought to make the whole world, past and present, metonymically available in the assemblages of objects and peoples they brought together and, from their towers, to lay it before a controlling vision."  

Those processes of control—through classification, display, the generation and manipulation of narratives—have been central to what has been described as the "exhibitionary complex" of museums since the early nineteenth century, and they survive today.  

Recently, the British Museum has once again embarked upon a programmatic scheme to sever the Parthenon Marbles, both historically and conceptually, from their origins. Their new identity, the "other story" now assigned to them, juxtaposes the Marbles with other objects in the British Museum's collections in order to relocate them within an arbitrary stylistic progression, the significance of which is entirely predicated upon their remaining in Bloomsbury, as though they would cease to be comprehensible if located anywhere else.

### Conclusion

We have seen, and continue to see, evidence of new visionary thinking among more progressive museum professionals. Many of them do nurture a vision of a more enlightened museology, grounded not in further encyclopedic accumulation, ownership, and confrontation, but in collaboration, cooperation, and exchange. This may require replacing the outdated model of the temple with that of the forum in order to account for the museum's changing social function in a rapidly changing world. However, that need not represent a dissolution of its primary responsibility to engage and educate. Instead it could endow the museum with a new function: to use the exchange of material culture to help build social cohesion. If the dispersal of parts of British national collections to the regions can be identified as beneficial in building local communities, then it logically follows that the repatriation of culturally significant artifacts to source communities could be equally beneficial in helping reconstruct a sense of national identity.
Today, as successive polls demonstrate, the most profound challenges to the more anachronistic aspects of the museum's inheritance come not from theorists or the academics, but from the museum's core constituency—its visitors, its public. Whether the “universal” or “encyclopedic” museum will succeed in honorably discharging the public trust on the critical issues remains the great unanswered question facing the profession.

This is an abridged version of a longer paper entitled "The Universal Museum: A valid model for the twenty-first century?" (Unpublished, © Tom Flynn 2005)

1 The Bizot Group—named after Irène Bizot, the former head of the Réunion des Musées Nationaux, who founded the group—convenes annually to discuss issues of concern to the museum profession.
2 "Declaration on the Importance and Value of Universal Museums" signed by the directors of eighteen European and American art museums.
3 Whether the signatories to the declaration considered how their joint utterance might be received by the international cultural community, or the extent to which it might polarise museum professionals remains unclear. However, it is hard to see how a potentially divisive and provocative policy document could have been constructed with such scant regard for the broader museum community, which was not consulted.
4 In a statement issued shortly after the declaration was published, ICOM supported the declaration’s general thrust against the illegal traffic in archeological, artistic, and ethnic objects, but quoted its own code of ethics with regard to repatriation to the effect that museums should “be prepared to initiate dialogues with an open-minded attitude based on scientific and professional principles.” See T. Flynn, "Artefact traffic". Museums Journal, February 2003, pp. 16ff. ICOM has subsequently published a discussion pamphlet addressing the issue (ICOM News, Vol. 57, No. 1, 2004).
7 Ibid., pp. 188–204.
8 The declaration by the Bizot Group is perhaps the most notable recent instance of this.

The “Anti-Humboldt”

After a resolution by the Bundestag in 2002, and the completed demolition of the “Palace of the Republic” (a modern building, completed in 1976, of central importance for the GDR containing the parliament, two large auditoriums, art galleries, a theatre, restaurants, and a bowling alley) in 2008, the planned reconstruction of the Berlin’s central palace, the Schloss—including the Humboldt Forum that will be housed inside it—is taking shape, a process that has so far gone largely unnoticed by the general public.

The Humboldt Forum is to house parts of the Central and Regional Library Berlin, and the scientific collections of the adjacent Humboldt University, but above all what is termed “non-European art and culture.” The palace façade symbolizes the lost and regained unity of Germany, the national center, as well as the “golden age” of Prussianism that is now being used as a post-separation historical gap-stopper.

The plan is to transfer objects from “non-European art and culture” back to the place where, from the seventeenth century onwards, they once formed the beginnings of the collection: in the Cabinet of Curiosities situated in the Hohenzollern palace. These were formed to demonstrate imperial magnificence, power, and control of the world via microscopic reproduction, and led later to human 2008. The palace’s Baroque Schütter courtyard upgrade from the eighteenth century marks the era of the Brandenburg–Prussian transatlantic slave trade. The last palace construction activities under Wilhelm II took place during the phase of coordinating, accelerating, and legitimating the Berlin-Africa Conference, summoned under Bismarck, where the division of Africa between the European imperial powers was negotiated. The non-European and ethnological collections, then, will be (re)placed in a building that is congruent with the colonial and academically hegemonic collection history.

And it is precisely in this context, of all places, that cultural treasures from around the world are to demonstrate cosmopolitanism. Non-European artifacts are made an instrument of national and European self-assurance under the cloak of the “cultural nation.” This term also stems from the spirit of the nineteenth century, when the “land of poets and thinkers” hoped to “peacefully” colonize the world by exporting culture. Yet instead of reflecting on such a term, the “cultural nation” is today being conjured again. German cultural expertise is in demand abroad, and German institutions like the German United Museums are at the service of an anti-Israeli, fradual state and tax haven (Dubai) while simultaneously claiming to be cosmopolitan at the price of abandoning democracy.

At the same time, attempts are made to politically link up with a new European cosmopolitanism, that as “Fortress Europe” is developing increasingly repressive migration policies against people of non-European origin. The exhibits are presented in places in which their producers have no right of residence. This is accompanied by a migration policy that discriminates according to direct economic usefulness, while massively intervening in the personal rights of individuals with a precarious residence permit status, created by the racist, special legislation of the aliens’ law.

In the museums in Dahlem, too, numerous objects exist that are known to have been violently appropriated or purchased from illegitimate traders. For example, close to half of the bronzes stolen by the British in Benin in 1897 came into the possession of German museums and several private collections: $80 for Berlin. Several descendents of inhabitants of the Kingdom of Benin have demanded the return of these artifacts, but their requests have been ignored.

The historicizing façade and the ties thus established with the nineteenth century obscure the breaks that the twentieth century has left in the history of German supremacy. Which “productive” relations, and for whom, should be imagined here, when both political recognition and the historical dimension are eliminated during this demonstration of cosmopolitanism (world art), this emphasis on the (state) reformist aspects of Prussianism (Alexander and Wilhelm von Humboldt, Wilhelm II), and this declaration of democracy and humanism?

Text of the Anti-Humboldt congress organized by Alexandertechnik in Berlin against plans for the establishment of a Humboldt Forum in this city, July 11–12, 2009. Alexandertechnik is a network of freelance artists, activists, and academics who reject both the reconstruction of the palace and the concept of the Humboldt Forum that is currently being circulated.

1 The Hohenzollern dynasty ruled Prussia and the German empire until 1918.
2 Dahlem is a suburb in south-west Berlin where a number of museums housing non-European art are situated.
Nation Branding: Art, Culture, and the Construction of National Identity

Panel at the Anti-Humboldt Congress in Berlin, 2009

“Nationbranding” was a workshop in the context of the “Anti-Humboldt” meeting organized by Alexander Stukemeyer, Johannes G. Raether (for Rosa Perutz), Max Hinderer, Alice Creischer, David Riff, Anthony Davies, and Jorge Luis Marzo. Below you can read excerpts from contributions by Anthony Davies, Jorge Luis Marzo, and David Riff.

Anthony Davies: I’m going to now try to illustrate the capital flows, the economic underpinning and interface between culture and education—an oblique way into nation branding. I'll do this by first going back to the early 1990s, the last major recession and the City of London's bid to become the global financial services hub. I'll then pick up again around the Dot Com and New Economy collapse in 2000-2002 and track a few developments in culture and education that will I hope, illustrate the way in which development might be regarded as a shorthand, an euphemism for capitalist crisis.

For the City of London, the stock market collapse of 1987 was further exacerbated by the global instability of the first Gulf War, Britain’s exit from the Exchange Rate Mechanism and the IRA's shift in strategy to “financial” targeting on mainland Britain in the early 1990s. When the IRA truck bomb went off at The Baltic Exchange in 1992 followed by Bishopsgate in 1993 the shockwaves spread quickly throughout the city, not just physically but symbolically shaking the foundations of the entire district. I recently revisited my notes from this period and though I can’t find a reference to it now, parts of the banking sector even threatened to relocate their operations—essentially move out of the City altogether if their safety, the safety of their employees couldn’t be guaranteed. The IRA had smashed the international perception of the financial district as a safe place to do business and totally undermined its ability to guarantee the smooth, uninterrupted flow of capital.

The initial response from the City of London Corporation and the British state was to build a so-called ring of steel, a series of checkpoints and concrete barriers to restrict and control the flow of people moving in and out of the zone. But of course, herein lies a contradiction where a physical concrete barrier keeping people out, controlling movement was totally at odds with the desire to attract international firms and workers and facilitate financial traffic, the management and flow of capital. So, to cut a long story short, this crisis and the threat posed by competing European financial districts, at the time principally Paris and Frankfurt, gave way to one of the first major City branding initiatives that explicitly linked culture to finance.

But it didn't stop at this. A number of quangos were also aggressively promoting the City to the international community as the global financial services hub—with a view to attracting Foreign Direct Investment. This promotional move cast Britain and the City as the place to do business, with low corporate tax rates (at the time, two-thirds of that in Germany if I remember correctly), a light regulatory environment, a largely compliant, resourceful, and international workforce, low strike rates and labor disputes due to a decade-long assault on union power, and to top it all a vibrant, cutting edge, entrepreneurial cultural scene. London pretty much knocked out all competition as the place to do business and this coincided with the rapid transformation and acceleration of financial services in line with economic globalization.

It goes without saying that young British art (yBa) followed in the slipstream. In fact and to draw this particular story to a close, one of the first surveys of yBa, the show Brilliant New Art From London at the Walker Art Centre in Minneapolis in 1995 tellingly referred to young London artists (yLa) and used the image of the collapsed buildings and rubble after the IRA truck bombs on the catalogue cover. The implication that young British art had emerged out of the rubble drew consternation and criticism from the City.

This particular archaeology could now move on to a district bordering the City—Shoreditch—and run through the entrepreneurial mayhem occurring roughly around the same time that brought artists, creatives, developers, landlords, estate agents together in what can only be described as the Thatcherite wet dream. All out to exploit and certainly no such thing as society. This so-called regional development, another response to the early 1990s recession and crisis, threw up the model for what would later become culture-led regeneration—an euphemism for displacement, dispossession, and exploitation.

I'm now going to have to leapfrog what might be called the golden period of British cultural and economic expansion in the 1990s—the government white papers, the think tank pamphlets and institutional realignment that made up Cool Britannia—and move straight into another recession, though many refer to this as a downturn and not official recession: the period 2000-2002 following the collapse of the Dot Com bubble and the New Economy.

The Dot Bomb along with the collapse of the New Economy and venture capital removed at a stroke the capital which had been flowing into the Creative Industries. This exposure to the market instabilities compelled the state to look for ways to anchor this sector... to find a safe haven... let's just call it a bailout. Education here played a role and universities were given access to a massive pool of state funds to set up staff and student enterprise schemes and business incubation aimed at locking down intellectual property and other creative and knowledge outputs. By 2006 the Creative Industries Observatory, a coalition of London-based educational institutions along with the Department of Trade and Industry entered the equation, set up to mobilize, monetize, and redeploy International Overseas Students or Alumni networks as ambassadors and conduits for British business. I don't have time to go into this in any detail but would like to very quickly note the extraordinary levels of student and staff exploitation underpinning these initiatives.

The globalized contemporary art market was also a direct beneficiary of the downturn that opened the century. Basically it grew out of crisis. (See "Burn Baby Burn... Some Thoughts on Finance and Art" in this section). Here we can track capital flight from corporate shares during the economic downturn of 2001-2003, where so-called pleasure investments (contemporary art, luxury yachts, sports teams, and so-called experiential travel) were linked to risk-balancing strategies and portfolio diversification amongst the world's rich. We can see new concentrations of wealth from the emerging BRIC economies (Brazil, Russia, India, China) entering the equation and along with this we get the myth of decoupling—the idea that an emerging economy or indeed sector could be both globally connected and simultaneously immune to, decoupled from any global downturn. If we wanted to be perverse here—and taking into account the British debt bomb of £60,000 per household—we might also factor in state divestment and the interest-free £2,000 "Own Art" Scheme put forward by Arts...
Council England to entice over-indebted British consumers into collecting art.

So finally, having briefly revisited two previous phases of the ongoing crisis and highlighted a single archaeology hauling in culture, education, and finance, we now arrive at the endgame of the current financial crisis and social crunch that many of us in Britain at least (and of course elsewhere) are now in the midst of. This is a world where the tide has gone out. With state bailouts of banks, unemployment figures on the increase, mass redundancies, pay freezes, with extraordinary levels of personal debt (£43,000 per household) and bankruptcies, and concomitant immiseration, peonage, and more recently wildcat strikes, walkouts, worker and student occupations, it's hard to see where next in terms of "development."

But let me bring some of this together for you and by way of illustration, the chaotic and desperate capitalist restructuring we're witnessing in Britain at the moment. Take one of the educational business incubators I mentioned earlier (now arguably redundant), factor in the downturn in the globalized contemporary art market, shrinkage in the creative industries, business bankruptcies, shop closures, and the emptying out of retail districts due to the economic crisis and you come up with an event called "Radical Incursions" at the University of the Arts London Innovation Centre promoting—wait for it—"the Berlinification of London" or Slack Space Movement. Here the British state in conjunction with Arts Council England (ACE), having already earmarked £4.4 million to—and I quote—"maintain artistic excellence during the economic downturn" announced that they were offering between £1,000 and £10,000 to artists and artist led initiatives to help reinvigorate ailing town centers, and of course in the process continue the process of deferral, mitigate against terminal decline, and the social upheavals to come.

The state is clearly staggering the impact and/or masking the current crisis, recasting it as "development" yet again. But make no mistake, this process of deferral is now in the endgame phase—there's nowhere else to go. In terms of branding then I might sing "London Bridge is Falling Down," though I doubt we'll see a rebranding drive to highlight Britain's economic, cultural, and social collapse. I doubt that very much. ...

Jorge Luis Marzo: Please allow some site specific remarks to start with. I visited the Humboldt Forum exhibition yesterday in the Altes Museum. I got this paper [an information brochure of the "Förderverein Berliner Schloss e.V. – Wiederaufbau Berliner Schloss"] from there. There is the authenticity of the old stones of all these monuments that were destroyed and then rebuilt, with comments of VIPs like Philip Johnson. The quotation is amazing: "from life and imagination the artist can create something which enchants us." I am going to answer to your question in talking about the connection between the creation of citizenship and a cultural brand. In Spain it is the connection between modernism and citizenship.

Franco's Spain was isolated. The only support that Franco had was the United States. The United States discovered that Spain was strategically important. In 1956 they came to an agreement to put sixteen military bases in Spain, and Franco got an international legitimation. The next step was to join the right-wing governments of South America under the umbrella of Hispanidad, to break off the international isolation of Spain. So the idea of promoting culture instead of supporting its production comes from that time. Culture was a part of the ministry of foreign affairs. The first agency was called the Hispanic Institute of Culture.

In 1975 Franco died; in 1977 we got a referendum, the attestation of democracy. Remember that Franco did not die like Nicolae Ceausescu or Benito Mussolini. Franco died in bed, surrounded by his family, with hundreds of thousands of people outside, everybody crying and weeping. The following government knew that they had to change Spain to make it fit into the new global economy. The system understood that the main problem was to acquire normality, an economic and social standard. In 1982 the Socialist party supported by parts of the Communist party won the elections. Spanish democracy was an experiment. Some thought it could reflect what would happen in the eastern countries. The first governmental statement said that culture was going to be the social glue that would hold together this new society. After forty years of dictatorship the losers and the winners of the civil war were still present in society. The culture was supposed to join them, to create a society, not divided by ideologies, political pressures, or autonomous regions like Catalonia, the Basque country, Andalusia etc. In 1980 Spain had five contemporary art museums. Today there are thirty-one. They have an investment budget of £500 million. We can compare this idea of promoting contemporary art to Germany's documenta as a re-education program, and its myth of the continuity of freedom of the avant garde under dictatorship. Painters like Antoni Tapies, Antonio Saura, were paid by Franco.

In 1996 the right wing won the elections. In the Aznar government all the ministers were sons and daughters of persons who were important for the Franco regime. In that time there was a new offensive in promoting contemporary art as culture, and culture as culture.

Contemporary art has not bettered Spaniards. Spaniards don't go to museums; 85 percent of the visitors are foreigners. When you impose an idea of culture upon social practices people do not respond to cultural calls. It just becomes cultural capital. The promotion of Spain as the cradle of culture has not worked at all, probably because we did not need to be better citizens. We are now being called cultural clients. I am affected like you with the Humboldt Forum, supposed to be a tourist in my own town. I discovered that the way it's being sold in Berlin is to say "Participate! Donate! Be a better citizen through the Humboldt Forum!" But citizenship is not acquired through culture. It is acquired through social struggle. It is acquired through all kinds of means, but not through culture. Culture is the result of social practices, not the other way around. ...

David Riff: I will tell you a little bit about the situation in Russia today. I am actually not from there, but have been living there for the last seven years. I was able to witness a radical transformation in the art scene which was small and marginalized in the 1990s, and over the last five years has undergone a drastic process of gentrification. There has been a consolidation of the brand of Russian art that has been emerging over these years. For me personally, it has been a traumatic process. It was a process of social atomization. The art scene fell apart. But at the same time it represented something to the outside world. I want to talk about the history of that "something." It is still quite undefined. Everything one would say about Russia before 1989, even before 2000, belongs to the prehistory of capital. It has its own twisted history of a branding of socialist culture. Beginning in the 1920s with the Russian avant garde, there was an awareness that socialism would have to compete with capitalism as a brand. That experience was crucial later on during the 1930s when the modernist form was rejected. A national Soviet culture was instituted as the main representation of the Soviet state. It was also connected to an idea of citizenship. The Soviet citizens would be able to go to the museum on Sunday afternoon and give themselves fully to aesthetic enjoyment. It was considered a human right. It was also used to represent the Soviet state to the outside. Socialist Realism was an international language, a counter brand to represent socialism in any context. This prehistory has formed things that...
have been going on more recently in a very deep way. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, there is a constant process of trying to rework this legacy. At the same time there was a massive disorientation, and a search for national self-representation in art. There were interest groups, corporations, and individuals trying to gain legitimacy through art by transporting a national idea; that search did not continue in such a dynamic way as in the 1990s, when there was no institutional framework to it. In the 1990s there were many different versions of what a Russian brand would be, which version of Russian-ness should be transported to the West and which version should be the typical thing at the biennials.

There were ideas that Russian-ness could be conflated with early capitalism and its wildness. Like Oleg Kulik, the Russian artist biting people like a dog, attacking children on the street naked. This was the image of the wild Russian that was popular in the 1990s. It was conveyed as a brand. It was called Naturalistic Terrorism.

In 1995 there was an exhibition in Stockholm called Interpol, where a conception of Russian Art was an anarchist brand that arose as a response to wild capitalism and clashed with global art. An installation by Wenda Gu, a Chinese-American artist was completely trashed by radical performance artist Alexander Brenner. He said global art was fascist, and now the Russian artist would rise up against this. In turn, Brenner was accused of fascism as well as the curator Victor Misiano. They then tried to accuse the accusers of fascism. It was a strange discussion which showed the political disorientation, and the stereotyping of Russians as those who have lost everything, gone mad, and decided to destroy everything. That image of Russia, as the travails of primitive accumulation ended or normalized, became redundant. It is connected to the ascent to power of Vladimir Putin in the aftermath of the 1998 crisis.

What you really see is a strategy of parallel investment, taking older legacies and privatizing them, setting them in the context of state-controlled representation. For example, the Russia Exhibition at the Guggenheim in 2006. There you had—spiral upwards in a dialectical perfect form—the entire history of Russian art, beginning with icon painting, going through nineteenth-century realism, through the avant-garde, and ending with an absurd fizzle of contemporary art, which was poorly represented and out of place. This goes over extremely well in the West. They associate Russia with this tradition, although they don’t know about it. The people who are most interested in developing a new brand now are these oligarchs. They are slowly taking control of a sizable part of the art market.

There is, until now, a lack of institutions for contemporary art in Russia. Those who have thought about, and are hungry to represent Russia to itself, are outright nationalists who have an anti-modern and anti-contemporary art agenda. For example, the Russian Orthodox Church is an important player in all this. They are funding their own artists, and at the same time actively attacking contemporary art. But I think the idea will emerge on the ruins of that Stalinist idea of Sunday viewing and citizenship. It will also emerge and have to do with the avant-garde legacy. One must be careful with how this will happen. At the same time you have things that are very similar to the Humboldt Forum project: Old replicas are going up to represent Russia to itself. Contemporary art is only grafted on this.

You have a war between contemporary culture production having to align itself with the haute bourgeoisie and represent a nice glamorous Russian style to the rest of the world. And, on the other hand, a conservative nation-state which is trying to represent itself to itself in its own tradition and is not interested in those openings, but that will change under the pressure of the haute bourgeoisie.
It's like WORK, which is not to everybody's liking.\footnote{1. The original title published in the press read as follows: 'It's like OPERA, which is not to everybody's liking.' The interviewee, of course, means 'opera' as a lyrical and musical theatrical performance and in fact prefers not to speak of work. Language betrays interviewer and interviewee. Susan Buck-Morss is right when she sees in a remark by Adorno (on the common structures in the organisation of labour in factories according to Marx and Wagner's project of a total work of art) the origin of the mode of production known as Post-Fordism, spectacle, cognitive capitalism—in short, the precise landscape where new cultural capitalism unfolds and which constitutes the exact framework of our opposition to BIACS. Our opposition is not merely tactical, but contrasts two different ways of understanding the community in which we live and work. The opening scenes of dedicated to the aerospace sector, fiercely defends the future of this contemporary art

proached after the fall of the Berlin Wall; when Toni Negri is astonished to learn that during the strikes staged in Seville in the late nineties the workers' protests were visualised in nightclubs and discos... all they are confirming is the existence of qualities and ways of life that have succeeded in facing up to a model of social exploitation that has been rehearsed in the city over three centuries of decadence. This explains why we consider our city, which for decades has belonged to the so-called tertiary sector (leisure, culture, tourism), a privileged laboratory of the different experiences of our day and age. (10 February 2010)}

2. We cannot but point out this other 'thread' of language, these bombshells that José Bergamin was so fond of. As soon as the journalist mentions the famous Airbus, the spearhead of Seville's aerospace industry that is presented as a showcase of the so-called 'second modernisation' language becomes less refined, more aggressive and violent: 'Fiercely defend!' But defend oneself from who? From the times when Seville was the visible face of the Spanish Empire the city has been besieged by the spectre of its inability to lead the scientific, technical or military progress it had never really attained. The Airbus would

The President of the BIACS Foundation, who also presides over a Seville-based company

\textit{Nemo}, the extraordinary film shot by Jesús Garay in 1976 based on Jules Verne's \textit{Twenty Thousand Leagues Under the Sea}, is a metallurgical company whose labourers worked to the rhythm of Wagner's \textit{The Rhine Gold}. The film closes with another musical scene, a lighthearted pop melody that marks the ballet steps of the seamen and in which a clumsy sailor—Seville-born Oscar, who would become a famous transvestite in Barcelona's underground art scene—is unable to follow the steps, and blurs the distinction between the figures performed by the other members of the corps de ballet. What passes through the story is a change of era and perhaps that is all the film actually is—the awan song of a way of understanding systems of production and labour. We shall not discuss in detail here Seville's tradition of ideal representation in opera (Pídelo, Don Giovanni, \textit{The Barber of Seville}, Carmen). To a certain extent, the city turned her back on this over-representation by constructing a world of her own, albeit one also made of papier-mâché. The \textit{Great Theatre of the World*} of the city's social life since its moments of splendour in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries is not a clear picture and presents several lights and shadows. When Guy Debord enthusiastically praises the city in the early eighties ('Oil Seville', the empire's Great Babylon'), believing he had discovered unprecedented resistance to the spectacular integration that preceded the political process that Europe sp-

competition, unique in Spain, that is now threatened by the economic crisis, like many

like to be at once the Niña, the Pinta and the Santa María, the three ships on which Christopher Columbus sailed to colonise America. The operation is only similar in advertising terms, for what is no more than a military plane is presented as a humanistian enterprise. Ever since the loss of the last overseas colonies (the defeat in Cuba took place in 1898) the city has been pursuing that technological spectre. The aeronautical industry was established in Tablada (a space now dedicated to town-planning speculation) in the early twentieth century, and its prototype of ship was named Great Power, like the famous image of Christ taken out on procession every Holy Week; the flight of the Piás-Ultra seaplane that unites Paio de la Frontera (from where Columbus departed) and Buenos Aires took place in 1926; the bolínavet Ignacio Sánchez Mejías bought a Berlin-Seville service for the Graf Zeppelin in the thirties... This limited mythology of progress also has a sinister underside: the coup d'état perpetrated by Generals Sanjurjo and Queipo de Llano that brought the social experiment of the Spanish Repub-

287
other cultural projects.²

underlying such a phantasmal construction. The term 'Spanish Empire' is no longer considered precise even by modern historiography for, strictly speaking, the city of Seville developed into a great colonial port under the Habsburgs, a conglomeration of interests of Central European princes whose only pledge was to ensure that the Kingdom of Castile hoarded the official capital. It is quite true that the city of Seville played a prominent role in the long process of emergence of modern capitalism. In 1569 the geographer and theologian Mercader declared, "Seville was the backbone of the world and now, suddenly, this anus has become a navel, its very core." If we go by what are now considered classic theorems (all of them dating back to the early twentieth century and the German historiography derived from Carl Marx), neither Max Weber's primitive accumulation, nor Werner Sombart's luxury surpluses, nor Georg Simmel's invention of money left more than a ghastly trace in Seville. Aside from the churriguereque passion for Christianising our arabesques, almost no vestige of industrial development remains of the millions of tons of silver from Potosí and Zacatecas. All that capitalism has left us is the need for organisation brought about by the luxury industry are the gold and silver robes in which we dress the body of Christ before displaying him every year. Our contribution to the world of money scarcely involves the forged notes expertly produced by the painter Francisco

determined to remain. What is true is that without that country's support the scope of this

of cultural colonisation that were deployed against the various indigenous peoples of South America had been rehearsed with the Jewish and Muslim minorities before these were definitively expelled from the Iberian peninsula. The systematic cultural dialogue that accompanied the military conquest (a sort of advance party of cultural studies in the service of Christ's soldiers, as Noam Chomsky observes) was based on the possibility of establishing universal eumecanism between images and myths. That was when the global iconosphere was rehearsed. In Mexico, Santiago Matamoros aspires to be Santiago Matallana" and finally Putinas-pochiti, the god of war. And yet he is overcome by intemperance and the Indians' pacific and violent forms of resistance are reassembled around his horse (a giant Trojan horse). The water line of this School of Images that is the basis of the spectacular (rites and everyday life) control of conquered peoples has its faults. In The Practice of Everyday Life (the volutum of contemporary political activism) by the Jesuit Michel de Certeau, the practices that illuminate and rouses rehearsed against their dominators in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries are updated to the contemporary city. The anachronism does not only allow for a more effective dynamics of political struggles, its double temporality also illuminates spaces of resistance, the utopian flavour of which

- Is Abu Dhabi the salvation of BIACS?
- No. BIACS has never been at risk because it is

Herero the Elder, and the smuggling in which the poet Silvestre de Balboa was well versed (furthermore, we are fascinated by the figure of Felipe Ramírez de Arribas, born in Gran, Algeria, of Sevillian descent who as a worker at the Seville mint did not only design the Non Plus Ultra Columns on the silver coin produced in Potosí but was the mastermind of the great forgery of 1640 that led to the first global economic monetary crisis). Spectres all around. So, although we have dedicated a funereal monument to him, we have no idea where Columbus is buried, and as regards our identity traits, we owe the word 'America' to an Italian and 'Baroque' to neighbouring Portugal. How is it possible that in the early days of capitalist modernity capital should have left such a slight idiosyncratic mark on the great city of merchants?
[26 February 2010]

3. It is paradoxical that once again our salvation should come from Arabia. "Where danger threatens, salvation also grows," wrote Hölderlin; "Where danger grows, there also grows / there also grows, salvation," is the immemorial verse in the Cuban rumba. In his seminal essay Las imágenes de la discordia, Felipe Pereda explicitly states how the methods

edition would not be as broad, the exhibition would be more in keeping with times of crises,

is, in turn, based on the continuous folds of secrecy and the intermittent unfolding of an insulting visuality. When Mario Praz visited Seville in the twenties, he asked himself, "Where is the Baroque?" His radical diagnosis pointed to southernhic-a-brac and Mudejar arabesques as dominant forms, true
determination of the world established by the great politics of the Baroque spectacle has its underside in these Mudejar practices in which the defeated, the Jewish and
less ambitious. This doesn’t mean, however, that we shall spare no expense. We have reached a

Muslim communities, with their dual cultural practice as converts, created a political idiom that, as Judith Butler has observed in the case of queer transvestism, could only be expressed, could only speak, through visibility. In the fifties, when Latin American poets (Octavio Paz in Mexico, Lezama Lima in Cuba, Haroldo de Campos in Brazil, etc.) based a certain identity standard on the Baroque, they must have noticed that their account recognised another tale of subjection, one that was always told from the staircase of the vertical. The mistress (the linguistic monster says it all) should have been Mudejar. In the eighties, when certain Baroque readings began to be revisited for contemporary artistic production, these modes – superficially diverse, seemingly multi-form, playfully complex – subjection to the single language of the Empire, in the Baroque style, were repeated. Exhibition projects such as Víctor Zamudio-Taylor’s Ultra Baroque to Omar Calabrese’s El infierno de lo bello, helped consolidate this model. In Spain, The Real Royal Trip by Swiss curator Harald Szeemann (the model that has inspired Seville’s BIACS) reinforced this position, that concealed a reactionary call to the most conservative order beneath a glitter progressive and modern discourse. A few years before then, however, in the late eighties, two different projects on a local scale, Antes y después del entusiasmo curated by José Luis Brea

art from the Middle East that is characterised by the impressive quality of the works.3

what to do when someone turns up covered in gilt and brilliantine, whether they arrive on a motor float or on an aerodynamic airbus. Emires por donde te mires,*** as the famous satirical song from Cadiz declares, we know we are being deceived.

[13 March 2010]

______________________________

* A reference to Calahorra de la Barca’s Baroque play of the same title.

** St Amores the Moor-killer and St Jaimas the Indian-killer.

*** The verse, which говорит the Spanish expression meaning ‘no matter how you look at it’, contains a play on the words ‘emires’ (enire) and ‘miere’ (look).

fourth edition of BIACS. This will also enable us to display the country’s art and all the Arabian

the most varied causes in our community. Later on, the ‘Arab’ mark vanished (literally, for the Cordova venue was ruled out a few days before the opening), proving it had been no more than a cheap decay, a colonialist strategy for re-selling second-hand goods that, like the pharmaceutical companies that sell their products to the Third World past their use-by dates, had managed to present its new cybernetic operas sidestepping again our main demand of ‘getting down to work’. Now, the same contemptible strategy is launched for the media (welcome emires, petrodollars to the rescue!) in the name of a certain cultural community between the Arabs and us. Pancho Bautista’s Se acabó el petróleo, a feverish 1980 film shot in Seville by local humorists, already described a similar situation. The sheikhs arrive in Seville and would like to bathe and discuss economic issues, ‘Before, the world solid, money ruled. The world now, liquid, we are rich in oil! It isn’t Zygmunt Bauman, it’s the humorist Pepe da Rosa!! As in the film, where they end up finding oil fields at Seville’s Macarena Gate, with this Abu Dhabi business they are hoping to deceive us once more, sanctioned by the city’s Neo-Baroque tradition. They will manage to dupe us and present their bankruptcy as a victory in the name of the city’s second modernisation.’ They will display their spectacles in different ways, but we shall not be dazzled, no. We know
La Nación clandestina es la que dice: No ¡Ya basta!
Entrevista con Jorge Sanjinés
por Max Jorge Hinderer

Max Jorge Hinderer: ¿Por qué el grupo UKAMU ha optado por ese tipo de cine?
Jorge Sanjinés: Cuando empezamos a trabajar, en el año 1962, éramos, en alguna medida, hijos de la revolución del '52. Todavía en el '62 se vivía una cierta euforia de ese proceso y nosotros queríamos de alguna manera participar políticamente del mismo. Entonces hicimos una película que se llama Revolución. Es una película corta que quería responder a la pregunta: ¿Ha hecho esta revolución del '52 lo suficiente para transformar la sociedad boliviana y sentar justicia en ella? Es una película que no tiene palabras, solo imágenes, ruidos, sonidos y música. Y la conclusión que sacamos en la película era que no: de alguna manera, era una revolución inconclusa. Los problemas básicos de explotación, de miseria, estaban todavía presentes. Fue muy temprana la posibilidad de construir un cine político que participase del proceso liberador de la sociedad boliviana, y que además al hacerlo, al denunciar estos hechos determinados, pudiera contribuir a construir una identidad, a afirmar una identidad cultural, hacer un cine que fuera boliviano; era importante hacer una obra cinematográfica que pudiera comunicar con una sociedad multicultural donde el predominio de la cultura indígena es muy fuerte. Si el cine es un instrumento moderno, el operativo cultural que hizo el grupo UKAMU fue transformar ese medio expresivo, producto de la modernidad europea, en un instrumento propio. Que pudiera contar su propia historia y que pudiera construir su propia manera de contar. Eso sería un cambio revolucionario también. La mayor parte de nuestras películas apenas tiene que ver con la narrativa europea y americana. Creemos nuestra propia narrativa, que tiene que ver con una idea de tiempo circular: un cine que está basado en la idea de integración colectiva. Además, vimos que nuestro destino más importante era el pueblo marginado, indígena, que sin embargo era el protagonista principal de la historia boliviana. La referencia a la cultura indígena es ineludible si de alguna manera queremos encontrar una identidad cultural en Bolivia. La cultura indígena es la que le da esencia y le da razón, por lo menos en este lado del mundo occidental boliviano. Y en ese sentido, yo entiendo que el cine era un cine político que, para que participara del proceso y contribuyera al proceso liberador, denunciaba hechos que otros medios ocultaban o no eran capaces de desentrañar o exponer. Al mismo tiempo iba construyendo una identidad en la manera de narrar, de contar la historia.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Hay una película que de manera muy programática muestra los distintos aspectos que acaba de nombrar y quizás incluso sea la más famosa: La Nación Clandestina (1968). ¿Qué quiere decir el título de su película?
Jorge Sanjinés: Creo que el proceso actual de cambio revolucionario que vive el pueblo boliviano, con la asunción del poder político por parte del MAS (Movimiento al Socialismo) liderado por el Presidente Evo Morales, ha cambiado radicalmente esa visión de clandestinidad de las culturas indígenas. Hoy día, los indios están siendo activamente protagonistas de su propia historia, de la política: están recuperando su presencia en territorios que habían sido arrebatados y están terminando con esa marginalización metódica, sistemática, de los grupos dominantes blanco-mestizos, quienes no les permitían participar de la construcción de la sociedad boliviana. Cuando hicimos La Nación Clandestina todavía el pueblo indígena era un pueblo clandestino porque tenía que realizar y llevar adelante sus costumbres de una manera clandestina, y ahora estamos cambiando con la nueva situación política social y, y hay un nuevo reconocimiento desde la última constitución política. Por ejemplo, la composición actual de los asambleístas del nuevo congreso boliviano: la Asamblea Nacional. La mayor parte de miembros de esa asamblea es gente del pueblo, no solamente indígenas, así que ya se puede hablar, por primera vez en la historia de Bolivia, de que el pueblo está en el poder político.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Después de la revolución del '52, sobre todo en los años '60, muchos investigadores latinoamericanos comenzaron a interesarse por la historia boliviana, la época pre-republicana, la economía potosina... Surge entonces toda una generación de sociólogos e historiadores críticos con las versiones oficiales de la historia. Igualmente en el campo de la política, el proceso actual boliviano es muchas veces comparado con el '52. ¿Es posible decir entonces que, a lo largo de las décadas, la revolución del '52 si tuvo un poder transformador?
Jorge Sanjinés: La revolución del '52 también produjo cambios más adelante y efectivamente determinó también transformaciones no inmediatas. El proceso boliviano fue muy avanzado en ese momento: era un proceso orientador en el contexto latinoamericano. Pero tiene antecedentes muy interesantes. Bolivia siempre ha dado algunos pasos precursoros. El primer grito libertario en el continente, en realidad no lo dieron algunos criollos en el 1809; lo da Tupac Amaru y lo da Tupac Catari, porque son los primeros en levantarse contra el poder en el 1780. Los criollos todavía estaban celebrando al rey de España. Sin embargo, el radicalismo de Tupac Catari, mayor que el de Tupac Amaru, decía: "Españoles, litodos afuera! Criollos incluidos". Pero este primer grito de independencia aún no se reconoce, a causa de ese mismo proceso de discriminación y de racismo que dicta la historia hegemónica. La posterior revolución de 1810 era producto de criollos muy conservadores que querían detener el poder económico de los papás, nada más. Murillo, por ejemplo, era un terrateniente muy rico que estaba que riendo sacarse a los españoles de encima para ocupar el poder él mismo. En cambio, los indios quechuas y aimaras en 1870 se juntan para expulsar directamente al invasor. Ése es el primer gesto de independencia de Bolivia no reconocido todavía. Aquí no se tendría que celebrar el 16 de julio sino una de las fechas del cerco de La Paz como una acción militar que le costó a la colonia más muer tos que cualquier batalla de Bolívar: la mitad de la población. La Paz tenía unos 20.000 habitantes y más o menos 10.000 murieron en ese cerco. ¿Qué batalla de la Independencia causa de golpe 10.000 muertos? Habría que estudiarlo. En cierto modo la nación clandestina es la que cerca e invierte a La Paz. La Nación clandestina es la que dice "No, 200".

Max Jorge Hinderer: Con la película Para recibir el canto de los pájaros (1995) usted articula una duda sobre la posibilidad de solidarizarse plenamente o entender los intereses indígenas por parte de los productores culturales de la sociedad blanca y mestiza. Ya en La Nación Clandestina aparece una duda acerca de este hecho, representada por un izquierdist a perseguir que termina insultando a una pareja indígena por no hablar español. ¿Cómo ve ese conflicto en la situación actual?
Jorge Sanjinés: Es un proceso a largo plazo. Tengo la esperanza de que se anime la transformación revolucionaria y política que se está dando en el país de una manera pacífica. Es algo que podría haberse producido de una manera violen temente. Pero las culturas indígenas han intentado resolver los problemas de manera pacífica siempre que han podido buscar la solución de los proble-
mas por la vía del diálogo, de la paz. Y si ese proceso llega a afianzarse y se le da el tiempo necesario, pienso que va a haber una transición a través de una re-educación de la sociedad que no es indígena. Se va a plantear claramente, así como antes se planteará el dominio de la sociedad blanca-mestiza sobre la mayor parte de la población indígena, que fue marginada, segregada, incapacitada para construir su vida en la Nación. Se puede dar el proceso inverso. Esa gran mayoría marginada que un día ocupaba el espacio político nacional va a asentar, quiérase o no, sus concepciones de la realidad. Ya lo está haciendo de muchas maneras.

El otro día hablaba con un ministro, que no es indígena, y él tenía problemas porque tenía dos viceministros en su ministerio con los cuales no podía decidir sus asuntos con la rapidez con la que él hubiera deseado (con la rapidez característica de la concepción piramidal del poder): “Sí yo soy el ministro, tengo el poder, decido vamos a hacer tal cosa y lo vamos a hacer”. No señor, le dijeron esos viceministros que eran indígenas: “Sí, nosotros tenemos que consultar a nuestra gente. Si la gente está de acuerdo y las bases están de acuerdo lo hacemos”. Pienso que va a producirse un período de re-educación hasta que esta sociedad pueda tener una cierta armonía. La mentalidad individualista del blanco-mestizos que quieren vivir cómoda, tranquila, orgánica y armoniosamente en la nueva sociedad boliviana, de aquí a 20 años, tendrá que haber cambiado de muchas maneras el blancos-mestizos tendrán que entender cómo es la praxis colectiva. Ocurre lo mismo con las películas: el gran desafío al hacer La Nación Clandestina era respetar la visión colectiva, por ejemplo, en el caso del tiempo. La concepción circular del tiempo, no lineal, de los aírmaras no es como la de los occidentales: las cosas no tienen un comienzo, un desarrollo y un final, sino que todo regresa, todo vuelve. La muerte puede ser el comienzo de la vida o el futuro puede no estar adelante, puede estar estar atrás. Así se ve en la escena final de la película: el protagonista está asistiendo al entierro de su perro y el es el hombre renacido de su conciencia. ¿Dónde está el futuro? Está atrás.

Max Jorge Hinderer: ¿La inversión del proceso modernista, a través de la inversión de la primacía del individualismo?

Jorge Sanjinés: Pienso que sí, ya que creo que entre los más lícitos dirigentes del mundo indígena está muy clara la idea de que no podemos ir adelante a construir una nueva sociedad retrocediendo hacia un pasado pre-moderno. Sino que hay que avanzar adoptando aquellos mecanismos de la modernidad que puedan ser útiles, que son necesarios. No se pueden negar las ventajas de un quirofano para resolver problemas que no se pueden curar con hierbas. Entonces, ese proceso es muy lento, va a ser de alguna manera doloroso para mucha gente que no va a soportar y que va a abandonar el país. Es muy difícil cambiar la manera de ver el mundo sin a uno lo han educado desde muy pequeño a verlo de una manera y se ve obligado a cambiarla para sobrevivir. Hay que tener una dosis de pasión, de compromiso político, ideológico con el proceso para adaptarse, y si no se dispone de todo eso no es posible adaptarse nunca: siempre se choca y surge el conflicto. Pero creo que la presencia de una mayoría demográfica de cultura colectivista es determinante. No es el caso de México, no es el caso de otros países donde tienen minoría indígena, donde para sobrevivir la minoría indígena no tiene más opción que adaptarse a la cultura dominante o perecer. Aquí es al revés.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Justamente la noción de las condiciones de vida y producción “al revés”, o la inversión de las mismas, en los últimos años surgió como concepto importante en varios libros que acompañaron los procesos de cambio político en Bolivia. En muchos casos los académicos politizan dos usan términos o perspectivas indígenas. En la redacción de El retorno de la Bolívia plebeya (1999/2007) del grupo La Comuna, Oscar Vega Camacho incluye el libro con la famosa cita de Gua- mán Poma de Ayala: “El mundo está al revés”. Raquel Gutiérrez publica Los ritmos del parachikuti (2008), donde señala el levantamiento indígena como renovación del orden social y político. Silvia Rivera, en una versión más onológica, habla del concepto “quip y nayra”, el caminar hacia adelante mirando atrás, un concepto que además ilustra con la figura de Sebastián, el protagonista de La Nación Clandestina. ¿Qué estamos pasando cambio colectiva?”

Max Jorge Hinderer: ¿Qué en el futuro? ¿Está atrás?

Jorge Sanjinés: Yo particularmente tengo una enorme confianza en la lucidez de muchos pensadores indígenas que han tratado ese tema y ese desafío, como Roberto Choque o Esteban Ticona. Intelectuales indígenas de mucho peso, de una formación académica muy seria, que no habían sido tomados en cuenta por el sistema anterior. Es el gran pecado de la clase dominante, que por racismo despreció al indio, tanto que cualquier manifestación indígena no tenía importancia, que cualquier intelectual indígena no tenía importancia. Pero lo que le ha permitido dar un gran salto a la sociedad boliviana a partir del año 2003, cuando se produce la guerra del gas en octubre, es justamente el uso de sus propias convicciones culturales, indígenas, de su capacidad de organización colectiva: eso la lleva a la victoria contra el modelo neoliberal, hace que Sánchez de Lozada, el presidente, se tenga que escapar del país. Y si uno se pregunta, bueno, ¿quién ha dirigido ese proceso? ¡Ha sido un partido político, un líder, un caudillo! Se sorprende de ver que no. Es el pueblo, solo pero acompañado, sí, de su cultura, de su capacidad de organización colectiva, de un pensamiento que lo hace hombre múltiple. Un aimara, como lo señala laba un sociólogo, se piensa como un nosotros y después como yo. Ésa es la gran diferencia y el gran reto que debe enfrentar toda la sociedad boliviana. Tener una división muy clara entre dos visiones del mundo, dos cosmovisiones de la realidad. Los blancos-mestizos, a los que yo pertenezco, que hemos sido formados dentro de los parámetros de la cultura individualista europea. Que entendemos que primero están los intereses del yo y después los de los demás. Contra una visión que es totalmente opuesta: la de una sociedad que es la mayoría de la sociedad boliviana, de la población boliviana que, desde muy pequeños, han sido ensayados a pensar primero como grupo y después como individuo.

Max Jorge Hinderer: Los recursos naturales siempre han tenido un papel clave en los movimientos sociales en Bolivia, en la formación de un sujeto colectivo. Ahora enfrentamos la explotación de litio en el Salar de Uyuni. Los líderes políticos y la voz popular dicen que será distinto al proceso que se vivió en las minas de Potosí (“No queremos otro Potosí”), que vivimos más tarde con el estado en Oruro. “Distinto”. ¿Supone en este caso una remodelación del sujeto minero, el debido respeto ante la condición de trabajo y vida colectiva de los mineros?

Jorge Sanjinés: No creo que sea radicalmente distinto, porque un trabajador siempre es un hombre que entrega parte de su vida en el mundo minero. Pero sí creo que habrá y se crearán condiciones, por fin, y tal vez por única vez, de respeto a ese hombre que va a entregar parte de su vida trabajando una riqueza, un recurso natural, que va a dar dinero al nuevo Estado. Y seguramente ese hombre minero será muchísimo más reconocido económicamente de lo que hubiera sido antes. Pienso que eso va ir cambiando. No está exenta de peligro esa lucha porque tampoco hay que idealizar. Los indios no son todos comunitarios ni colectivistas. Hay también indios y indios. Sebastián en La Nación Clandestina es un ejemplo, es un hombre que voluntariamente se acultura y empieza a actuar como un individuo occidental, y comete los errores que comete porque tiene una visión distinta de los valores, de la vida. Esas cosas ocurren
en la vida real. También a nivel de gobierno. Pienso que el gobierno tiene que hacer un trabajo muy grande y tener mucha conciencia de la importancia que tiene mantener bien esos valores y comunicarlos, transmitirlos al otro lado de la sociedad, y a su propia sociedad también. Los jóvenes indígenas tienen que ser hoy mucho más conscientes de estos valores colectivos que provienen de su propia cultura y dejar de mirar a la cultura occidental como el paradigma. Va a ser necesariamente un sindicato muy diferente del sindicato del mundo capitalista, donde se organiza para defender del abuso del patrón, de los patronos, de los dueños de las minas, y si no actuaban de una manera coherente con los intereses del dueño entonces o se los despedía o se los masacraba. Así que esas organizaciones nuevas van a ser muy diferentes. Van a tener, yo creo, un enorme peso en el aparato de las decisiones porque ya es un pueblo que va teniendo conciencia de estar trabajando en una mina que va a favorecer a su país. Su trabajo ya no está destinado a la acumulación ajena. No estoy trabajando para que acumule el esfuerzo de mi trabajo un rico chón que ni siquiera conozco. Esto es diferente, se va a dar un tipo de relación muy diferente del que se había dado desde la época de la colonia en Potosí.

Entrevista con Jorge Sanjinés, 16 de enero de 2013, Fundación UKAMU, La Paz, Bolivia.
List of works

Sonia Abián
El Aparato del Ángel
installation. Painting, collage, paper and binding material
2009 / 2010
Barcelona / Posadas

Anonymous
Antonio López de Quiróga
Oil on canvas
159 x 129 cm (framed)
1660
Museo Casa Nacional de Moneda, Potosí

Anonymous
Las Novicias
Oil on canvas
246 x 332 cm (framed)
First half 17th century
Convento-Museo Santa Teresa (O.C.D.), Potosí

Anonymous
Felipe V, convertido en Santiago Matamoros
Oil on canvas
219 x 175 cm (framed)
Mid 18th century
Museo Nacional de Arte, La Paz

Anonymous
Impresión de la cañuela a San Ildefonso
Oil on canvas
223 x 178.5 x 6 cm (framed)
17th century
Museo Casa Nacional de Moneda, Potosí

Anonymous
La Muerte de Nagasaki
Oil on canvas
258 x 341 cm (framed)
17th / 18th century
Convento de la Recoleta, Sucre

Anonymous
Vírgen del Coro
Oil on canvas
159 x 102.5 cm (framed)
1720
Museo Nacional de Arte, La Paz

Anonymous
Vírgen de la Inmaculada
Oil on canvas
263 x 207 cm (unframed)
1732
Diócesis de Córdoba, Parroquia de Santa Ana

Anonymous
Sanlústima Trinidad
Oil on canvas
178 x 117 cm (framed)
16th century
Museo Colonial Charcas, Universidad San Francisco Xavier de Chuquisaca, Sucre

Anonymous
Anonymus
La flagelación de Jesús
Oil on canvas
163 x 119 cm
18th century
Parroquia de San Pedro, Potosí

Anonymous
Plano y perspectiva del horn on que se habia sacado agua de la mina de Santa María de Chilpa en casa del onor de México Gonzalo Sánchez de San Martín
Manuscript. Paper, gouache in ochre, orange and blues
28 x 42 cm (unframed)
1677
Archivo General de Indias, Seville. MP México, 71

Anna Altscher
Mapamundi
Drawing and coin on paper
134 x 212 cm (unframed)
2010
Vienna

Monika Baar
Amor Divinus
Oil on canvas
60 x 40 cm
2010
Berlin

Quirín Bauml
El Índio de Caquiarini
Silver pencil on transparent foil
317 x 765 cm
2010
Berlin

Quirín Bauml
La Muerte de Caquiarini
Silver pencil on transparent foil
313 x 419 cm
2010
Berlin

Gaspar Miguel de Berlio
Descripción del Cerro Rico e Imperial Villa de Potosí
Oil on canvas
182 x 262 cm (framed)
1758
Museo Colonial Charcas, Universidad San Francisco Xavier de Chuquisaca, Sucre

Christian von Borries
Scenes: The Dubai in Me – Rendering the World
Video
2010
Dubai / Berlin

Matthijs de Bruijne
1000dreams.org (1000 safes)
Installation with table and 20 LCD monitors
20m long (table)
2009–2010
Amsterdam / Beijing

Chito delat
The Tower: Sangspiel
Installation with video
2010
Saint Petersburg

Alwin Estricher, Christian von Borries, Andreas Siekman
Dubai – Expanded Horizons. The museums create a new public sphere.
Re-enactment of a press conference; music performance
2009
Tempera Kunsthalle, Berlin

Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers
Installation of the museum
Installation, objects, photographs, graphics
2010
Picun Village, Chacray District, Beijing

CVA (TIPSA)
Crisis Chronology
Sheets of paper DIN-A 2 / Installation
2010
London

Ines Doujak
Erika el castillo
Performance, dress, book
2010
Vienna

Ines Doujak
Witches
Sculptures
2010
Vienna

Alejandro Durand
Máquina hidroúrica o vestidura para cubrir a un hombre dentro del agua
Manuscript. Paper, pen drawing with sepia brown ink
41.5 x 56 cm (unframed)
1720
Archivo General de Indias, Seville.
MP Ingenieros, 248

Elvira Espejo
Camino de las Santas
Textile installation and objects with audio
2010
La Paz
Marcelo Expósito
143.253 (los ojos no quieren estar siempre cerrados)
Double-channel video
2010
Barcelona / Buenos Aires

Harun Farocki
The Silver and the Cross
Multimedia-installation
2010
Sucre / Potosí / Berlin

Leon Ferrari
1482–1982. Quinto Centenario de la Conquista
Installation; shell with more than 130 bottles and objects
250 x 280 x 20 cm
1982
Buenos Aires

Leon Ferrari
Untitled
Photography with intervention
100 x 70 cm
2010
Buenos Aires

María Galindo / Mujeres Creando
Ave María, llama era de Rebelión
Installation with video and graffiti
2010
La Paz

Isasas Gutiérrez
Mercado Energetico Puro
Installation with documents, drawings, photographs and video
2010
Huelva

Luis Guarani
El Infierno de Caquieri
Audio
2010
Caquieri / La Paz

Sally Gutiérrez Dewar
Filming of the painting “Entrada del Virey Morcillo en Potosí” at the Museo de América, Madrid
Video
2010
Madrid

Max Jorge Hinderer
NO2: The Long Memory of Cocaine
with texts by John Barker, Max Jorge Hinderer, Jorge Hurtado Gurruchaga et al.
Images: Max Jorge Hinderer
Magazine (dummy for the exhibition)
2009–2011
La Paz / London / Berlin

Hermanus Hoge
Pla disidenies emblematis, elegiis et effectibus SS. Patrum illustrat
Book, cover: glassine
1628
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Centrale Bibliotheek
Tabeburium, 74354

The Karl Marx School of the English Language
David Riff / Dmitry Gutov
The Rosy Dawn of Capital
Installation in a closed space with oil paintings on canvas and audio installation
2010
Moscow

Rogelio López Cuenca
With Roser Cardinal, Ismael Cabecudo, Laura Marte, Cecilia Postiglioni, Daniela Ortiz y Ana Recasens, Car Xalant / Centre de Creació i Pensament Contemporani de Mataró
Mapa de Mataró
Website
2010
Barcelona

Maestro de Calemarca
Gabriel Dei, Letiel Dei, Laseiel Dei, Uriel Dei
(Ángeles arcabuceros)
Oil on canvas
163.5 x 112.5 / 163.5 x 112.5 / 160.5 x 110 / 116.5 x 109.5 cm
1680
Calemarca, Departamento de La Paz

Maestro de Cauyaviiri
Infierno
Oil on canvas
Ca. 317 x 765 cm
1735
Iglesia de Cauyaviiri, Departamento de La Paz

Maestro de Cauyaviiri
Muerte
Oil on canvas
Ca. 313 x 419 cm
1735
Iglesia de Cauyaviiri, Departamento de La Paz

Melchor María Mercado
Álbum de paisajes, tipos humanos y costumbres de Bolivia
Watercolor on paper (10 sheets)
24 x 34 cm each
1841–1869
Archivo y Biblioteca Nacionales de Bolivia, Sucre

Eduardo Motinori / Archivo Caminante
The Soy Children
Installation, drawings, collages, photographs
2010
Buenos Aires

Francisco Moyrán
El Cristo de las cruces
Oil on canvas
154.3 x 114 cm (framed)
Early 18th century
Convento-Museo Santa Teresa (O.C.D.), Potosí

Juan Eusebio Niestenberg
De la diferencia entre lo temporal y lo eterno
1705
Print
Jesus order, Paraguay
Original by Gaspar Bouttats, Antwerp 1684

Luis Niño
Virgen de Candelaria de Sabaya
Oil on canvas
99 x 79.5 cm (framed)
18th century
Museo Casa Nacional de Moneda, Potosí

Mariano Florentino Olivar
Vista del Cerro a la ciudad de La Paz, 1781
Oil on canvas
142 x 186 cm (framed)
1803
Museo Casa de Murillo, Unidad de Museo Municipales. Gobierno Municipal de La Paz – Bolivia

Melchor Pérez de Holguín
Entrada del Virey Morcillo en Potosí
Oil on canvas
230 x 600 cm
1718
Museo de América, Madrid

Felipe Guamán Poma de Ayala
El Primer Nueva Cordulca y Buen Gobierno
(Reproducción de páginas escogidas)
1815 / 1816
Royal Library, Copenhagen

Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales (PRPC)
Untitled
Installation
2010
Sevilla

Ascribed to Juan Ramos
Amar Divinus
Oil on canvas
Ca. 40 x 60 cm
1703
Iglesia de Jesús de Machaca, Departamento de La Paz
Photographic credits for color plates

P. 153 and cover image © Andreas Siekmann
P. 154 / 155 above: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 155 below left: © Franz Ostermaier
below right: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 156 / 157 above: © Andreas Unterländerstaetter
P. 156 below: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 157 below: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 158 above: Andreas Siekmann
below: © Photo: User of the Centro Ocupacional Municipal "Carlos Castillo del Pino," Ayuntamiento de Alcorcón / Programa Correct© del MNCARS.
P. 159 above: © Courtesy Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia, Madrid. Photo: Román Loes and Joaquín Cortés
below: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 160 above: © Andreas Unterländerstaetter
below: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 161 above: © Andreas Siekmann
below: © Courtesy Museo de Bellas Artes de Sevilla. Photo: Guillermo Monjo
P. 162 above: © Courtesy Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia, Madrid. Photo: Román Loes and Joaquín Cortés
below: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 163 above: © Andreas Siekmann
below left: © Courtesy Museo de Bellas Artes de Córdoba right: © Andrés Unterländerstaetter
P. 164 above: © Andrés Unterländerstaetter
below: © Courtesy Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia, Madrid. Photo: Román Loes and Joaquín Cortés
P. 165 above: © Andreas Siekmann
below: © Chito delat
P. 166: © Andreas Siekmann
P. 167 above: © Marcelo Espósito, 2010
below: © Matthias de Bruijne
P. 168 above: © Andrés Unterländerstaetter
below: "The Silver and the Cross" © Harun Farocki, 2010
P. 170 above: © Courtesy Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia, Madrid. Photo: Román Loes and Joaquín Cortés
below: © Courtesy Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofia, Madrid. Photo: Román Loes and Joaquín Cortés
P. 171 above: © Matthias de Bruijne
P. 172: © Matthias de Bruijne

Andreas Siekmann
Dubai – Expanded Horizons
Acrylic on canvas
270 x 590 cm
2010
Berlin

Lucas Valdés
Santiago batallando con los mares
Oil on canvas
176,5 x 119 cm (framed)
1699
Museo de Bellas Artes de Córdoba

Lucas Valdés
Retrato milagroso de San Francisco de Paula
Oil on canvas
90 x 117,5 cm (framed)
Ca. 1710
Museo de Bellas Artes, Seville

Zhao Liang
Petitioners
8 videos (scenes from the film-archive Petition) and installation
2010
Berlin

Storage – Ethnological Museum
Installation with photographs
2010
Berlin

296
List of contributors

Sonia Abián (b. 1966 in Posadas, Argentina) lives and works in Barcelona. She began her artistic work as a painter, and later also turned to action art, video, and conceptual art. She has been dealing with archives and sound research from the beginning of her career.

Luís Victor Alemán Vargas (b. 1982 in La Paz, Bolivia) graduated in sociology from the Universidad Mayor de San Andrés and is the author of a bachelor’s degree thesis entitled “El transportista vivo del volante: La producción del transporte público y su organización social, el caso del grupo Hito 45 del Sindicato Mixto de Transportes Litoral.” He wrote the article “Empresarios al volante” for the electronic publication Revista Transporte y Territorios. He lives in Potosí.

Alexandertechnik (founded in 2008 in Berlin, Germany) is a group of artists, activists, and academics critically examining the reconstruction of Berlin’s Stadtgeschichte and the concept of the Humboldt Forum.

Maria Isabel Álvarez Plata is a curator, art historian, and restorer. She was vice-minister of culture and has published works on a number of occasions on colonial art and Bolivian contemporary art, most recently Bolivia: Los Caminos de la Escultura, ed. (2010), and Alfredo La Place: Tramas, Tramas y Trazos, ed. (2010). She lives in La Paz.

Anna Artaker (b. 1976 in Vienna, Austria) lives and works as an artist in Vienna. She focuses on creating pictures connected to historiography or the relationship between photography and subject.

Bartolomé Aráoz de Orosa y Vela (b. 1676, d. 1736) was a chronicler in the viceroyalty of Peru, the region covered by present-day Bolivia.

Antonio de Ayaz (b. 1599 in Güendulaln; d. 1598 in La Paz, Bolivia) was a Jesuit who in 1596 published a critical account of the working conditions of the Indians in the silver mines.

Monika Baer (b. 1964 in Freiburg im Breisgau, Germany) lives and works as an artist in Berlin.

John Barker (b. 1948 in north London, Great Britain) lives and works as a writer and cultural critic in London. Barker regularly publishes political and cultural critical essays in the London publication Mute Magazine, among others.

Quirin Bäumler (b. 1965 in Weiden, Germany) is an artist living and working in Berlin. He graduated from the Fachschule für Holzhandwerkerei Oberammergeus and the Kunstkademie in Munich. Together with other artists he founded the firm Sculpture Berlin in the German capital.

Gabriela Behoteguy Chávez is an anthropology student at the Universidad Mayor de San Andrés (UMSA) of La Paz, Bolivia. She is currently finishing her bachelor’s degree thesis on the cultural representations of the Virgin of the Nativity of Chuchulaya. The rediscovery of the restored painting for the Potosí Principles exhibition was an important part of her research.

Gaspar Miguel de Berrio (b. 1706 in Potosí, Bolivia, d. 1763) was a painter, representative of the American Baroque, who worked in Potosí, now Bolivia. He is cataloged as one of the chief exponents of the Potosí School, after Melchor Pérez de Holguín, whose disciple he had been.

Christian von Borries (b. 1969 in Zurich, Switzerland) is a conductor, composer, and producer. He lives in Berlin and is engaged in the audio branding of classical music. In 2002 he and Martin Hossbach founded the music label Masse und Macht.

Matthijs de Bruijne (b. 1967 in Amsterdam, the Netherlands) studied at the Gerrit Rietveld Academie and the Rijksakademie in Amsterdam. His multimedia installations are a reflection of research on political realities in Argentina, the Netherlands, China, and elsewhere. De Bruijne’s works have been shown in locations such as Europe, Argentina, and Canada, and in the exhibition project Ex Argentina, 2006, at Museum Ludwig, Cologne. He lives in Amsterdam.

Roberto Cheque Canqui (b. 1944 in the province of Pacajes, Dep. La Paz, Bolivia) is a historian and archivist. From 2003 to 2010, he was the vice minister for decolonization at the Ministry of Culture in Bolivia. Cheque Canqui is the author of numerous articles, research essays, and books on indigenous education, and other topics.

Chito delat/What is to be done? (founded in 2003 in St. Petersburg, Russia) is a platform of artists, philosophers, and writers from St. Petersburg, Moscow, and Nizhny Novgorod, who share their commitment to political theory, art, and activism. Chito delat published an art magazine of the same name in English and Russian.

Alice Creischer (b. 1960 in Geroistel, Germany) is an artist and writer living in Berlin. In 2004 she and Andreas Siekmann curated the exhibition project Ex Argentina at Museum Ludwig, Cologne, and in 2002 the exhibition Die Gewalt ist der Rand aller Dinge at the Generali Foundation, Vienna.

Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers (Beijing, China) is part of the Migrant Workers Home that was founded in a former factory in Pimin Village in 2002. The Migrant Workers Home is an NGO based in Beijing, dedicated, among other things, to equipping schools and offering legal advice to migrant workers. The Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers was set up in 2008. Sun Heng, a former migrant worker, is the cofounder and director of the Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers. Lin Zhbin is research coordinator of the Culture and Arts Museum of Migrant Workers.

Anthony Davies (b. 1966 in the United Kingdom) is a writer, cultural critic, and organizer. He lives and works in London.

Stephan Dillmeuth (b. 1954 in Bödinger, Germany) is an artist and teaches at the Academy of Fine Arts in Munich. Dillmeuth works across genres with installations, videos, performances, painting, documentation, and publications.

Ines Doujak (b. 1959 in Klagenfurt, Austria) lives and works in Vienna. In her photographs, installations, and performances, she examines norms and stereotypes particularly with regard to gender roles and racism.

Elvira Espejo (b. 1981 in Qaqachaka, Bolivia) studied painting and textile design at the National Art Academy in La Paz until 2004. Her artistic practice includes paintings, charcoal drawings, and woven pieces, as well as linguistic creations—poems, stories, and songs. She lives and works in La Paz.

Marcelo Exposito (b. 1966 in Puertollano, Spain and Buenos Aires, Argentina) lives and works mainly in Barcelona. His works focus on the interdisciplinary nature of literature, photography, and video. He is a member of the Universidad Nómada (http://www.universidadnomada.net/).

Harun Farocki (b. 1944 in Nový Jičín/Neutitschein, Czech Republic) is a filmmaker, writer, and professor of film. Harun Farocki has produced a number of artistic works that were shown in the context of exhibitions and museums. He has been teaching at the Academia de Bellas Artes since 2004.

León Ferrari (b. 1920 in Buenos Aires, Argentina) is a conceptual artist concerned with the overlapping of politics and religion. His works are situated in the area of collage, painting, and sculpture. He lives and works in Buenos Aires.

Mariano Florentino Olivares (b. in Oruro, Bolivia) worked as a painter in La Paz in the nineteenth century.

Tom Flynn is a London-based writer and artist historian with interests in sculpture history, art and business, museology, cultural heritage, the art market, and art crime.

María Galindo/Mujeres Creando. Galindo (b. 1964 in La Paz, Bolivia) is an artist, theorist, and activist, and a founding member of the feminist group Mujeres Creando (founded in 1992 in La Paz, Bolivia). The group opposes homophobia and machismo. She became known especially for her graffiti. Mujeres Creando has published numerous books, including La Virgen de los Desamparados (Buenos Aires, 2005), and produced TV series and videos. She lives and works in La Paz.

Teresa Gisbert is an architect and art historian. She was the director of the Museo Nacional de Arte in La Paz, Bolivia, and the Instituto Boliviano de Cultura.
Zhao Liang (b. 1971 in Dandong, Liaoning Province, China) lives and works as a video artist and photographer in Beijing. He graduated from the Film Academy in Beijing and studied art at the Luxun Academy of Fine Arts in Shenyang.

Peter Linebaugh is an American Marxist historian who specializes in British and Irish labor history and the labor history of the Atlantic. He has taught at New York University, University of Massachusetts Boston, and Harvard University. Linebaugh currently teaches at the University of Toledo.

Rogelio López Cuenca (b. 1955 in Nerja, Spain) is a visual artist, who lives and works mostly in Mexico and Barcelona, Spain. He has done interventions in urban public spaces, for TV, on the Web at www.malagana.com, and he has also taken part in the Johannesburg Biennials: Manifesta 1, Rotterdam; São Paulo; Lima; and Istanbul. He lives and works in Nerja.

Jorge Luis Marzo (b. 1964 in Barcelona, Spain) is an art historian, curator, writer, and professor at the Escuela Elisa Nava/Universitat Pompeu Fabra. He lives and works in Barcelona.

Gabriela Massuh was born in Tucumán, Argentina. She studied arts at the UBA and gained her PhD at the University of Nuremberg, Germany. She worked as a university teacher, culture journalist, and translated Kafka, Heiner Müller, Camus, Schiller, Brecht, and Eizenberger, among others. As cultural director of the Buenos Aires Goethe Institute, a position she has held for several years, she has published Formas no políticas del autoritarismo, Benjamin en América Latina, Ex Argentina (IZ, 2004) and La Normalidad (IZ, 2006). La intemperie (2008) is her first novel.

Christoph Menke is a professor at the Goethe University Frankfurt am Main and together with Arnd Pollmann is editor of the Junius introductory work Einführung in die Philosophie der Menscherechte.

Melchor María Mercado was a state official and graphic artist in the nineteenth century.

Eduardo Molinari (b. 1961 in Buenos Aires, Argentina) has been working with the Archivo Caminante—a “wandering” and “changing” archive—since 2001. Thematic focuses are on history and identity, utopia and remembrance, as well as on contexts of artistic work. Molinari is a lecturer at the National Art Academy in Buenos Aires.

Francisco Moyen (b. 1720 in Paris, France) was a French merchant, musician, and painter. He first worked as a technical draftsman at various European courts and later invested his inherited fortune in transatlantic trade. Due to his enlightened attitude and tendency toward polemics, he was sentenced by the Inquisition and died as a prisoner on a Spanish galley in 1761.

Juan Eusebio Nieremberg (b. 1595 in Madrid, Spain, d. 1658) was a humanist, physicist, biographer, theologian, and Spanish ascetic writer who belonged to the Company of Jesus.

Luís Niño (b. in Potosí, Bolivia) was a painter, sculptor, and silversmith who worked under the commission of Obispo de Charcas and for the parish of San Lorenzo. It is often stressed that Niño was an Indio.

Fátima Olivarez R. is curator of the National Museum of Art in La Paz. She has a master's degree in cultural management, with professional experience in public and private museums.

Plataforma de Reflexión sobre Políticas Culturales (PRPC, Seville, Spain) was founded as a discussion platform on cultural politics, questioning the privatization of public funds for cultural production via the BIACIS Foundation (International Biennal for Contemporary Art Seville) and private investment lobbies since the beginning of the Seville Biennal.

Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala (b. 1556, d. 1644) was an indigenous chronicler from Peru during the viceregency of Peru.

Melchor Pérez de Holguín (b. 1660 in Cochabamba, Bolivia, d. around 1732 in Potosí) was one of the most significant painters of the Andean Baroque. He lived in Potosí.

Juan Ramos (b. sixteenth century in the viceregency of Peru, now Bolivia) was a painter who worked in the style of the Leonardo Flores school and in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries completed commissioned works in the Church of Jesús de Machaca.

David Riff (b. 1975, London, Great Britain) is an art critic, translator, and writer. He is a member of the group Chito delat. Riff teaches art history at the School of Photography Rodtschenko and multimedia in Moscow. He lives and works in Moscow and Berlin.

Jorge Sanjines (b. 1936 in La Paz, Bolivia) is a filmmaker and the founder of the group UKAMAU. He is the winner of various international prizes and ex president of the Fundación del Banco Central de Bolivia.

Konstanze Schmitt (b. 1974) studied theater and literary studies in Berlin, where she still lives and works. After completing her studies, she was an assistant in the project Ex Argentina in Buenos Aires and Berlin. Since 2004 Konstanze Schmitt has been working as an artist and theatermaker in the independent theater scene and has realized projects among other places, in Mannheim, Madrid, and Berlin (e.g. exhibition participation in La Normalidad, Buenos Aires 2006, Vom Sinn der Arbeit, Mannheim 2009; performance at the Internationale Schillertage 2009).
Acknowledgments


Finally, we’d like to express our thanks to all the artists, authors and lenders.
Organized and produced by

MUSEO NACIONAL CENTRO DE ARTE
REINA SOFIA

HAUS DER KULTUREN DER WELT

In cooperation with

GOBIERNODE ESPAÑA
MINISTERIO DE RELACIONES EXTERIORES Y DE COOPERACIÓN
MINISTERIO DE CULTURA

KULTURSTIFTUNG DES BUNDES

SEA CEX

Supported by

Seguros y Reaseguros

The Haus der Kulturen der Welt is supported by

Der Bundesrat der Bundesregierung für Kultur und Medien

Federal Foreign Office

on the basis of a resolution adopted by
the Deutscher Bundestag.
Every care has been taken to identify the holders of the authors’ rights. Any unintentional error or omission must be communicated to the publisher in writing and will be corrected in subsequent editions.

We are committed to respecting the intellectual property rights of others. While all reasonable efforts have been made to state copyright holders of material used in this work, any oversight will be corrected in future editions, provided the Publishers have been duly informed.

The texts reflect the opinions of the individual authors.

We thank all copyright owners for their kind permission to reproduce their material. Should, despite our intensive research any person entitled to rights have been overlooked, legitimate claims shall be compensated within the usual provisions.
Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía, Madrid, Spain

Haus der Kulturen der Welt, Berlin, Germany

Museo Nacional de Arte and Museo Nacional de Etnografía y Folklore, La Paz, Bolivia